

Appendix P – Public Comment on the Draft RMP/Draft EIS

The Draft RMP/ Draft EIS was released for a 90-day public review and comment period on September 9, 2011. During this period, the Bakersfield Field Office received approximately 274 comment letters, emails, or comment forms completed during one of the public open house meetings.

Each submission was carefully reviewed to identify substantive comments. Each substantive comment was numbered separately with the comment submission number and a unique comment identifier (e.g., 125-3). It should be noted that some submissions contained no substantive comments, and as such no response is provided in Chapter 5.

In accordance with regulations on the implementation of the National Environmental Policy Act (40 CFR 1503.4) all substantive comments must be addressed in the Final EIS. Substantive comments are generally those that:

- Question, with reasonable basis, the accuracy of the information in the Draft EIS.
- Question, with reasonable basis, the adequacy of, methodology for, or assumptions used for the environmental analysis.
- Present new information relevant to the analysis.
- Present reasonable alternatives other than those analyzed in the Draft EIS.
- Cause changes or revisions in one or more of the alternatives.

To the extent possible, substantive comments similar in nature were combined and paraphrased. When necessary, however, context of the comment was provided so it might stand-alone in a more complete, comprehensible form. Original comment submissions are available for review by the public at the Bakersfield Field Office.

It should be noted that comments are not treated or tallied as “votes.” Rather the substance of the comments help the BLM to understand and weigh the multiple factors considered as part of its decision making process.

Table P-1 identifies commenters, the number given to their comment letter, and their affiliation if any. This information can be used in conjunction with the comment responses provided in Chapter 5, Section 5.5 Comment Response to identify the origin of the comment.

**Table P-1
Comment Sources**

| Comment Submission Number | Commenter Name | Commenter Affiliation |
|--|-----------------------|--|
| 1 | Robert Jump | |
| 2 | Dave Singleton | State of California, Native American Heritage Commission |
| 3 | Norman I. Rilling | |
| 4 | Shannon Lodge | |
| 5 | Carloe Combs | Tulare Basin Wildlife Partners |
| 6 | Steve Evans | Friends of the River |
| 7 | Austin Snedden | |
| 8 | Rebecca Royal | |

| Comment Submission Number | Commenter Name | Commenter Affiliation |
|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|
| 9 | Jack Caufield | Lodi Gem & Mineral Club, Fossils for Fun, Kern County Gem and Mineral Society, Quartzsite Roadrunners Gem & Mineral Society, Buena Vista Museum of Natural History |
| 10 | Bob Brister | |
| 11 | Carolyn Straub & Steve McHenry | |
| 12 | Phillip Simon | |
| 13 | Marshall Havner | American Lands Access Association Tule Gem & Mineral Society |
| 14 | Angel Campbell | |
| 15 | Erik Melchiorre | California State University San Bernardino |
| 16 | Greg Meade | CCMA, Sneakers M/C |
| 17 | Jerri & Gene Curtis | Bakersfield Trail Blazers |
| 18 | James Johnston | Bakersfield Trail Blazers |
| 19 | James Sanders | Bakersfield Trail Blazers |
| 20 | Eileen Sanders | Bakersfield Trail Blazers |
| 21 | Justin Branch | Bakersfield Trail Blazers |
| 22 | Eric Mattick | Bakersfield Trail Blazers |
| 23 | Dennis Sizemore | |
| 24 | Charles Reed | Tule Gem and Mineral Society |
| 25 | Tony Hart | Tule Gem and Mineral Society |
| 26 | Richard Spencer | Young Men Organization |
| 27 | Sam Mudie | Sierra Nevada Alliance Trustee |
| 28 | Scott M. Kruse | Friends of the River |
| 29 | George Silva | American Lands Access Association Tule Gem & Mineral Society |
| 30 | Patrick Harrison | Tule Gem and Mineral Society |
| 31 | John Martin | American Lands Access Association Palmdale, Lone Pine, and Palomar Gem & Mineral Societies |
| 32 | Christina Lynch | |
| 33 | Bill Bingaman | Tule Gem and Mineral Society |
| 34 | Martin Dougherty | Long Beach Gem and Mineral Society |
| 35 | Kathy Jarrett | Friends of the River |
| 36 | Richard Crosland, Ph.D. | Friends of the River |
| 37 | Phillip Simon | Friends of the River |
| 38 | Dan Silver | Endangered Habitats League |
| 39 | Alan Anderson | Friends of the River |
| 40 | Stacy and Greg Kline | Friends of the River |
| 41 | Roger Reid | Friends of the River |
| 42 | Mark Takaro | Friends of the River |
| 43 | Ms. Rachael Denny | Friends of the River |
| 44 | Dr. Anthony De Riggi | Friends of the River |

| Comment Submission Number | Commenter Name | Commenter Affiliation |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|
| 45 | Ms. Kathleen Frank | Friends of the River |
| 46 | Charles Hammerstad | Friends of the River |
| 47 | Ms. J Lasahn | Friends of the River |
| 48 | Jan Summers | Friends of the River |
| 49 | Dr. Wade Graham | Friends of the River |
| 50 | Barbara Bazan | Friends of the River |
| 51 | Dr. Robert Rosenberg | Friends of the River |
| 52 | William Dvorak | Friends of the River |
| 53 | Dr. Michael Molamphy | Friends of the River |
| 54 | Frank J. Perruccio | Friends of the River |
| 55 | Tom Grasshoff | Friends of the River |
| 56 | Pandora Edmonston | Friends of the River |
| 57 | Felipe Garcia | Friends of the River |
| 58 | Dr. Margery Kampa | Friends of the River |
| 59 | Jan Kampa | Friends of the River |
| 60 | Sue Ghilotti | Friends of the River |
| 61 | Joyce Burk | Friends of the River |
| 62 | Michael Rifkind | Friends of the River |
| 63 | Herbert Cattanach | Friends of the River |
| 64 | Randall Smith | Friends of the River |
| 65 | Kit LOFROOS | Friends of the River |
| 66 | Janice Foss | Friends of the River |
| 67 | Patricia Snow | Friends of the River |
| 68 | Robert Algieri | Friends of the River |
| 69 | Richard Montgomery | Friends of the River |
| 70 | Paul Jarvis | Friends of the River |
| 71 | Randall Frank | Friends of the River |
| 72 | Dana Shokes | Friends of the River |
| 73 | Rae Peronneau | Friends of the River |
| 74 | Al Knickerbocker | Friends of the River |
| 75 | Julie Ford | Friends of the River |
| 76 | Gordon Becker | Friends of the River |
| 77 | Tim Thomas | Friends of the River |
| 78 | Andrea Ganz | Friends of the River |
| 79 | Donald Norton | Friends of the River |
| 80 | Judy Schriebman | Friends of the River |
| 81 | Tracey Sittig | Friends of the River |
| 82 | Kevin Branstetter | Friends of the River |
| 83 | Kenneth Lavine | Friends of the River |
| 84 | Juan Byron | Friends of the River |
| 85 | Dr. David Adams | Friends of the River |
| 86 | Henry Gutierrez | Friends of the River |

| Comment Submission Number | Commenter Name | Commenter Affiliation |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 87 | Larry Keller | Friends of the River |
| 88 | Don Hoernschemeyer | Friends of the River |
| 89 | Sherman Lewis | Friends of the River |
| 90 | Kathy Hanson | Friends of the River |
| 91 | Daniel Brower | Friends of the River |
| 92 | Beth Obrien | Friends of the River |
| 93 | Dr. Janet Anderson | Friends of the River |
| 94 | James Peeler | Friends of the River |
| 95 | Shawn Trice | Friends of the River |
| 96 | William Butler | Friends of the River |
| 97 | Walt Levitus | Friends of the River |
| 98 | Juliet Bradley | Friends of the River |
| 99 | Andrew T and JoAnn Pohorsky | Friends of the River |
| 100 | Mr. & Mrs. James Denison | Friends of the River |
| 101 | David Seaborg | Friends of the River |
| 102 | Joshua Switzky | Friends of the River |
| 103 | Dirk Beving | Friends of the River |
| 104 | JB Pearce Sr. | Friends of the River |
| 105 | Richard Spotts | Friends of the River |
| 106 | Don Morrill | Friends of the River |
| 107 | Connie Spears | Friends of the River |
| 108 | Morteza Danesh | Friends of the River |
| 109 | Erik Johnson | Friends of the River |
| 110 | Jenny Wilder | Friends of the River |
| 111 | Jim Foran | Friends of the River |
| 112 | JoAnne Clarke | Friends of the River |
| 113 | Scott M. Kruse | Friends of the River |
| 114 | George Alderson | Friends of the River |
| 115 | Steven B. Giddings | Friends of the River |
| 116 | Don Forman | |
| 117 | Joel Masser | Friends of the River |
| 118 | Dennis P. Davie | Friends of the River |
| 119 | Gary Hartsough | Friends of the River |
| 120 | Marshall Havner | |
| 121 | Donald J. Viera | American Lands Access Association |
| 122 | Michael Arbogast | |
| 123 | James Arbogast | |
| 124 | Lawrence H. Thompson | Friends of the River |
| 125 | Ms. Sandy Zelasko | Friends of the River |
| 126 | Donna Miranda- | Tubatulabal Tribe |

| Comment Submission Number | Commenter Name | Commenter Affiliation |
|----------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|
| | Begay | |
| 127 | Amy Wolfberg | Friends of the River |
| 128 | Karen Linarez | Friends of the River |
| 129 | Chisholm & Ashley Twisselman | |
| 130 | Tom Twisselman | |
| 131 | JoAnne Clarke | |
| 132 | Robert McLaughlin | Friends of the River |
| 133 | Erik Melchiorre | |
| 134 | Dennis Huggins | Kern County Mineral Society |
| 135 | Carole Clum | |
| 136 | Jean Circiello | |
| 137 | Sopac McCarthy Mulholland | Sequoia Riverlands Trust |
| 138 | Nick Rodin | Friends of the River |
| 139 | Robert E. Reynolds | |
| 140 | Timothy Elam | |
| 141 | Michaea Souza | Friends of the River |
| 142 | Tia Triplett | Friends of the River |
| 143 | Richard Gibbons | Friends of the River |
| 144 | William Mahoney-Watson | Friends of the River |
| 145 | Lori Lindburg | Friends of the River |
| 146 | Dr. Mark Hoyer | Friends of the River |
| 147 | Rob Seltzer | Friends of the River |
| 148 | Dr. John Brinkley | Friends of the River |
| 149 | Jennifer Quashnick | Friends of the River |
| 150 | Nathan Ferguson | Friends of the River |
| 151 | Joanne Crandall-Bear | Friends of the River |
| 152 | Lesley Hunt | Friends of the River |
| 153 | Nina Jones | Friends of the River |
| 154 | Dr. Arthur Strauss | Friends of the River |
| 155 | Steven Hibshman | Friends of the River |
| 156 | Jeff Depew | Friends of the River |
| 157 | Jim & Diana Prola | Friends of the River |
| 158 | Verne Huser | Friends of the River |
| 159 | Susan Rowe | Friends of the River |
| 160 | Maureen Lahiff | Friends of the River |
| 161 | Roberta Sparkman | Friends of the River |
| 162 | John Nathaniel | Friends of the River |
| 163 | Deanna Wulff | Friends of the River |
| 164 | Matthias Schwartz | Friends of the River |
| 165 | Sharon Cavallo | Friends of the River |

| Comment Submission Number | Commenter Name | Commenter Affiliation |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|
| 166 | Timothy LaVerne | Friends of the River |
| 167 | Lowell Young | Friends of the River |
| 168 | Harry Surtees | Friends of the River |
| 169 | Miranda Everett | Friends of the River |
| 170 | Frank Ackerman | Friends of the River |
| 171 | Sarah Nash | Friends of the River |
| 172 | Jeff Wieland | Friends of the River |
| 173 | George Williams | Friends of the River |
| 174 | George Williams | Friends of the River |
| 175 | Dr. Clyde Wilson | Friends of the River |
| 176 | Eileen Heaser | Friends of the River |
| 177 | Jack Van den Bogaerde | Friends of the River |
| 178 | Laraine Downer | Friends of the River |
| 179 | Tyana Maddock | Friends of the River |
| 180 | Barbara Mendenhall | Friends of the River |
| 181 | Dave Zumwalt | Friends of the River |
| 182 | Lisa Reinertson | Friends of the River |
| 183 | Patrick McCully | Friends of the River |
| 184 | Constance Sutton | Friends of the River |
| 185 | John Kolarik | Friends of the River |
| 186 | Allen Jamieson | Friends of the River |
| 187 | William Mittig | Friends of the River |
| 188 | Eric G. Ramstrom | Friends of the River |
| 189 | Dr. Gene R. Trapp & Jo Ellen Ryan | Friends of the River |
| 190 | Eric Bernhard | Friends of the River |
| 191 | Jeremy Shane | Friends of the River |
| 192 | Dr. Donna Carr, M.D. | Friends of the River |
| 193 | Tim Ryan | Friends of the River |
| 194 | Dr. Juliett Lamont | Friends of the River |
| 195 | Don Houston | Southern California Gas Company |
| 196 | George Johnson | Friends of the River |
| 197 | Dennis Huggins | |
| 198 | David Chipping | California Native Plant Society, San Luis Obispo Chapter |
| 199 | Richard Cochran | Backcountry Horsemen of CA, High Sierra Chapter |
| 200 | Rosada Martin | Friends of the River |
| 201 | Audrey Evans | Friends of the River |
| 202 | Janice Gloe | Friends of the River |
| 203 | Matt Gunnell | SoCal High School Cycling League |
| 204 | Arthur Unger | |
| 205 | Mrs. Damara Stone | Friends of the River |
| 206 | Gregory Meisinger | Aera Energy LLC |

| Comment Submission Number | Commenter Name | Commenter Affiliation |
|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|
| 207 | Tammy Mebane | Friends of the River |
| 208 | Susie Snedden | |
| 209 | Richard Snedden | |
| 210 | Kenneth & Rosemary Twisselman | |
| 211 | Jerry Jonnum | |
| 212 | David Hardt | |
| 213 | Anonymous | |
| 214 | Anonymous | |
| 215 | Bruce Miller | |
| 216 | Mary Gorden & Silvie Robillard | Southern Sierra Archaeological Society |
| 217 | Emmy Cattani | Ranchers for Responsible Conservation |
| 218 | Annette Faraglia | Pacific Gas & Electric Company |
| 219 | Jennifer Hopper | |
| 220 | Jeff Kuyper | Los Padres ForestWatch |
| 221 | E.J. Remson | The Nature Conservancy |
| 222 | Ronald Jacobsma | Friant Water Authority |
| 223 | Chris Evelyn | |
| 224 | Michael Painter | Californians for Western Wilderness |
| 225 | Paul Martzen | |
| 226 | Bruce Witcher | CORVA |
| 227 | Chris Horgan | Stewards of theSequoia |
| 228 | Dennis Law | Central Coast Motorcycle Association |
| 229 | Darin Layton | Layton Melton Productions, Inc. |
| 230 | Allison Diller | Kern River Mountain Bike Association |
| 231 | Warren Gross | San Joaquin Grotto |
| 232 | Kyle Griffin | |
| 233 | Michael Lekas | |
| 234 | Charles Nelson | National Speleological Society #54262 |
| 235 | Marcia Rasmussen | Tehipite Chapter of the Sierra Club |
| 236 | Charlotte Campbell | PXP |
| 237 | Chris Tulley | |
| 238 | Tim Crab | Taft Motorcycle Club |
| 239 | Susan Antenen | Conservation Biology Institute |
| 240 | Gary Rollinson | Friends of the River |
| 241 | Allen Chen | Friends of the River |
| 242 | Tom Brown | |
| 243 | Nick Ortiz | Western States Petroleum Association |
| 244 | Phillip Eddey | San Joaquin Grotto |
| 245 | David Weaver | |
| 246 | Mark Kinsey | |
| 247 | Julie Booker | |

| Comment Submission Number | Commenter Name | Commenter Affiliation |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------|---|
| 248 | Ryan Baker | |
| 249 | Genie Luzwick | |
| 250 | Chris Roske | |
| 251 | Dr. Kathryn Biacindo | |
| 252 | Chris Acree | Friends of the River |
| 253 | Michael Connor | Western Watersheds Project |
| 254 | David Reynolds | Association of California Water Agencies |
| 255 | Bruce Rogers | |
| 256 | Mark J. Pishinsky | Venoco, Inc. |
| 257 | Lorelei Oviatt | Kern County Planning & Community Development Dept. |
| 258 | Shawn Kerns | Occidental of Elk Hills, Inc. |
| 259 | Jim Robinson | Vintage Production California, LLC |
| 260 | Ray Watson | Kern County Supervisor, District 4 |
| 261 | Kathleen Goforth | US Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX |
| 262 | David Clendenen & Dan York | The Wildlands Conservancy; Wild Wolves Preserve |
| 263 | Leonard A. Bidart | Bidart Bros. |
| 264 | Reed Tollefson | Audubon California-Kern River Preserve |
| 265 | Dave Steindorf | American Whitewater |
| 266 | Gary Coats | |
| 267 | Steve Evans | Friends of the River California Wilderness Coalition |
| 268 | Wendy & Vince Hoss | |
| 269 | Terry Harris | |
| 270 | Dennis Fox | |
| 271 | Jeff Baxter | |
| 272 | Liz Robinson | |
| 273 | Dennis Tipton | |
| 274 | Dale Lincoln | |