

SANTA ROSA AND SAN JACINTO MOUNTAINS
NATIONAL MONUMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

LOCATION: RIVERSIDE COUNTY
PERMIT ASSISTANCE CENTER
38686 El Cerrito Road
Second Floor Conference Room
Palm Desert, California 92211

DATE AND TIME: Monday, September 15, 2008
3:07 p.m. to 5:33 p.m.

REPORTED BY: DIANE CARVER MANN, CSR
CSR NO. 6008

JOB NO. : 67486DM

A P P E A R A N C E S

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

TERRY HENDERSON, CHAIRPERSON - City of La Quinta

JEFF MORGAN - Local Conservation Organization,
Sierra Club

ROBERT BROCKMAN - City of Rancho Mirage

BARBARA GONZALES LYONS - Agua Caliente Band of
Cahuilla Indians

DAWN WELLMAN - Pinyon Community Council

JOHN KALISH - Field Manager for the Palm Springs South
Coast Field Office

BUFORD CRITES - City of Palm Desert

LAURIE ROSENTHAL - District Ranger for the San Jacinto
Ranger District

GARY WATTS - California State Parks

BOB LYMAN - Riverside County

BILL HAVERT - Coachella Valley Mountains Conservancy

JEANNE WADE-EVANS - San Bernardino National Forest
Supervisor

1 PALM DESERT, CA MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 15, 2008

2

3

4 P R O C E E D I N G S

5 -000-

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Good morning --

7 or good afternoon.

8 MR. CRITES: Good evening.

9 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Good evening.

10 It's going to be that, too, before very long. I thank

11 you for joining us today, and it's been a long time.

12 I hope everyone did well with their time since our

13 last meeting. And with that, I'll call the meeting to

14 order. It is -- I have, like, 3:06, I believe. So

15 we're getting a little bit of a late start. And if we

16 could have the roll call.

17 MR. KALISH: City of Palm Springs,

18 Sharon Apfelbaum? City of Cathedral City, Paul

19 Marchand. City of Rancho Mirage, Bob Brockman?

20 MR. BROCKMAN: Here.

21 MR. KALISH: City of Palm Desert, Buford

22 Crites?

23 MR. CRITES: Present.

24 MR. KALISH: City of La Quinta, Terry

25 Henderson.

1 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Present.

2 MR. KALISH: Pinyon Community Council,
3 Dawn Wellman?

4 MS. WELLMAN: Here.

5 MR. KALISH: Band of Agua Caliente
6 Indians, Barbara Gonzalez-Lyons?

7 MS. LYONS: Here.

8 MR. KALISH: Coachella Mountains
9 Conservancy, Bill Havert?

10 MR. HAVERT: Here.

11 MR. KALISH: County of Riverside, Bob
12 Lyman?

13 MR. LYMAN: Here.

14 MR. KALISH: California City Parks, Gary
15 Watts?

16 MR. WATTS: Here.

17 MR. KALISH: University of California
18 Riverside, Al Muth?

19 MR. CRITES: On his way.

20 MR. KALISH: Sierra Club, Jeff Morgan?

21 MR. MORGAN: Yes, here.

22 MR. KALISH: Is there any persons in
23 attendance that have submitted ongoing applications?

24 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: For appointment?

25 MR. KALISH: For appointment?

1 MS. OLINGER: Deborah Olinger, Agua
2 Caliente.

3 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you.

4 MR. KALISH: Anybody else?
5 Acknowledging Jean Wade-Evans is not in attendance?

6 MS. ROSENTHAL: She's supposed to be on
7 her way. There she is now.

8 MR. KALISH: Steve Orchard will not
9 attend, of course. Lauri Rosenthal --

10 MS. ROSENTHAL: Here.

11 MR. KALISH: -- with San Jacinto Ranger
12 District. Myself, John Kalish, Field Manager, Palm
13 Springs. And then Jack Hamby, sitting in for Steve
14 Borchard, Associate District Manager, BLM, California
15 Desert District. And then I would like to acknowledge
16 Diane Mann as the court reporter.

17 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you.

18 MS. ROSENTHAL: Jean Wade-Evans just
19 came in. We're taking attendance, Jean.

20 MS. EVANS: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I'll announce at
22 this time that Mr. Foote is not with us today. There
23 was a death in his family, so he is away. So in lieu
24 of Mr. Foote, I have three able -- four able-bodied
25 plus commissioners assisting.

1 MS. ROSENTHAL: That might not even be
2 enough to replace Jim, but we'll try.

3 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We'll do our
4 best to proceed in a very professional way where Jim
5 will be proud of us.

6 At this point I'd like to take just a
7 moment and recognize those members of this commission.
8 Some have been with us since day one, 2001, and some
9 not quite as long, but very dedicated folks to this
10 organization. And we're certainly sorry to see them
11 leave. Does that mean you're never coming back, ever?

12 MS. LYONS: I'll be in the audience,
13 maybe.

14 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Buford? Are you
15 ever, never?

16 MR. CRITES: I will do my very best to
17 be here as often as most people are in the audience.

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We certainly
19 appreciate that, and given that we're down to two
20 times a year, it should be that much easier.

21 MR. CRITES: So it seems.

22 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: And Gary and
23 Dawn, are you going to come visit us?

24 MR. WATTS: Never say never.

25 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: At this time I'd

1 like to just take a second and recognize your
2 involvement for the times that you were here. We have
3 this plaque for you, Dawn.

4 MS. WELLMAN: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you. And
6 I know Buford is just waiting to put this with his
7 other plaques, Buford. We certainly thank you for
8 your time, your effort, your expertise, your
9 knowledge, your personality and your orneriness.
10 Gary, thank you. Thank you, and ditto.

11 MR. WATTS: Except for the orneriness.

12 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Wait a minute,
13 Barbara.

14 MS. LYONS: Come on now. Don't forget
15 I'm leaving.

16 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Take care.

17 MS. LYONS: Thank you. God bless.

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We have more
19 coming in. Could we seat him? Look at this, a
20 mountain. Come on, Buford.

21 MR. CRITES: There it is.

22 MS. WELLMAN: It's beautiful.

23 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: You don't even
24 get to hang it on the wall. And look at the way the
25 green reflects through.

1 MR. CRITES: That's nice. It's the
2 national forested Land, forest area.

3 MR. WATTS: Thank you.

4 MR. CRITES: Thanks. That's very
5 pretty.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We certainly
7 thank you, and we'll miss you and hope to see you come
8 back and join us.

9 Moving on and maybe trying to catch up a
10 little bit here in time, the next item is approval of
11 the Advisory Committee meeting minutes.

12 MR. CRITES: So moved.

13 MR. MORGAN: Seconded.

14 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We have a motion
15 and a second. All in favor? Any opposition or
16 corrections? Seeing none, the minutes will stand.

17 Moving on to reports, updates and
18 presentations. We have a presentation today for the
19 proposed land exchange between BLM and Agua Caliente
20 Band of Cahuilla Indians. I notice we have things
21 being set up all over the place, so are we ready for
22 that, Allison?

23 MS. SHAFFER: Yes, I am. Is this your
24 computer, John?

25 MR. KALISH: I'd like to introduce

1 Allison Shaffer, who is one of our realty specialists
2 who's handling our acquisitions, along with the
3 proposed land transfer, land exchange between BLM and
4 the Tribe.

5 MS. ROSENTHAL: While she's setting up,
6 we have a sign-up if anybody wants to speak.

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Make a public
8 comment.

9 MS. ROSENTHAL: During the public -- why
10 don't we pass this down to the end of the table.

11 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you,
12 Lauri.

13 MS. SHAFFER: John, if I could get you
14 to unlock this.

15 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Ruth, why don't
16 you turn your chair a little more.

17 MS. WATLING: I like breaking my neck.

18 MS. SHAFFER: Okay. Again, my name is
19 Allison Shaffer. I'm a realty specialist with the BLM
20 Palm Springs field office, and thanks for listening to
21 me today.

22 Just a little about me, I came from our
23 headquarters office in D.C. I've been with BLM Palm
24 Springs for a little over a year now. And this was
25 one of my first assignments that was delegated to me.

1 So it's been very fun to work on so far. Just to go
2 over the topics that are going to be covered, I'm not
3 sure how familiar everybody is with the exchange, but
4 I thought I'd go into a little bit of history about
5 the exchange, the lands that are actually going to be
6 exchanged, the process and where we are to date in
7 that process. At the end I'll open it up to
8 questions, but feel free to stop me at any time if you
9 want to interject or ask a question, and that would be
10 no problem.

11 Just to give you an idea of the lands that
12 are -- let me try to use this pointer. There we go.
13 These are the lands that we're going to be talking
14 about and these two townships in the National
15 Monument. The boundary is right along here, and these
16 are the non-federal lands that are proposed to be
17 transferred to the BLM.

18 MS. WELLMAN: What sections are those?

19 MS. SHAFFER: I have a whole long land
20 description of the sections, but I'll get to that
21 slide in a few minutes.

22 In 1999 the BLM and Tribe entered into a
23 cooperative agreement. The cooperative agreement was
24 to coordinate and cooperate in management of the
25 federal lands in and outside the boundaries of the

1 Santa Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains. The Tribe and
2 the BLM agreed to meet annually and identify specific
3 resource management land tenure adjustments and
4 management goals. And later in 1999 an MOU was signed
5 between the Tribe and the BLM for acquisition and
6 exchange of lands within the Santa Rosa/San Jacinto
7 Mountains National Monument.

8 In October of 2000 the Monument Act was
9 passed by Congress, and within the Monument Act, and
10 Congress recognized, there are certain lands in the
11 National Monument that have a special cultural value
12 to the Agua Caliente Tribe.

13 Within 6E of the act, the Congress
14 specifically cites the cooperative management that was
15 signed between the Tribe and the BLM in 1999, and
16 basically it directs the Secretary of Interior to
17 exchange lands with the Agua Caliente.

18 In 2002 in order to implement the land
19 exchange, the BLM and Tribe entered into an agreement
20 to initiate and assemble land exchange. Generally
21 that's one of the first steps in the process for the
22 land exchanges. And usually the agreements to
23 initiate have to go through Washington office
24 clearance through our national land exchange team.
25 And within the agreement it specifically identifies

1 which lands are going to be exchanged and the
2 responsibility of each party for the exchange process.
3 And in the agreement to initiate, there are two phases
4 of exchange that are identified.

5 In 2003 the proposed resource management
6 plan and final EIS, those were completed for the Santa
7 Rosa/San Jacinto Mountains National Monument. And the
8 final management plan was approved in February of
9 2004.

10 These are the lands that are identified in
11 the ATI and the RMP to be exchanged in Township 4
12 south, range 4 east. And again I'll show you a map
13 that clearly outlines where these lands are, but these
14 are the sections that are proposed to be transferred.

15 And the RMP also identifies lands that
16 would be acquired from the Tribe in Township 5 south,
17 range 5 east. And within the RMP it says that
18 depending on appraised values, additional lands could
19 be identified for transfer to the United States.

20 This is the map of the lands that are to be
21 exchanged. The lands in red, these are the lands that
22 are to be transferred in the first phase of exchange
23 and Section 36 down here is identified in the
24 agreement to initiate as an equalization parcel.
25 These two up here are identified in the agreement to

1 initiate as Phase 2 lands to be transferred out of the
2 BLM ownership -- or excuse me -- federal ownership.

3 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: These two up
4 here, are they the green ones?

5 MS. SHAFFER: These two green ones up
6 here.

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay.

8 MS. SHAFFER: These lands in purple are
9 the lands the Tribe would be exchanging with the BLM.

10 Basically the exchange process is very
11 long. I'm not going to cover all of it today. In
12 lands academy, an academy I went through -- it's a
13 joint academy with the Forest Service and BLM -- they
14 use an entire binder -- it's four inches thick -- to
15 cover the exchange process, and they use an entire
16 wall to cover it. But in interest of time, I'm not
17 going to go over in that much detail.

18 MR. HAVERT: Thank you.

19 MS. SHAFFER: Just to give you an idea,
20 this is how the exchange process goes. It generally
21 starts with signing an agreement to initiate between
22 the two parties. The proponent publishes a notice of
23 exchange proposal. The notice of exchange proposal
24 goes into a local paper for four consecutive weeks,
25 and there's also a 45-day comment period that goes

1 along with that. And the comments that are submitted
2 to the BLM will go into the environmental document and
3 will be addressed.

4 We need to complete certain resource
5 reports. We need to know what minerals are actually
6 on the land. We do a mineral report. We do a
7 cultural report and a biological report. With this
8 particular exchange, the Tribe has prepared and is
9 finalizing their own trial RCP Habitat Conservation
10 Plan, and for the cultural side of things they've
11 completed a Historic Preservation Management Plan, and
12 that was signed in July of 2008.

13 We also need to conduct a Phase 1 ESA's for
14 federal and non-federal lands for Haz-Mat purposes.
15 We need to prepare a Certificate of Inspection
16 Possession, and that's a requirement by Department of
17 Justice. We need to request an appraisal for the
18 properties. We need to prepare an environmental
19 document. For this one we'll be doing environmental
20 assessment.

21 We need to -- as you can see, we have
22 certain requirements with escrow instructions.
23 Preparing a preliminary title opinion, and that's for
24 our solicitors to review. And we also need to request
25 concurrence from our state office and Washington

1 office to issue any sort of decision. So we sign the
2 decision record. We have to publish and distribute a
3 Notice of Availability for that decision. And as you
4 can see, there are a couple of other steps up there
5 too that we need to complete just for Phase 1 alone.

6 Where are we now? Again, like I said
7 before, the proposed exchange will occur in multiple
8 phases. Currently we're implementing Phase 1 of the
9 exchange. Within the next couple of weeks we're
10 hoping to get out a Notice of Exchange Proposal to go
11 in the paper, and we'll also be notifying specific
12 individuals that regulations require.

13 We need to complete all of the resource
14 reports that I discussed earlier. We pretty much got
15 the biological and the cultural reports taken care of.
16 The mineral report, I went out with our state office
17 geologist and Jim Foote in the middle of August -- it
18 was very, very hot -- to do a fieldwork for that
19 mineral report, and our geologist is working on that
20 report as we speak.

21 We need to prepare the Certificate of
22 Inspection and Possession as required by Department of
23 Justice, and we're also starting to prepare an
24 environmental assessment. Actually the Tribe is doing
25 that.

1 Since Jim couldn't be here today, I thought
2 it might be nice to have a little reminder of him. So
3 are there any questions that I can answer?

4 MR. MORGAN: Yeah. Who determines who
5 gets what for what? In other words it looked like
6 certain parties in this exchange were getting about
7 three times as much land as they were, so who decides
8 that and how?

9 MS. SHAFFER: Well, a lot has to do with
10 the appraisal, their appraised values. The way we
11 exchange lands in BLM are value for value, not
12 necessarily acre for acre.

13 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Yes, please.

14 MR. BROCKMAN: Is that value for value
15 determined and balanced by each phase or by the total
16 package?

17 MS. SHAFFER: The goal would be to -- I
18 guess, for Phase 1 -- and John, correct me if I'm
19 wrong -- but for Phase 1 the goal is to try to get as
20 much of a -- I guess, to balance it out as much as
21 possible in that first phase and keep going that way.
22 Again the Resource Management Plan allows for
23 additional lands to be purchased by the Tribe to
24 exchange with us in order to balance out the value, if
25 I'm making sense.

1 MR. KALISH: Yeah. It's an assembled
2 land exchange, which allows a little more flexibility
3 where you don't have to actually -- as the exchange
4 moves forward, you don't have to match up parcels that
5 are equal in value. You do have some flexibility to,
6 through the use of a ledger process, you know, deposit
7 money into a ledger if the values go over. And in
8 that way, then, you can fashion the overall land
9 exchange a lot more effectively. So it isn't strictly
10 a matching up individual parcels throughout the entire
11 process. It's an assembled land exchange.

12 MR. MORGAN: How long do you think this
13 will take, then, if it goes through for both phases?

14 MR. KALISH: It depends on the unknowns
15 of, you know, how well the appraisals work and how we
16 can match up the various parcels in each of the phases
17 and whether or not anything comes out of the mineral
18 report and how we can complete the handling of
19 cultural resources through 106 process and just all
20 those variables. But the goal is to expedite the
21 process.

22 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I think you had
23 a question first.

24 MR. HAVERT: Yeah, I did. Can you
25 refresh my memory as to what the -- either the

1 Monument legislation itself or the actual agreements
2 that were entered into between the Tribe and BLM say
3 about the management of the lands once they're
4 transferred to the Tribe. Is there language in either
5 of those agreements about that?

6 MS. SHAFFER: I would have to look.

7 MR. HAVERT: Okay. And then sort of --

8 MS. SHAFFER: I have them both with me
9 but not all the sections memorized.

10 MR. HAVERT: A follow-up question, which
11 may be is more for Barbara. I assume the lands would
12 end up in tribal trust.

13 MS. LYONS: Yes.

14 MR. HAVERT: Do you know under the
15 tribal HCP what management or status of the lands
16 would be?

17 MS. LYONS: No, I don't recall right
18 now. But I think it would follow the way we do it
19 now. Whatever lands that are held in our jurisdiction
20 would be under our jurisdiction.

21 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Buford?

22 MR. CRITES: If I understand right, you
23 don't have to trade equal value land for equal value
24 land; there can be some offset, which as an example,
25 BLM could give to the Tribe \$10 million worth of land.

1 The Tribe could give to BLM worth of land and deposit
2 \$3 million in cash or something of that equivalent?

3 MS. SHAFFER: There is a certain -- in
4 our regulations, there is a certain percentage that
5 that has to fall into.

6 MR. CRITES: So the Tribe would give
7 \$2.5 million on a \$10 million deal. Does the
8 \$2.5 million stay in the district for land
9 acquisition? Because if not, the National Monument
10 has just been short-changed. I would use the word
11 "fleeced," but it being a warm day, I won't use
12 "fleeced."

13 MS. SHAFFER: My understanding is that
14 it goes into treasury.

15 MR. CRITES: So our local BLM would be
16 ill-served by anything less than value for value?

17 MS. SHAFFER: I'm going to punt that one
18 to John.

19 MR. KALISH: Is that a comment?

20 MR. CRITES: Just a question.

21 MR. WATTS: An observation.

22 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I'm sorry, Gary.
23 You go ahead.

24 MR. WATTS: I have something separate,
25 so if you're on the same train, go.

1 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Well, I guess
2 value for value or not -- and we know that the Tribe
3 has done a wonderful job of managing their land, and I
4 presume that we're doing a wonderful job managing the
5 land. And in most cases the way I see it, it's kind
6 of alike with the same purpose, so I'm wondering what
7 the whole purpose of a land exchange was to begin
8 with.

9 MS. LYONS: Consolidation. Basically
10 consolidation. If you look on the map, you'll see
11 where our reservation is blocked by BLM land, and so
12 when we take care of the land, you're trying to find
13 out, okay, where is our boundary at? And especially
14 we have this eradication of what kind of species?

15 MR. CRITES: Tamarisk.

16 MS. LYONS: I know tamarisk. What do
17 you call that? Invasive species; okay?

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Species, yeah.
19 And you're doing it on some land that's not tribal
20 land.

21 MS. LYONS: If we can't get BLM to help
22 us do this up river, upstream, we're like really doing
23 nothing downstream because your seedlings are still
24 going to come downstream. So the more we can
25 consolidate the land, the more ability we have to

1 really work on how we need to get that done.

2 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. Well, in
3 looking at the map here, the red squares are going to
4 become tribal land; is that correct?

5 MS. LYONS: Right.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: And so they will
7 then be what color, the little darker color?

8 MS. LYONS: The darker color, I believe.
9 Is that the even numbers?

10 MS. SHAFFER: Right.

11 MS. LYONS: It will be the darker
12 colors.

13 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Even if you
14 looked down at the bottom of the chart, you can see a
15 different color between the two yellows.

16 MS. LYONS: Right, but you can see where
17 a lot of it is going to be consolidated.

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Right. The red
19 ones are going to become the dark ones.

20 MS. LYONS: Right. So we have a lot
21 more where -- Tahquitz Canyon and Andreas.

22 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. So why is
23 that land there, let's say, where the purple is -- why
24 is there much difference in the value of it if it's
25 all being restricted in -- no?

1 MR. HAVERT: Topography and access and
2 things like that. The purple on the far right is
3 essentially land along the Dunn Road, and it's flatter
4 in character and --

5 MS. LYONS: The other --

6 MR. HAVERT: Most of the BLM land is --

7 MS. LYONS: More valuable? Mountainous.

8 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Is the purple
9 land privately owned land?

10 MR. HAVERT: It was private, and the
11 Tribe purchased it from the privately owned.

12 MR. CRITES: Much of it was owned by the
13 Lovekin (phonetic spelling) estate in a huge bunch of
14 sections that provided really enough land for major --

15 MS. LYONS: Development, and we
16 purchased it from them.

17 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Allison, what
18 did you say was going to happen to the purple land?

19 MS. SHAFFER: It would be transferred to
20 BLM.

21 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: From you folks?

22 MS. LYONS: Right, and the BLM land
23 would be Agua Caliente's. And we purchased it because
24 we didn't want anything happening there, first of all.
25 The community doesn't want anything happening there,

1 but it was good for us to purchase it for land we do
2 want.

3 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Right, because
4 there's no consolidation with you over there.

5 MS. LYONS: Right.

6 MR. CRITES: Just to follow up to make
7 it easier for people to remember why I'm not here the
8 next time, a lot of land that's now BLM was bought
9 with water conservation funds. People worked very
10 hard, a lot of organizations in this room, to get that
11 land. It should be something BLM tries their very
12 best to make sure that they don't end up, in essence,
13 sending a bunch of land water conservation money
14 indirectly right back to Washington. And they can do
15 that by making sure that the tribal exchange ends up
16 with as many acres as possible to match up dollar for
17 dollar so that there's not a 25-percent disparity.

18 MS. LYONS: I don't think the Tribe is
19 trying to do that either. I think we want to match it
20 as best as possible because, I mean, for us, we don't
21 have to be putting out the cash. It's best for land
22 exchange instead of cash.

23 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: But I understand
24 your word of caution there. Yes?

25 MR. HAVERT: Just to follow up, if it

1 came down to there being a significant monetary
2 discrepancy from the appraisal, then another
3 alternative in lieu of the cash is that the Tribe
4 could go purchase some additional lands outside the
5 reservation and add those to the exchange. So that
6 would be another way to get there and keep things --

7 MS. LYONS: I think that's part of the
8 secondary phase part. We may still owe land, and
9 that's something we'd have to do later down the road.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. Please
11 help us here.

12 MS. OLINGER: Forest Service does a lot
13 of time exchanges as well. They are time-consuming,
14 as Allison articulated, and the main goal is to
15 consolidate for easier management. When you have
16 these kind of checkerboard situations, it's hard on
17 any land, even if you've got an over-arching mission
18 for conservation to manage that, if nothing else, to
19 post your boundaries and see that the posting is
20 maintained.

21 I think the question that was asked earlier
22 about what the legislation says is really key because
23 there is some legislation that talks about the ability
24 to offset with cash. And then possibly there is
25 legislation that says where that cash could go in some

1 sectors in San Bernardino National Forest.

2 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I don't ever
3 remember seeing that. Do any of you remember seeing
4 that?

5 MS. LYONS: It could be an agreement
6 between BLM and Agua Caliente. I believe that's where
7 it's at.

8 MS. EVANS: Or if there is some cash
9 equalization, if you want make it value for value,
10 it's very difficult to accomplish just because all
11 land is not created equal. The cash equalizations are
12 some way for that to stay, and I don't want to tell
13 John -- I don't want to complicate John's life. But
14 we've had that ability based on legislation. That's
15 why I was wondering what was in the actual
16 legislation. I would expect these guys to know what's
17 actually in the legislation.

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Maybe it's Katie
19 that knows. She just came in. Jeff?

20 MR. MORGAN: The current administration,
21 which fortunately doesn't have too much longer to
22 run --

23 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We don't need
24 any editorial comments.

25 MR. MORGAN: -- changed the way that

1 money that was acquired by local field offices of BLM.
2 It used to be able to stay within that field office to
3 purchase other lands, and the administration fairly
4 recently changed this policy so that any money
5 collected by BLM goes back to the treasury.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Unless it's in
7 the agreement.

8 MR. MORGAN: Unless it's specifically
9 specified in the acquisition of something else.

10 MR. CRITES: Goes directly back there?

11 MR. MORGAN: Yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Could you make a
13 note of this and sometime in the next six months, but
14 hopefully one month, e-mail everybody with whether or
15 not that was in the agreement or not?

16 MR. KALISH: Yeah. We'll do that.
17 We'll research the agreement and give the answer to
18 the question.

19 CHAIRPERSON MUTH: Just that.

20 MR. KALISH: Whether or not were there
21 to be any excess funds, is it identified where those
22 funds are to be used or how they could be used? The
23 goal obviously is to maximize all monies through the
24 land exchange process for the furtherance of the
25 National Monument, and that's throughout the process.

1 And there's creative ways, like you were talking
2 about, that that can be done to ensure the Monument
3 stays local even if it isn't identified, that there's
4 a feasible way through the agreements or through the
5 legislation to do that. So we will research that and
6 then get back to everybody with that information.

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you.

8 Gary?

9 MR. WATTS: Yeah. Backing away from
10 this hot stove, Allison, the very upper-left section
11 with the rectangle and the square and the little
12 parcels.

13 MS. SHAFFER: These?

14 MR. WATTS: Yes, that one. Two-part
15 question. Number one, is that the Tribe's section
16 surrounding those parcels?

17 MS. SHAFFER: Yes, sir.

18 MR. WATTS: Number two, curiosity
19 question more than anything. You may not have the
20 answer, but why is there such goofy ownership in that
21 section as compared to the others which appear to be
22 complete ownerships?

23 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Barb, do you
24 know?

25 MS. LYONS: No. I don't recall the

1 history of why that was. I know in Section 2 -- and I
2 don't know if that's Section 2 -- the federal
3 government decided to give half to the Tribe and half
4 to Las Palmas residents.

5 MR. HAVERT: There were many instances
6 where the land, instead of being given to the Tribe as
7 tribal trust land, it was allotted to individual
8 members of the Tribe or even other bands, and they
9 were able to sell it.

10 MS. LYONS: Yeah, but it would still be
11 reservation. Whether or not it's a fee or trust, it's
12 still reservation, so it would still be the whole
13 orange. It wouldn't be open like that. That happens
14 when the federal government might have done something
15 when, like I said, Section 2 -- I think half of it
16 went to fee. Half of it was in the Tribe, and so we
17 only got half that section because --

18 MR. HAVERT: Yeah. And individual
19 Cahuillas may have sold their parcels so it was sold
20 by non-Indians, in which case eventually BLM for
21 whatever reason came to have that land through an
22 acquisition from those people, or it might have even
23 been -- there's many ways it could have happened, so
24 now it's time to go back.

25 MR. WATTS: I don't want to belabor

1 this. Just curious.

2 MR. MORGAN: Quick comment. Those
3 sections north and west of the area are very heavily
4 parcelized. If you look at the plot map, they're
5 20-acre, 30-acre parcels. You might have 20, 30
6 different owners within one section, particularly that
7 section, and Section 18, I think, as well.

8 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Please, Bob.

9 MR. BROCKMAN: Is this a matter in which
10 the committee is ultimately going to be asked to make
11 a recommendation?

12 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I believe this
13 is information only. I don't believe that we would
14 make a recommendation on this.

15 MR. BROCKMAN: Okay.

16 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Reports,
17 updates, presentations. We're being presentated.
18 Buford.

19 MR. CRITES: I think certainly BLM and
20 Tribe deserve a lot of hoorah for undertaking this
21 remarkably complex task, especially on BLM's side with
22 limited staff to do all this stuff.

23 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: And I think it
24 was refreshing to make the positive comments which you
25 initially brought up. It seems like that's been

1 pretty paramount in everybody's thinking as we move
2 forward. We don't want our money to go to Washington
3 in any way, shape or form.

4 MS. SHAFFER: If I could jump in with
5 another reiteration, these parcels down here are the
6 only two parcels that have been specifically
7 identified in any document for, you know, gross
8 transfer to the BLM, and it's only for Phase 1 that
9 any parcels have been identified to date because more
10 properties would need to be transferred to be able to
11 be transferred to the BLM. So it does seem like a lot
12 of properties for something very little. But again it
13 depends on appraised values. Those are the only two
14 that have been identified to date.

15 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. So in
16 other words the entire land swap is not before us
17 right here.

18 MS. SHAFFER: We don't know what it's
19 going to be yet. This is just the only parcels that
20 have been identified for Phase 1.

21 MS. LYONS: Phase 1.

22 MS. SHAFFER: And on another note, the
23 folks that I've been working with over at the Tribe
24 have been just very nice to work with and have been
25 very helpful in this process as well, especially to a

1 new person such as myself.

2 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Barbara told
3 them they had to be.

4 MS. LYONS: All our staff is that way.
5 They're very, very helpful. All our staff is that
6 way.

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Buford.

8 MR. CRITES: Being that all this is in
9 the National Monument, could the Tribe purchase land
10 on the Forest Service side of the boundary that are
11 privately owned and use those as part of the trade to
12 BLM in, let's say, Phase 2?

13 MS. LYONS: If it's privately owned, I
14 think we could.

15 MS. SHAFFER: I believe that both the
16 RMP and the act allow for that.

17 MR. CRITES: Okay.

18 MS. SHAFFER: I believe they could be
19 outside the boundary, but again I'd have to look into
20 it and double-check for you.

21 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Is that outside
22 the boundary of the Monument?

23 MR. CRITES: No, outside the BLM
24 elevational boundary, which really which makes what is
25 being done meaningless.

1 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Any other
2 comments or questions? Anybody out there get confused
3 on anything? Okay. If not, Allison, thank you very
4 much.

5 MS. SHAFFER: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Update on the
7 Advisory Committee nominations and appointments.
8 John, you get to handle this one.

9 MS. ROSENTHAL: Actually, he's Jim.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. John,
11 Jim.

12 MS. ROSENTHAL: It's just reading this.

13 MR. KALISH: What Jim Foote did was
14 spend quite a bit of time providing us directions and
15 information as to how to run this meeting in
16 anticipation of his being gone. And we're on page --

17 MS. ROSENTHAL: Two, after Ally's
18 presentation.

19 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Hey, I've got
20 one too.

21 MR. KALISH: All right. "The nomination
22 application package was sent to the BLM state office
23 on July 7th. A joint letter of submission by the
24 state director and regional forester was prepared, and
25 the package was forwarded to the Washington office on

1 August 14. In each of the members' packets is
2 information about the timeframe for MAC appointments
3 as well as a flowchart showing how the packages were
4 to be routed. MAC members have seen this information
5 before, so this is just a reminder."

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We each had one
7 of these in our packets.

8 MS. ROSENTHAL: The very beginning of
9 your packet.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Takes about ten
11 years to get an appointment.

12 MR. KALISH: Look at the color of the
13 flowchart.

14 MR. HAVERT: Is there supposed to be ten
15 pages?

16 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Just follow the
17 arrows.

18 MS. LYONS: A little over a year, it
19 takes.

20 MR. MORGAN: A lot more than a year, I
21 think.

22 MR. KALISH: "MAC members have been sent
23 this information before, so it was just a reminder.
24 According to the sheet showing the timeframe for
25 appointments, it would take 180 days from submission

1 to the state office, which occurred July 7th, to date
2 of appointment. Hence appointments could be expected
3 in early January."

4 MS. LYONS: Do you have a December
5 meeting?

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: No. We have a
7 meeting twice a year, so we won't meet again now
8 until -- I believe it's probably March.

9 MR. KALISH: Okay. "And on the second
10 page of the roll call sheet is a list of primary and
11 alternate positions that will remain vacant because no
12 nomination applications were received for any of
13 them."

14 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I'd like to
15 interject there and find out, do you know of anybody
16 in your area that's going, Dawn, that's going to
17 apply?

18 MS. WELLMAN: Do you know, Ruth?

19 MS. WATLING: No, I don't. We can
20 request.

21 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: You did?

22 MS. WATLING: I did, yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: You've already
24 applied?

25 MS. WATLING: But we need a backup.

1 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Oh, an
2 alternate?

3 MS. WATLING: An alternate.

4 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Yeah. That
5 alternate idea we had was good. It's just not working
6 and creating bigger problems than -- pardon me?

7 MR. CRITES: You said it would work.

8 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I was not the
9 one that said it would work. You said it would work.
10 Buford, have you recommended somebody from your city
11 council?

12 MR. CRITES: No, ma'am.

13 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Is there a
14 chance you might be able to do that?

15 MR. CRITES: Yes, ma'am.

16 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Would you do
17 that within the next 368 days so we could start the
18 process again.

19 MR. CRITES: Yes, ma'am.

20 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you.
21 Gary?

22 MR. WATTS: Yes. I understand there's
23 an application already in the pipeline from Garrett,
24 the superintendent of Mt. San Jacinto; is that
25 correct?

1 MS. ROSENTHAL: I believe so.

2 MR. WATTS: Originally he was supposed
3 to be the alternate, but we'll have to go through it
4 again when my replacement gets named. But we do have
5 hopefully some continuity going. It depends on how
6 long the 368 days take.

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: And your
8 alternate or your next appointment --

9 MS. LYONS: Or delegate, actually;
10 right?

11 MS. OLINGER: Yes.

12 MS. LYONS: I was supposed to designate
13 an alternate on council or staff, I believe.

14 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Don't your folks
15 have to go through the appointment process also?

16 MS. LYONS: Uh-huh. I think -- well, I
17 don't know if we had an alternate already appointed,
18 and I don't know if they're up yet.

19 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay.

20 MR. MORGAN: I would suggest we get Jim
21 Foote to send a memo out.

22 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: He has sent a
23 bunch of them on this, so --

24 MR. KALISH: I can continue to read on.

25 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay.

1 MR. KALISH: Appointment for Buford
2 Crites. And it may be explained in Jim's -- "Bob
3 Brockman, Barbara Gonzales-Lyons, Al Muth, Dawn
4 Wellman expire on December 16th. The nomination
5 applications for reappointment of Bob and Al were
6 submitted, and applications for new representatives of
7 the other positions of City of Palm Desert, Agua
8 Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians and Pinyon Community
9 Council were submitted. The process for next call for
10 nominations will begin before month's end, as five
11 more appointments will expire on July 21, 2009.

12 "So only three of the five positions are
13 currently occupied, these positions are for the City
14 of Cathedral City, Coachella Valley Mountains
15 Conservancy, County of Riverside, Winter Park
16 Authority and City of Indian Wells."

17 That's all that Jim wanted us to hear.

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. Thank
19 you.

20 MS. ROSENTHAL: Any questions anybody
21 wants to know the answer to that Jim could send out
22 something? The next part -- why don't you read them,
23 and we're going to go over what's in your packets, and
24 I'll hold it up, and you can describe what it is.

25 MR. KALISH: "The next agenda item is an

1 update on the new Monument trail map and brochure.
2 Since the MAC meeting in March, these two products
3 have been printed. Each current member should have
4 already received both products in the mail. The
5 packets contain an article from the Press Enterprise
6 about the new trail map. Note that Buford's age is
7 provided under his picture. Apparently it's important
8 to highlight the younger residents."

9 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Is that all you
10 are?

11 MR. CRITES: Was.

12 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: It was how old
13 you were. Well --

14 MR. KALISH: "There's also a sheet in
15 the packet that shows the layout for a page in the
16 upcoming October issue of Palm Springs Life magazine.
17 The new Monument brochure will be included along with
18 the issue. It can be removed from the magazine. Also
19 of interest is our development of an electronic
20 version of the new Monument brochure. The E-brochure
21 was developed by Palm Springs Life magazine and is
22 housed on their web page. Links to the E-brochure are
23 provided on the BLM and Forest Service web pages as
24 well as the Friend of the Desert Mountains web page.

25 "After the E-brochure was developed, I," as

1 in Jim, "requested all organizations represented here
2 to include the link in their respective web pages.
3 Kudos to the Cities of Rancho Mirage and Indian Wells
4 for linking up. Others may have lately included the
5 link, but if not, I ask that the MAC members follow
6 through. At this point it may be a good idea to
7 identify the remaining items in the packet."

8 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Those are
9 asides.

10 MS. ROSENTHAL: You can just call me
11 Vanna.

12 MR. KALISH: Hey, I'm speaking to you.
13 "A Press Enterprise article regarding a study
14 conducted in the Monument of Deep Canyon that revealed
15 how plants are migrating to higher elevation as
16 temperatures have risen. Al Muth can provide
17 additional insight on this study."

18 MR. HAVERT: Were he here.

19 MR. KALISH: Were he to be here, and
20 that obviously was an aside, given the current
21 circumstances. I've got to sort out what's an aside
22 here. He made things very complicated.

23 "Following the P.E. article described above
24 is another article regarding up-slope vegetation
25 migration as the climate warms. The next item shows

1 graffiti removal along Santa Rosa Mountain Road as
2 conducted by Lee Beyer. Now that the Monument has
3 purchased sandblasting equipment, we should be able to
4 keep up with removing graffiti as it occurs."

5 I've seen it out in the back ware yard, and
6 it is a very nice piece of equipment.

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Has it been used
8 yet?

9 MS. LYONS: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: On these? Oh,
11 yeah. I see the before-and-after pictures.

12 MR. KALISH: "Related to the previous
13 topic, included in a report on graffiti at Vista Point
14 on Highway 74, Caltrans has been doing a good job of
15 removing the graffiti in a timely manner, as well as
16 keeping up with the trash collections. Lee Beyer
17 assists with trash collection and graffiti removal as
18 time permits. However the trash thrown over the edge
19 of the hill continues to be a tougher challenge."

20 And is there a photo of that?

21 MS. ROSENTHAL: Yes, unfortunately.

22 MR. KALISH: Jim states that he "will be
23 scheduling regularly occurring trash cleanup for the
24 down-slope areas hopefully using volunteers to take on
25 this project. We cannot, however, use volunteers to

1 clean up the roadsides on Highway 74 as the road is
2 too narrow and the potential of serious injury too
3 great.

4 "The next item is the Monument events
5 overview from 2008 and 2009 printed on front and back,
6 so don't miss Page 2. As indicated, for more
7 information call the number provided, as it is the
8 telephone number of the Visitor Center.

9 "And finally the last item is one more
10 Press Enterprise article about the Thursday morning
11 hike program conducted by Friends of the Desert
12 Mountains from the Monument Visitor Center. The
13 online version of the story has a link to a slide show
14 that was narrated by Drew Leander, one of the Friends
15 and Monument volunteers and is also a good link for
16 downloading a podcast version to your ipod. This is
17 one of the interpretive techniques we hope to develop
18 in the near future, i.e., providing downloadable
19 podcasts at the Visitor Center that cover a variety of
20 subjects. And these could also be made available on
21 our website.

22 "And the remaining agenda items are
23 straightforward. Please remind everybody the next MAC
24 meeting is March 16, 2009, same time, same place."

25 MS. ROSENTHAL: Good job, Jim.

1 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: The only problem
2 is, he got to the end of the meeting and we're not
3 quite there yet.

4 MR. HAVERT: That's okay.

5 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Did anybody have
6 any questions on any of those things, those issues? I
7 just can't help commenting when I see the graffiti so
8 predominantly in front of us as we used to see it all
9 the time, and members of other boards. It's so
10 disheartening and so destructive to our entire
11 community. The only thing we can do is spend time,
12 energy and money and get out there and take care of
13 it. And someday I'd like to see the figure printed in
14 the paper, the hundreds of millions of dollars that's
15 spent yearly on just getting rid of graffiti and maybe
16 correlate that with how many soccer teams and sports
17 teams and skate parks and other facilities, senior
18 centers, could be built and operated with the loss of
19 expense of taking care of graffiti. I think it's -- I
20 can't comprehend it, I guess.

21 With that, we're just one minute away from
22 four o'clock, and I do remember seeing in my notes
23 here that we must stop at four o'clock. I think I saw
24 for a break, but it was actually for public comments.
25 Are you chiming in on public comment?

1 MR. CRITES: I'll just take one minute
2 and give the Friends of the Mountain report real
3 quick.

4 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay.

5 MR. CRITES: Just to let the folks know
6 about the area of the National Monument south of
7 Highway 74, Santa Rosa Mountain, that area down
8 towards springs, Joan Taylor this last year went up
9 and did some work at the Agua Alta Spring that
10 somebody had turn the faucet on and literally turned
11 the spring off, and the only water in that area had
12 disappeared for some time. The faucet is no longer
13 workable. The government has done some disruption of
14 alternate agriculture in the southern part of the
15 National Monument, and so that's tended to.

16 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: In other words
17 the pot's gone.

18 MS. ROSENTHAL: Marijuana is gone,
19 marijuana eradication.

20 MR. CRITES: On Santa Rosa Mountain the
21 Forest Service has completed a comprehensive
22 archaeological survey of the entire mountain and spent
23 several weeks with folks up there looking at all the
24 cultural resources, both recent history and further
25 back. Friends of the Mountains along with Forest

1 Service and BLM have taken three volunteer days this
2 summer up the mountain and have cleaned up the yellow
3 post sites and the trash, all kinds of things and done
4 a really superb job up there making it more inviting
5 for campers.

6 Tim Dunfee and the BLM fire folk have
7 worked on looking at a rescue area on top of the
8 mountain near the upper campground for campers in case
9 of a fire. They've worked on fire clearance issues
10 near the what is called the Nightingale Cabin. And a
11 group of them a week and a half ago put a brand-new
12 deck on the front of that cabin made out of Trex, the
13 non-burnable material, and so they've been incredibly
14 good partners with Friends and others in terms of
15 working on the mountain.

16 They're also working to rehab the old
17 3,000-4,000-gallon tank that's up at the cabin so we
18 have some fire water up at the top of the mountain
19 available for us.

20 MS. WATLING: Is it white or wood color?

21 MR. CRITES: It is gray, which is the
22 perfect color of the cabin area, so yeah. And as
23 noted, the graffiti removal -- and Jim Foote got
24 really going with Forest Service folks and BLM, and
25 the road now is cleaned up, which tends to not attract

1 graffiti, and I think just really good work. So
2 compliments to both BLM and Forest Service and
3 especially fire folks and archeologists for taking
4 that half of the Monument and really putting in a lot
5 of good time this year.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Wow. That's
7 great.

8 MR. HAVERT: I'll add real quickly to
9 that that already two properties along Highway 74 and
10 a couple of other properties in sort of between Palm
11 Canyon and Highway 74 that are currently in escrow
12 that the Friends are purchasing the grants from the
13 conservancy, and then there are some other parcels
14 that have been acquired down in the Santa Rosa
15 Wilderness with grant funds to the Friends from the
16 Resources Legacy Fund Foundation, and that's an
17 ongoing program that there's almost always a few new
18 parcels down there being acquired.

19 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: If there's any
20 comments, I'm going to hold them because we're now a
21 little past our time for public comment. We'll break
22 at this time for public comment. I don't see that
23 anybody filled out a form, so I have no official
24 requests. Is there anybody out there that would like
25 to make an unofficial request to comment at this time?

1 Okay. Seeing none, then we'll continue on
2 with the agenda. I would like to just take a second.
3 I'm hoping that Mr. Muth gets here. You indicated he
4 was on his way. Do you know that for a fact?

5 MR. CRITES: I know for a fact that he
6 said he was going to be on his way to be here and he
7 was leaving to come here.

8 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Unfortunately I
9 have had something to come up and I do need to leave
10 no later than 5:45, a quarter till six. Jim won't let
11 you call the meeting early.

12 MR. CRITES: Oh, yeah. We did that two
13 years ago.

14 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Well, I was just
15 going ask you to take over for me, Buford.

16 MR. CRITES: In that case, we can't.

17 MS. LYONS: As long as you get through
18 public comment and the agenda.

19 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. Well,
20 we're through public comments. And the way I see it,
21 right after that is a report from Katie on an update
22 on the Coachella Valley Multiple Species Habitat
23 Conservation Plan, Santa Rosa and San Jacinto
24 Mountains Trails Plan.

25 MS. BARROWS: In the interest of time

1 would anybody like to ask any questions?

2 CHAIRMAN HENDERSON: Well, I do have a
3 question. This article that was in the paper recently
4 about a new habitat plans for bighorn. It was only
5 about a month or so, not even that long ago, something
6 about 800 -- 36,000 acres, and this was, like, adding
7 33,000 or 88. Anyway, I couldn't understand it.

8 MS. BARROWS: Should I stand over here?

9 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: If you would.

10 MS. BARROWS: Katie Barrows from the
11 Coachella Valley Association of Governments. Thank
12 you for the chance to be here. The question about the
13 critical habitat designation, the Fish and Wildlife
14 Service is in the process of redesignating, and Jeff
15 may need to chime in here, but basically they are
16 looking at a new designation of critical habitat which
17 they've been working on. The parcel refers to a
18 proposed critical habitat designation that they have
19 circulated now. I don't know, Jeff, what the comment
20 period is.

21 MR. MORGAN: The comment period is still
22 open.

23 MS. BARROWS: Right. So I think it's in
24 later October. But essentially what they have done is
25 do a new analysis to identify critical habitat, and

1 just last week they had a meeting at the Living
2 Desert, a public meeting to solicit comments on that
3 proposal. And they, I believe, are submitting written
4 comments through October. I can't say that I could
5 explain to you exactly the implications of that right
6 now.

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: What it says is
8 that they're talking about adding 36,000 acres of
9 protected habitat. And then the group noted that
10 there are 384,000 of protected range, and they're
11 going to add 36, but there's a controversy because
12 that's less than half of the 845 that was designated.
13 But the 845 that was designated, my question is, was
14 there the opportunity to do the kind of reformulating,
15 if you will, with new information to change the 845,
16 or is that written in stone?

17 MR. MORGAN: The end result of the
18 direction that the Fish and Wildlife Service was given
19 is to cut critical habitat in half.

20 MS. WELLMAN: I thought you said that
21 they were adding. They're cutting it in half?

22 MR. MORGAN: Yeah. They took about half
23 of it away, and then after comments they received so
24 far, they've added a bit back. But it's still only
25 half of what it was before.

1 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Apparently the
2 way I read this article, the court must have order 845
3 acres at some point to be critical habitat.

4 MR. MORGAN: There's no court.

5 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: No court. Okay.
6 Whoever ordered it. Somebody ordered it. And I guess
7 Fish and Game.

8 MR. CRITES: Fish and Wildlife.

9 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Fish and
10 Wildlife has 384 currently. They're going to add 36,
11 and then that, in their mind, is it. And there's a
12 dispute because that's less than the 845 that was
13 ordered by someone.

14 MR. HAVERT: Not ordered. The original
15 800 and whatever it was, was the original proposal by
16 the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to designate
17 critical habitat for bighorn sheep. After they came
18 out with that some years back, there were challenges
19 to it. As a result of those challenges, Fish and
20 Wildlife decided they had to go back and redo critical
21 habitat. And as Jeff pointed out, they basically cut
22 it in half.

23 Then there were comments on that, and as a
24 result, they are now adding a small amount back in.
25 So the net result is a major change from the original

1 designation some years back.

2 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay.

3 MR. CRITES: And almost all of the added
4 critical habitat is a portion of the habitat that had
5 been deleted from the original proposal.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Deleted from the
7 845?

8 MR. CRITES: Right, so 845 down to this,
9 and then a little of that has come back.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Right.

11 MR. CRITES: Oddly enough, the City of
12 La Quinta is directly adjacent to one of the very few,
13 if not only, areas that was not in the original
14 critical habitat listing that has been added. And
15 that is the area between La Quinta and Palm Desert.
16 And remarkably enough, it happens to follow exactly
17 the delineation of the proposed trail from La Quinta
18 to Palm Desert. I'm sure there is no reason that --
19 even though sheep have never been seen there. It
20 wasn't part of anybody's original thing -- that now it
21 has become remarkably important.

22 MS. LYONS: For the sheep.

23 MR. CRITES: For the sheep, yeah, I'm
24 sure it is for that and for no other reason.

25 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: You must have

1 really made someone angry.

2 MR. CRITES: I think probably we can
3 even guess whom.

4 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Dawn.

5 MS. WELLMAN: Is there somewhere we can
6 get a map to see what's being added and taken way?

7 MR. MORGAN: Yeah.

8 MS. WELLMAN: Who do you contact?

9 MR. MORGAN: Fish and Wildlife Service
10 in Carlsbad. It's on the computer. If you go to
11 their website, you can see what it is now and what
12 it's going to be and what it might be. But remember,
13 these are just proposals. It's not accomplished.

14 MS. WELLMAN: But it's still open for
15 public comment?

16 MR. MORGAN: And how that came about
17 with the original 850 acres is -- whatever it was, was
18 when the peninsular bighorn sheep were declared
19 endangered, a recovery team was formed to develop a
20 recovery plan, and their recommendations were taken up
21 by Fish and Wildlife Service when they designated the
22 original critical habitat.

23 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. Thank
24 you. All right. And while you're there, did you want
25 to just add anything on?

1 MS. BARROWS: On the critical habitat?

2 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Well, just --

3 MS. BARROWS: Jim asked me to come to
4 give you a really brief update on the status of trails
5 element in terms of multiple species plan. So I think
6 most of you are familiar that for eons we've been
7 working on a multiple species plan for the Coachella
8 Valley, and that's an over-arching conservation plan
9 that includes most of the Monument, not all of it but
10 most of it, as part of that plan that is Santa Rosa
11 and San Jacinto Mountain trails plan, which could be
12 implemented in a cooperative way with Monument
13 Advisory Committee, BLM and all of the agency staff
14 represented.

15 We're right now at the final, final. We're
16 within weeks of actually finally getting the Multiple
17 Species Plan finished, and we feel so confident about
18 that because this has never happened before where
19 we've just been weeks away from getting it done.
20 However, the State Department of Fish and Game
21 actually did issue the final permit on the plan last
22 week, and they're about to issue a press release
23 announcing that. That's very good news.

24 The Fish and Wild Service is telling us
25 with all confidence that they are going to give us a

1 permit by October 1st, so we're very close to having
2 that plan in place, and we're assuming everything is
3 going to go according to schedule.

4 What that means is we finally, after
5 planning for 12, 13, some number of years that those
6 of us who have been involved for a long time care not
7 to admit, we are actually going to start implementing
8 the Multiple Species Plan, and in particular that has
9 a lot of significance with regard to trails because
10 there's a lot of pieces of the trails issues that
11 we've been kind of waiting to kind of work on and
12 address for quite some time.

13 From that standpoint -- I don't want to go
14 into a great deal of detail because I think a lot of
15 you are already familiar. But essentially the trails
16 plan for the Santa Rosa/San Jacinto Mountains involve
17 a number of key things. One is a research program to
18 look at trails and bighorn sheep, the impact of
19 bighorn sheep, the impact of bighorn sheep on trails
20 and the impact of trails on bighorn sheep. So that's
21 our research program that we would be initiating. And
22 we would be anticipating working very closely with the
23 Monument Advisory Committee in putting that research
24 program together.

25 That will be overseen by the Coachella

1 Valley Conservation Commission, which for some of you
2 is a new agency. This is the agency that is created
3 to implement the Multiple Species Plan. It's actually
4 been in place for a couple of years. It is made up of
5 representatives of all of the cities and the
6 permittees, the water district and the County of
7 Riverside, as well as Imperial Irrigation District.
8 So elected officials -- actually, your Chair sits on
9 the Monument Advisory Committee as a representative of
10 the -- sorry, Terry. Is it fourth?

11 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Supervisor
12 Tavaglione.

13 MS. BARROWS: Thank you. Second
14 district.

15 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I don't know. I
16 always flub it up too.

17 MS. BARROWS: And we have obviously a
18 number of permittees involved. I certainly appreciate
19 all of the support and help we've gotten from all of
20 you over the years in getting this together. State
21 Parks is a permittee under this plan. Mountains
22 Conservancy is a permittee under this plan. All of
23 the cities are. The Forest Service, Fish and Game,
24 BLM and all of the agencies are partners in that
25 effort.

1 And what I wanted to share with you in
2 terms of the trails is, we are already underway with
3 getting the implementation of the trails plan going,
4 happening. We have a trails management subcommittee
5 that's basically provided for in the plan, and that
6 includes representatives from all the cities, the
7 County, Mountains Conservancy, the BLM, all of the
8 agencies involved. And we have asked, and I think now
9 gotten, most of the appointments for those agencies
10 made. There may be a few of you that we need to catch
11 up with, but we're trying to get everybody appointed
12 to that subcommittee. The Coachella Valley
13 Conservation Commission will ultimately appoint five
14 members, and hopefully they will do that in the next
15 month or so.

16 Basically that committee is going to work
17 with the CVCC, with BLM, with all of the participating
18 agencies on getting the trails plan in place. And we
19 really are looking forward to that. I've been
20 coordinating with Jim. We're trying to look at
21 scheduling a meeting, hopefully getting all the
22 appointments made as soon as we get the permit in
23 October. Maybe by November or thereabouts we could
24 actually have the group meet.

25 I think the intent is, that group will be

1 involved in the implementation of the trails plan,
2 everything from looking at the research program to a
3 couple of other pieces.

4 One of the significant pieces that we will
5 need your help on is, we're going to put into place a
6 voluntary permit system on a number of trails. That
7 would be basically like what you have now with the top
8 of the tram or elsewhere, where folks just sign in
9 with some kind of voluntary permit. It helps to give
10 us an idea of use on the trails but also helps to keep
11 track of people. And if they're missing, we can
12 figure out maybe where they are. So on that permit
13 system, we're going to need a lot of feedback,
14 especially from the expertise in this room on what
15 would be workable.

16 We are going to have to take a look at the
17 dog issue and how we implement control of dogs on
18 trails. I know that's something you've already dealt
19 with, and we'll continue to work with trail user
20 groups and so forth.

21 We have some restrictions on trails. Most
22 of those are seasonal restrictions. Basically this
23 research program is one where we would be getting
24 information from that research program and ultimately
25 working with the MAC and the trails committee and

1 others to put together a trails management plan that's
2 probably going to be five, ten years in the offing,
3 but I think our initial interest is, what are some of
4 the key things that we need to do in terms of trails
5 to get things off the ground?

6 I just wanted to mention as an aside, it's
7 not strictly under your purview, but the CVCC, the
8 Coachella Valley Conservation Commission, has also
9 asked that that trails committee deal with trails
10 valley-wide in the conservation area. So it's going
11 to interface with many of you who are involved in
12 other agencies.

13 We have a position on the trails committee
14 for the tribal representatives, for the Tramway
15 Authority, for the County and actually all of the
16 cities. So we want to make sure -- and actually Jeff
17 has been appointed to represent the Monument Advisory
18 Committee. So we'll just be keeping you -- we are
19 going to keep him busy.

20 So we just wanted to make sure you're up to
21 date on that and that, as I say, we're anxious to get
22 going and have the first meeting, giving people some
23 background and starting to look at some of the things
24 that have been kind of outstanding with regard to
25 trails, and we can get underway. Yes?

1 MS. WELLMAN: Are these hiking trails or
2 bicycle? What kinds of trails?

3 MS. BARROWS: All of the trails, really,
4 that are on the new Monument map are trails that under
5 the Multiple Species Plan become officially authorized
6 trails, if you will. So by the Multiple Species Plan,
7 we have a list of all those trails, and they could be
8 a combination of hiking trails, equestrian trails,
9 mountain-biking trails, all of the trails that are
10 used in the Santa Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains. And
11 if am I correct about that, the map has all of the
12 trails that are in the Multiple Species Plan, and
13 those are essentially the recognized trails.

14 So there are issues, like some trails -- we
15 have in some areas trails that need to be removed.
16 You've got multiple trails established. We want to
17 look at what trails might be decommissioned or
18 rehabilitated or removed. And that's the kind of
19 thing the subcommittee will be working on. So it's
20 really all of the different ways in which trails get
21 used.

22 And in terms of the public membership, I
23 think you'll get representation through those folks
24 from the various trail user groups. Yes?

25 MR. KATES: You might want to tell

1 everybody where we are meeting as a subcommittee.

2 MS. BARROWS: We don't know that yet.
3 Are we meeting here? Actually we haven't set a
4 definite meeting schedule yet, only because we still
5 don't have all the appointees to the committee, and
6 I'm anticipating we are going to try to get that
7 finished up in October. Jim is going to be away, and
8 we're looking at tentatively having a meeting in
9 November, but we'll get word out to you. I suspect
10 we'll have a meeting either at BLM or CVAG, but we'll
11 get the word out.

12 At this point we won't be able to have a
13 full meeting until November. The CVCC will have to
14 officially act on the appointees so we can get that
15 done in the next few weeks. Anybody else want to add
16 anything on trails?

17 I was just going to next -- as an aside, I
18 happen to live in the city of La Quinta, and the City
19 of La Quinta is actually now hosting together some
20 monthly walks that are not necessarily in the National
21 Monument but adjacent in an open space area called the
22 Bear Creek Nature Preserve. It's a monthly nature
23 hike that involves some of the Monument lands. We're
24 working on coordinating with Jim and his staff and
25 Friends of the Desert Mountains just to make sure

1 folks are aware of those. But it seems like as we
2 move forward with trails issues, there are more and
3 more of those kinds of opportunities in the various
4 locations throughout the valley where trail
5 opportunities and hikes could be offered.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Any questions?
7 Thank you. Thank you for coming today and giving a
8 report.

9 MS. BARROWS: Sure.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Moving on,
11 Monument Communications Strategy, formerly known as
12 the Business Plan. Shelva, do you want to --

13 MS. NOBLES: I actually need to use the
14 Power Point machine.

15 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. Are we
16 there?

17 MS. NOBLES: Yeah. We're almost there.
18 I had to go in a different way.

19 CHAIRMAN HENDERSON: Shelva, we could
20 have another report given while you're still locating,
21 but are you there?

22 MS. NOBLES: I was there, but it's
23 telling me I can't access the drive, which is crazy
24 because it just told me it was there. But I can try
25 and talk while I'm doing this if you want me to.

1 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We were thinking
2 that we could go on and get the next report while you
3 continue to look for that. We're having some
4 technical problems. We're going to allow Shelva to
5 keep looking for her report, and we're going to go
6 ahead and take the next one, which is --

7 MS. NOBLES: I think I may have found
8 it. Okay. There it is.

9 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. My name
10 is Shelva Nobles. Thank you all for having me this
11 afternoon. This is kind of interesting because Jim is
12 not here, and I was like, "What am I supposed to do
13 again?" He said, "You'll be fine. It's fine." I was
14 like, "Okay." So hopefully it will be fine.

15 I've come from Washington D.C. on a detail
16 assignment from our Washington headquarters office to
17 work on the continuation of the Communications
18 Strategy, which was the former Business Plan, as we
19 called it. So it's now the Communications Strategy.
20 This is the marketing plan piece of it.

21 And with that being said -- I don't know
22 how to use this cool thing, so I'll go to --

23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's childproof.

24 MS. NOBLES: There it is. And I'm going
25 to abbreviate the whole Santa Rosa/San Jacinto

1 National --

2 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: That's fine.

3 MS. NOBLES: Thank you. The marketing
4 plan serves as a component piece of the Communications
5 Strategy, so it's that next step. And there are
6 currently four marketing strategies already in place
7 for the Monument that I was able to ascertain, and
8 that would be the website, which is the Friends of the
9 Desert Mountains, the brochure, which you all were
10 just told about that was just issued, the E-brochure,
11 which is actually online and the DVD, which is
12 wonderfully produced. I had an opportunity to view
13 the entire DVD. It's fantastic.

14 The objectives of creating this particular
15 marketing plan were to get more involvement from all
16 of the shareholders in the use of the Monument and
17 create a venue where we could -- I don't want to use
18 the word "solicit," but basically that's what it is,
19 soliciting more contributions and corporate
20 sponsorships, corporate gifts.

21 So this marketing plan consists of four
22 strategic areas of focus. The focus areas are,
23 increased exposure to the general public, increasing
24 adolescent involvement on the Monument, increasing
25 donations for addressing Monument priorities and

1 corporate level sponsorship.

2 So basically in the time that I've been
3 here -- I've been here about five weeks -- what I
4 noticed was that the Monument has a presence here in
5 the community. It's not as great of a presence on the
6 web.

7 So when I go into -- let's say I'm a person
8 coming into the area and I don't really know much
9 about the area and I'm looking for things to do. The
10 Monument is not the first thing that pops up if I'm
11 doing a web search. Joshua Tree pops up. The aerial
12 tramway pops up. There's other things that pop up but
13 not necessarily the Monument. And if we're going to
14 get to that end result of increasing donations and
15 corporate-level sponsorships, part of that is
16 increasing people's awareness, what it is does, what
17 it's for, who can use it, how to use it, those sorts
18 of things. And that's not just from a specialized or
19 specific group of the public population. It comes
20 from the more generalized public, and so you'll see
21 that as we go on.

22 This particular marketing plan, as I said,
23 has four component pieces. The first part is
24 increased public exposure. The second part is a
25 children's brochure. It's to complement this

1 brochure. The third part is a Monument quick
2 reference. And the fourth part is a major gifts kit.

3 So actually they're structured in order by
4 the cost that it would take to implement each piece.
5 So you see we go from low cost, no cost, all the way
6 to making sure we have money to implement that last
7 part.

8 Increasing the general public exposure.
9 The Monument receives the majority of its exposure
10 through the visitor centers, Palm Springs Life
11 magazine, the Desert Sun articles, the Palm Springs
12 Chamber of Commerce and various other local websites.
13 Web access exposure is very limited, though. And
14 currently the Friends of the Desert Mountains website
15 is linked through the partnering websites like Bureau
16 of Land Management, Forest Service and a limited
17 number of auxiliary sites like Palm Springs Life and
18 California State Parks, et cetera.

19 Exposure needs to be increased on general
20 public recreational and travel websites. This is a
21 free, no-cost first approach. It includes the
22 following recommendations. The first one I would
23 recommend is Trip Advisor. And again the reason I'm
24 recommending exposure through websites is because it
25 is a free, emphasizing, the word "free," or very

1 low-cost initiative. And usually what it just entails
2 is asking them, can we add a link through the website.

3 So Trip Advisor, there's a presence on Trip
4 Advisor. If anyone is not familiar, it's a very
5 highly used website by people who are traveling from
6 all over the world to a location. They'll go onto
7 this website. They can type in the location they're
8 going to visit, and they'll type in "things to do."
9 They'll look at a link that says "things to do."

10 What happens is under that particular area,
11 it will list things do in that area, and it will list
12 them in order by popularity. Popularity is determined
13 by how many people actually go onto that website and
14 populate it with actual information from having gone
15 to see that particular venue or event or whatever and
16 photos. So those things can be uploaded by the user.

17 So the recommendation is that we populate
18 the current listing with user reviews and photos to
19 increase the ranking on the popularity index.

20 Currently the Monument is ranked 55 out of 92, which
21 means that if you're the average traveller coming to
22 Palm Springs, Palm Desert area and you go onto this
23 particular website and you look for things to do, we
24 are not even in the top ten. So most people don't
25 scroll past 20, so if you're No. 55 out of 92, nine

1 times out of ten they're not even seeing it as being
2 something to do.

3 Very easy to do, something that can be done
4 by -- volunteers who have hiked the Monument or camped
5 on the Monument or used the Monument in any type of
6 way can easily go on there and populate that part of
7 the website and put pictures up as well.

8 Okay. The Monument website is not
9 referenced on the Palm Springs Convention and Visitors
10 Authority website given to the desert. I looked all
11 over that website, and we are not there, which is
12 really important because this is typically a
13 first-reference website.

14 When people are planning meetings or
15 conventions or events, they'll go to Convention and
16 Visitors website for that particular area to see what
17 are the things that they can recommend for their
18 attendees to do while they're in the area. And when
19 we don't have a presence there, they don't know we're
20 here to do things until they actually get their
21 attendees on-site. And at that point usually
22 attendees have made some type of an itinerary of what
23 they want to do when they're in a particular area.

24 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: They have a
25 higher profile website, PalmSpringsUSA.com, and you

1 might find it on there.

2 MS. NOBLES: I looked, and I didn't see
3 it on there. I'll go back and look again, but yeah,
4 that's one of the ways I ended up getting to the
5 desert. But actually what happens is, if I go in
6 and -- like, a Google search, if I type "Palm Springs
7 Convention and Visitors Bureau," that's the website
8 that comes up first.

9 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: The Convention
10 Visitors Bureau is completely different than the
11 Convention and Visitors whatever.

12 MS. NOBLES: Authority.

13 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Whatever the
14 other one is, authority.

15 MS. NOBLES: But they're linked in some
16 way. And so even not having a presence on one and
17 having a presence on the other still puts us at a
18 disadvantage because, if someone misses that first one
19 and they get to the second one and they don't see it,
20 they don't know that there are things there to do.

21 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: All right.
22 Well, I'll take care of that one.

23 MS. NOBLES: We're missing a valuable
24 portion of the recreational market share by not having
25 a presence, and we are not taking full advantage of

1 the recreational websites that cater to outdoor
2 enthusiasts. The Monument needs to have a link on the
3 following websites, and there's usually no cost
4 associated with this.

5 When I e-mailed or called these locations,
6 they said, "All you have to do is fill out a form
7 requesting you put a link on our website to yours."
8 And those would be the American Hiking Society, Desert
9 Trails Hiking Club, Coachella Valley Hiking Club,
10 Camping USA, Go Camping America and camping.com.
11 Those are all highly trafficked websites where we
12 don't have a presence as of yet.

13 All right. Increasing adolescent
14 involvement. The BLM is currently conducting the
15 Healthy Initiatives for Kids in the Environment, or
16 the HIKES program, in conjunction with local
17 elementary schools. This is a grant-funded program,
18 and it's being very highly used. It's very effective,
19 and there's also a Junior Guides program that's being
20 developed by the Monument office. Scott is doing that
21 for youth ages nine to 11 to help them make a
22 connection with the outdoors.

23 With that being said, we have this
24 wonderful brochure that has been produced. It's very
25 beautiful. I looked at it. I love the pictures.

1 It's very informative. But there's something missing
2 as far as the connection for children, and so the
3 proposal is that we create a children's brochure, not
4 as highly stylized, of course, as this one because
5 that's a lot of money, but it should be developed as a
6 companion piece to this particular brochure. And the
7 brochure would deliver interesting information about
8 things to do and see in a fun, child-friendly format.

9 And I have a mock-up for you. There it is.
10 Again, very basic, very simple but very child
11 friendly. It catches the attention of children. And
12 what we find is that a lot of times, particularly if
13 you have a family coming into the area to visit,
14 children may see something that their parents don't
15 see. And if you can capture the attention of the
16 child through a brochure, a lot of times they'll go to
17 their parents and say, "This looks like something I
18 want to go do," or, "This may be something that looks
19 fun for us to go do." And then you get them that way.

20 This has a couple of things involved.
21 There would be a list of things to do on the Monument,
22 highlights of the two particular programs that we just
23 talked about, the California Children's Outdoor Bill
24 of Rights, contact information. There are some
25 testimonials there from some children who have

1 actually done the HIKES program and things that
2 they've had to say about going through that program
3 and then a fun activity of some sort, because you
4 always want to keep the kids' attention.

5 Another thing we discussed is maybe having
6 a small give-away item at the Visitor Center so when
7 the children bring that brochure into the Visitor
8 Center, they receive a small token, a wooden coin, a
9 little magnifying glass, something of that nature,
10 very nominal in cost.

11 All right. Increasing donations.
12 Increased general public awareness of the Monument
13 will enable us to reach a broader audience
14 for generating donations that will help us to
15 accomplish the priorities as identified in the
16 Communications Strategy.

17 There's a fairly large number of priorities
18 that are identified in the Communications Strategy
19 that will need some money to make them happen. And
20 the suggestion is that development of a quick
21 reference guide for the Monument, and it would also
22 include information various activities available in
23 the easy-to-access format.

24 This is just a mock-up, kind of, of what we
25 were talking about. It's a very small, pocket-sized

1 quick reference guide. It's tabbed. You could have
2 tabs for every activity that you can do on the
3 Monument, and then you would have a tab on ways that
4 you can contribute or help on the Monument. So the
5 quick-reference guide would include tab on ways to get
6 involved with and support the Monument through
7 volunteering and donation opportunities.

8 And then corporate sponsorship. The
9 development of a corporate gifts program and
10 coordinating materials is essential to acquiring the
11 major ongoing financial support that the Monument
12 requires, outside of federal funding and what's
13 generated through Friends of the Desert Mountains.

14 And here we want to make a suggestion to
15 produce a set of compact informational cards that
16 highlight current priorities of the Monument that
17 would require corporate-level sponsorship. And when
18 we talk corporate-level sponsorship, we're talking
19 money upwards of \$10,000 and then at whatever
20 increments are agreed upon by the group.

21 These priorities would include but are not
22 limited to improving the peninsular bighorn sheep
23 habitat, eradication of invasive vegetation, replacing
24 camping facilities in certain areas, the Keenwild
25 helibase construction, improvements at Cahuilla

1 Tawanet Vista Point, et cetera. These are areas where
2 you'll need much larger monetary gifts in order to
3 accomplish some of that work.

4 And then you can do that through the
5 corporate sponsorship. And the mock-up for that looks
6 like -- and the idea behind that is what was done with
7 the golf tournament that the Friends of the Desert
8 Mountain does. I kind of saw that and thought of
9 doing something that was, again, very compact because
10 a lot of times people get a lot of materials,
11 particularly those being solicited for larger gifts,
12 something that is compact, easy to read, easy to
13 digest but gives a really good overview of what the
14 issues are and how they can help through their
15 corporate gifts.

16 So there would be a set of cards in a
17 small, folder-type deal where you would have them
18 tucked inside, and they would address each of whatever
19 the priorities are. So the good thing about this is
20 that the cards can change as the priorities change.
21 You're not stuck with having to keep the same
22 priorities all the time. So if something else -- you
23 know, if you do a review of the Communications
24 Strategy in a couple years and you decide the
25 priorities have now changed and you need something

1 else that needs corporate gift sponsorship, you can
2 change the cards.

3 And the conclusion to all of this is that
4 the marketing strategy presented here would be
5 developed to be inclusive of all of the Monument
6 users. So this is not something that would benefit
7 just one particular user group. It's designed to
8 benefit all of the users of the Monument.

9 And the development of the marketing
10 materials will require continuing partnerships with
11 the stakeholders in the Monument. This would include
12 having the BLM and Forest Service and Friends of the
13 Desert Mountains and the California State Parks and
14 Recreation all work together to make sure that the
15 content that is there that addresses all of the user
16 needs and the development and printing and maybe even
17 sharing the cost of printing the documents is there.
18 And that's pretty much it in a nutshell.

19 CHAIRPERSON MUTH: Questions?

20 MS. NOBLES: Yes?

21 MR. HAVERT: Just a couple of quick
22 observations. On your list of other websites to try
23 to go to, I noticed you had a couple that referenced
24 camping. And my only question there is, we have very
25 limited camping opportunities, and so we need to make

1 sure that those are real things before those sorts of
2 links would go up. And obviously at least one or two
3 of the campgrounds need some serious refurbishing,
4 which kind of goes back to the corporate thing too.
5 Maybe you had it on there, but I'm not sure I saw it.

6 Was Pacific Crest Trail Association -- I
7 assume they have a website. Since part of the trail
8 goes through the Monument, it might be a logical
9 place.

10 MS. NOBLES: I'm definitely open to
11 suggestions because I have limited knowledge in the
12 five weeks I've been here of what all is available.

13 MR. HAVERT: The other thing you were
14 talking about towards the end, the corporate
15 sponsorship and campaign there. I'm sure you know the
16 Friends already have the so-called three in three
17 campaign in progress, which is designed to generate
18 \$3 million over three years, and it's heavily focused
19 on corporate sponsorship. So I assume you will be
20 working with the Friends marketing committee on the
21 development of any materials.

22 MS. NOBLES: Yes. And I have met with
23 the Jones agency. I've also met with the Agua
24 Caliente band of --

25 MS. LYONS: Cahuilla.

1 MS. NOBLES: Thank you. At least I got
2 the Agua Caliente part right -- of Indians in ways
3 they can participate in development of these materials
4 as well. So again it was developed in conjunction
5 with all people who have a stake in the Monument and
6 users.

7 MS. EVANS: I just really enjoyed your
8 presentation. It's interesting to have fresh eyes on
9 it, and it's apparent that we had that. So I really
10 appreciate that.

11 I would offer a marketing strategy that was
12 deployed by businesses associated with the
13 San Bernardino National Forest. Last week Lake
14 Arrowhead Resort came to us -- they do not have a
15 resort on National Forest lands; they're private lands
16 surrounded by National Forest lands -- and told us
17 they wanted to do a conservation fee associated with
18 their room rates. So for the last year they've been
19 collecting three dollars a night per room to give to
20 our non-profit association.

21 This year they delivered \$100,000 to our
22 San Bernardino National Forest Association. This year
23 Northwoods Resort in Big Bear Lake area decided to do
24 the same thing. And so what's happening is the
25 resorts that are associated with benefiting from being

1 located in those environments -- i.e., the
2 San Bernardino Mountains -- are giving back to the
3 non-profit groups associated with those mountains.

4 And that's something that I just wonder,
5 since every picture that I ever see in the Coachella
6 Valley has a picture of the Monument in the
7 background, that maybe some of the resorts here might
8 not be interested in. If they kind of knew that there
9 was a way to give back to something that -- and in a
10 sense some of those -- on the Lake Arrowhead Resort
11 there are some trails -- there are some naturalist
12 programs associated with that but pretty organized and
13 pretty minimal compared to the \$100,000 they donated
14 to us last year.

15 So it actually builds additional
16 recognition for the values that are there when people
17 don't even necessarily go there, they just appreciate
18 it. So just thought I'd put that out there because
19 it's been quite a success.

20 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Sounds like it.

21 MS. NOBLES: Great idea.

22 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I think we had a
23 question out there.

24 MR. HAMBY: Comment. I represent a very
25 small segment of new people who moved into the valley.

1 I have a 40-something-year-old wife and 13- and ten-
2 and eight-year-old boys.

3 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Is that the
4 group that you're representing?

5 MR. HAMBY: For eight weeks or so we
6 have been crawling all over the valley down here
7 looking for things to do. We're new to the area, and
8 the first time we went to go to the Visitor Center --
9 I mean, we went there for a meeting five or six weeks
10 ago --

11 MS. NOBLES: Yeah.

12 MR. HAMBY: Fantastic Visitor Center.
13 Went to take my family back there on Labor Day. It
14 said, "Open seven days a week it." It was closed, and
15 the gate was locked. So the small segment that I
16 represent was extremely disappointed. Fortunately we
17 were able to go across the street to the parking lot
18 there and spend an hour or so walking down the canyon.

19 Not to be deterred, we went back on the
20 opposite side of the mountain through Hemet that way.
21 And on the way up we did find the Pacific Coast Trail
22 sign, which is kind of small. Some of us who are
23 getting older, we need --

24 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We have a couple
25 of big signs.

1 MR. HAMBY: Where we passed it was kind
2 of small, and then we came across the top of the
3 mountain. And on the way down, I was waiting for some
4 big, giant at least Forest Service sign, preferably
5 BLM but, at least a sign on top that says, "You are
6 now entering the Monument."

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: See, we had a
8 big one. Buford didn't like it.

9 MS. WATLING: It wasn't Buford. It was
10 everybody.

11 MS. NOBLES: I know that signage is one
12 of the things that is in the budget for next year, I
13 believe.

14 MS. EVANS: Another controversial item.

15 MR. CRITES: You'll enjoy the size of
16 the signs when you're transferred to North Dakota.
17 They'll be visible through the snow.

18 MR. HAMBY: But anyway, we kept waiting
19 for the sign. I purchased over a hundred dollars
20 worth of maps and books in the last couple of weeks to
21 try to figure out where I am. We waited, waited,
22 waited. Never saw the sign. Then we got to the edge
23 of the mountains, started dropping off, and as my wife
24 was screaming her way down the mountain, we stopped at
25 the little pull-out there, and the graffiti was beyond

1 anything -- I had to put my kids back in the car for
2 fear of being forced to explain what a condom was
3 because that was spelled out very clearly on the wall,
4 the big pull-out with the rocks on it. And there was
5 a lot of garbage there.

6 This was yesterday. This was yesterday.
7 So anyway, we got back down the mountain, and I
8 promised them we'd see a road runner at the Visitor
9 Center. And I want to say that's one of the finest
10 visitor centers I have ever been to, having the tree
11 an water right up front with the humming birds. I
12 shot half a roll of film of nothing but humming birds.
13 So fantastic.

14 The middle-aged lady there was wonderful,
15 provided a wealth of information. We spent money and
16 time there. That was very good. The trail was great.
17 The kids walked on the trail. They didn't want to go,
18 which is always a good sign, check that off. That's a
19 good thing, and we'll be back.

20 My suggestions are, if you really want
21 people coming from elsewhere to see this or if you
22 really want newcomers, new people who are going to
23 become citizens eventually, whenever the California
24 citizenship thing happens, there needs to be signs,
25 need to be aware of when we're entering the area where

1 the Pacific Crest Trail is or when we're entering the
2 area where the Monument starts, and then logos, BLM
3 Forest Service, Friends of the Valley, Friends of the
4 Monument, Friends of the Rocks, Friends of the Trees.
5 You know, I mean these things need to be there.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We're not
7 laughing at you. We've been at this for eight years.

8 MR. HAMBY: I understand that. I'm just
9 representing a segment of the public.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: An important
11 segment.

12 MR. HAMBY: This was our viewpoint as of
13 24 hours ago.

14 MS. WATLING: Did you get a volunteer
15 application?

16 MR. HAMBY: No. I figure as part of
17 Uncle Sam's group, I'll be up there picking up
18 garbage. These types of areas are extremely important
19 to what we all do because it's what the public wants
20 from us, us as agency members.

21 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Keep your voice
22 up for the reporter here.

23 MS. NOBLES: So in this little quick
24 reference guide, that's the kind of thing that you
25 would be able to find out in your quick reference

1 guide, what are the opportunities to volunteer on the
2 Monument, and how can I contribute? If I can't
3 volunteer, what are the ways that I can contribute to
4 the Monument, to the upkeep and the ongoing
5 wonderfulness of the Monument?

6 But the reason I like this format was
7 because it's very easy to find exactly what I'm
8 looking for. If I'm looking for trails, it's easy to
9 find it on here. There's a little tab that would say
10 "trails." If I'm looking for the limited amount of
11 campsites that are available, it would be very easy to
12 go straight to the camping.

13 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: And the
14 boundaries?

15 MS. NOBLES: The boundaries, the rules,
16 what you can and cannot do on the Monument, which is
17 always somebody's question. So we thought we could do
18 that. Well, you didn't ask, but here it is in a very
19 quick little -- keep it in the back pocket when you're
20 out so you'll know exactly, no, you can't light a fire
21 right there unless you've done these proper things to
22 make sure that you safeguard it, and leave no -- I
23 keep saying "leave no trace behind." I'm getting my
24 two laws mixed up. Leave no trace. Your
25 leave-no-trace rules would also be included in this as

1 well. This is something they could keep on them at
2 all times, which is a really quick reference to the
3 National Monument and ways they could support it.

4 Open to suggestions. Buford will probably
5 tell you I had a whole list of stuff when I first got
6 here, and I had to whittle it down. They were like,
7 "You have seven weeks." I was like, "We can't do
8 weddings on the mountain in seven weeks."

9 There's a wealth of ways that the Monument
10 can be marketed to the general public that would
11 really be great ways to generate support. But again
12 support happens when people are aware that it exists.

13 And someone coming from the west, I've
14 always heard about Joshua tree. I've always heard
15 about the Mojave Desert, so I knew all those things
16 were here. I didn't know about the Santa Rosa and San
17 Jacinto Mountains National Monument until I was
18 actually asked to come out here and work on it.

19 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Well, we're only
20 seven or eight years old.

21 MS. NOBLES: You know, you want to get
22 our name out there and get public interest and support
23 from the local community.

24 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Does anyone know
25 if we have a link to the Living Desert? I mean, these

1 are local things to do, and if people are going to go
2 spend a day at the Living Desert, they can pick up
3 information on hiking the next day.

4 MS. NOBLES: Absolutely. It's
5 interesting you said that.

6 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I know that
7 look.

8 MS. NOBLES: It's interesting you said
9 that because I spent about a half a day at the Visitor
10 Center last week, and about 50 percent of the traffic
11 that came to the Visitor Center were people who just
12 happened upon it, didn't know it was there. They were
13 coming down 74; they saw the sign. They had a
14 question about someplace else they were trying to go,
15 decided to stop in and ask.

16 And they said, "Oh, well, we didn't even
17 know this was here." Well, yeah, that's great, but we
18 need you to know this is here so that you're actually
19 stopping here on your way to somewhere else. That's
20 the goal.

21 You had a question.

22 MR. WATTS: I don't know if this is so
23 much your part of the plan, but it falls under
24 communication, and we kicked this around several years
25 ago. But it's great to have this plan put out to the

1 public, but if internally we don't know what's going
2 on amongst the partners -- and I really think that's
3 the case -- somebody is going walk up and ask somebody
4 a question, whether they're in State Parks, BLM or
5 Forest Service, and there's going to be a breakdown
6 because they don't know what the other part of the
7 other component is doing.

8 And I would encourage -- since I only have
9 20 more days in office, I would encourage the partners
10 and the Monument to somehow establish an operational
11 working group that would meet, and maybe one day it
12 would be in the Forest Service location, next time in
13 BLM, next time in Tribe, next time in State Parks,
14 whatever, but an ongoing -- just a communication group
15 to would recognize what the other partners are doing,
16 get familiar with them, get to know each other on a
17 personal basis, and would really help solidify and
18 make that cohesive. And I think that ultimately would
19 really generate out as you go out, the outside
20 communication.

21 Maybe I'm wrong, but I just don't think
22 that's existing right now. We kicked that around a
23 couple of years ago, how important that would be to
24 have the interchange going on. That would be good to
25 continue that with the people on the ground in uniform

1 walking the trails, working the Monument. I think
2 that's really important, and I think I can speak for
3 Parks that we would love to take part of in that part
4 of it. And we're as guilty as anybody for not
5 embracing the big picture. So that's just a quick
6 comment.

7 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. That was
8 an excellent report.

9 MS. NOBLES: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you, and
11 you did do well.

12 MS. NOBLES: Thank you so much.

13 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: See, you don't
14 need Jim. I don't need Jim either.

15 MR. MORGAN: Don't tell him that.

16 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: He'll never come
17 to another meeting. Okay. We're going to move right
18 along here.

19 MS. ROSENTHAL: Did you want to act on
20 Gary's recommendation at all?

21 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I'm sorry. Was
22 that in the form of a recommendation?

23 MR. WATTS: It was more a suggestion to
24 not so much the committee but to the folks running the
25 Monument that maybe something could be created. If

1 the committee wanted to support that effort, that
2 would be great.

3 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I'm disappointed
4 to hear that there is a breakdown between the
5 agencies. I would have thought that most of them sit
6 on this in some fashion, and don't they come here?
7 You're here. You're here (pointing).

8 MR. WATTS: That's why I mean the people
9 on the ground.

10 MR. CRITES: That's the equivalent of
11 saying city reps sit around CVAG and therefore city
12 staff knows what's going on. You and I both know the
13 answer to that.

14 MR. WATTS: I'm not suggesting so much
15 there's a big breakdown or a big wall. I'm just
16 suggesting it would improve things a lot.

17 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I think it would
18 be great. I don't know whether you have the same kind
19 of turnover that other committees have. Just when you
20 get somebody learning one thing, somebody new comes
21 in.

22 MR. WATTS: Even more reason it should
23 be done.

24 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I would support
25 that. Is there general consensus that we would

1 support the agencies looking at some kind of working
2 group with those folks on the ground to better
3 communicate?

4 MS. LYONS: Would this be a
5 recommendation by the board to send a letter to these
6 agencies and ask them to start this type of --

7 MR. WATTS: My feeling is that the key
8 people are here. They've heard it. They probably
9 have their own ideas of whether that's worth while or
10 not. I think they could run with it. If they don't,
11 you could bring it up in a year.

12 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We can make sure
13 we have a discussion with Mr. Foote when he returns on
14 the communication effort of that. Is there a
15 consensus on having that move forward?

16 MS. LYONS: Sounds good.

17 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. I'm
18 seeing lots of nods. I don't think we need a formal
19 vote.

20 MS. EVANS: For clarification we're
21 talking State Parks, Forest Service, Bureau of Land
22 Management and the Tribe.

23 MS. LYONS: And the Tribe.

24 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: The tram should
25 definitely be there. I'm disappointed we haven't seen

1 them for such a long time.

2 MS. EVANS: I just wanted clarification.

3 MS. LYONS: Who's going to start the
4 ball?

5 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Gary, this will
6 be your swan song.

7 MR. WATTS: If I have your support,
8 we'll host the first one.

9 MS. LYONS: But also talking to get that
10 started, like you said, the first meeting.

11 MR. WATTS: Who's going to contact?

12 MS. LYONS: Margaret Parks.

13 MS. NOBLES: I just have a quick
14 question for the group because I have two weeks to get
15 this stuff together. Are there any objections to what
16 I've presented to you all?

17 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: I didn't see
18 anything there I would object to. I would caution on
19 the camping effort.

20 MS. NOBLES: Correct. You want to be
21 very clear about where they can or can't go.

22 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: We don't want to
23 be promoting ourselves as a big camping designation
24 and turn out not to be one. I would be interested in
25 maybe a follow-up with the Living Desert to see if

1 there's any coordination there, and I will talk to the
2 Convention and Visitors Authority and try to get that
3 straightened out.

4 MS. NOBLES: Okay. Great. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you very
6 much, and I guess we won't see you at our next
7 meeting.

8 MS. NOBLES: No. I'll be back in
9 Washington by then.

10 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: But we'll see
11 results of the time you spent here, and so far I think
12 they've been outstanding. Thank you.

13 MS. NOBLES: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: The next item
15 is, John is going to talk to us about wind energy.
16 That could be taken two different ways, but go ahead.

17 MR. KALISH: At the last meeting back in
18 March we put on -- or actually Jim Foote put on a
19 Power Point presentation about the Cabazon Wind Energy
20 Project, the proponents which are Bill and Brad Adams
21 and the Adams Wind Energy Partnership, and that Power
22 Point went into a fair amount of detail describing the
23 project and the issues and how it relates to the
24 National Monument.

25 But in lieu of really kind of going back

1 over all of that detail, I thought we would just put
2 up the map, and we can pull it back to here and make
3 it a little easier to see. We saw the cork board with
4 the little stick-ems, and that's where we put the map.

5 So the actual project is located over in
6 the Snow Creek area south of I-10 in the Finkle's
7 Finger vicinity, and you can see from the land status
8 this color yellow is BLM, and then non-BLM, or private
9 lands, are the darker colors. Each of the wind
10 turbines are designated by these yellow little
11 squares. It gives you an idea of the extent and what
12 really characterizes this project, is that the wind
13 turbines will be used.

14 They're going to be the very large- --
15 what's being proposed would be the largest wind
16 turbines in Coachella Valley, larger than those
17 recently put in the Indio Hills area. It would be
18 over three-megawatt machines and over 400-feet tall.
19 In the project all of the windmills would be placed on
20 private lands. So it would be consistent with the BLM
21 requirements not allowing the wind turbines, so that
22 type of wind energy development on BLM administered
23 Monument lands.

24 However, just given the nature of the land
25 status in the area, BLM lands would be used for the

1 ancillary facilities, including access road up across
2 BLM. And all of these turbines are way high up on the
3 slope. Probably as you go up San Gorgonio Pass on the
4 south side of the freeway -- and these are these very
5 steep slopes that head up into the forest. So we're
6 really looking at some pretty substantial road
7 construction in the area.

8 But the facilities on BLM under
9 rights-of-ways would involve access, and any of the
10 collection lines that collect the generated
11 electricity and transmit it down to the substation as
12 well as any of the communication lines that are needed
13 to communicate with each of the wind turbines. So
14 BLM's involvement in this project would be assessing a
15 right-of-way grant application for those facilities on
16 BLM lands.

17 Under County jurisdiction under the CEQA
18 process the County would analyze the other parts of
19 the project involved in the wind turbines themselves.

20 At the March meeting there was a fair
21 amount of discussion about how BLM and the County
22 should interface, resulting in a conclusion that, at
23 least from the committee standpoint, a real desire
24 that BLM wait until the County kind of runs through
25 their process, in particular, issues of consistency

1 with the general plan, and gets it through to the
2 board of supervisors before BLM would enter into a
3 NEPA analysis, a NEPA process.

4 With that said, just to really quickly give
5 you an update, I realize that presentation was back in
6 March. The project kind of went on the back burner.
7 In fact we didn't hear very much from Bill and Brad
8 Adams about the project for quite a while. But right
9 now the status of the project is that Riverside County
10 is essentially in a holding pattern very much as we
11 all are, all based on a process that the project is
12 going through with the Coachella Valley Coordinating
13 Committee.

14 Let me drink some water here. It's tied
15 into a tolling agreement whereby, and as I understand
16 it, and maybe Katie can kind of provide some more
17 information. But the whole purpose of this tolling
18 agreement is that it allows for the project proponents
19 to extend their right to sue the MSACP under CEQA
20 while there is an attempt to reach an agreement
21 regarding concerns on various aspects of the Habitat
22 Conservation Plan. Did I cover that pretty
23 accurately?

24 So that process right now is ongoing, and
25 as long as that process is kind of moving through,

1 both the County and the BLM are essentially standing
2 by until that process is done. And especially the
3 Riverside County, then, based on whatever agreements
4 are reached, can begin to start to move forward with
5 their overall project.

6 There has been a fair amount of, I'd say,
7 pressure from the project proponent directed at BLM to
8 kind of jump in with Riverside County, once the County
9 starts their CEQA process, do a joint CEQA/NEPA
10 process. And we don't expect that those expectations
11 or that pressure is going to go away, at least from
12 the project proponent standpoint.

13 But at some point under that tolling
14 agreement and the negotiations that are ongoing, at
15 some point we may reach an adequate resolution where
16 the County will initiate their own CEQA process. And
17 at that time we -- or BLM as an agency is going to be
18 in the position of saying yea or nay as to whether or
19 not we will jump in with the County and process the
20 proposal as a joint NEPA/CEQA process or whether we,
21 per the discussions at the last MAC meeting, just hold
22 off and let the process run through the County CEQA
23 process and get before the County Board of Supervisors
24 before we would entertain our initiating a NEPA
25 process. So that's really the status of this project.

1 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Questions?

2 MR. HAVERT: Just a comment. You
3 weren't necessarily trying to show other ownerships in
4 the area, but just for everybody else's information,
5 this 160 acres here belongs to University of
6 California Natural Reserve System, and this roughly
7 200 acres here belongs to the Mountains Conservancy,
8 but this piece here is BLM. And I'm not quite sure
9 what is our designation, and apparently it looked like
10 road routes on here, because that land used to be
11 Friends of the Desert Mountains. And when it was
12 conveyed to BLM, it included a deed restriction that
13 would prohibit those sorts of things on there. Can
14 you elaborate on that.

15 MR. KALISH: The Adams project, although
16 they recognize the Lazar property is BLM under
17 donation and there are deed restrictions that would
18 limit development of those lands, basically all of
19 this has actually gone way back even while the lands
20 were being acquired. And then once they were acquired
21 and the transfer was ongoing, some real issues that
22 were being raised by the project proponent about BLM
23 accepting lands with such a deed restriction, there's
24 really been a hold-over of their concerns and issues
25 that they feel that those deed restrictions should not

1 have been accepted on lands that were accepted by the
2 BLM. It's just coming from the project proponent.

3 So in our discussions with them, they just
4 identified that this is a concept that, you know, they
5 still would like to keep that issue open as far as
6 treating BLM lands like, maybe, other lands where they
7 would be available for development under a wide range
8 of scenarios and they don't want to see that issue go
9 away and so it shows up in the project proposal.

10 But obviously from our standpoint, we have
11 not issued a notice of intent to move forward in any
12 kind of analysis. We're still very much in the
13 pre-application phase even though we have received
14 right-of-way applications. But we're still going
15 through that preliminary process of working with the
16 project proponent to get them to submit ultimately
17 what would be project design. So everything is very
18 preliminary.

19 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: This certainly
20 hasn't been in the newspaper in the last couple of
21 months, a couple of articles.

22 MS. BARROWS: Sorry, Terry. I just
23 wanted to clarify, too, from the standpoint as John
24 described, there is an agreement that is CVAG actually
25 is working with Wind Energy Partnership and actually

1 with the County. I just wanted to clarify under the
2 Multiple Species Plan this is still a County project,
3 and all approvals are under the County, so Multiple
4 Species Plan doesn't really make that determination.

5 We're working actually very closely with
6 Bob and folks in this office to address the impacts of
7 the project, but basically what we've been waiting for
8 and just fairly recently received from the project
9 applicant is more definition on kind of what they
10 propose, and that's kind of been a challenge.

11 I just want to make sure it's clear to
12 everyone that this is really the County's process and
13 we are working with them in that effort. But there is
14 a question with regard to the project applicant.

15 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. So at the
16 end of the day would the Multi-species Habitat Plan,
17 as any other agency, would have a right to respond to
18 any environmental document, but does it play into the
19 actual permission process? She's saying no; he's
20 saying yes.

21 MR. LYMAN: We look at it a slightly
22 different way. But the County has set forth very
23 rigid guidelines in terms of conservation areas where
24 the project proponent can only develop eight percent
25 of the proposed area of any conservation area. The

1 proposal is well beyond that.

2 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Okay. But --

3 MS. BARROWS: So what we would be
4 doing -- and we've been doing it in a preliminary way
5 for this project, but any project in the conservation
6 areas would come to the jurisdiction, in this case the
7 County, and they would then do what's called a joint
8 project review, where we look at the project in terms
9 of whether it's consistent or not with the Multiple
10 Species Plan. In this point it has to do with bighorn
11 sheep and a variety of issues. We provide that
12 information to the County.

13 As Bob said, the County has a policy that
14 only allows eight percent, and that's another piece of
15 it. Our primary role is really to provide information
16 about whether it's consistent with the Multiple
17 Species Plan.

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Thank you. I've
19 got one over here.

20 MR. MORGAN: About nine months ago,
21 whatever, there was a scoping package put out, and
22 lots of comments were received by the County. Is the
23 project substantially changed since what was proposed
24 at that time?

25 MR. LYMAN: No.

1 MR. MORGAN: No. So the County is what,
2 waiting for the proponent to come out with his EIR or
3 whatever documents?

4 MR. LYMAN: We're waiting.

5 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Speak up,
6 please.

7 MR. LYMAN: Sorry. We're waiting, if I
8 remember, for the draft EIR. We have not seen it yet.
9 No screen check.

10 MR. MORGAN: No screen check.

11 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Barbara.

12 MS. LYONS: Yeah. Just for John and
13 Bill, the company who's putting on this project, then,
14 are saying that they don't believe that the
15 restrictions on the BLM land that was done through the
16 Friends exchange, land exchange, is legal and binding,
17 basically is what is being stated so that -- and I'm
18 just wondering, if they're saying that, wasn't that
19 addressed when Friends gave the donation to BLM? And
20 wasn't that -- since there's such a restriction on the
21 access to that property, wasn't that addressed in
22 Washington D.C. before BLM accepted it? It seems like
23 they would have legally gone through the hoops that
24 you have to go through before you accept a donation of
25 land to BLM with certain restrictions on it.

1 So if it has already gone through that
2 legal process, it seems like it would be, then,
3 binding to that property and they wouldn't have
4 access.

5 MR. KALISH: We're very comfortable with
6 the deed restrictions, but I think it's just an issue
7 that keeps being brought forward.

8 MS. LYONS: It will just be something
9 they'll do in court, then.

10 MR. KALISH: At the time it was
11 controversial and appeals were made back to
12 Washington.

13 MS. LYONS: But it still went through,
14 so legally it's binding because, if BLM accepted it
15 with the restriction through Washington D.C., it seems
16 like that would be binding legally.

17 MR. KALISH: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: It sounds to me
19 like the gentleman is just ignoring that issue.

20 MS. LYONS: He's ignoring the issue with
21 respect to being able to go through that property, but
22 he's probably going to go for a lawsuit probably
23 trying to get the use of it. But then again, you tie
24 him up in a lawsuit.

25 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Please, one

1 more.

2 MR. BROCKMAN: Well, notwithstanding
3 that issue, I have a question regarding the breadth of
4 the authority that BLM has to either approve or deny
5 access to private land. I wasn't at the last meeting,
6 but I read in the minutes some comments that Jim made
7 that said, if I understood it, that BLM does have some
8 obligation to provide access to private property.
9 What wasn't said in that but I think was implied is,
10 that's not an automatic grant of access to any
11 particular use on private property.

12 And so my question, maybe for John, would
13 be, does BLM have the authority to deny the access
14 even if it turns out to be consistent with an amended
15 County general plan? Because I'm assuming that the
16 County general plan isn't so specific that it says
17 wind energy as a land use category, for example. It's
18 probably in a broader land use category that may allow
19 other uses, wind energy being one that may be more
20 environmentally damaging than others. It's a
21 long-winded question.

22 MR. KALISH: We would analyze whether or
23 not they'd access and the level of cuts and the
24 overcast and the overall footprint of the disturbance,
25 especially in that steep and rugged area, whether that

1 type of use would be consistent with the purposes for
2 which the Monument was initially designated, and that
3 would be one issue. And we do try and provide access
4 to in-holdings. But where there's alternative access
5 routes that do not involve BLM lands or other
6 alternative routes that have less impact, then of
7 course, those would be much preferred.

8 So there is -- you know, through the
9 analysis process, there would just be a lot to analyze
10 to come to a conclusion as to whether or not we had
11 enough there to either deny the proposed access route
12 in that specific area or authorize an alternative or
13 just deny it based on the fact that there is an
14 alternative off of BLM land, so just a lot of
15 variables. It would just be through the outcome of
16 the NEPA process.

17 MR. BROCKMAN: Right.

18 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Any further
19 comments or questions? I'm sure we'll all be watching
20 closely as this works its way through the process.

21 Next item on the agenda is other Forest
22 Service actions. Lauri?

23 MS. ROSENTHAL: We have a new Deputy
24 Forest Supervisor. His name is Tom Gillette,
25 G-i-l-l-e-t-t-e. He's been with us a couple months

1 now.

2 MS. EVANS: Three months.

3 MS. ROSENTHAL: Three months. And
4 unfortunately he wasn't able to be here today, but he
5 really want to come out and immerse himself in the
6 Monument and get to know all of you. So stay tuned
7 for that.

8 And we have three projects right now in
9 environmental analysis. The first is the Palm Canyon
10 tamarisk removal project. And the environmental
11 analysis, the draft has been completed. And it's at
12 the regional office for the regional forester's
13 signature for the signing of the pesticide use part of
14 it because it's a proposed wilderness area, the
15 proposed Pyramid Peak area.

16 So once that happens, then we'll have a
17 30-day comment period. And those of you that are not
18 on the Monument Advisory Committee mailing list that
19 would like to become, see me after this and we'll put
20 you on for your e-mail address. So it should be
21 forthcoming pretty soon, and that will be, as I said,
22 a 30-day comment period.

23 Any questions about that project before I
24 go on to the next?

25 MS. WELLMAN: I do. What's used to

1 remove tamarisk? I know if you just cut it off, it
2 grows right back. What do you do that eradicates
3 tamarisk?

4 MS. ROSENTHAL: Part of it is bringing
5 it up from the roots and getting it up that way.

6 MS. WELLMAN: Digging it?

7 MS. LYONS: Yeah, a lot of manual labor.

8 MS. ROSENTHAL: Manual labor. This
9 particular project is in an area that is not easily
10 accessible for heavy equipment, so that's where the
11 pesticide use comes in. All that information will be
12 in the environmental analysis. I know, Terry, we've
13 got a time problem here. But come see me afterwards,
14 and we'll get your name on that environmental
15 analysis.

16 MS. WELLMAN: Okay.

17 MS. ROSENTHAL: Any other questions
18 about that project?

19 The second project is the Santa Rosa fuel
20 reduction project. This area is south of Highway 74,
21 and we're proposing approximately 9,000 acres of
22 treatment, and some of the -- this project has been
23 going on for a while as far as the analysis. And way
24 back at -- maybe it was our December meeting, we had
25 passed this out, but I do have copies. It's about

1 four pages of the letter that went out, the scoping
2 letter for public involvement.

3 And this project is -- the goals are to
4 reduce fire intensity, public safety and recreation
5 areas, evacuation groups to help with public safety on
6 that and also firefighter safety are probably the four
7 most important parts of the project. And we are going
8 to be going out for public comments in probably the --
9 well, I'm sorry. We already went out for a formal
10 public comments period, and we have a team that's
11 coming the last week of September. It's, like,
12 September 26th or so.

13 And some of you have been privy to the
14 e-mail message that Joan Taylor sent out. I know
15 Buford was on that and maybe some other folks. We're
16 still open for comments. Even though the formal
17 comment period is over, we are still open at this
18 point for comments, but preferably before the team
19 comes in, because they're going to be analyzing our
20 comments until the next few weeks, and so we really
21 encourage -- come see me afterwards, and I can give
22 you the information of the e-mail address to send the
23 comments to.

24 But it sounds like there's also a need for
25 another field trip, even though we offered a field

1 trip way back. And this will probably have to be
2 after the inter-disciplinary team meets. But we're
3 not planning on having a final decision for a few
4 months after that. So we still have time. So I had
5 sent out some e-mail, some dates, some possible dates
6 out to Joan Taylor. And she's coordinating so we
7 don't have, like -- you know how hard it is to set up
8 a meeting. She is coordinating, so come see me if
9 you're interested in a field trip for the Santa Rosa
10 fuel reduction project. And I have, as I said, if
11 anybody wants, copies of the scoping letter that went
12 out last year.

13 Lastly our third project is a grazing
14 environmental assessment. Now, we're going to have
15 decisions for Garner allotment, the Rouse and the one
16 that affects the Monument is the Wellman, which we
17 have a representative here who's very much involved in
18 the allotment. We started out for public scoping
19 comments, and a newspaper article that came out has
20 all the information to comment on it. And we're going
21 to be analyzing all the different resources that are
22 involved in the grazing allotments. Any questions on
23 that front?

24 Lastly we have a volunteer appreciation day
25 scheduled for Saturday, October 11th from 11 to two at

1 the supervisor's office. It's going to be a barbecue,
2 and Scott has probably sent out something to all the
3 Friends, but if you haven't received anything, let
4 Scott or myself know on that. And any questions or
5 additions?

6 MS. EVANS: No.

7 MS. ROSENTHAL: No? Okay. Any
8 questions?

9 MS. WELLMAN: Can I just make a comment
10 on this newspaper article? It's a little bit
11 misleading in places. I went through and read the
12 entire report, and they just sort of picked out things
13 out of that report. So if you're really interested in
14 this, you should get the report and read it.

15 MS. ROSENTHAL: Very good. Thank you,
16 Dawn.

17 MR. MORGAN: It is now available on the
18 website. It wasn't the first few weeks. So maybe you
19 could extend the comment period by a couple of weeks.

20 MS. ROSENTHAL: It actually was. I
21 don't know why people couldn't find it. We'll talk
22 about that off-line, but it has been done. Okay. I'm
23 done.

24 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Well, thank you
25 very much. John?

1 MR. KALISH: Real fast, I'd like to
2 introduce, if you haven't met Tim Dunfee, our fire
3 management officer. And we thought we would talk
4 about a couple of fuels projects that are being done
5 up in the Monument, one up in the Pinyon area
6 involving 150 acres of BLM lands. And basically the
7 project is to remove deadened, downed pinyon and
8 juniper and other dead materials. The removed
9 materials will either be burned on-site in piles or
10 hauled to a green waste facility. And that project
11 has started and should be wrapped up fairly quickly, I
12 understand.

13 MR. DUNFEE: Two to three days.

14 MR. KALISH: Yeah. The purpose being,
15 from an overall community protection standpoint, to
16 reduce the overall fire threat within the area. And
17 two other projects which aren't on the map, but so you
18 may know where they are, Snow Creek. This was a joint
19 Forest Service-BLM project involving ten acres on BLM,
20 about four acres on the forest. A lot of it was
21 invasive species, sierra mustard. And that actually
22 was completed last summer in July as part of the
23 community defense program.

24 And BLM and the Forest Service are still
25 working with homeowners to encourage them to remove

1 other hazardous fuels and develop safe zones in and
2 around their properties.

3 And then the last project was in the
4 Magnesia Spring area, and that was tamarisk removal,
5 about 30 acres, and that project has just begun.

6 MR. DUNFEE: It will probably start
7 Thursday.

8 MR. KALISH: Does that about cover it,
9 Tim?

10 MR. DUNFEE: Yes, sir. Thanks for
11 allowing me to sit in on a meeting.

12 MR. MORGAN: How far up Magnesia Spring
13 Canyon is this project going to go?

14 MR. KALISH: Kevin is working with
15 the --

16 MR. DUNFEE: I was getting updates. I
17 could e-mail you if I could get your address, but it's
18 just tamarisk removal.

19 MR. MORGAN: But yeah, way beyond the
20 source of the tamarisk. It goes way up Cat Creek,
21 which actually is at the same watershed.

22 MR. DUNFEE: No. I'm sorry. I don't
23 know.

24 MS. BARROWS: The overall project, as
25 Lauri was talking about, will be working targeting

1 those other areas, Cat Creek and elsewhere.

2 MR. MORGAN: As Barbara said earlier,
3 you cut it out at the bottom. If you don't cut it out
4 at the top, it comes right back.

5 MS. LYONS: Right. But that's why we're
6 coordinating. That's why they've got their man going
7 now. That's something off the record we've been
8 coordinating being done for years.

9 MS. BARROWS: I tried at the bottom a
10 long, long time ago at Palm Canyon, and now we're
11 going to do the top.

12 MS. LYONS: We've been working with them
13 to get the top done.

14 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: Any other
15 questions?

16 And I'm sure anybody who doesn't feel they
17 got all information they wanted to be available, if
18 you contact any of these officials, then they'll fill
19 in any blanks you might have.

20 The next item is to report on the next
21 meeting, which is scheduled for March 16th, same
22 location. That's 2009. It's from three to six, and I
23 hope to see you all there. Are we supposed to have
24 some appointments, did I hear, in January? The
25 appointments made by January? That's fine. Maybe we

1 will; maybe we won't.

2 Any closing comments or remarks? I think
3 the only issues that we've asked the staff to look
4 into and bring back some thoughts -- I think John has
5 got all those notes for us. Anything further?

6 MR. CRITES: Move to adjourn.

7 MR. MORGAN: Second.

8 CHAIRPERSON HENDERSON: The meeting is
9 so adjourned. Thank you.

10 (The proceedings were concluded at 5:33 p.m.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 R E P O R T E R ' S C E R T I F I C A T E
2

3 I, DIANE CARVER MANN, a certified shorthand
4 reporter, do hereby certify that the foregoing pages
5 comprise a full, true and correct transcription of the
6 proceedings had and the testimony taken at the hearing
7 in the hereinbefore-entitled matter of the regular
8 meeting of the Santa Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains
9 National Monument Advisory Committee.

10 Dated this 2nd day of October, 2008, at
11 Chino, California.

12
13
14
15
16
17
18 _____
19 DIANE CARVER MANN, CSR NO. 6008
20
21
22
23
24
25