Appendix D—Assessment of the Environmental Degradation Caused by Illegal Immigrants at Fort Bowie National Historic Site

UDA Cleanup Project
August 29, 2003
Lana Moore, National Park Service
(520) 670-6501

A. ASSESSMENT DOCUMENTATION

1. PARK: Fort Bowie National Historic Site, Arizona

2. PROJECT TITLE: Undocumented Alien (UDA) Cleanup Project

PROJECT LOCATION: Located throughout the Fort Bowie National Historic Site and adjacent areas.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: The systematic survey of the park and neighboring areas for location of Undocumented Alien (UDA) campsites and trails. Identified sites will be recorded with a GPS, trash sites will be documented, before and after photographs taken, and subsequent trash collected. The trash will be placed in large bags to be counted and weighed. Data will be formatted into a report and map generated demonstrating the site localities.

DISCLAIMER: Previous work has been done at Fort Bowie National Historic Site to remove trash discarded by immigrants in and near the park. The amount of trash gathered is unknown but said to be extensive. Consequently, the data collected only reflects a small amount of the actual refuse found in the park each year. It should also be noted that Karen Roberts, an employee at Chiricahua National Park, had performed work on this project prior to my arrival. Therefore, the documentation and removal of several sites had already been completed before I began. Methodologies discussed are mine, but are probably similar to those used by Roberts.

DESCRIPTION OF METHODS: The survey resulted in a thorough examination of the project area. The crew (me) surveyed the project area examining known sites and identifying new ones. Areas with higher potential (washes, roadsides) were covered more intensively. Park employees were also questioned about known sites within the park and in nearby areas

Once identified, the horizontal extent of the site was established and significant features noted. The sites were recorded using a standardized form and checklist. A description of the trash found at the site and general information about the locality and function of the site was noted. A GPS point was taken using a Trimble GeoExplorer 3. These points were used in the later production of a map. Photographs were taken before trash removal as well as after. All trash (excluding fecal material) was placed in 50-gallon bags, separated by site. These bags were weighed and data recorded on form. A map was generated using

points previously collected and placed on a map using Pathfinder Office and ArcView GIS programs. All data collected was used in the compilation of this report.

3. FINDINGS: Fifteen sites were recorded in the project area. A complete description of the sites can be found in the attached site forms. The majority of the sites were small trash scatters usually containing clothing, water containers, and some food containers. The project area also contained a couple of sites that had extensive trash scatters over a sizeable area (Site 5, 7 and 8). Two main UDA areas at the West End of the park and in Siphon Canyon, just outside of the park (see map) contain the majority of the sites.

   Most of the sites are either located in a wash or alongside Apache Pass Road, frequently both. Upon examination of locality and types of trash found, I determined many of them to be pick-up/drop-off sites. This was concluded based upon their proximity to the road and the amount of clothing, backpacks, blankets and the types of food containers found there.

   Fast food containers from McDonalds, Kentucky Fried Chicken as well as perishable food items such as lunchmeat, mayonnaise, and corn on the cob are not conducive to people on long journeys. These items suggest that these people are being dropped off here to be picked up later or are being brought food. The site localities near the road would make an ideal set up.

   Discarded clothing, backpacks, and blankets are commonly seen in areas where people have completed their journey by foot and are to be picked up. Canned food, insulated water containers, and numerous water jugs also indicate a pick-up site. These sites are commonly found near the road.

   UDA trails are often difficult to identify due to the fact that the immigrants frequently travel in washes or use pre-existing game trails. However, one trail was found leading from Site 6 to the road (see map and pages 8-9). This was determined to be a UDA trail because of the lack of game sign (droppings, tracks) on the trail and its obvious route from the site to Apache Pass Road.

4. RESOURCES IMPACTED BY ILLEGAL IMMIGRANTS: Figures released from the Border Patrol in the Fort Bowie area show a considerable increase since last year. Greg Maier, Public Relations Officer, reported the total apprehensions in 2002 to be 104. These numbers rose to 218 for 2003 to date (September). This demonstrates a steady increase that may continue into next year.

   The chief impact of illegal immigrants to the park is an aesthetic one. A couple of the areas studied were extensively covered with waste. Clothing strewn from the trees; cans, water jugs, and plastic bags tossed about; aluminum cans, and bottles reflecting in the sun; disintegrating toilet paper, feces and rotting food. Not a pleasant experience. Least of all one that the National Park Service wants its visitors to have.

   Other impacts can be found on cultural and natural resources as well. Several times I noticed that recent UDA sites were located on or near historic trash scatters and sites. I had to be careful when picking up trash not to pick up the

historic artifacts with the recent trash. Site 6, for example, is located on a historic mine site. The site includes a prospect pit, rock pile, and associated artifacts. The integrity of this site has been greatly compromised by illegal immigrant activity. Site 6 also contains a tree that appears to have been lit on fire (see page 9). This act has the potential to cause an insurmountable amount of damage to the park and the plants and animals that inhabit it.

Table 1

Site #	Article I. ate Recorded	Article II. UT M	Trash Inventory	# of bags (50-gal.)	Weight (lbs.)	Exposure
1	08/11/03	None	Fire rings, plastic bags, cans, FF condiments, plastic silverware, blankets, WC, TP, can opener	1	3.06	1, 30, 31
2	08/11/03	None	Beer bottles, cans, clothing, WC	1	2.06	None Taken
3	08/11/03	None	Cardboard, clothing, TP, FF travel containers	1	2.06	2
4	08/11/03	N 3558119.24m E 643549.68m	Clothing, cardboard, tin foil, cans	1	2.56	3
5	08/13/03	N 3557809.26m E 643226.67m	Clothing, cans, WC, backpack, toothpaste tube, jars, corn cobs, feces (not collected), Marlboro container	1	7.06	5, 6
6	08/13/03	N 3558079.73m E 644156.41m	Clothing. Food cans, WC, TP, cardboard, tin foil, beer cans/bottles, burned tree	1	3.56	7, 8, 32-36
7	08/18/03	N 3559224.93m E 646838.52m	Clothing, WC, cardboard, tinfoil, cans, 2 backpacks, food wrappers and cans, 2 pairs of shoes, medicine wrappers, bottles	1	16.06	9-16
8	08/19/03	N 3559426.07m E 646790.95m	Clothing, WC, blankets, backpacks, cans, TP, bottles, FF containers (KFC, McDonalds), tinfoil, cardboard, food cans and containers, plastic, plastic bags, plastic silverware, jars, beauty products	4	1-10.56 2-14.56 3-14.06 4-6.06	17-28
9	11/18/03	None	Backpacks (7), WC (6), Food cans, clothing, cardboard, and a cut aluminum beer can used as a dish.	1	15.5	None Taken
Totals				**12**	**97.16**	

FF- Fast Food, WC- Water Containers, TP- Toilet Paper

Table 2

Article II ite #	Lat/ Long	Trash Descriptions	Article IV of bags (50-gal.)	Article V. eight (lbs.)	Picture File Names
T01	32.152° 109.481°	Aluminum cans	1	1	T01-1
T02	32.153° 109.478°	Clothing	1	2	T02-1
T03	32.152° 109.475°	Clothing, tin cans, plastic	1	8	T03-(1-5)
T04	32.152° 109.479°	Plastic milk jugs & water bottles, clothing, fast food bags	1	8	T04-(1-5)
T05	32.163° 109.444°	Aluminum cans, plastic jugs, various pieces of metal	1	14	T05-1
T06	32.157° 109.453°	Picked up by Fort Bowie Maintenance	3	1-4.5 2-4.5 3-5.5	None
Totals			**8**	**47.5**	
Initial	**Totals**		**20**	**144.66**	

T01-T06- Sites Identified by Karen Roberts

SITE 1: Site consists of a fire ring and three other scorched areas where UDA's have camped. Also located on site are blankets, fast food condiment wrappers, water containers, toilet paper, and plastic bags, cans, can opener and plastic silverware. Site is located at the West End of the park on the North side of Apache Pass Road. The site is in the wash below the Massacre Site. The blankets were found just North of the park boundary.

SITE 2: The site consists of a sparse scatter of trash on both the North and South sides of the main park road. Trash inventory includes beer bottles (may be related to road locality), clothing, water jugs, food and aluminum cans. Site is located south and in the same wash as Site 1.

SITE 3: Site is located in the wash that runs North from the West Boundary fence. Site is 218° Southwest of first pullout. Site consists of a small scatter of clothing and cardboard (fast food travel containers from McDonalds) located along the wash.

SITE 4: Site is located in a series of drainages just South of the first pullout. Site contains mainly clothing but also contains cardboard, cans, and small fragments of tin foil.

SITE 5: Site is located just outside of the park boundary on the West. Site is a moderately dense scatter of clothing, cans, water containers (including an insulated jug), a backpack, toilet paper, jars, cans and other food containers, corncobs, Marlboro wrapper, and feces (not collected). Site is located in some mesquite brush near Apache Pass Road.

SITE 6: The site is located in drainage and nearby areas to the south-southeast of the second pullout. The trash is mainly concentrated in a protected area of the wash but items can also be found on higher places on both sides of wash. A historic prospect and rock pile are located within trash site along with other historic artifacts. This demonstrates the impact of UDA's on cultural resources. Site contains clothing, water containers, toilet paper, food cans, cardboard, tin foil, and beer cans/bottles. At this site a live tree caught fire or was lit on fire (exp. 7). Fire started at base and went up tree. The potential risk of wildfire related to UDA activity should be assessed.

SITE 7: Site is located along both sides of wash in Siphon Canyon. Site is located in dense groves of mesquite and other vegetation. Appears to be a more migration-like site than a drop off one. Site is rather large and appears to have been used for quite some time. Site contains 2 backpacks, clothing, 2 pairs of shoes, water containers, food wrappers, cans, bottles, medicine and gum wrappers, cardboard, and tin foil.

SITE 8: Site 8 is an extensive site that follows Siphon Canyon. Site covers both the East and West sides of the wash/road and is densest where the wash/road intercepts Apache Pass Road. Site appears to be another pick-up site along with a camping/drop off site. Site consists mainly of clothing, blankets, backpacks, water containers, tin foil, plastic silverware, jars, and beauty products.

Section 5.01 **SITE 9:** Site 9is located just Northwest of Site 5 on the opposite side of Apache Pass Road. The site appears to be a pick-up site based on the types of trash discarded there. Site consists of backpacks (7), water containers, food cans, clothing, and cardboard. A burned log was also found, representing the threat of a wildfire. Site is located in a deep ravine approximately 30 meters from road.

5. SITE MONITORING: Due to the extension of the project I was able to revisit the sites previously discussed. I discovered during my visit that some of the sites (3,7,8) were continuing to be used. One bag of trash was collected at each site weighing from 10 to 16 pounds.

Table 3

Site #	Article VI. ate Recorded	Article VII. U TM	# of bags (50-gal.)	Weight (lbs.)
3	11/18/03	None	1	10
7	11/20/03	None	1	11
8	11/20/03	None	1	16
Totals			**3**	**37**
Project	**Totals**		**23**	**181.66**

6. DEDUCTIONS: As indicated previously in this report, I have determined Fort Bowie National Historic Site and surrounding area to be widely used as a drop-

off/pick-up site for illegal aliens. Evidence for this can be seen in the items left behind from these activities and the localities in which the items are found. Fast food containers, perishable food items, discarded clothing, blankets, and backpacks are indicators of this activity. Most sites were located just off of Apache Pass Road in wash or thick vegetation, also indicative of this activity.

UDA activity has the potential to diminish the enjoyment of park visitors when confronted with large amounts of unsightly trash. Numerous hours are spent annually cleaning up after UDA's in hopes of preventing this confrontation and maintaining the integrity of the park. UDA sites have been found on known historic sites in the park and have impacted the Cultural Resources protected by the park. The threat of a wildfire as a result of UDA activity is evident in the presence of a scorched tree in UDA campsite 6, a burned log ins site 9, and fire pits in site 1.

During this project 23 bags of trash were collected. These bags weighed a total of 181.66 pounds. As mentioned before, UDA trash removal had been done prior to my arrival. Consequently, the figures above only represent a small portion of the actual amount of waste found in the park each year.

The necessary steps needed to minimize the impact of illegal migration on the park are unclear. Many parks throughout the southwest face this same problem. Continued communication between the Border Patrol and Law Enforcement may be the only action the park can take until further studies are completed or more money becomes available to combat this problem. The only certainty is that illegal immigrants are having a negative impact on the park and will continue to do so until they are prevented from entering the park and leaving their refuse behind.