

?

1

2

3

SANTA ROSA & SAN JACINTO MOUNTAINS

4

NATIONAL MONUMENT

5

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

6

7

United States Department of Agriculture

8

United States Department of the Interior

9

10

11

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT

12

OF

13

PROCEEDINGS

14

15

MEETING LOCATION: LIVING DESERT EDUCATION CENTER
47900 Portola Avenue
Hoover Room
Palm Desert, CA

16

17

18

DATE AND TIME: Monday, January 28, 2002
8:40 a.m. to 4:05 p.m.

19

20

REPORTED BY: DIANE L. MARTIN, CSR, RMR
CSR No. 8268

21

JOB NO.: 58933DLM

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

P R E S E N T

MONUMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE (MAC):

- ALLAN MUTH, expertise in natural science and research, University of California, Riverside, Deep Canyon Research Center
- WILLIAM WATTS, District Superintendent, California Department of Parks and Recreation
- FRANK BOGERT, former Mayor, City of Palm Springs
- BARY FREET, Palm Springs Fire Chief, resident of Cathedral City
- TERRY HENDERSON, Council member, City of La Quinta
- ROBERT BROCKMAN, Planning Director, City of Rancho Mirage
- BUFORD CRITES, Council member and former Mayor, City of Palm Desert
- LARRY GRAFTON, Senior Planner, City of Indian Wells
- BARBARA GONZALES-LYONS, Vice Chair, Tribal Council, Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians
- BILL HAVERT, Director, Coachella Valley Mountains Conservancy
- JEFFERY MORGAN, Sierra Club, Local Conservation Organization
- EDWARD KIBBEY, Building Industry Association
- BOB LYMAN, Regional Office Manager, County of Riverside
- ROB PARKINS, General Manager, Winter Park Authority
- RUTH WATLING, Chair, Pinyon Community Council

1 STAFF AND PRESENTERS:

2 DANELLA GEORGE, Santa Rosa and
3 San Jacinto Mountains National
4 Monument Manager
5 CONNELL DUNNING, Community Planner,
6 Bureau of Land Management Palm
7 Springs/South Coast Field Office
8 GENE ZIMMERMAN, Forest Supervisor,
9 San Bernardino National Forest USFS
10 PAUL IDEKER, Meeting Facilitator
11 LAURIE ROSENTHAL, USDA Forest Service,
12 District Ranger, San Jacinto Ranger
13 District
14 JIM KENNA, BLM Field Manager, Palm
15 Springs/South Coast Field Office
16 RICHARD CAMPBELL, Superintendent,
17 California State Parks
18 TOM DAVIS, Agua Caliente Band of
19 Cahuilla Indians
20 ELENA MISQUEZ, Planning Coordinator,
21 Bureau of Land Management Palm
22 Springs/South Coast Field Office

23 PARTICIPANTS:

24 LINDA VALTER, Representative from
25 Congresswoman Mary Bono's Office

	I N D E X	PAGE
1		
2	WELCOME & INTRODUCTIONS	5
3	WELCOME FROM CONGRESSWOMAN MARY	25
4	BONO'S OFFICE - Linda Valter	
5	MEETING GOALS & OBJECTIVES	29
6	OVERVIEW OF THE LANDSCAPE AND	54
7	SIGNIFICANCE OF THE SANTA ROSA	
8	AND SAN JACINTO MOUNTAINS-	
9	Bill Havert/Jim Sullivan	
10	AGENCY/GROUP PRESENTATION	75
11	ELECTION OF ADVISORY COMMITTEE	124
12	CHAIR & VICE CHAIR	
13	LUNCH BREAK	132
14	STATUS OF MONUMENT PLAN - Connell	134
15	Dunning	
16	SET SCHEDULE AND TIMES FOR NEXT MEETINGS	221
17	PUBLIC COMMENTS	253
18	MEETING SUMMARY	286
19	MEETING ADJOURNS	287
20	PUBLIC SPEAKERS:	
21	EDDY KONNO, Page 254	
22	NICK STEFFANOFF, Page 256	
23	DAVE MATHEWS, Page 261	
24	JOE INGRAM, Page 265	
25	GAYLE CADY, Page 268	
	GLEN RASMUSSEN, Page 272, Page 282	
	LITA TUNNICLIFF, Page 274	
	LES STARKS, Page 274, Page 283	
	EILEEN HENNING, Page 276	
	NIKI BOGERT, Page 278	
	REBECCA NAVARRE, Page 279	
	SCOTT QUINNEL, Page 281	

1 Palm Desert, CA Monday, January 28, 2002

2 P R O C E E D I N G S

3 -o0o-

4

5 MS. GEORGE: My name is Danella
6 George, and I am the Santa Rosa/San Jacinto
7 Mountains National Monument Manager. I would like
8 to welcome everybody here today. I am pretty
9 excited, being the first meeting.

10 Some basic introductions this morning.

11 Paul Ideker is going to be our facilitator.

12 Ms. Martin here is a court reporter. The
13 Federal Advisory Committee Act, FACA, requires a
14 record be made of public meetings like this, and
15 so we are using a court reporter.

16 I also wanted to just at some point this
17 morning -- might as well do it now. I am going to
18 have somebody pass a paper around to the different
19 committee members. And what it's for is for
20 lunch. Pretty important. And your choices today
21 are sandwiches; turkey, roast beef, pastrami, ham,
22 or vegetarian. And if you could just sign up what
23 you would like for lunch. And then I will get it
24 at the end and we will make sure it gets sent
25 off.

1 Will that work, Connell?

2 MS. DUNNING: Yes.

3 MS. GEORGE: Another important person
4 I want to introduce everybody to is Connell
5 Dunning. Connell is Bureau of Land Management
6 Community Planner and did most of the legwork to
7 make this meeting happen.

8 Also, Elena Misque, who is in the back.
9 She has been working on the Habitat Conservation
10 Plan.

11 I am also going to introduce from the --
12 because this is a joint Monument. This is a new
13 thing of seamless government. It's USDA Forest
14 Service, the San Bernardino National Forest,
15 Idyllwild Ranger District or San Jacinto Ranger
16 District, and the Bureau of Land Management. And
17 the management of this Monument is in cooperation
18 with Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians, State
19 Parks, and California Department of Fish & Game.

20 But this morning, Jim Kenna is going to
21 represent the BLM for an introduction. And Gene
22 Zimmerman. Jim is field manager for BLM South
23 Coast/Palm Springs Field Office, and he has also
24 been my boss for two years at BLM and taught me
25 everything I know about BLM.

1 And then Gene Zimmerman, who is Forest
2 Supervisor. And they are going to give you guys a
3 little welcome.

4 MR. KENNA: I would like to welcome
5 you all here. Probably the most important place
6 to start is sort of recognize today as a very,
7 very important transition in the process of
8 creation of the National Monument and the
9 legislation.

10 We had a lot of people at the local level
11 working hard on what that should look like. But
12 from the very beginning, there wasn't any
13 discussion about whether or not there should be an
14 Advisory Group. And what we have today is we are
15 transitioning from out of the legislative process
16 and into the implementation process. And this is
17 the group that will represent that liaison with
18 the public that will help the agencies work
19 together and will help us create the direction for
20 the National Monument.

21 So I guess I am very, very appreciative,
22 and this is a very, very good group in the sense
23 of it's a good mix of folks and some very, very
24 important people are here, 15 of them, that will
25 represent a lot of different interests and bring

1 to us a lot of information that will help us in
2 the planning process and make sure that we are
3 doing our very, very best to provide the kind of
4 public service and to realize the kind of vision
5 that the National Monument legislation
6 represents.

7 So with that welcome -- Gene, did you
8 want to offer something?

9 MR. ZIMMERMAN: Yes. Good morning and
10 congratulations. This is kind of the end of the
11 honeymoon, I guess. Time to roll up the sleeves
12 and go to work. And there is a lot of work to
13 do.

14 In less than two years, we need to
15 produce a Management Plan for the Monument. So
16 perhaps instead of congratulations, maybe there
17 will be condolences, because we do have a lot of
18 work for you to do.

19 As Jim said, you are kind of the point of
20 contact into the community. We have got this
21 Management Plan. We really need to work hard to
22 try to develop a consensus of community views, a
23 plan that represents good land stewardship,
24 provides for recreation, some tourism, and that
25 provides for recovery of threatened species,

1 threatened and endangered species. So it's a
2 tough job.

3 At the same time, I think the Management
4 Plan can be a model in that we have folks like you
5 to help us. I think we can make it more in the
6 form of a business plan, a business plan that
7 integrates community resources into how we get
8 things accomplished as opposed to just relying on
9 funds from Congress. We all know how tight that
10 is.

11 So with your skills and energy and
12 interest and background and so on, I think we can
13 do a Management Plan that's a little different
14 than what us bureaucrats might think about if we
15 just did it ourselves in kind of a smoke-filled
16 room back in a government building someplace.

17 This Monument has been a place where
18 these folks probably turned to many times for
19 respite and to go relax, get away from the strain
20 and stress of daily living. I would suggest to
21 you that perhaps it's going to give you some of
22 that stress and strain over the next two years,
23 particularly as we work on the Management Plan.

24 So continue to go out there and use it
25 like you always did. Just think about the work

1 you have to do when you are out there, because
2 there's a ton of it. This is going to be a
3 collaborative effort between the Advisory
4 Committee, the community, Agua Caliente. And
5 that's a challenge, but I think we are all up to
6 it and we need to work very, very
7 collaboratively.

8 It's going to be interesting, because
9 Danella has got two bosses; Forest Service and
10 BLM. And we are going to try that out and see if
11 we can stretch her thin, make her run fast. And
12 she's your point of contact. She's your go-to
13 person when you folks have issues with the whole
14 process and so on. If they are Forest Service
15 issues, she will bring them to us. If they are
16 BLM, she will take them to Jim or whoever.

17 But today you will be working on
18 government, so -- that's kind of a simplified
19 Reader's Digest version -- on the government
20 side.

21 So I mentioned collaboration earlier.
22 Don't expect any less from us. Again, like I said
23 to start with, roll up your sleeves. Time to go
24 to work. And let's have fun while we are at it.
25 I appreciate you folks. You are really kind of

1 the esteemed volunteers for this Monument. That's
2 really what it is. We want this to be kind of a
3 model of volunteerism and community activism to
4 make this thing work. So you folks can set the
5 pace for that.

6 Thank you.

7 MR. IDEKER: Well, let me add a
8 personal welcome. I have had the pleasure of not
9 only facilitating meetings, but working with both
10 the Forest Service, the BLM, some other federal
11 agencies, and the State of California on this kind
12 of thing.

13 This is exciting for me personally,
14 because it's the first time I get to get in my car
15 and drive about 20 minutes and do it. I am a
16 resident of the Coachella Valley, so I have a deep
17 personal interest in the work you are about to set
18 upon.

19 I want to also welcome the folks who
20 decided to get up very early and be with us
21 today. We will try to make it informative and
22 entertaining to rivet you to those seats and keep
23 you here throughout the afternoon as we possibly
24 can. We do have a very busy day ahead of us, if
25 you have seen the agenda.

1 A couple of things I would like to share
2 with you in terms of house rules: If you have a
3 pager or cell phone, please turn it off now.
4 That's kind of one of my big house rules in this
5 age of technology. Please feel free to leave the
6 room anytime you need to, both to check messages
7 or when you think you might need to take a call.

8 Also, for rest rooms, both men's and
9 women's rest rooms, out the door, turn left. They
10 are on this side of the building at the very end
11 of the building. If you check the agenda, you
12 will see we have some programmed breaks during the
13 day and then lunch. We will try to stick to those
14 as much as we are able to, given the amount of
15 work we have to do.

16 In the room, I would hope that everybody
17 would respect each other. We are all here to
18 listen, to learn, to share ideas. There will be a
19 time at the end of the day, about 3 o'clock, we
20 hope, when public members, noncommittee members,
21 will have an opportunity to speak.

22 Connell, I think you have sign-up cards
23 for those people who may wish to speak.

24 MS. DUNNING: Yes. A pink sheet.

25 MR. IDEKER: If you haven't filled

1 those out and you want to speak, or even leave a
2 written comment, please see Connell sometime
3 between now and 3 o'clock so she has that
4 information and we can make that happen.

5 Members of the Committee, in the front of
6 your binder, you will see a sheet. That sheet is
7 for you to give us your best mailing and contact
8 information. As most of you know, I tried
9 contacting you during the course of the last week
10 or so. I found that some of you have better
11 mailing addresses, better phone numbers than
12 others. We want to make sure you get material.
13 There will be a lot of it coming your way. We
14 want to make sure, with the cooperation of the
15 post office, we get it to you in a timely way. So
16 if there is a phone number that's better than
17 others, a fax number that's better than others,
18 and a mailing address, and an e-mail address -- I
19 would say when e-mail is again available to some
20 parts of the world -- please give us that and,
21 again, give it to Connell before you leave today
22 so that she can update her master file.

23 The clock up there is wrong by about an
24 hour and five minutes. I have the official
25 clock. And we will try to keep us on schedule,

1 but I will also be mindful and respectful of the
2 need for everybody to have a time to express
3 themselves and to share their thoughts.

4 We hope to be able to take questions in
5 some orderly fashion or engage in the dialog
6 around subject areas so we don't get far off
7 track. If you would help us do that. It would be
8 very useful to kind of save a question, write it
9 down, don't forget it, come back when the time
10 seems best and appropriate.

11 I also want to plug in for my friend,
12 Diane, here. She must listen to everything that
13 is said and it must come out of her fingers and
14 end up on that funny sheet of paper, but
15 ultimately in a printed document that will be the
16 recorded proceedings of this session. She may ask
17 you to repeat something. We ask that at least the
18 first time you speak, if you would announce your
19 name -- even though I am going to have you
20 introduce yourselves in a moment, but -- announce
21 your name so she gets a sense of who's in the
22 room.

23 Also, when members of the audience may
24 speak, we would ask you to also announce your
25 name. If it's a weird spelling -- my last name,

1 Ideker, everybody puts a "c" in it. No "c." I
2 know usually I have to spell it. If you would do
3 that, it would help her out enormously.

4 Speak loud. The acoustics in here are
5 pretty good, but, remember, the person that we
6 need to make sure, if you are going to be on the
7 record, that hears you is here at the front of the
8 room.

9 Danella, are there any other housekeeping
10 details I have overlooked or didn't know about?

11 MS. GEORGE: No. I've got to put on
12 that Forest Service hat. I realized I introduced
13 BLM staff that are here, but also Laurie
14 Rosenthal, the new District Ranger for Mt. San
15 Jacinto Ranger District, is here.

16 Fran Caldwell, who has been instrumental
17 in helping with the Monument from San Bernardino
18 National Forest.

19 And Doug Humphries has just come in the
20 door, a man of many hats with the Forest Service.

21 And so I will turn that over for you to
22 do the intros. Actually, we are going to let them
23 do that themselves.

24 We are going to start right here. If you
25 would introduce yourself by name and by

1 affiliation, including "interested member of the
2 community." That's an affiliation today.

3 MR. FREET: I am Bary Freet. I am
4 representing the City of Cathedral City, where I
5 reside. My profession is Fire Chief for the City
6 of Palm Springs. I have in my background
7 approximately 15 years of service with the federal
8 government, both Bureau of Land Management and
9 National Park Service, preceding my work for the
10 City of Palm Springs.

11 MR. BROCKMAN: This is an easy
12 introduction. I've actually got a cheat sheet in
13 here I can read from. Bob Brockman. I am with
14 the City of Rancho Mirage. I am the City's
15 Community Development Director and have been with
16 Rancho Mirage since 1989. And I have been
17 involved in the Multiple Species planning effort
18 and other similar planning efforts through CVAG
19 and other committees.

20 I look forward to working on the
21 Committee here.

22 MR. PARKINS: Rob Parkins,
23 P-a-r-k-i-n-s, general manager of the Mt. San
24 Jacinto Winter Park Authority, owners and
25 operators of the Palm Springs Aerial Tramway,

1 where we can take you from a desert environment to
2 an Alaskan environment for under 21 bucks and take
3 you back.

4 We obviously consider ourselves one of
5 the entryways to the National Monument, so this is
6 a very important committee for us, and I
7 appreciate being on it.

8 MR. CRITES: Buford Crites, City of
9 Palm Desert.

10 MR. MUTH: I thought he was more
11 notorious than that.

12 Al Muth, University of California, Boyd
13 Deep Canyon Desert Research Center. I am a
14 biologist. My primary field of research is sand
15 dune lizards. The Research Center that we operate
16 is embedded entirely within the National Monument,
17 so we have a good deal of interest in what goes
18 on.

19 It's a punctuation mark in a long process
20 that's brought us to this moment, and I am looking
21 forward to working with this group to set a course
22 that will have an impact for a long time to come.

23 MR. WATTS: My name is Gary Watts. I
24 am the representative from California State
25 Parks. As you know, the Committee has a slot for

1 either the California State Parks Department or
2 the Department of Fish & Game. I am representing
3 them as the State Parks representative.

4 I have 25 years experience with the State
5 Parks system. I have been in Southern
6 California -- I grew up here. I have been
7 managing parks in San Diego/Western Riverside
8 County area since 1993. San Jacinto State Park is
9 one of our crown jewels in the entire State Park
10 system, which we are celebrating our 100 years of
11 existence with Big Basin Park's 100th birthday
12 this year.

13 We have a long history of collaboration
14 and partnerships throughout the state with various
15 recreation and resource agencies, including those
16 at Lake Tahoe, Redwood National Park, San
17 Francisco Bay area, right here in the Coachella
18 Valley with the Salton Sea, and with the Winter
19 Park Authority.

20 We are very interested in seeing this be
21 a success. We have a great interest, obviously,
22 being at the top of the mountain and being a
23 critical part of the Monument, in terms of
24 resource management as well as recreation
25 interest. So we are looking forward to being an

1 active and productive member of this Committee and
2 making sure that the Monument becomes a success
3 that can be held up to the rest of the country.

4 MR. HAVERT: Bill Havert. I am the
5 Executive Director of the Coachella Valley
6 Mountain Conservancy. The Conservancy is a state
7 agency. If you are not familiar with us, we were
8 established specifically to protect these
9 mountains and all the mountains around the
10 Coachella Valley through a combination of
11 acquisition and fostering partnerships with other
12 agencies and community groups to provide for
13 people's appreciation and enjoyment of the
14 mountains as well as their protection.

15 On our governing board, we have
16 representatives from the various cities in the
17 Valley, the County, all of the state and federal
18 agencies that manage land within the mountains
19 here, the Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians,
20 and members of the public.

21 And so we have been working with these
22 various agencies for, oh, a little over ten years
23 now on protection of the mountains that are now
24 the National Monument. And we were active
25 advocates of salvaging the National Monument.

1 MR. BOGERT: My name is Frank Bogert.
2 I have been here 74 years in Palm Springs. I have
3 done every damn thing there is to do in the
4 valley. And I was on the President's Commission
5 on American Outdoors for two years. We made a
6 report. I just gave it to Danella.

7 I was the Mayor of Palm Springs for 14
8 years. And I have done a lot of other things. I
9 have ridden every damn trail in this whole area
10 and I know it like a book. For 74 years, I have
11 been riding trails and I still ride every day.

12 MR. LYMAN: Bob Lyman, L-y-m-a-n,
13 County of Riverside. I am the Regional Office
14 Manager for the Transportation and Land Management
15 Agency, which I think one of the things I am going
16 to relate to, going into background and
17 everything, is my kids are now grown and they ask
18 what my involvement in this was. And I kind of
19 explained it. And they all said, "You know, Dad,
20 we went camping there with you when we were very
21 little, and we want to be able to take our kids
22 there."

23 And I think that is really the easiest
24 way to sum up my involvement.

25 MR. MORGAN: My name is Jeffery

1 Morgan. I am with the Sierra Club. I am a member
2 of the Executive Committee. I am Vice Chair of
3 the Conservation Committee. I am also the Chair
4 of the Trails & Access Committee.

5 I have lived in this area for more than
6 25 years, both in Idyllwild and in Palm Springs.
7 I have been exploring and looking after these
8 mountains kind of for all that time. I know them
9 very well. And I would like to see this Monument
10 really go ahead and eventually be protected
11 forever.

12 MS. WATLING: My name is Ruth Watling,
13 and I am Chairman of the Pinyon Community
14 Council. I am also on the CSA Board and the Board
15 of Friends of Desert Mountains. And I have lived
16 in the mountains since 1979. And I think they are
17 a precious commodity and I want to do everything I
18 can to make it work up there.

19 MR. GRAFTON: My name is Larry
20 Grafton. I am a Senior Planner with the City of
21 Indian Wells. I have been employed with them for
22 up to, I guess -- starting in about 1990.
23 Sixteen, twenty years as land use planner,
24 somewhere in that range.

25 The City has a lot of concern with the

1 Monument, considering that almost seven square
2 miles of the City limits are within the Monument
3 itself.

4 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Yes. My name is
5 Barbara Gonzales-Lyons. And I am the daughter of
6 Priscilla Patencio Gonzales and Vincent Gonzales,
7 the granddaughter of Frances Saubel Patencio and
8 Joe Patencio, the last ceremonial singer for our
9 Tribe. And I introduced myself that way because
10 then you know who I am.

11 Our people have been here since the
12 beginning of time. People say 4,000 years. We
13 say beginning of time.

14 Our lands have -- ancestral lands have
15 been these mountains and the valley floor. Our
16 reservation now only consists of 32,000 acres.
17 And we want to make sure we do all we can to work
18 with everybody here to protect the land as best we
19 can.

20 MR. KIBBEY: Before I begin my
21 introduction, Bill Havert forgot to mention that
22 he's also the prime author of the legislation that
23 put this together.

24 I am Ed Kibbey. I represent the building
25 industry of the area. I am the Executive Director

1 of the Building Industry Association, Desert
2 Chapter. I was involved with Bill in writing the
3 legislation, traveled to Washington a couple times
4 to testify before the House and Senate. So I
5 think I got a lot of time in on this.

6 And the building industry is looking very
7 carefully at the preservation of this area, and we
8 are going to help.

9 MS. HENDERSON: Good morning. My name
10 is Terry Henderson. I have been here 33 years.
11 Considering I am only 34, that's most of my life.
12 It was and has been fun watching the Coachella
13 Valley evolve. We now are nine cities instead of
14 what we were when I came here, which was two. So
15 the evolution of this particular Monument and the
16 progress that it makes is very critical to me.

17 I represent the City of La Quinta. I
18 also served as Chair on the Convention and
19 Visitors Authority for two years. And I am a
20 member of LAFCO, which deals with land use issues
21 throughout the County of Riverside.

22 And I can tell you that our particular
23 issues here are Countywide. And I have a very
24 sincere vested interest in seeing that this
25 particular group covers and meets the needs of all

1 of the people in the Coachella Valley and
2 California.

3 MR. IDEKER: Thank you, all.

4 One more technical note that occurred to
5 me as I was sitting there. It takes about an hour
6 for Diane to run out of paper that goes through
7 her machine. So there will be kind of a soft
8 break -- that means you don't get to leave the
9 room -- about every hour and five minutes or so.

10 So when you see the high sign, it means
11 she's reloading. Take a break. Talk among
12 yourselves. Get a cup of coffee or whatever. But
13 don't leave the room. Because we won't be long
14 until we are back.

15 Danella?

16 MS. GEORGE: Well, it's lots of
17 expertise, lots of history. We will have to
18 calculate all the many years that sits here. And
19 it's a privilege to work with you guys and for you
20 guys.

21 When building the agenda, we felt it very
22 important to invite Congresswoman Bono or somebody
23 from her staff. And since the Congresswoman is in
24 session right now, Linda Valter has come to
25 visit. Linda is aide to Congresswoman Bono in

1 Washington, D.C., and instrumental in helping
2 create the legislation.

3 MS. VALTER: And I can't believe that
4 I would say it's warmer in Washington at the end
5 of January than it is out here. It's about 68
6 degrees. It was yesterday too.

7 So, first of all, I would like to thank
8 you for agreeing to serve on this Local Advisory
9 Committee and then congratulate you for all your
10 efforts in putting this bill together. Especially
11 would like to congratulate the Forest Service, the
12 BLM, and the Tribe for the role that you guys
13 played.

14 I figured that I would maybe give you a
15 little brief history of how you all came to be,
16 because it is kind of a funny little story.

17 December 7th, 2000, I think, was when we
18 held the first town hall meeting about the
19 Monument. Several of you were there
20 participating. It was a collaborative effort from
21 the very beginning. And the Congresswoman wanted
22 to reflect that in the legislation. And so we
23 went back and looked at past Monument bills and
24 legislation of that sort. And they had Local
25 Advisory Committees, and so she figured, "Well,

1 let's put one in and let's really delineate who is
2 going to sit on it."

3 So in it went. And then we were going to
4 meet with Secretary Bruce Babbitt, bill in hand.
5 Pretty good first rough draft, we thought. And we
6 were going to talk about that bill. And there was
7 a couple other bills that were floating through
8 Congress. And I told her that I had heard through
9 my sources that her bill was looking good in the
10 Secretary's eyes; the other two bills had
11 problems. "Oh, great."

12 So in we went. Sat down. And the first
13 thing out of his mouth was, "I have a problem with
14 your bill."

15 We went through it and he said, "You
16 know, quite frankly, at this point in time I think
17 I would rather just suggest that the President do
18 this Monument by Executive Order."

19 And the Congresswoman sat there and said,
20 "No. I don't think so," and went into the
21 importance of this Monument, its proximity to
22 various cities, the Tribe, all the local work that
23 had been put into it from the get-go. And the
24 Secretary took notice.

25 So through the bill we went. And toward

1 the very end, he got to the Local Advisory
2 Committee. He said, "What is this?" Well, you
3 know, she explained the reasoning why it was in
4 there. He said, "Okay. This is a little
5 unusual. How come there are so many people in it?"
6 Again, explained the reasoning behind that. And
7 he looked at her and he said, "You know what? You
8 have a good point there. We can work on this. I
9 do see the importance of all these individuals and
10 cities and organizations being reflected in this
11 bill." And into law you guys became.

12 Although it wasn't that easy. Second
13 meeting we had with the Secretary was up in the
14 Congresswoman's fifth floor office. It was kind
15 of small, if you all have ever been there. All
16 his staff and us sitting there. And we thought we
17 had an agreement. Congressman George Miller had
18 signed off on the general language of it and we
19 thought we had ourselves a deal.

20 Well, a few days before the bill was
21 going to go on the floor, Congressman Paumbo
22 voiced a few objections. So for three days on the
23 house floor, Congresswoman Bono chased down
24 Congressman Paumbo and explained the importance of
25 this bill, and really explained that, you know,

1 this is a local effort, the Building Industry
2 Association had sat down with the Sierra Club, the
3 Tribes had sat down with the U.S. Forest Service
4 and the BLM, and how could he look at this bill
5 and say that it's no good. And eventually he
6 said, "You know what? That is the way it should
7 be created."

8 And so on the suspension calendar it
9 went, and went through the Senate and was signed
10 into law. Coincidentally, on the Congresswoman's
11 birthday, October 24th. So she couldn't have
12 asked for a better present.

13 So, again, I want to thank you guys for
14 serving here. Your work is critical. She
15 certainly fought for the inclusion of this
16 Committee in the legislation in Washington, D.C.
17 And, you know, again, I want to thank you for
18 taking your time and devoting it to this cause.
19 So thank you.

20 MS. GEORGE: Thank you, Linda, very
21 much.

22 What we are going to do is some just
23 basic overviews of information that I thought
24 would be fairly important to go over, but tying in
25 with what Linda just talked about.

1 In reading John Adams -- has anybody read
2 that? Last night, I was reading it. It's a
3 really good book. But it was interesting, because
4 I am at the point where he had been in Europe, he
5 had been in France, he had been in England. He's
6 come back to the United States and not real sure
7 what he is going to do in government service, but
8 he knows he's going to do something. Right about
9 there, he's looking at the Vice President of the
10 United States. But he was talking to somebody,
11 and it was the realization of wanting to get
12 something accomplished.

13 And I thought it was so important that I
14 read this last night, that it showed up right
15 before sleep, because he realized that you
16 couldn't get a lot done without it being done at
17 the local level. That was basically it. And one
18 of the tools was committee at the local level. So
19 this is good.

20 So what I have here is just to go over
21 goals and objectives for the first meeting of the
22 Santa Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains National
23 Monument Advisory Committee Meeting as required by
24 the Santa Rosa and San Jacinto National Monument
25 Act of 2000.

1 First of all, we have an agenda. Do you
2 have that, Paul, the agenda for today?

3 MR. IDEKER: No.

4 MS. GEORGE: Did we ever get that on a
5 flip chart? We probably need to put that up,
6 because the agenda itself for today's meeting is
7 to complete the items on the agenda. If we could
8 just put that up.

9 MS. DUNNING: I just have the five
10 things you are addressing right now.

11 MR. IDEKER: She doesn't have the
12 agenda.

13 MS. GEORGE: Well, the agenda is
14 basically what we are doing right now. Does
15 everybody in the audience have a copy too? Do you
16 all have a copy?

17 Okay. It's to establish what's on the
18 items of the agenda, because the agenda itself was
19 built looking at the Federal Advisory Committee
20 Act, FACA, and what we need to accomplish in a
21 first meeting, what the Committee needs to
22 accomplish. So we've got to get that done today.

23 And then, (B), establish the role and
24 expectations of the Committee from the National
25 Monument Manager. This is in FACA.

1 When preparing for your first meeting, I
2 talked with various people that had worked with
3 the different committees, with the BLM, and felt
4 that was important and, also, feedback from Paul,
5 talking with Committee members, and Connell.

6 And so basically what the role and
7 expectations of the committee, of you folks, or me
8 is just straight from the language: You folks
9 advise the Secretaries, the secretaries being the
10 Secretary of Interior, the Secretary of
11 Agriculture, with respect to the preparation and
12 implementation of the Management Plan for the
13 Monument.

14 You work with the public and the
15 Committee is who you input any information to from
16 the public at Committee meetings. And that is
17 really important. The input, when you guys give
18 input, isn't to me. It isn't to BLM. It isn't to
19 Forest Service. It is to the Committee. That's
20 how the input will be distributed during our
21 meetings.

22 To establish critical subcommittees --
23 that, we need to do pretty quickly. Establish
24 critical subcommittees to begin the task of
25 developing a National Monument Management Plan.

1 The group today is to agree to operating
2 guidelines, the Chair and Vice Chair, who those
3 parties will be, and leave with a schedule of next
4 year's -- or a year from today, onward -- meetings
5 at dates and times readily accessible to the
6 public. That, we are going to do a little bit of
7 tweaking on, when we meet, so that the public can
8 be here, because most of the public works, like we
9 do.

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Would the critical
11 subcommittees only be these folks? Or is that --

12 MS. GEORGE: We are going to get
13 there. We will get there when we get into FACAs.

14 I just ask people to hold questions, jot
15 them down until I kind of get through there.
16 Because I want to keep us on the agenda. But
17 that's going to come up.

18 Clarify the Federal or the Monument
19 Manager role with the Advisory Committee. I will
20 serve as the Designated Federal Official. And the
21 legislation talks about a Designated Federal
22 Official. It can either be the District Ranger or
23 the Forest Supervisor, I believe, or Forest
24 Service Official or BLM.

25 And I talked with BLM and with Forest

1 Service and it was agreed that they would delegate
2 and designate myself. And that's what we have
3 agreed to, so that there's one point of contact.

4 I am your Monument Manager. It's my role
5 to work with the Committee on -- you guys -- with
6 the Committee and so information stays in one
7 point of contact. And my responsibility is to
8 make sure the federal employees or federal folks
9 get that information.

10 Okay. By law, I have to call the meeting
11 together, attend and adjourn meetings, by FACA.
12 FACA requires that the Designated Federal Official
13 build the meeting agenda; request assistance and
14 recommendations from the Committee, i.e., we need
15 something done, we ask for the Committee to work
16 on something and then they may create a
17 subcommittee; ensure information is accessible to
18 the public.

19 We will have records on file at both the
20 Ranger District in Idyllwild and at our Field
21 Office that the public can come and view from
22 these meetings.

23 Keep Committee advised about the National
24 Monument activities; be readily available as
25 questions arise from the Committee that they can

1 reach me and they can get answers.

2 Ensure staff expertise from the agencies
3 -- BLM, Forest Service -- or through consultants
4 as available to the Committee.

5 Our staffs work as consultants to them,
6 and if need be on a project, the money is
7 available, we can hire consultants.

8 Okay. My goals this year in the job I'm
9 doing is create and empower the National Monument
10 core staff and contributing staff. We have an
11 organization for the Monument that's been approved
12 by the Regional Forester and the State Director.
13 We have hired some folks in those positions. We
14 call them the core staff. Then the contributing
15 staff are folks like Agua Caliente Band of
16 Cahuilla Indians, their folks.

17 We meet together, we plan projects, we
18 work in concert with each other. We just met on
19 Tuesday; Forest Service, BLM, Agua Caliente.
20 Those are like the contributing staffs. And also
21 our volunteers, our public volunteers in the
22 agency.

23 This week -- or last week, excuse me --
24 on Tuesday, when we met. The core and
25 contributing staff came up with a mission

1 statement of how they see themselves working with
2 the Monument and then helping the Committee. And
3 that is their mission statement, "A shared vision
4 for resource management and public service."

5 Okay. So that's -- got to have a good
6 organization, good team. So that's going to be
7 one of the good things this year for me.

8 Okay. I need to build a strong
9 relationship with the nonprofit friends of the
10 Monument. We have the Friends of the Desert
11 Mountains that have helped us, BLM, and Forest
12 Service. Forest Service has its nonprofits.
13 There's a push to develop a nonprofit foundation
14 structure for monuments in BLM, and this is
15 something I am going to need to work on this year,
16 be very involved with. Some of what Gene talked
17 about is we want to be able to build kind of a
18 friends group that can -- not friends group, but
19 nonprofit strength that we can draw on for
20 agreements, because we are never going to get the
21 kind of federal funding to do the things we need
22 to do.

23 Okay. The deeper penetration into our
24 local communities about the Monument and what it
25 means to the community. Build relationships and

1 trust.

2 We really need to get out into our
3 community, into our schools, into the general
4 population. I just ordered -- it sounds corny,
5 but -- bumper stickers, "Santa Rosa/San Jacinto
6 Mountains National Monument." So how many of us
7 are stuck in traffic? We can see the name of the
8 Monument, start getting that in the minds of the
9 community and the people.

10 Building a strong working relationship
11 with the Advisory Committee and, also, very strong
12 one, I need to add, with the Chair and Co chair.

13 The other job is, "The plan. The plan.
14 The plan." The legislation talks about the plan.
15 The due date for the plan to be finalized and it
16 has to be submitted to Congress is October 24th,
17 2003.

18 And then keeping the Board happy. And
19 the Board is who I report to. And that is Tim
20 Salt, California Desert District Manager; Jim
21 Kenna, BLM Field Manager; Gene Zimmerman, Forest
22 Supervisor; and now Laurie Rosenthal, District
23 Ranger.

24 Okay. So those are basically those
25 items. And before we go to FACA, does anybody

1 have any questions on that, on the Committee? Any
2 rules, responsibility, expectations? Questions?
3 You are clear?

4 Okay. Didn't miss anything? All right.

5 Now, the next thing we got to talk about,
6 because you guys are FACA, is FACA. And we are
7 going to see a little video in a moment.

8 And first to the Committee is
9 reimbursements. We are going to have vouchers we
10 are going to hand out to you guys, and that's
11 going to cover your meals and your mileage. So
12 you just keep track of that, submit it to us, and
13 you guys will get a check in the mail. It's
14 covered.

15 MR. IDEKER: Should that be submitted
16 once a month? Once every quarter? Is there any
17 guideline that you'd like them to follow?

18 MS. GEORGE: Maybe once a month. Why
19 don't we go ahead and say by the end of the month
20 each month?

21 MR. IDEKER: And they have guidelines
22 about what's appropriate to charge or to claim in
23 terms of meeting outside this general meeting?

24 MS. GEORGE: Yes. Subcommittees can
25 also -- and I can sit down with them and go

1 through any detailed questions, but --
2 subcommittees can also charge for mileage and for
3 meals. That is correct.

4 MR. IDEKER: Okay.

5 MS. GEORGE: Yes. And I just jotted
6 down some notes with FACA, because this is very
7 important, the Federal Advisory Committee Act, and
8 to make sure it goes into the record, because the
9 record is submitted to the great FACA-keeper
10 somewhere.

11 And that is FACA is the Federal Advisory
12 Committee Act. Its oversight is by GSA, General
13 Services Administration. I think it was 1974,
14 1976, the Act was finalized, although dating back
15 all the way to President George Washington, he
16 utilized community folks to have committees and to
17 seek advice. I think the Whiskey Rebellion is the
18 one they referred to, is the first time he sought
19 this out. Going back to what John Adams said,
20 last night, the realization that you've got to
21 have local committees to get the job done.
22 Congress recognized the merits of seeking the
23 advice and assistance of our nation's citizens,
24 created FACA, basically to provide advice that is
25 relevant, active, and open to the public, to act

1 promptly to complete their work and comply with
2 reasonable cost controls and record keeping.

3 The meetings are open unless actions or
4 discussions based -- are based on some provisions
5 of the Sunshine Act of 1974. And I -- well,
6 Connell and I, but -- this is information that we
7 got from the Forest Service from an excellent
8 training session. You have it in your notebooks.
9 I have some really good information on FACA and
10 reference sites, because there's things about
11 conflict of interest and ethics and conduct that
12 you might just want to take a look at.

13 And then we talked about the meals and
14 the travel.

15 If you've got any questions, just jot
16 them down. Provide them to me. And we will
17 answer the FACA questions.

18 And we will go ahead and just play this
19 video for folks to get an understanding of the
20 Federal Advisory Committee Act.

21 MR. IDEKER: Now, we decided to show
22 this video rather than go through some of the
23 administrative discussion that you will see in it,
24 because it's -- what? -- 13 minutes, 17 minutes?

25 MS. GEORGE: Thirteen.

1 MR. IDEKER: It's concise. Some of it
2 seems obvious in the true traditions of some
3 instructional federal videos, but it's a good way
4 and a good package to deliver this message.

5 Please, at the end of the video, Danella,
6 as well as others here, are prepared and want to
7 answer your questions today. One of the things
8 that's very important about today's meeting is
9 that everybody, as we proceed through the day,
10 have a clear understanding about, and that is that
11 when you leave here, you are then in charge.

12 So in terms of clearing up and setting a
13 course with as much clarity around housekeeping,
14 logistics, administrative matters, by the time you
15 leave today, we are here to get those issues
16 resolved and understood amongst everybody who's
17 going to be an active player in this as it moves
18 forward.

19 To the extent we are able to accomplish
20 that goal overall, everybody will find this much
21 smoother going. We will be able to accomplish
22 that if you think about that question that is
23 important to you. It doesn't matter if it's
24 important to anyone else. We want to answer it,
25 want to get it out on the table. It may be

1 something someone else is thinking about. So as
2 you watch this --

3 MS. GEORGE: For housekeeping, though,
4 can we do that at the end of the presentation, the
5 Q&A's, so that -- at the end of the presentation,
6 so people can finish their presentation?

7 MR. IDEKER: Sure. That would mean
8 that when we are done seeing the video, you would
9 be ready for Q&A's.

10 MS. GEORGE: Or to write them down.
11 FACA is very complicated --

12 MR. IDEKER: Oh, they gave me a
13 handbook. It's really probably a lot simpler than
14 that handbook, which, again, is why I thought this
15 movie shows us everything we need to know about
16 FACA in terms of being functional. And we don't
17 want to be burdened with too much of the
18 administrative, but we do need to operate within
19 the guidelines. Okay?

20 (Video shown.)

21 MR. IDEKER: Well, I noticed many of
22 you on the edge of your seat, just absolutely
23 riveted about that. And if you weren't, of
24 course, you have no appreciation for high art.
25 You will also be glad to know the score for that

1 film is available at the end of the meeting; CD
2 and cassette version. So if you are having
3 trouble sleeping, you won't want to miss that
4 purchase as a memento of today's meeting.

5 As you saw, it covered a great deal of
6 the basics, some of the rudimentary questions that
7 may be going through your minds.

8 To further embed you in the culture of
9 FACA, Danella is now going to go over the actual
10 charter that's handed to this Committee, as it's
11 handed to others, and review that with you, review
12 some of the key points.

13 After that, we are going to go into a Q&A
14 time for the members of the Committee about some
15 of the issues raised by the film, raised by
16 Danella's presentation earlier, and by the
17 coverage of the charter she's going to give you.

18 Danella, might I just ask you to -- you
19 speak very quickly.

20 MS. GEORGE: Okay.

21 MR. IDEKER: I saw Diane's ears kind
22 of going --

23 MS. GEORGE: Okay. Can you guys hear
24 me, too, back there? Everybody can? Good.

25 All right. FACA requires that once it's

1 been determined there's going to be a committee,
2 that a charter is drawn up. And that is what
3 occurred here. And the charter was approved in
4 October of last year by Secretary Venaman of the
5 Department of Agriculture and Secretary Gale
6 Norton of the Department of Interior.

7 And, basically, I am just going to focus
8 on two here, because I think that's important.
9 The Committee objectives and scope. And that's,
10 "To advise the Secretary of the Interior and the
11 Secretary of Agriculture with respect to the
12 preparation and implementation of the management
13 plan for the conservation and protection of the
14 Santa Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains National
15 Monument, now the 'National Monument,' as required
16 by the Santa Rosa and San Jacinto National
17 Mountains Monument Act of 2000."

18 So, I mean, that was basically what the
19 objectives were for the Committee and the scope
20 when it was established.

21 Period of time is discussed for the
22 Committee's activities. Basically, it was once
23 the plan was done and ready to be implemented,
24 they will go back and see if the Committee -- what
25 next it probably needs to tackle.

1 FACA requires every two years that a
2 Committee be rechartered. And in addition,
3 continuation of this Committee will be subject to
4 periodic review and rechartering every two years.
5 That's under No. 3.

6 Okay. You guys report to the
7 secretaries, again, No. 4, through the Designated
8 Federal Official.

9 And I am not going to go into
10 administrative support. There's copies of the
11 charter in the back for everybody on the Committee
12 to grab, put in your notebook, and for the public,
13 too, that's really, really interested. But I
14 think it's really important for the Committee to
15 be pretty square on the charter.

16 So on this one, "Duties of the
17 Committee," No. 6: "At the request of the
18 Designated Federal Official or his or her
19 designee, the Committee will meet periodically to
20 gather and analyze information, conduct studies,
21 field examinations, hear public testimony,
22 ascertain facts, develop recommendations in an
23 advisory capacity only for the Designated Federal
24 Official concerning preparation and implementation
25 of the management plan for the National

1 Monument." That's pretty important.

2 Another thing that might be of interest
3 to the public is No. 8, and that was how members
4 will be appointed to serve a three-year term,
5 except at the beginning of this Committee
6 one-third of the Committee has a one-year term, a
7 five -- excuse me -- a three-year term, and a
8 two-year term.

9 And, again, "All members will serve
10 without pay, but will be reimbursed for travel and
11 per diem expenses at current rates for government
12 employees." And that's under 8(f).

13 And then the question with subcommittees
14 the gentleman had here. "Subcommittees," No. 9.
15 "To facilitate the functioning of the Committee,
16 subcommittees may be formed to study and develop
17 recommendations on selected issues for
18 consideration by the full Committee. The
19 membership of any subcommittee shall be balanced
20 in terms of points of view represented and
21 functions to be performed. Subcommittees may
22 include individuals who are not Committee members
23 if they are appointed by the Chairperson with the
24 concurrence of the Designated Federal Official or
25 his or her designee."

1 So this is where we could bring in folks
2 that aren't on the Committee.

3 And, also, subcommittees can meet without
4 public notice and a public meeting.

5 MR. IDEKER: Unfortunately, that
6 person I don't believe is in the room who asked
7 the question. You might keep an eye out when he
8 comes back in the room, show him that section of
9 the charter.

10 MS. GEORGE: I will show him, too, if
11 I see him -- or give him a copy.

12 The Committee -- let's see.

13 "Committee Officers: The Committee will
14 elect a Chairperson and Vice Chairperson from
15 among its members annually. Chairpersons and
16 members of any subcommittees formed will be
17 appointed by the Committee Chairperson with the
18 concurrence of the Designated Federal Official or
19 his or her designee."

20 And it just goes into the meetings, how
21 they are called. The DFO calls the meeting after
22 consultation with the Committee Chairperson. "The
23 Designated Federal Official will attend all
24 meetings of the Committee. All Committee
25 meetings, including field examinations, will be

1 open to the general public, including
2 representatives of the news media."

3 We have to publish in the Federal
4 Register -- that's what was the glitch for the
5 first meeting that we had hoped to hold -- has to
6 be published preferably 30 days before the
7 meeting, and in an emergency situation if
8 circumstances prevent a 30-day day notice, not
9 less than a 15-day notice will suffice.

10 The Committee meeting agendas must be
11 formally approved in advance by the Designated
12 Federal Official or their designees.

13 Committee records, it goes into. This
14 one shows about \$60,000 in estimated operating
15 cost for this Committee for the first two years or
16 the two years that it was set up for.

17 Talks about the termination date of the
18 Committee. And -- let's see. I think we better
19 go back. There is one more important thing about
20 the Committee membership in here, and that is,
21 "When a member fails to regularly attend
22 meetings, the Designated Federal Official will
23 inform the member, in writing, that their service
24 on the Committee could be terminated. When any
25 member fails to attend two consecutive meetings,

1 without good cause, the DFO or his or her designee
2 may deem that member's position on the Committee
3 to have been vacated." So it's important to be
4 here.

5 And that's basically it on the charter.
6 Again, we have copies of the charter in the back.
7 And we also have copies of the legislation in the
8 back.

9 Does anybody have any questions on FACA?

10 MR. KIBBEY: Neither the charter nor
11 the video addressed the requirements for minutes
12 of subcommittee meetings.

13 MS. GEORGE: Okay. I will have to
14 look to know exactly what that is. I will have to
15 look that up.

16 MR. IDEKER: So the question is -- so
17 we have it in the record correctly -- "Are
18 subcommittees required to produce minutes and make
19 them part of the record as well? And what is the
20 process for doing that?"

21 MR. KIBBEY: And at what specificity.

22 MR. IDEKER: Okay. "What level of
23 detail?"

24 And, again, if you would, as you ask a
25 question, precede it, just for this initial

1 go-round, by your name so --

2 MR. KIBBEY: Ed Kibbey.

3 MR. IDEKER: -- we make sure and we
4 have that in the record as well.

5 MS. GEORGE: Does somebody in the room
6 have that answer? Jim? Would you --

7 MR. KENNA: Actually, the charter says
8 "by this Committee." And when you send someone
9 off to do a job, you give them their marching
10 orders and what they are supposed to bring back,
11 and that's what comes back into the record.

12 MR. KIBBEY: So it's up to the
13 Committee Chair, then, who makes the --

14 MR. KENNA: Well, this Committee.

15 MS. DUNNING: And there is a big
16 packet in the back that you guys haven't seen yet,
17 but it's quite lengthy. It's a little bit longer
18 than the FACA information that was mailed to you,
19 and it has more information than what's in the
20 video. It starts out with the Federal Advisory
21 Committee Act and then it's followed by a series
22 of questions and answers.

23 So some of the questions that you have
24 might actually be addressed in that section.

25 MS. GEORGE: But we will follow up

1 with an answer. "Does FACA specifically require
2 subcommittee detailed notes?"

3 Is that right, Ed?

4 MR. KIBBEY: Yes.

5 MR. IDEKER: I would believe until you
6 get that answer, and in experience with some other
7 advisory group operations, it's reasonable to
8 expect that you will operate as a subcommittee
9 within the same framework that the real Committee
10 operates with the exception that in subcommittees
11 you don't need a Diane to come and take your
12 minutes, but that those meetings also would follow
13 the guidelines in terms of Sunshine, public access
14 to the information, and the record.

15 Until you may be told otherwise by
16 someone, it's just best to operate within that
17 same set of guidelines to mirror those.

18 Other questions from the Committee about
19 you, your role, the overall Committee's role?
20 Specifics about almost anything you have heard or
21 thought about so far? Yes, sir?

22 MR. MUTH: I am a little confused on
23 the --

24 MR. IDEKER: This is Allan Muth.

25 MR. MUTH: Allan Muth, M-u-t-h --

1 requirements of the subcommittees. Would I infer
2 from what you just said that we would also need to
3 notice in the Federal Register 30 days in
4 advance?

5 MR. IDEKER: I don't believe you need
6 to notice --

7 MS. GEORGE: No.

8 MR. MUTH: I don't think so. But it
9 needs to be open to the public.

10 MR. IDEKER: No? Some subcommittees
11 do not. Then ignore everything I just said.

12 MS. GEORGE: What needs to happen is
13 the Chair needs to make a determination to the DFO
14 of a subcommittee and the components of that
15 subcommittee, who the members would be. The DFO
16 concurs with the Chair of the Committee. And you
17 guys -- we have a clear objective so we know what
18 they are doing, what they are tasked to do, and a
19 time frame to get it done. And then they can meet
20 and go ahead.

21 And it does not have to be open to the
22 public, no. But I don't know about minutes. The
23 minutes was the question. That was a separate
24 question.

25 Did that answer it, Al?

1 MR. MUTH: Sort of.

2 MS. GEORGE: Okay.

3 MR. IDEKER: I did think they had to
4 be noticed to the public.

5 MS. GEORGE: "Meetings of two or more
6 Advisory Committee members or subcommittee members
7 solely to gather information or conduct research,
8 analyze, draft position papers for a chartered
9 Advisory Committee," as an activity not covered by
10 FACA.

11 In your notebook, in the back -- and I
12 can reference it -- it's in here under -- on
13 "Activities Not Covered by FACA." It says,
14 "Meetings to obtain recommendations or advice
15 from one individual; meetings with more than one
16 individual to obtain advice of individual
17 attendees and not for the purpose of obtaining
18 group or consensus advice."

19 MR. IDEKER: Would that preclude this
20 Committee, though, from deciding they do want such
21 meetings to be open to the public?

22 MS. GEORGE: No. I don't think so.

23 MR. IDEKER: Or to make their own
24 rules with regard to the conduct of the business
25 of those subcommittees? So it wouldn't preclude

1 that?

2 MS. GEORGE: No.

3 MR. IDEKER: Once you get down to that
4 level.

5 Other questions? Yes, sir?

6 MR. BROCKMAN: Bob Brockman. Is legal
7 counsel required to be in attendance at the
8 meetings? And if not, how are legal issues
9 handled during meetings?

10 MS. GEORGE: I am not aware of any
11 requirement for legal counsel whatsoever. The
12 only thing I come against with legal counsel was
13 the Sunshine Act to make sure if somebody is
14 invoking -- wanting to have a closed door meeting
15 with the Committee, to make sure that it follows,
16 you know, to ask --

17 MR. IDEKER: Yes, Jim?

18 MR. KENNA: Jim Kenna. Legal counsel
19 is not required to attend the meetings.

20 Generally, if there are legal questions, we do
21 have the option to refer them to a source outside
22 the meeting.

23 MR. IDEKER: So that means that there
24 is a BLM attorney or a Forest Service attorney
25 available to address legal questions should the

1 Committee have them? And those, like everything
2 else, should come through the DFO.

3 MS. GEORGE: From the Chair to the
4 DFO. And then we would submit it and the DFO
5 would bring it back to the Chair and the Chair
6 would bring it back to the Committee. Is that --

7 MR. IDEKER: Got it.

8 MS. GEORGE: Got it.

9 MR. IDEKER: Other questions?
10 Everybody clear on what your role is so far? Some
11 of that is still going to evolve during the course
12 of the day, I'm sure, but -- no questions about
13 that?

14 Well, we are ahead of ourselves. That's
15 pretty exciting.

16 And my inclination, looking at Diane's
17 paper supply, is to move forward and possibly, if
18 Bill is ready, maybe jump to your presentation
19 before the break. Does that make sense?

20 MR. HAVERT: Yes. We are ready.

21 MR. IDEKER: We will confirm that
22 technology is in place and we will swing into
23 Bill's presentation.

24 MS. DUNNING: Could I ask a quick
25 question of members?

1 If you would like to have lunch served
2 from the cafe, what I can do is just take your
3 order, so to speak. It's a sandwich, cookie,
4 water, potato chips, and it will be ready for you
5 if I go over and sign on for you. So if anybody
6 would like to raise your hand, if you'd like to
7 have that lunch, you can order that.

8 MS. GEORGE: And the cost is --

9 MS. DUNNING: The cost is \$10.80. But
10 we don't have to drive anywhere, so that's good.
11 And everybody will be paying for it. You guys
12 will -- hopefully, you got that message that you
13 can pay for it. You will get reimbursed as a per
14 diem to take care of today, but it's \$10.80.

15 So anybody who would like to partake of
16 this great meal that's being provided for us from
17 the cafe at break? Anyone?

18 MR. IDEKER: Can we hit the lights
19 back there, please?

20 MR. HAVERT: What I am going to
21 attempt to do while he is bringing the images up
22 is just give you a quick overview of the National
23 Monument and some of its resources, some of the
24 important pieces of the history of it from our
25 standpoint.

1 But, first, to put it in context, I am
2 going to give you a quick overview of the
3 Coachella Valley area. We are down here right now
4 in Palm Desert. And the black boundary here, by
5 the way, represents a planning area boundary for a
6 Multi Species Plan which is in progress. And
7 that's the source of all these imageries. But
8 that's why you see that boundary on there.

9 In the Coachella Valley itself, you are
10 now seeing the cities located on here from Palm
11 Springs and Cathedral City and Rancho Mirage, Palm
12 Desert, Indian Wells, La Quinta. And then out on
13 the valley floor, Coachella and Indio. And on the
14 north side of the valley, Desert Hot Springs.
15 Interstate 10 running through the Valley here.
16 The Salton Sea is actually down in this area.
17 Just doesn't happen to show up on this map.

18 And you can see, from the imagery on
19 here, the Santa Rosa Mountains and the San Jacinto
20 Mountains, which are the National Monument, of
21 course. And on the far side of the Valley,
22 however, we have the San Bernardino Mountains.
23 This is Joshua Tree National Park. And the Indio
24 Hills out here in the center of the Valley.

25 So we are blessed with a valley which, on

1 one side, has a national park; on the other side,
2 a National Monument. Pretty special place.
3 Pretty special resources out here.

4 On this map now, you are seeing the
5 landownership pattern in the Coachella Valley.
6 And so, again, you see the National Park
7 boundaries over here. BLM is this color. So you
8 see a considerable amount of BLM land, obviously,
9 in the National Monument. You also see
10 significant BLM areas out in the Mecca Hills and
11 the Orcopia Mountains. Two wilderness areas down
12 in this area, Dos Palmas, and on the north side of
13 the Valley, the San Gorgonio Wilderness and the
14 Morongo Canyons, areas of critical environmental
15 concern, and also significant areas out in
16 mid-Valley in the Indio Hills area.

17 You also see green here. This is the
18 Forest Service land. So, again, at the higher
19 elevations in the National Monument you can see
20 Forest Service National Forest lands. And, again,
21 on the north side of the Valley outside the
22 Monument, more of the same San Bernardino National
23 Forest area.

24 This color is Indian reservation land.
25 So this area both within the National Monument in

1 the San Jacinto Mountains and out in the Valley
2 floor, this is the Agua Caliente Indian
3 reservation. And there's actually another area
4 down here. This is the Santa Rosa Band of
5 Cahuilla Indians' reservation up at the higher
6 elevations in the National Monument.

7 There is also other Indian land in the
8 Valley, but these are the only two here within the
9 National Monument boundaries.

10 The bluish tint here is State land. It's
11 actually not differentiated here between State
12 Parklands in the Mt. San Jacinto State Park and
13 the University of California Deep Canyon Desert
14 Research Center.

15 And then we have other lands on here
16 which largely belong to the Department of Fish &
17 Game spread throughout the Santa Rosa Mountains.
18 There are several actual State ecological reserves
19 in the mountains and there's also some land in
20 here in various places that belong to the
21 Coachella Valley Mountains Conservancy.

22 I think that gives you a fairly good
23 sense of the ownership.

24 Now, there are actually some other areas
25 in here that are owned by nonprofit organizations,

1 such as the Friends of the Desert Mountains here
2 and here and here, and some other smaller
3 parcels.

4 And I think there's still possibly a
5 piece up here that belongs to the Wildlands
6 Conservancy. I don't know if that transfer has
7 been made yet, but that's destined for BLM.

8 And the lands with no color on them at
9 this point except for the underlying brownish
10 represent private lands, private ownership within
11 the National Monument. So you can see from this
12 map that we have predominantly BLM and Forest
13 Service lands, a lot of State lands, a lot of
14 Indian reservation lands, and then still a
15 significant amount, but probably the minority
16 amount altogether, of private lands within the
17 National Monument as well.

18 And with that -- let's see. If we can
19 maybe take off the ownership and put on parcel
20 boundaries in the mountains. I just wanted to
21 give a quick sense --

22 MR. SULLIVAN: This is the private
23 parcels.

24 MR. HAVERT: Yes. What you see here
25 now is private lands within the Monument. And

1 within those, we have actually put on parcel
2 boundaries. And what that means is that you can
3 see some areas where whole sections are owned by
4 individuals, other areas where the land is heavily
5 parcelized down to five, ten acres. You can see
6 areas here -- this is the Pinyon Community, where
7 you have considerable residential, rural
8 residential areas up in the mountains, and Pinyon
9 and Alpine Village and Springcrest, Royal
10 Chorizo. So those are sort of the developed
11 centers of the mountains.

12 And in areas where we have been acquiring
13 lands, obviously we work with willing sellers to
14 acquire lands within the mountains. We have been
15 doing that for many, many years.

16 Some other aspects that I think are worth
17 pointing out about the mountains: If we can put
18 on -- let's see. Do we have the exterior boundary
19 of the National Monument as now showing in red?

20 MR. SULLIVAN: Yes.

21 MR. HAVERT: Yes? And do we have the
22 old scenic area boundary?

23 The scenic area is the predecessor of the
24 National Monument. And it was established in 1990
25 by the Secretary of the Interior, and it shows

1 that the boundary is obviously a little bit
2 different. It had some variations along the toe
3 of the slope and probably, most importantly, it
4 was a BLM land use only. It was designated by the
5 Secretary of the Interior.

6 And, of course, the Forest Service is
7 under the Secretary of Agriculture. So at that
8 time, the upper elevations under the Forest
9 Service were not part of the scenic area. And
10 that was one of the things that the National
11 Monument legislation recognized, is that, "Well,
12 the mountains don't stop down here at, you know,
13 4,000 feet," or whatever elevation that is; that
14 it really is a single range that goes up to the
15 ridgeline of the Santa Rosa and San Jacinto
16 Mountains. And so the legislation added the
17 Forest Service lands as well as the BLM lands into
18 the new National Monument.

19 If we can put on the Natural Communities
20 Map now.

21 While he is loading that up, by "Natural
22 Communities," we are really talking about the
23 different vegetation types in the mountains. This
24 is just a way of giving you some sense of the
25 diversity of the landscape and the diversity of

1 the biology in the mountains. And at the lower
2 elevations, again, you are looking at basically
3 creosote bush scrub, which is sort of the typical
4 desert vegetation type that you see as you drive
5 through the Coachella Valley and elsewhere,
6 actually, in the desert.

7 And as you get up to slightly higher
8 elevations, you will start to see a different mix
9 of plants come in. You will start to see the
10 agaves. And then as you get up higher, you will
11 start to see the juniper and the pinyon.

12 So we run through a whole variety of veg
13 types in the mountains from the typical desert
14 communities at the lower elevations. As you get
15 up higher, you would start to encounter the pines,
16 the Jeffery pines, sugar pines, white fir at the
17 very highest elevation. There are areas in here
18 of different kinds of chaparral.

19 In some of the other areas -- looking for
20 the riparian communities on here.

21 MR. SULLIVAN: Probably be pretty hard
22 to find, because they are relatively small.

23 MR. HAVERT: If we can maybe -- well,
24 highlight a few of the communities.

25 You had one there. The Southern Arroyo.

1 Southern Sycamore.

2 MR. SULLIVAN: You are not going to
3 see much, because they are small.

4 MR. HAVERT: Well, in any case, you
5 can see these bands here and there that represent
6 the riparian communities. This one is associated
7 with Palm Canyon and West Fork. And there are
8 other areas as well. Deep Canyon, where you have
9 some really amazing features in the mountains,
10 with perennial streams, you have waterfalls, you
11 have the various kinds of trees that you don't
12 normally associate with the desert, like the
13 cottonwoods, the alders, sycamores.

14 You would also see spread throughout the
15 mountains -- the scale on this map is, of course,
16 too small to show these, but -- dotted throughout
17 our mountains are also the palm oases. And, of
18 course, if you have hiked in the Palm Canyon --
19 and I'm sure almost all of you have -- you have
20 seen the largest native palm oasis in the
21 country. But if you hike elsewhere in the
22 mountains, you would see very small ones. You
23 might find two palm trees or perhaps 20 or 30
24 clustered in an area. Might be down in a
25 sheltered area where there's a spring.

1 Occasionally, you see them in sort of odd-looking
2 places on the side of the mountain themselves
3 where there happens to be water available to
4 support that kind of vegetation.

5 So all in all, it's really a rather
6 remarkable area where you can go from the desert
7 at the valley floor and in a very short distance
8 really you can ascend two vertical miles and find
9 yourself up in communities that are really more
10 alpine in character at the very highest
11 elevations. And that's part of what is really
12 special about this National Monument, is the sheer
13 biological diversity of vegetation types that we
14 have in the mountains. And, of course, it's an
15 extremely dramatic landscape as well.

16 One of the other things we wanted to show
17 you is the boundary of the Bighorn Sheep Habitat
18 in the mountains. I think that's sort of a
19 special feature as well.

20 This is the habitat line. It's called
21 the Essential Habitat Line as determined by the
22 U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service after listing of the
23 species as endangered and done so in cooperation
24 with the recovery team.

25 What you can see here is that the sheep

1 goes down all the way to the bottom of the
2 National Monument boundary and up to about the
3 4,000-foot elevation. That's pretty much
4 considered the upper limit for the Bighorn Sheep,
5 really, based on vegetation. They like the open
6 areas where they can see potential predators. And
7 as they get into the denser vegetation, that would
8 provide a much too easy place for being ambushed
9 by a mountain lion or other predator that is out
10 of their habitat area.

11 So they range pretty far and wide,
12 obviously, through this area. It takes a large
13 area to sustain them simply because the resources
14 are relatively meager in any one area. So this is
15 an important facet of the National Monument, is
16 the presence of this endangered species.

17 There are other species that use this
18 Monument that are also on the endangered species
19 list in the riparian areas. You might
20 occasionally find a nesting Southwestern Natural
21 Flycatcher. They also use the area in migration.
22 So even some that don't nest here may at least
23 pass through, especially during the spring on the
24 way to nesting grounds.

25 There is another one called the Desert

1 Slender Salamander that occurs in two places in
2 the mountains, two very small places, and only
3 there in the entire world. So it's another
4 species that is protected pretty well in the
5 National Monument and is unique to the National
6 Monument.

7 If we can go to the coverage that shows
8 the conservation that's been done since 1990.

9 This map shows at least much of the
10 acquisition efforts that have gone on since 1990
11 when this was established as a National Scenic
12 Area by the Secretary of Interior. A number of
13 agencies have been at work acquiring land in the
14 Monument; the Forest Service, BLM, the
15 Conservancy, the Friends of the Desert Mountains,
16 the Wildlife Conservation Board. Primarily, those
17 entities have been acquiring lands within the
18 mountains. The Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla
19 Indians, I know, have acquired lands at the base
20 of Palm Canyon as part of the Indian Canyons
21 Heritage Park, which is one of the protected areas
22 in the mountains.

23 At this scale, all of these acquisitions
24 don't look like a great deal. But, in fact, they
25 represent many, many thousands of acres, well over

1 15,000 acres of land that has been acquired in the
2 last ten years to help protect the resource values
3 in the mountains as well as protecting them for
4 the species, protecting them for people, and
5 allowing people to enjoy these lands in a variety
6 of ways, viewing them from the valley floor,
7 hiking, horseback riding, et cetera, et cetera.

8 And to put this again in context, then,
9 if we can look back at the overall land use or
10 landownership pattern, you will see that prior to
11 1990, a lot of conservation has occurred in these
12 mountains. You can go back a century and look at
13 the development of the conservation of the
14 mountains. Originally, a lot of federal land in
15 the mountains, but some consolidation. And way
16 back in the twenties, I believe, was the creation
17 of this State Park, which involved not only some
18 acquisition, but also a land exchange. It
19 involved the Forest Service and at that time
20 Southern Pacific Railroad.

21 You can see pre-1990 all of the -- a lot
22 of this blue area. There's a significant
23 involvement on the part of the State Wildlife
24 Conservation Board in acquiring lands, especially
25 trying to fill in the checkerboard among BLM lands

1 to protect primarily the Bighorn Sheep area.

2 Back in the fifties was the establishment
3 of the University of California Deep Canyon
4 Research Center as a gift, actually, from Phillip
5 Boyd, after whom it's really named, and with some
6 additional funding that allowed some later
7 additions to the original acreage that he donated
8 in this area.

9 And then, again, as you saw in the
10 previous map, there's been quite a bit of
11 additional acquisition work done by the State, the
12 federal government, the Friends of the Desert
13 Mountains, Coachella Valley Mountains Conservancy,
14 and so on.

15 So that brings us to the National
16 Monument that we have today. Those acquisition
17 efforts are ongoing. The Friends of the Desert
18 Mountains, also, as a nonprofit organization here,
19 works very closely with BLM and the Forest Service
20 on staffing the Visitor Center down in this area,
21 quite close to where we are today, over on
22 Highway 74.

23 There are efforts going on amongst BLM
24 and amongst the Agua Caliente and amongst all
25 these other agencies and the Forest Service to

1 continue consolidating public ownership in the
2 mountains to protect the resources and to make
3 those available to people for their enjoyment of
4 the Monument as well.

5 I'd be happy, if there is some spare
6 time, to answer any questions people might have.

7 MR. IDEKER: There is time. And if
8 you have questions, while Bill is armed with his
9 maps, it might be a good time to address any
10 interests or concerns or questions you have about
11 the resources in the Monument.

12 Ed over there?

13 MR. KIBBEY: Ed Kibbey.

14 Bill, how do you see the Bighorn Sheep
15 Habitat affecting what we might suggest here on
16 the Committee as to use?

17 MR. HAVERT: Well, I think we need to
18 look at that issue and some other issues in the
19 context of not just the Monument Management Plan,
20 but also the Multiple Species Habitat Conservation
21 Plan.

22 As an endangered species, it obviously
23 does have a level of protection from what's called
24 take. In other words, no harm, no harass of that
25 species or its habitat. And the Multi Species

1 Plan has been in the process of preparation for
2 some years now. And it's getting close to
3 conclusion. Hopefully, by the end of this year,
4 we will have -- well, for certain -- a draft plan
5 out for public review. Whether the permits will
6 actually be issued by the end of the year, I am
7 not quite certain, but that's a rough target.

8 And that plan will address the protection
9 of that species, you know, the different kinds of
10 measures, both land use control, acquisition, and
11 so on associated with that. That plan is also
12 addressing public access, trail use in Bighorn
13 Sheep habitat.

14 And so I think what we need to make sure
15 is that this planning effort and that planning
16 effort are coordinated and in sync with each
17 other.

18 MR. IDEKER: Any other questions for
19 Bill from the Committee?

20 Okay.

21 MR. HAVERT: Thank you much.

22 MR. IDEKER: Quite good.

23 We are still ahead of schedule. And at
24 this point, though, we are going to go ahead and
25 take our first break. It is, by the official

1 clock, 10:11, 10:12. You have earned three extra
2 minutes. We will be back here about 10:35.
3 Please, Committee members are the important ones.
4 We will start at 10:35 once we have critical mass
5 back in your chairs.

6 Once again, rest rooms are at this end of
7 the building on the other side. Good time to
8 check messages -- that's what I plan to do --
9 because cell phones have been off. And I
10 appreciate that and thank you for that. 10:35,
11 back here.

12 (Brief recess was taken.)

13 MR. IDEKER: The Designated Federal
14 Official has already executed her first official
15 act in reminding me to do something that I was
16 supposed to do earlier that I didn't do. So she
17 is on the job. She's working for you.

18 That basically was to review the agenda
19 with you. Since we have gone through about a
20 third of it and we have done that successfully,
21 this may not or may be necessary for some of you.
22 There's a couple of changes as we have kind of
23 gone on, so let's just look at where we are.

24 We are going to begin with this charming
25 and good-looking panel of people as we reconvene

1 here, who are going to talk about basically --
2 these are the people, along with Danella and the
3 other BLM staff you have met so far -- and
4 probably some you haven't met -- who are really
5 most likely going to be the people you interact
6 with most as you move forward with this work.
7 They are going to be talking a bit about their
8 expectations, their plans, their hopes, their
9 dreams for the Monument and their relationship
10 with this Committee, what their expectations are,
11 how they hope to benefit from the partnership that
12 you are now setting out to forge together.

13 We have had Bill Havert's presentation.
14 Very excellent presentation. We then are going to
15 move into the part -- we are gradually moving to
16 the part where you take this over and it's out of
17 the hands, as Danella said, of the bureaucrats.
18 Although there's been little bureaucracy in the
19 morning so far. And hopefully we will keep it
20 that way.

21 But it is time to begin to select
22 leadership. We will do that with an election. I
23 will talk a little bit more about the specifics of
24 the election when we get there. And then we will
25 go to lunch.

1 I am anticipating that we will be ready
2 for lunch a little earlier than we expected if we
3 continue to meet this schedule. And that means we
4 will probably go to lunch 12:00, 12:15. We will
5 be at lunch probably until about 1:00, depending
6 on when we actually break.

7 I am not sure -- Connell, does lunch come
8 here or do they go someplace?

9 MS. DUNNING: Either way. We could
10 have it delivered or we could just take a walk
11 over.

12 MR. IDEKER: Is there an indoor cafe
13 where they might sit?

14 MS. DUNNING: There is an indoor
15 cafe. I am not sure if everybody would take over
16 the space. There is some space available. I
17 haven't asked if reservations are made for all --
18 I was actually going to at some point ask you what
19 you preferred. There's covered outdoor space.

20 MR. IDEKER: Okay. We will just
21 wander over that way and get our box lunches and
22 socialize during the lunch hour. When we come
23 back, we are really going to focus on the
24 Committee and how it wants to operate; any rules,
25 guidelines you want to establish for yourself.

1 Also, it's a time to begin discussing
2 subcommittees, what they might be, what areas,
3 specific areas they may cover. And I am going to
4 move up into the part about setting a time and a
5 schedule for the next meeting. It seems like
6 that's a Committee household chore that we should
7 take care of. And I know that Danella especially
8 is interested to attempt to build a 12-month
9 calendar that starts with this meeting and goes
10 forward for your meetings, at least as a framework
11 to begin the work.

12 We then will hear from Connell, who is
13 going to be talking this afternoon about the
14 current status of the Monument Plan, how the Plan
15 is coming together, who is involved in that, how
16 you will be involved in that. So she has a
17 presentation and a discussion, Q&A time for you to
18 ask questions about that planning process when she
19 gets up here.

20 We then will move into an opportunity for
21 public comments. I don't know what we have
22 received, but by that time, whatever we have
23 received in terms of people saying they would like
24 to address the Committee, there is room for that.
25 We will see how many people there are. Probably

1 keep those presentations to five or ten minutes,
2 depending on how many we might have.

3 After that, Danella and I will kind of
4 wrap the meeting in terms of summary, send you off
5 with words of encouragement into the future to do
6 good work, and then we will ask the Chairman to
7 adjourn the meeting, officially adjourn the
8 meeting.

9 So we still expect that to be somewhere
10 around the 4 o'clock hour, although we can't be
11 sure, the way we are going.

12 So these individuals, who, if everybody
13 is who they are supposed to be today, Laurie
14 Rosenthal -- she raised her hand earlier -- from
15 the Forest Service, who is the new District Ranger
16 up at Mt. San Jacinto.

17 Jim Kenna, you have already met.

18 Richard Campbell is on the end, the man
19 in uniform. He is your friendly State Parks
20 person, superintendent for a broad region in the
21 area, I think. Aren't you?

22 MR. CAMPBELL: No. Mt. San Jacinto
23 State Park.

24 MR. IDEKER: And Tom Davis. You would
25 be Tom Davis?

1 MR. DAVIS: I would be Tom Davis.

2 Good guess. Representing the Agua Caliente Band.

3 MR. IDEKER: So these folks are here

4 to talk with you specifically, as I said, about

5 their expectations, their ideas, their thoughts.

6 This is the beginning of the process, and I would

7 hope that each of you are going to find something

8 in this part of the discussion that you are going

9 to gravitate to in terms of a question.

10 They are here. I don't know when again

11 you will have them all in one room until the next

12 whole meeting of the Committee, so this is really

13 a great opportunity. If there's anything on your

14 mind or you hear anything that any of them have to

15 say, get clarity, ask your questions.

16 And, Laurie, you are the kickoff.

17 MS. ROSENTHAL: Hi. I am Laurie

18 Rosenthal, the new District Ranger for the San

19 Jacinto District. And I want to say that this is

20 such an impressive group and I am just really

21 thankful to be here. I am brand-new, brand

22 spanking new. In fact, I am just lucky that I

23 could find some clothes to wear this morning,

24 because I am in the process of moving. So I am

25 grateful about that.

1 And I just want to say that of all the
2 things in my career that are most precious to me,
3 this would be on top; a group of people from
4 diverse backgrounds coming together to protect and
5 enhance land. And I am just, as I said, very
6 impressed to be here.

7 A couple of things. I come from a
8 background where partnerships and collaboration
9 are extremely important. There is a synergy that
10 I have noticed that develops. It's like the whole
11 is much bigger than the sum of the parts. Know
12 that saying? It's almost like magic that develops
13 when people come together for a common cause like
14 this and put aside their differences and work to
15 protect the land.

16 The last place I came from was Bosque del
17 Apache National Wildlife Refuge in New Mexico.
18 And just to give you an example -- I think it was
19 brought up a little bit before -- of what an
20 amazing power citizens have to get the attention
21 of Congress: We didn't meet any of the criteria
22 for a new Visitor Center, even though it was sadly
23 needed. We weren't right next to an urban area.
24 We didn't have the visitation. And the refuge
25 system is about to be, in 2003 -- about to be 100

1 years old and have a centennial, so there was all
2 this money coming there and they had to
3 prioritize. Well, we were the only one of the top
4 ten for Visitor Centers that made it into that top
5 ten because of our public support. We had a
6 Friends group of 1,000 members. It was like,
7 "Well, you don't want to mess with them," you
8 know. So there is such power here that happens
9 when citizens take charge of things and get
10 involved.

11 One thing that we are going to be
12 striving for is called seamless management. I
13 think you will hear this phrase, if you haven't
14 already heard it. And I think that what this
15 means is the public does not care who manages what
16 lands. When most of the public goes on public
17 land, I think the agencies care more than the
18 public does. And so we want to create a situation
19 here where the public doesn't have to care, that
20 they just know the land is being managed properly
21 and that the citizens are involved as well. And I
22 am committed to this process of seamless
23 management.

24 Now, there are a lot of kinks involved.
25 Things weren't set up for seamless management

1 between our agencies. We have different budgets.
2 We have different regulations. I mean, it's kind
3 of a nightmare. But we want to keep this away
4 from you guys. We want you to be creative and we
5 want you to just have pure thought. Let us handle
6 all the sticky stuff behind the scenes.

7 But I want you to know that we are
8 committed towards this seamless management. There
9 will be Forest Service people that are hired and
10 there will be BLM people. But we are all working
11 together for a common goal. And we might have to
12 go slow in the beginning to get this seamlessness
13 together, but it will happen, I'm convinced.

14 I look forward to attending
15 subcommittees, if I am invited, myself and the
16 district staff, to act in an advisory capacity and
17 information capacity and in any way that you need
18 us. So please feel free. Danella will be your
19 liaison, but please feel free to contact us, or
20 she will get the message to us, most likely.

21 And on a personal note, I do have a
22 vision that is even greater than the Monument, and
23 that is to be a role model so that other
24 communities can look at us and say, "Wow. Look at
25 what they did. They got legislation and they are

1 just moving forward on this great community
2 involvement."

3 Gale Norton, I met her recently, and
4 she -- you are on her list here in a very positive
5 way. She said that what she's heard about you all
6 and all the people that brought this Monument
7 forth is just amazingly good things. So you
8 should know that even Washington is looking
9 closely at this situation. It's kind of like a
10 big experiment. Jim Kenna -- Jim, I hope you
11 don't mind if I quote you. He said that he's had
12 many experiences with different communities, he
13 said. None have compared. This is the most
14 wonderful community involvement. The dedication
15 here is just amazing. So I am really excited to
16 be working with you as well.

17 And this vision I see as a role model
18 that the subcommittees are going to -- and the
19 planning and all these different things that are
20 going to happen, that this will lead to different
21 circles spreading wider and wider. As I said,
22 this synergy that develops, we can end up, when
23 the plan is done, with permanent community
24 involvement. I really believe that success breeds
25 success. And so there's the first stage and the

1 second stage. And people want to come on board
2 when things are successful and things are
3 positive.

4 So I look forward to meeting and getting
5 to know each and every one of you. And thanks for
6 being here.

7 MR. IDEKER: Jim? We will go through
8 all four presentations and then we will come back
9 to questions for individuals and the group.

10 MR. KENNA: All right. I guess it's
11 interesting, because we didn't really get a chance
12 to compare notes, but we are already in sync. I
13 want to talk about things from a slightly
14 different perspective. And there's two or three
15 of you that have heard this pitch from me before.
16 If you want to take a nap, that's fine. Buford is
17 already going to sleep.

18 I want to talk about the National
19 Monument specifically from the standpoint of the
20 seamlessness that's already been mentioned. And I
21 guess I would like to start it from a little
22 different perspective. And maybe my whole purpose
23 is to lay before you the challenge that I see this
24 group has in front of us.

25 I am struck by Barbara's remarks. And if

1 I could borrow a perspective that I have heard
2 before. If you look at the National Monument map
3 and all the colors that are on it, or think about
4 the presentation that Bill gave, you recognize
5 that it's a fairly complicated land pattern.
6 There's a lot of different colors. But if you go
7 back to the kind of perspective that Barbara was
8 talking about, all those colors wouldn't be on the
9 map. It would just be -- it would be mountains.
10 We wouldn't have laid over it a whole bunch of
11 squares and they wouldn't all be different
12 colors.

13 And if you think about that in terms of
14 the history of this country and -- and I will try
15 and keep this short, but I do like history, so I
16 am going to talk a little bit about it. The
17 General Land Office of this country was
18 established in 1812 to manage what the Maryland
19 legislature called the -- what was won by the
20 blood and pressure of all, the Commons. And that
21 group pretty much had as its mission in large part
22 the divestiture of public lands, getting rid of
23 them. And for a lot of good reasons at the time:
24 to cover war debts, to reward soldiers, and those
25 sorts of things.

1 If you sort of fast-forward to 1891, we
2 have shifted gears a little bit. And in 1891,
3 they established the first forest reserves, which
4 was the Forest -- Bureau of Forestry was the
5 predecessor to the modern day Forest Service. And
6 the concept was to deal with some issues,
7 environmental issues primarily, relative to
8 cutting, to establish areas that would be under
9 specific management. And it was still more an
10 agricultural kind of concept of farming trees and
11 making sure that bad practices were not occurring
12 on the landscape.

13 But that model carried us forward into
14 the early part of the next century. Actually,
15 clear until at least World War II. In 1905, the
16 Bureau of Forestry became the Forest Service and
17 then changed departments, from the Department of
18 Interior to the Department of Agriculture.

19 And in 1916, the Park Service was
20 established. And in 1935, the Soil Conservation
21 Service and the Grazing Service. And then in
22 1946, the Bureau of Land Management came along,
23 which was a combination of that very, very first
24 agency, the General Land Office and the Grazing
25 Service. Those two things were put together.

1 And the reason I mention these things --
2 back to that map and to the Monument -- is that
3 our solution to dealing with issues and problems
4 that address the relationship of people and land
5 has largely been to -- when we encounter an issue
6 or encounter a problem, you know, on the federal
7 level, to set up an agency, assign a fairly narrow
8 responsibility, and sometimes a fairly specific
9 landscape to that agency and say, "Go do that
10 thing."

11 And we did a lot of parcelling up of the
12 landscape. And some of it was to encourage
13 settlement. You know, the checkerboards that you
14 see have a lot to do with the railroad history,
15 and they are all over the west relative to
16 railroads and wagon roads and those sorts of
17 things.

18 But if this -- and this is where the
19 vision comes in. What if -- just think for a
20 minute -- we return to that concept that these are
21 mountains and we set aside for a minute all the
22 colors and all the parcelling up and the land map
23 that we have put over the top of it and we said,
24 "You know, maybe we could all work together
25 without anybody giving up jurisdiction or anything

1 else, we could all come to the table together and
2 we could arrive at what makes sense, what makes
3 sense from the public's standpoint, from the
4 outside looking at what we are doing, and what
5 makes sense for the sake of the landscape and
6 what's occurring on that landscape." Pretty
7 radical concept.

8 But that radical concept is, I guess,
9 what I think this Advisory Committee needs to be
10 about. This Advisory Committee has the
11 opportunity, as Laurie indicated, I think, to set
12 the bar to a new level. We have the opportunity,
13 I think, to take this concept of seamless
14 management and show that it can work not just on a
15 little project-by-project basis, but that it can
16 work on a large landscape, that we can take
17 different points of view, different perspectives,
18 that we can grind our way through issues and we
19 can come to an end point which serves the
20 landscape well and it serves the public well.

21 And I guess that is what I would like to
22 lay before you. There will be some things that
23 have to happen that are just -- well, they have
24 been characterized as this adminitrivia. And,
25 hopefully, a lot of that can happen behind the

1 scenes. We are going to have to grind through all
2 of the things that happened between 1905 and
3 today. We are going to have to grind through all
4 of those delegation manuals and all of those
5 regulations that don't match and all of those
6 programs that don't match and budget cycles that
7 don't match.

8 But I think that can't be the focus.
9 What has to be the focus is that bigger vision of
10 trying to set the bar at another level in terms of
11 what we do on this landscape and for the public.

12 So --

13 MR. DAVIS: I'm next?

14 MR. IDEKER: Tom?

15 MR. DAVIS: Good morning. Again,
16 thanks for inviting us to participate in what we
17 think is really a historic and important
18 pioneering event.

19 I want to give -- on behalf of the Tribal
20 Council, I want to give thanks to Danella, Jim,
21 staff, and Laurie, who you just met, who I just
22 met a couple weeks ago, to include us in the
23 process. I am the Planning Director for the
24 Tribe. I work for Barbara and for other
25 individuals who are the Tribal Council.

1 And the Tribe itself is an integral part
2 of this Monument -- creation of the Monument and
3 the Monument itself. And I want to kind of show
4 you a map of what the reservation looks like in a
5 little closer detail. It was fortunate that Bill
6 had his presentation before ours in a sense that
7 you saw on the graphic probably better than you
8 can see on these hard copies where the reservation
9 stands within the Monument itself. But the
10 reservation is 32,000 acres -- and as Jim
11 mentioned the history of the checkerboard --
12 32,000 acres of land. All the colored squares in
13 this map is the historic and existing reservation
14 created by Executive Order back in 1876, of which
15 the -- in the reservation itself. And this is
16 generally the Palm Springs area, Cathedral City,
17 and Rancho Mirage area. The foothills of San
18 Jacinto and the access to the tram road is up on
19 the northern part of the reservation, in Chino
20 Canyon.

21 The Monument boundary goes basically
22 right around the foothills of the Valley and goes
23 up into the mountains. And as you can see, over
24 half the reservation is within the Monument
25 boundary.

1 Linda made a great presentation regarding
2 how, at the federal level and in Washington, how
3 the Monument came into being, but I want to at the
4 local level give you a little insight as to how
5 the Tribe became involved in this process and what
6 happened at the local level on that just to give
7 you a perspective on why we are so concerned and
8 interested in the Monument besides the geography
9 of where the reservation is located.

10 Back in 1999, Bill and several other
11 groups were sponsoring the creation of the
12 National Monument. And, quite frankly, the Tribe
13 had mixed feelings about it. Proposals for
14 National Parks and National Monuments had been put
15 before us all the way back to the twenties, and
16 they were not ever really received warmly because
17 all we were seeing was additional federal
18 regulation within the Tribal affairs, and it
19 wasn't always received well by the Tribal
20 membership and the trust landowners and Tribal
21 Trust -- Tribal Council.

22 So during a series of meetings both
23 behind the scenes and with the Tribal Council, Jim
24 and myself and a fellow by the name of Bob Laidlaw
25 met on several occasions to discuss the

1 differences between the Tribe's interest and what
2 the Interior's interests were with regards to
3 creating the Monument. And that culminated in a
4 meeting, a face-to-face meeting, with Secretary
5 Babbit and the Tribal Council at The Spa Hotel in
6 August of 1999 where they hammered out basically a
7 relationship that, if the Monument was to occur,
8 what participation the Tribe would have in the
9 Monument, in land use planning, land management,
10 and budgeting.

11 And that basically created what we have
12 here as the cooperative agreement between the Agua
13 Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians and the U.S.
14 Department of Interior, BLM.

15 And in this cooperative agreement, it
16 spells out the interests of what the Tribe and BLM
17 had with regard to this area of the Monument and
18 the Monument in general. And it focuses on
19 several elements. And these are things that
20 actually our office and Jim's office has been
21 working on for many years informally, but they
22 have been put into writing so that it's
23 institutionalized in such a way that future Tribal
24 Councils and future administrators or whoever can
25 look back to this and go by what has been outlined

1 as a cooperative effort to work together to manage
2 these lands.

3 I am just going to cite some of the
4 points, key points to the elements of what the
5 Secretary and the Tribal Council came to an
6 agreement on, and that was to maintain a joint
7 commitment to address mutual areas of concern,
8 protection of the rights of the Tribe and the
9 allottees to access, development, enjoyment of the
10 property within consistent, applicable federal
11 tribal laws and regulations, clarify, identify,
12 preserve, protect and, where necessary, cover
13 cultural resources -- and this is something we
14 have always been working on.

15 We just recently completed a cultural
16 survey with BLM in the Indian Canyons area, first
17 of many we hope to have done over a period of time
18 -- need to identify and preserve, protect the
19 need to preserve, protect cultural and traditional
20 uses, including gathering places and access to
21 sacred places. And so these are the major
22 tenets.

23 In addition to that, also natural
24 resources, Bighorn Sheep and so forth. And we
25 were working with -- presently have been working

1 with BLM on eradication of tamarisks, fountain
2 grass in the canyons, to improve the wetlands, the
3 water source for the habitat in general.

4 You will note that the -- if many of you
5 have been to the Palm Canyon area, the Tahquitz
6 Canyon area, some of the best wetlands in the
7 entire Coachella Valley. There's a tremendous
8 amount of cultural resources in the Monument. And
9 the Monument is really -- the western part of the
10 Monument really is particularly -- even though we
11 have a distinct reservation boundary, that
12 boundary really extends beyond that when you talk
13 about traditional use areas, because there are
14 habitation areas, cremation sites, pictographs,
15 and so forth throughout the entire foothills, and
16 the Tribe -- this particular tribes's traditional
17 use area runs from approximately Indian Wells all
18 the way to the Banning Pass. So it's a very
19 important area for the Tribe and Tribal Council.

20 We look forward to working with you. I
21 will be the staff designee from the Tribe, Tribal
22 Council. And so if you have any questions or
23 concerns, you can contact me directly. I will
24 probably see you at most of these meetings. And I
25 have seen most of you at other meetings. Maybe a

1 little too much. But I look forward to working
2 with you and I look forward to participating as to
3 what the Tribal Council directs us to do.

4 Thank you.

5 MR. CAMPBELL: Good morning. My name
6 is Richard Campbell. I am Superintendent at the
7 Mt. San Jacinto State Park, a position that I have
8 held for just under 15 years now.

9 I am pretty much a native of Southern
10 California. I went to high school in North San
11 Diego County and attended school at Santa Barbara
12 after that. I hiked in these mountains as a
13 teenager.

14 And I can't express what a historic
15 occasion this is. I am very honored to be asked
16 to speak here today. My thanks to Connell and
17 Danella for inviting me.

18 Because it's a historic occasion, I'd
19 like to talk about history a little bit. Gary
20 mentioned that the 100th anniversary of Big Basin
21 State Park is coming up this year. And in 19- --
22 oh -- -26 or so, there were five State parks at
23 that time. And they were pretty much independent
24 of each other. They were headed up by -- through
25 political appointees for the most part. And Big

1 Basin was involved in a bit of a controversy in
2 that the superintendent that had been appointed
3 there was selling off the trees to one of his
4 friends. It resulted in a lot of publicity. He
5 was removed from the position, naturally. But
6 there was a need to develop a comprehensive system
7 for the state parks, and that resulted in the
8 first State Park Bond Act being passed in 1928.

9 And one of the first parks that was
10 proposed for addition to this new system was
11 Mt. San Jacinto State Park. That was done at the
12 first State Park Commission meeting in Southern
13 California in Los Angeles. And that was done by
14 many of the community leaders that flew out from
15 Riverside County. This wasn't something that came
16 from the top. It was proposed by local people.
17 And that, in fact, went forward.

18 The Forest Reserve System that had been
19 created, these mountains were recognized as
20 special. They have been recognized as special by
21 the Native Americans on through the Europeans, up
22 to the present time. But because of the
23 fragmented ownership at that time, the San
24 Jacinto/Santa Rosa Mountains were not included in
25 the forest reserve when that went through.

1 So the District Forester, S. B. Snow,
2 directed his assistant to work with State Parks,
3 Louis Barrett. And Louis Barrett and Newton Drury
4 got together with the gentlemen from Southern
5 Pacific Railroad and worked out a land swap
6 whereby about 12,000 acres at the top of the
7 mountain was transferred to a total ownership of
8 Southern Pacific and then that land was purchased
9 by State Parks out of this first Bond Act.

10 The Bond Act specified matching funds
11 would be required in order for the purchase to be
12 complete. Riverside County came up with a little
13 less than half, and State Parks came up with a
14 little less than half, and the remainder was
15 raised by the Friends of the San Jacinto
16 Mountains, including a penny drive from the school
17 children of Riverside County because everyone felt
18 it was such an important thing that the mountains
19 be preserved as the special place they are.

20 Even today, Mt. San Jacinto has the
21 highest point in the State Park system. It's not
22 only one of the first. It is the first wilderness
23 area in the State Park system. And that was the
24 agreement between the Forest Service and State
25 Parks back when the park was created. The top of

1 the mountain would be managed as a wilderness
2 area, that there would be no roads permitted, no
3 building permitted, that it would be an area
4 preserved in its natural state where man was a
5 visitor, not a permanent resident.

6 The reason I present this to you today is
7 to let you know that's -- I was asked to talk
8 about our management philosophy. That's where our
9 philosophy comes from. We are strictly
10 preservationists. Our intent on the mountain is
11 to preserve it in its natural state as much as
12 possible.

13 We couldn't do it without partnerships.
14 I mean, the Forest Service was our partner to
15 begin with. They are our partners today.
16 Laurie's office is across the street from mine in
17 Idyllwild. We have worked closely with the Forest
18 Service the entire time I have been on the
19 mountain. The opportunity to work with the
20 National Monument is just outstanding. I mean,
21 that just extends the ability of all of us to do
22 more good things for the mountain.

23 The Palm Springs Aerial Tramway -- oh, I
24 should back up just a little bit.

25 When the park was created, it was at that

1 -- the dedication was in June of 1937, and that
2 was after the partnership with the California
3 Conservation Corps, the three Cs, came in and
4 spent about four years working in the park
5 developing the trails, putting in the building,
6 many of the buildings that still exist today.
7 They put in the rock shelter at the top of the
8 mountain.

9 The park has always existed through the
10 benefit of the partners that we work with, and
11 today we work with the Palm Springs Aerial
12 Tramway. That gateway into the park we hope will
13 bring us 400,000 visitors this year. What a
14 tremendous opportunity for people to come in and
15 experience something that's not available
16 virtually anywhere else around this part of the
17 world.

18 The Bureau of Land Management has worked
19 with us over the years. We look forward to closer
20 ties with them. We are available to work with the
21 Monument Committee in any way that we can. And
22 thank you again for this opportunity.

23 MR. IDEKER: Well, there's a couple of
24 consistent themes I heard there that I think it
25 would be interesting to hear in some initial

1 comments from Committee members. Of course, the
2 overall -- it seems the overarching thing we hear,
3 two words: "Seamless" and "partnership." Each of
4 these individuals up here have mentioned that. We
5 have had other presentations where that is
6 something that has been raised that I think is on
7 your table for discussion and some practical and
8 specific ways you are going to move in that
9 direction and be part of that.

10 Right now, in addition to that, those two
11 topics, are there any other questions, comments,
12 clarifications? Any of the things raised by any
13 of these folks or collectively, a question you'd
14 like to ask all four, since you have got them
15 here? Let's take advantage of that time.

16 Yes, sir?

17 MR. BOGERT: I would like to ask Tom
18 Davis a question.

19 The Indian gate is on our best trails
20 that we have to ride all the way up to Pinyon
21 Flats. They all start there to go up. It's the
22 most beautiful part of the whole park. And they
23 are charging \$10 to get through the gate. I took
24 65 people through there on Saturday and every one
25 of them had to pay \$10 to get through their

1 cotton-picking gate.

2 If the Indians have got so much money
3 with their casino, why do they charge us so much
4 money to get through your gate?

5 MR. DAVIS: Well, Mr. Bogert, I think
6 there's two answers to that. And, frankly, I am
7 not in operations, but I am going to do my best;
8 okay?

9 One is that the toll gate has been in
10 operation for many years, as you know. And just
11 having the gate there and controlling access to
12 that area is very important to preserve the
13 quality of the area. In other words, avoiding the
14 willy-nilly access to a very precious area. The
15 control there is needed.

16 Also, tribal operations runs their
17 operations like any business. Every segment of
18 the business has to stand on its own two feet.
19 There are over 2,000 acres to maintain in that
20 area. I mentioned tamarisk removal. I mentioned
21 the fountain grass removal, the damage to trails
22 by people, horses, and trespassers. We have
23 protection of cultural resources. A lot of
24 manpower goes into the protection and
25 administration of that area. And it has to stand

1 on its own. It can't depend on other businesses
2 to support it.

3 Some day in the future the business may
4 come and go, but that area has been like that and
5 it's going to be controlled in that fashion. And
6 I'm sure that if there's a group rate we can, you
7 know, discuss with you, we will discuss that with
8 you. But it's very important to have a nominal
9 fee and to have some income derived off of that,
10 off of the users using the canyons.

11 MR. IDEKER: Yes, sir? Gary?

12 MR. WATTS: Gary Watts. I don't know
13 if this is a question so much as a comment. And
14 if you do have a return comment, I'd love to hear
15 it.

16 Just as Gene Zimmerman advised the
17 Committee that it's time to roll up our sleeves
18 and get to work, I think you all need to get ready
19 to roll up your sleeves and work.

20 And you have talked about seamless. And
21 I certainly am familiar with that term. We have
22 dealt with it in many areas throughout the State
23 Park System. And we all have different turf
24 interests and management responsibilities in how
25 we view things. The difference between BLM and

1 the Tribe and Forest Service and Parks, I mean,
2 they differ a lot. We get along as well as we
3 can, but there's going to be a real challenge for
4 you to get us all together on the same page to
5 make it seamless where we can.

6 And on simple operational things like
7 trail use and what's allowed and that type of
8 thing, I mean, that's going to be a challenge to
9 get all of us on the same page. But at the same
10 token, seamless extends beyond the Monument
11 boundary. In the State Park, for instance,
12 approximately two-thirds is in the Monument.
13 Another third is not.

14 So as we approach our operational
15 responsibility inside the Monument from the State
16 Park's perspective, we have to still be consistent
17 with that outside the boundary as well.

18 So I guess my comment is be prepared to
19 roll up your sleeves as multi-interests. And I
20 think there's a lot of common ground, those
21 overlapping circles, that we can reach, good solid
22 management recommendations that this Committee can
23 endorse. And where we can't, we are going to need
24 your help. This Committee is going to need your
25 help to get through that, because I can see some

1 conflict in certain areas.

2 MR. IDEKER: Any of the group have
3 any --

4 MR. DAVIS: You know, I have a comment
5 to go back to that. And this is a key element
6 between what Jim and I have been working on for
7 the last couple years, is that I totally agree
8 with you. You know, we have a lot --
9 collectively, we have a lot of work to do. And
10 that takes resources.

11 And what I would hope the Committee would
12 consider is to make sure that we get the -- we,
13 collectively -- and BLM or Forest Service, whoever
14 gets it, but -- get the proper resources and
15 funding to do what you want to do; okay? And to
16 do what we need to do with regard to land use
17 management. Because I think that's the critical
18 element in what's going to happen in the next
19 several years with the Monument.

20 It's really nice to paint a great
21 picture, but if there's isn't anybody to implement
22 it, if there isn't anybody to actually go out and
23 do the tasks the Committee is formulating, it's a
24 waste of your time and our time.

25 So I think that's one of the things that

1 the administrators look to to get your help to get
2 from Congress or State or get the Tribe or
3 whoever, get them to fund these tasks.

4 MR. IDEKER: From some of you who
5 represent agencies, specifically, if I were
6 sitting there, I'd be saying, "Okay. So what can
7 I do to do what -- just as Tom suggested?" "What
8 should I be doing as a Committee member?" Or,
9 "What opportunities should I be trying to create
10 to influence funding?"

11 You are hiding back there. Or this is
12 hiding you, I should say.

13 MS. ROSENTHAL: I am not trying to
14 hide.

15 MR. IDEKER: No.

16 MR. KENNA: I was going to suggest and
17 kind of follow up on Tom's comment. I do think we
18 have, in a way, plowed some of that ground,
19 particularly with agreement between BLM and the
20 Tribe. And I think the beauty of it is that no
21 jurisdiction has to give up anything of their
22 jurisdiction to come to the table. What we do is
23 -- I think you articulated it very well. We look
24 for those overlapping circles, things that we can
25 do together that are a mutual interest and fit the

1 management direction for the Monument.

2 You are right. And some things will be
3 easy and some things will be -- you know, we will
4 have to really work at, you know. How can we make
5 it fit together so that it works for the missions
6 of both entities, whoever the entities are?

7 And I also think Tom's point is really
8 important. Some of these problems that we might
9 encounter, it takes the dedication of some
10 resources to make the solution happen. But I also
11 believe that the strength of this group will be
12 because of its own diversity and its
13 representation that -- I think that's perhaps even
14 the smallest barrier, because if the strength of
15 this group is that we can agree on something, we
16 can hammer through a difficult issue, we get to a
17 solution, I think we can find the wherewithal to
18 make stuff happen.

19 MR. CAMPBELL: I would like to comment
20 on it, if I could, for a minute. I prefer
21 "challenges" rather than "conflicts." Just at
22 the meeting we had last week over at the BLM
23 office, I was talking with the Recreation Officer
24 from the Forest Service, and she mentioned that
25 she's bringing in the Student Conservation

1 Association Group to work on trails this summer,
2 but that the commitment was for more time than
3 they actually had work to do.

4 And so we have sort of tentatively set up
5 an agreement where we can split the costs, split
6 their time, and they can come in and work in the
7 park at the same time. And it's basically just
8 because we were at the meeting talking.

9 And it's kind of like a marriage in a
10 way. You know, a good marriage is not sitting
11 there looking at each other, but looking toward a
12 common goal and moving in that direction. And we
13 all bring different things to the table. We have
14 different goals for our own respective
15 departments, but that doesn't mean we can't have
16 the common goal of moving toward the same
17 direction for the Monument. And I think it is
18 complimentary that way, and I think it's only
19 going to be a benefit for all of us in the long
20 run.

21 MR. IDEKER: Would you see the
22 Committee in any way, then, in relationship to
23 this area of interest helping define the goals
24 where what available resources can be pooled to
25 this work are focused? Are they going to play

1 some role in your minds about defining that, would
2 you say?

3 MR. CAMPBELL: That's the goal. They
4 define the goal.

5 MR. IDEKER: Laurie, do you have
6 anything?

7 MS. ROSENTHAL: I just want to add I
8 agree with everything that's been said here. And
9 there's so much resource out here in these
10 communities as far as volunteerism and, yes, we
11 need to commit to having staff and to having
12 budget resources, but I have experienced
13 situations where so much can be added with the
14 help of volunteerism, and I would hope that the
15 subcommittees will be addressing this to some
16 extent and the Friends groups and all these
17 different entities, because there is such talent
18 and such abilities out within the community that
19 are probably just waiting to help us in all the
20 various areas that we need.

21 MR. IDEKER: Bill Havert. Jeffery,
22 did you have your hand up? No? And then Ed.

23 MR. HAVERT: Well, I just wanted to
24 enlarge the circle a little bit. Obviously, these
25 are four entities up here that have major land

1 management responsibilities in the Monument. But
2 I think it's also important that we recognize that
3 there is an even larger partnership. You think
4 back to the map that we looked at before. There
5 is a very large ownership in the Monument by the
6 Department of Fish & Game. They have large
7 management responsibilities up there as well.

8 If you start looking along the toe of the
9 slope of the mountains, you will see that the
10 cities have a really important role. The cities
11 have been involved in acquiring lands specifically
12 to protect them. They have fee ownership of a lot
13 of land along the toe of the slope that they have
14 acquired sometimes in partnership with the public
15 agency, sometimes on their own initiative. And so
16 they are real important.

17 Similarly, the County has been involved
18 in acquisitions. I know partnership acquisition
19 between the County and the Tribe occurred within
20 the last several years that was really critical.
21 The Conservancy does land acquisition. The
22 Friends of the Desert Mountains does land
23 acquisition. And even with that expanded list, I
24 am probably forgetting somebody else.

25 And so I think it's just really key that

1 we consider all of the entities, the private
2 sector, the local government, the state
3 government, and the federal government, and the
4 Tribe all as part of this overall equation here of
5 the larger partnership.

6 The University of California is one I
7 definitely don't want to forget as well, so --
8 almost did. Boy, would I have been in trouble.
9 So everyone else whom I have forgotten, please
10 raise your hands. Get it all on the table.

11 And to go back to one other thing that
12 was heard there, too, is obviously that complexity
13 on the landscape poses challenges. And, you know,
14 we have heard talk of some of those. And just one
15 thought. Some years ago, it became apparent that
16 because there are different agencies out there
17 with different objectives, they weren't
18 necessarily always in sync. You know, just one
19 example. The acquisition programs. One agency
20 might be focusing on one area, and another on a
21 different area, and some opportunities might not
22 be coming together. There might actually be one
23 area where one agency was getting rid of land in
24 exchanges where another agency was thinking,
25 "Hmm. Good area to acquire land."

1 So I think the one thing that the
2 Monument already accomplishes, as we are starting
3 to see, is to focus everybody's attention on the
4 bigger picture and the fact that we do need to
5 look at the mountains as one landscape and figure
6 out how we achieve, first, common understandings
7 and common goals as the basis for, you know,
8 getting down to the fine tuning and figuring out
9 the practicalities of how do you allocate
10 resources here and here and so on to make sure
11 that everybody is actually accomplishing the
12 maximum amount with whatever resources we have.

13 And then, again, part of our objective is
14 how to increase the resources so that what we see
15 needs to get done is actually able to get done.

16 And just a last thought. As I think has
17 been stressed over and over and just to underscore
18 it one more time, these partnerships, I think,
19 give us an opportunity here that's as good as
20 anywhere else I can imagine in the country of
21 dealing with things on a cooperative basis, on
22 identifying issues and working together to resolve
23 them rather than finding ourselves in adversarial
24 positions. And we just have to remember that all
25 the time over and over again, that that

1 opportunity to work together to deal with conflict
2 resolution and to identify common goals and work
3 together is our ultimate strength.

4 MR. IDEKER: Ed?

5 MR. KIBBEY: I realize the time will
6 come to present the plan a little bit later on,
7 but I, for one, am a little unsure as to how the
8 plan fits. I am taking it for granted that all of
9 you have had a part in drafting the plan as it is
10 today. You have all had input.

11 Is it then to be understood that this
12 Committee would perhaps begin its service by using
13 that as our base document and operating off that
14 plan and making suggestions as to what we have now
15 in the plan and what perhaps is missing or should
16 be deleted and then going onward to expand out
17 from that plan? I know that's a lot of questions,
18 but I'd like the partnership to answer as to, Is
19 this what you want the Committee to do? Is this
20 what you see for us?

21 MR. IDEKER: Jim, it seems like a
22 great question for you.

23 MR. KENNA: Yes. I think I can give a
24 pretty good stab at that.

25 The charter of the plan is you are going
109

1 to work with the Designated Federal Official to
2 build a plan. You are going to provide the input
3 into that. It doesn't exist at this point.
4 There's some relationships among planning
5 documents that I presume Connell will probably go
6 into this afternoon which will help clarify that
7 to some degree, but I will give you the thumbnail
8 right now.

9 We have the Coachella Valley Multi
10 Species Plan that -- Bill actually answered this
11 question in part earlier in his presentation.
12 There will be some issues that are already on the
13 table as a result of listed species that are being
14 worked through in the Multiple Species Plan.

15 There are also going to be things that
16 need to be done over and above and beyond that
17 that will fill in behind that, some of the issues
18 that have been discussed here about how do you
19 make things fit together, how do you make it look
20 more seamless, how do you address the recreating
21 public.

22 All of those kinds of questions, I think,
23 will come in the management plan.

24 There also is a Forest Service planning
25 process which maybe Laurie wants to talk about,

1 which is also going on involving four forests that
2 will have to have a relationship to the Monument
3 Plan.

4 So it isn't going to be one of those
5 plans that's really simple in the sense that
6 everything within the boundaries stands on its own
7 and doesn't relate to anything else. There are
8 going to be relationships to the other planning
9 efforts. And the other one I almost missed is Tom
10 has a planning effort going on.

11 So there are different planning efforts.
12 And I think our interest -- and it's been
13 expressed by, I think, all the parties that they
14 make sense together. All of those plans are still
15 going to have to happen; the Forest Service
16 planning update, the BLM planning update. But the
17 Monument has to sort of pull that all together
18 within those bounds and address those issues that
19 are specific to the Monument so it works together
20 across those lines of jurisdiction.

21 As far as a document is concerned, what
22 you have at this point, at least from the BLM
23 side, is a preplan for the Monument, which lays
24 out the roadmap essentially. And, you know, that
25 we can play with a little bit. So I guess those

1 are the places I'd direct you to to answer that
2 question.

3 There isn't a real short, simple answer,
4 but hopefully that helped a little bit.

5 MR. KIBBEY: Follow-up?

6 MR. IDEKER: Surely.

7 MR. KIBBEY: Did the other partners
8 have any part in your preplan, Jim?

9 MR. KENNA: No. A preplan for BLM is
10 something that's required for our budget processes
11 internally. But we are going to share it with you
12 anyway.

13 MR. IDEKER: They will get a copy of
14 that preplan?

15 MS. GEORGE: It's in the notebook. I
16 asked that it be put in there to start --

17 MR. KENNA: It's basically an internal
18 working document for BLM.

19 MR. IDEKER: Terry?

20 MS. HENDERSON: And to follow up on
21 Ed. Terry Henderson, La Quinta.

22 At the end of this process, when
23 presumably we have reached this magic point, this
24 seamless understanding in a document, will there
25 be one control agency of that document? Or is it

1 just kind of out there?

2 MR. KENNA: I am going to offer you my
3 vision. My vision is no. There won't be one
4 controlling entity; that it will run off of
5 relationships, you know. For example, BLM and the
6 City of La Quinta are neighbors and you will have
7 a general plan at the City of La Quinta where you
8 have the jurisdiction. But hopefully what we will
9 end up with is the decisions that you make with
10 respect to lands within the National Monument
11 match up in some way with what we have done as
12 your neighbor in that portion of the Monument.

13 So I don't envision anything that would
14 represent a change of jurisdiction to a single
15 entity. I doubt it.

16 MR. IDEKER: Ed?

17 MR. KIBBEY: I think the way I
18 understood Terry's question, will there be a
19 Danella, a person --

20 MR. DAVIS: Oh, yes. Forever and
21 forever.

22 MR. KIBBEY: -- that will be the
23 central point that people can go to and filter, if
24 you will?

25 MR. KENNA: I misunderstood. Yes.

1 MR. IDEKER: Other committee members?

2 Yes, sir?

3 MR. FREET: Bary Freet.

4 Danella commented earlier on that there
5 were going to be a number of occasions in our
6 deliberation where staff was going to be
7 challenged by different policies and procedures
8 and budget cycles and so on and so forth.

9 I would hope that when you are challenged
10 by those differences, that the Committee is made
11 aware of it so that we can help work through those
12 issues, perhaps, or at least understand them.

13 MR. IDEKER: Anyone else have a
14 question? Comment? Anyone from the panel want to
15 add any closing thoughts before we move on?

16 Yes, sir?

17 MR. LYMAN: Bob Lyman. I have a
18 question. As we go through these budget cycles
19 and given the condition of the state budget and
20 the condition of the federal budget, which flows
21 down, what's the outlook for resources in the next
22 two to three years?

23 MR. KENNA: I will start. I think I
24 would anticipate federal budgets -- although this
25 is always just, you know -- this is crystal ball

1 stuff, so hopefully the reporters aren't here --
2 probably to be fairly flat.

3 There are going to be, you know, with the
4 outflow from September 11th, among other things,
5 increasing demands on the federal budget from
6 other areas, and so I would not anticipate huge
7 amounts of inflow of money.

8 However, I also think that -- and we
9 heard this from the Secretary on her visit -- and
10 I know that the Congressman feels this way -- that
11 this Monument, particularly given the way that it
12 was created, with the local support from a
13 diversity of groups, is very important. And I
14 think there is a shared vision to show that this
15 kind of an approach that doesn't ask anybody to
16 give anything up in terms of jurisdiction to come
17 to the table, there's a real incentive for the
18 parties that are supporting this and supporting
19 the way it was put together to see that it is
20 successful.

21 So I think there will be opportunities
22 particularly focused on the Monument to look
23 towards funding. That's sort of both sides of the
24 same coin. Overall, I think there will be more
25 demands on the budget and it will in general tend

1 to be flat.

2 Point two, this National Monument is very
3 important to this administration and is very
4 important to our local congressional
5 representatives. So I would anticipate we will
6 get support from those venues.

7 MR. IDEKER: Danella?

8 MS. GEORGE: Along with that, a
9 correction to today's newspaper. I don't know how
10 many folks read The Desert Sun. All we really
11 have locked for the budget is \$540,000 for
12 operational. The million is for land
13 acquisition.

14 And it goes kind of with the theme and
15 what the Committee has talked about of focusing on
16 what it costs to run an organization charged with
17 conservation and restoration. We do the
18 acquisition. What we then have to do, we have to
19 do a boundary still, describe the boundaries of
20 this Monument. There's a lot of costs of things
21 we need to do. And I would think in this
22 community there is the opportunity and one of the
23 focus items for my position this year of building
24 a strong foundation, nonprofit, to assist us. We
25 have Annenbergs that winter here. I mean, we have

1 got to build an outside source besides the federal
2 pipeline.

3 And, hopefully, you guys will be able to
4 help with that too.

5 MR. IDEKER: Richard, did you have a
6 State perspective on --

7 MR. CAMPBELL: Well, the State budget
8 doesn't look so hot these days. In fact, it looks
9 really bleak. We have been cut several times just
10 recently. They are talking about a 15 percent cut
11 coming July 1st.

12 But at the same time, we will still
13 operate and there are still areas where we can
14 direct resources to benefit the Monument. And
15 that's the advantage of working together.

16 Hopefully, over the course of time, one
17 group's up will be another person's down so that
18 we can kind of help each other out through the
19 rougher times.

20 MR. IDEKER: Go ahead.

21 MR. DAVIS: I have just one comment.
22 I think what's really great about -- and it's also
23 challenging for the Committee -- is getting all
24 these parties together. Like Bill had mentioned,
25 all the parties that have a stake in the mountains

1 and the Monument. They have an interest. They
2 have all been sort of -- we have all been
3 informally networking, but we have never had a
4 cohesive single point to coalesce and coordinate
5 our efforts with regards to acquisition and
6 maintenance and security and surveys and these
7 types of things that need to be done.

8 And I think it's part of the challenge
9 and part of what I see as a great opportunity,
10 that this Committee serves as the point where you
11 can prioritize tasks, acquisitions, endeavors,
12 whatever you want to call them, and put together
13 the solution to the problem. You have the right
14 people sitting at the right table to do that.

15 And it's going to take some -- because of
16 the budget situations that the federal and State
17 level has, and the County -- and even I have
18 budget limitations, believe it or not -- that we
19 stretch this dollar and use the creative matching
20 funds that Danella is referring to and Bill is
21 referring to and stretch this dollar to make the
22 best things happen first.

23 And once you get a track record of doing
24 that, this funding element becomes easier and
25 easier, because it's something everybody can

1 support.

2 MR. IDEKER: Edward?

3 MR. KIBBEY: Ed Kibbey.

4 Do you then see all of the funding for
5 the various aspects of the Monument coming through
6 the individual agencies, whether it be State Parks
7 or BLM or Forest Service? Or would there at some
8 time be the possibility of a budget item for the
9 Monument?

10 MR. IDEKER: Danella?

11 MS. GEORGE: For the federal sector,
12 because, you know, we are different. Yes, I do.
13 And we already have done that. Forest Service and
14 BLM, Bureau of Land Management, have done that
15 with Service First projects. The money, because
16 it is to two departments, you know, has to be kept
17 separate. There is -- I forgot the buzz words --
18 in appropriations, has to be kept separate. But
19 they designate it, they show it as a Service First
20 project to accomplish such and such on the
21 landscape.

22 MR. KIBBEY: I understand that. My
23 question was, Do you see in the future a Monument
24 budget, all by itself, stand-alone for certain --
25 management or whatever the case may be of the

1 overall for "the Danella"?

2 MS. GEORGE: Well, I don't know
3 legally if you can do that with the BLM -- or
4 Department of Agriculture and Interior dollars.
5 But, yes, I mean, if a Congressperson wants to
6 line item something and call it such-and-such,
7 they can do that, get it done. I mean, that's
8 happening in other places on the landscape.

9 Linda, what do you think?

10 MS. VALTER: We just did it. I mean,
11 if you go into the Department of Interior's
12 budget, there's a specific line item that says
13 "Santa Rosa/San Jacinto National Monument." Both
14 the land acquisition there's a line item, and for
15 management there's a line item.

16 So the Department of Interior can't come
17 and take Santa Rosa/San Jacinto Monument money and
18 ship it anywhere else. That has to be used for
19 that specific purpose. And because now the
20 management project is going on, we are going to
21 tap into -- attempt to tap into more funding for
22 Department of Agriculture, too, to help the Forest
23 Service get the same level of funding.

24 And just adding on to what Jim said, it
25 is a tough -- next year or two is going to be very

1 difficult in terms of securing money, because, as
2 we all know, September 11th has eaten a great deal
3 into the budget.

4 But Congress views very favorably things
5 that it creates, and so all the other monuments
6 that were created by Executive Order, especially
7 if you find -- the current Chairman of the
8 Resources Committee and Appropriations Committee
9 did say that they are not as fondly looked at as
10 one created by Congress itself. And the efforts
11 that went into creating this Monument definitely
12 give it that leg up.

13 MS. ROSENTHAL: And, Linda, would you
14 have any advice for our agencies and this
15 Committee on how to keep that funding going?

16 MS. VALTER: I think that -- as you
17 move down the cycle -- and I have spoken to
18 Danella about this too. The first step is for us
19 to ask you -- Congresswoman ask you what your
20 requests are, which we have officially done last
21 week. And then you, of course, as detailed as
22 possible, submit to us a budget.

23 And when I say "detailed," you know, down
24 to the hundreds of thousands of dollars, not down
25 necessarily to the dollar, because we have to go

1 then to the Interior Appropriations Chairman and
2 the Overall Appropriations Chairman and argue for
3 almost literally each hundred thousand dollar
4 figure. And the more it's spelled out, the easier
5 it is for the Congresswoman to state her case.
6 And so backup information from you guys is very
7 helpful as we go down the path.

8 MS. ROSENTHAL: Would you say that if
9 there is a challenge grant from the community or a
10 foundation that's going to be set up, that it's
11 elevated to a higher level of priority?

12 MS. VALTER: I would say that, yes. I
13 would say that, because, you know, when Congress
14 sees that the community itself is a stakeholder --
15 and by that, I mean a financial stakeholder -- in
16 the situation, I think that gives it more legs. I
17 think it's helpful.

18 But regardless of whether or not
19 something like that is set about, Congresswoman
20 has made it very clear that this is her priority,
21 you know, from the get-go in terms of -- I know
22 you guys saw when she was trying to get this bill
23 passed in Congress what a priority it was for
24 her. And each and every year -- you know, last
25 year we had to fight for that \$1.5 million or

1 \$1.543 million or whatever. And she is going to
2 do it again this year.

3 But, again, as Jim said, the money is
4 tight, but we definitely have a leg up.

5 MR. IDEKER: Other questions? Other
6 comments?

7 Okay. Thank you, all. That was
8 informative.

9 MR. DAVIS: Thank you.

10 MR. IDEKER: And even inspiring, I
11 might say.

12 Connell is also asking me to let you know
13 that we do have a representative from the
14 California Department of Fish & Game who will
15 speak during the public comment section -- right?
16 -- whenever that comes about, about how they plan
17 to engage in this great adventure with all of
18 you. Danella?

19 MS. GEORGE: Is that the request for
20 Allen to come? I am just curious. We called
21 Friday to ask Allen Pickering -- Picker to sit
22 with the group. Is it the same?

23 MR. KONNO: I was requested to come
24 Friday, late.

25 MS. GEORGE: That was it. I

1 apologize. Because Bill turned the light switch
2 on.

3 MR. IDEKER: We can talk about that.

4 The next part of the agenda is going to
5 be devoted to the first big step to organize the
6 Committee. It involves the election of your own
7 Chair and Vice Chair.

8 During the break, I was approached by
9 Committee Member Crites, who suggested that we
10 elect first the Chair and then the Vice Chair. If
11 there is no objection from a majority of the other
12 members of the Committee, that is what we will
13 do.

14 Objection to moving in that direction?
15 Otherwise, it would be my intent that that
16 election proceed along the lines of normal Roberts
17 Rules of Order for such elections and that we take
18 open nominations from the Committee members.
19 Given that there is more than one nomination for
20 each of those positions, we will do a secret
21 ballot, announce the winner, and then move on.

22 Is that agreeable to the members of the
23 Committee? Does anyone have any suggestions about
24 alterations to that process?

25 Then we will, once he gets a pen in his

1 hand, entertain nominations for Chairman or
2 Chairperson.

3 Yes?

4 MS. WATLING: I would like to nominate
5 Ed Kibbey.

6 MR. IDEKER: Don't make me write this
7 up if you are going to decline later on, you
8 know. So you just get right in there and say,
9 "No. No. Not me, ever."

10 Yes, sir?

11 MR. BOGERT: I wanted to nominate Bill
12 Havert.

13 MR. HAVERT: I decline.

14 MR. BOGERT: You what?

15 MR. IDEKER: You guys have been
16 sitting together all morning long, and you could
17 have worked that out.

18 MR. BOGERT: He knows more about the
19 situation than anybody. He should be our
20 Chairman.

21 MR. IDEKER: He's declined.

22 Other nominees?

23 MR. MUTH: Just as a technical point,
24 do you need seconds --

25 MR. IDEKER: Let's get a second.

1 MR. MUTH: Second for Kibbey.

2 MR. IDEKER: We have a second for
3 Kibbey from Allan Muth.

4 Other nominations? I see no other
5 nominations. I will declare the nominations
6 closed and call for a vote. It would seem to me
7 by acclamation, Mr. Kibbey -- now you be leading
8 this journey.

9 Did you see those four? There's now a
10 fifth, and it's you.

11 MR. KIBBEY: Thank you. Thank you
12 very much.

13 MR. IDEKER: Congratulations.

14 MR. KIBBEY: Thank you.

15 (Applause.)

16 MR. IDEKER: I will now open the
17 nominations for Vice Chair. Mr. Crites?

18 MR. CRITES: I would move to nominate
19 Rob Parkins.

20 MR. IDEKER: Rob Parkins.

21 MR. KIBBEY: Second.

22 MS. HENDERSON: Second.

23 MR. IDEKER: Other nominees? Other
24 nominations? This is a friendly group.

25 MR. MUTH: Move nominations be

1 closed.

2 MR. IDEKER: Nominations are closed.

3 I would again ask you for your unanimous vote. We
4 will let the record show unanimous vote for
5 Mr. Parkins as Vice Chair? Any objections to
6 that? Mr. Parkins.

7 (Applause.)

8 MR. PARKINS: Thank you.

9 MR. IDEKER: Let's talk a little bit
10 more about how we are going to proceed this
11 afternoon so there may be huddling during lunch
12 today. As you plan -- I also am going to -- I
13 want to ask the four individuals who were up
14 here: My assumption is you are all staying, so --
15 you are not staying? Tom, are you staying through
16 lunch?

17 MR. DAVIS: No. Unless you have --
18 unless I need to.

19 MR. IDEKER: I was just going to get
20 the opportunity for people at lunch to get to know
21 you better if you are going to be here. If you
22 are not going to be here, leave a picture and they
23 will get to know that better. Laurie?

24 MS. ROSENTHAL: I have to go to a
25 Monument meeting during lunch, because there's no
127

1 other time. But I will be here this afternoon.

2 MR. IDEKER: Okay. So as time allows
3 and you see one of these people, please take
4 advantage of that opportunity to get to know them
5 better, especially the ones you may not know very
6 well, although it seems a lot of these folks have
7 been around here a while and I am sure your paths
8 have crossed already.

9 This afternoon, it would be my hope that
10 our new Chair and -- we might do a little
11 rearrangement of seats up here so that you can --
12 we have no official emblem of your power to give
13 you, Ed.

14 MR. KIBBEY: That's all right. I've
15 got it embroidered on my pants.

16 MR. IDEKER: Well, we will be excited
17 to see that.

18 But I would hope that you and Rob might
19 chat a little bit during lunch, maybe with some of
20 your colleagues here, to begin the discussions.

21 What I think we need to talk a little bit
22 about and maybe reach some conclusions this
23 afternoon is clearly we need to set a schedule, a
24 calendar, at least a basic calendar for the next
25 year for meetings of the group.

1 Secondly, I believe it's going to make a
2 great deal of sense if you all agree on some basic
3 operating principles among one another, who to go
4 to, what to go to. That may be related, in fact,
5 to what you decide to do about subcommittees. It
6 may be useful after Connell's presentation to come
7 back to subcommittees, but you need to kind of
8 identify those areas where you think a
9 subcommittee is going to be useful. I'm sure
10 staff may have some ideas about where they feel
11 they could use a smaller group of people to go
12 to.

13 You need to exchange those ideas and
14 maybe come up with not only a list -- ideally, we
15 would leave here today with a list of
16 subcommittees and a list of subcommittee members.
17 Boy, wouldn't that be great. Danella will see
18 that everybody gets a Hershey bar if that comes
19 about.

20 So, that, of course, will help if you
21 leave this room and go out into the world, I
22 think. Buford?

23 MR. CRITES: This afternoon, Connell,
24 when you make your presentation, I don't know if a
25 Monument has within its requirements that, as an

1 example, a City General Plan has: There has to be
2 a section on transportation; there has to be a
3 section on housing; there has to be a section on
4 this and that. And if this has that, that may
5 very well form our list of committees quite
6 aptly.

7 You don't need to answer. I am just
8 saying when you get around to that this
9 afternoon.

10 MR. IDEKER: Don't give it away. Keep
11 them in suspense through lunch. There was another
12 hand. Ed? Chairman Ed?

13 MR. KIBBEY: I was just going to
14 suggest that following the organization of a plan,
15 that we just insert an item, "Organization," and
16 that would be our next function after that.

17 MR. IDEKER: Well, obviously, it's
18 your agenda now, sir. So anything that you say,
19 we insert.

20 MR. KIBBEY: Thank you, sir. I guess
21 so.

22 MR. IDEKER: Calm down. Finally, they
23 are awake.

24 MR. DAVIS: I have one suggestion.
25 Something to consider for the Committee is that a

1 Land Acquisitions Coordination Committee would, I
2 think, be very helpful.

3 MR. IDEKER: Okay. Yes, ma'am?

4 MS. GEORGE: May I suggest along with
5 what Buford asked, because I brought that up with
6 BLM earlier -- we will talk about that -- Connell,
7 I'm sure, will -- of stuff that BLM plans.

8 The legislation, if we go back to the
9 legislation itself, starting in -- I guess
10 Section -- what is it? -- Section -- where is it?
11 Of course, I don't have the right section, but I
12 think Section 3 talks about general management,
13 but Section 4 and Section 5 -- maybe just that's
14 another way to think about committees, because it
15 had its transportation, it had its recreation.
16 Not really the endangered species per se. But
17 that's a place, too, for the Committee to think
18 about as you talk about legislation.

19 MR. IDEKER: And if you didn't receive
20 it before, there is a copy of the legislation --

21 MS. DUNNING: Oh, yeah. There's lots
22 of copies. Everyone can have five each.

23 MR. IDEKER: Any other comments before
24 we adjourn for lunch? We are adjourning roughly
25 at noon, which means we will reconvene roughly at

1 1:00, no later than 1:00. If we have a critical
2 mass and the Chair is of a mind to do it, we will
3 convene earlier than 1:00.

4 So we appreciate your promptness in
5 getting back. Thank you for a great morning of
6 work. We have accomplished our goals so far. And
7 I am happy. So that's all that's important in my
8 world. Enjoy your lunch.

9 MS. DUNNING: Just some logistics for
10 lunch. Some of you have already given me money,
11 so I am going to pay for your lunch. I am not
12 going to keep it. But if you haven't given me
13 money, let's just go ahead and line up at the
14 cafe. And if it's taking a long time, you can
15 just give it to me real quickly and then you can
16 get your lunch boxes. But let's just proceed over
17 to the cafe and see how much space there is to eat
18 and then we can mingle over there.

19 (Lunch recess was taken.)

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Ladies and
21 gentlemen, we are going to call the meeting back
22 to order. Well, back on the record.

23 I am going to have a modification to the
24 agenda. You will notice at 1:30, "Determining
25 Committee Standards & Procedures." Let's move

1 that up to following the 2:30 "Status of Monument
2 Plan," the thinking being that Connell will give
3 us the outline of the plan, some comments on what
4 we can and can't do, and some further comments on,
5 if we decide to go ahead and do something, what it
6 entails.

7 One of the things you will learn working
8 under the auspices of regulations and limitations
9 of the federal government is nothing is easy. And
10 whatever we decide to do, we always want to think
11 of what it takes to do it, because in some cases,
12 you won't want to bother.

13 So we will have Connell do her thing and
14 then Paul will open it up to discussion. And I
15 have asked Connell to give all these different
16 aspects in the hopes that it will start your
17 juices flowing and start asking questions.

18 It is important in a Committee like this
19 that we ask a lot of questions. Even though you
20 know the answers, there are many times the others
21 don't. And so by asking questions of the process
22 is how we educate all the rest of us. There is no
23 dumb question, period. I don't care how basic it
24 is. Ask it. Because too often, there's going to
25 be someone in here that also wants to ask that

1 question, but they think, "Oh, that's stupid."

2 There is no stupid question.

3 MR. CRITES: How long is the Chair
4 term of office?

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: The Chair's term of
6 office is a hell of a lot longer than you'd like
7 it to be.

8 Connell?

9 MS. DUNNING: Okay. I am going to go
10 ahead and -- I think the presentation that I have
11 prepared might be a little bit more general than
12 some of the things that Ed was talking about, so
13 after I finish my general presentation, then I am
14 going to try to address some of the questions that
15 were brought up over lunchtime.

16 Okay. So first and foremost, the time
17 line of the plan, as you can see in your
18 legislation, which I think we have mentioned
19 enough times today that everybody has a copy or
20 several -- the time line of October 24th, 2003, is
21 written in the legislation. So because of that,
22 it's been identified as a time sensitive plan.
23 And what that means is our Washington folks, at
24 least in the BLM side and Forest Service as well,
25 have identified that as one of the -- I think 162

1 plans at least in BLM that are going on right now
2 -- one of the most important that it get done
3 quickly.

4 Also in the legislation, it was stated
5 that BLM and Forest Service must coordinate, both
6 in managing the monument and also in creating that
7 land use plan.

8 So a lot of what we have been doing so
9 far or thus far with planning has been meeting
10 with Forest Service to kind of get through a lot
11 of the administrative -- administrivia -- was that
12 Jim's word? -- identifying things like how will we
13 work together budgetwise, how are we going to
14 share monies, how are we going to work together
15 projectwise, resourcewise.

16 And the Service First initiative was
17 mentioned also. And Service First is an
18 initiative to help coordinate BLM enforcers in
19 working together and managing and both creating
20 land use plans and lots of other things.

21 Tell me if I am standing in the way.

22 So we do have support to help get that
23 kind of a BLM/Forest Service/Secretary of the
24 Interior/Secretary of the Agriculture, and kind of
25 get through the barriers there.

1 We have been meeting together, like I
2 said, to help get through some of that. And it
3 was our intention that we kind of speak to each
4 other and then extend out to invite the other land
5 managing agencies, which the legislation also
6 states that we should consult and coordinate with
7 the other land managing agencies.

8 And so in looking at the map, thanks to
9 Bill -- it's always great talking after Bill
10 Havert -- during his discussion, you were really
11 able to see the different number of land managing
12 agencies that we will have to consult with
13 ultimately.

14 And the last meeting that we had a week
15 ago was one of the first steps planningwise and
16 also managementwise to sit down and say, "Okay.
17 Here's some BLM ideas, here's some Forest Service
18 ideas, present those to Agua Caliente and also
19 State Parks and, hopefully, to Fish & Game,"
20 through Gary, who was going to help us identify
21 who would be the best person to help represent
22 Fish & Game at those meetings. So that was kind
23 of our first step planningwise, too, just to see
24 what issues are on the table, what kind of
25 projects are people working on, and to help

1 facilitate just the discussion of working
2 together. So that was the working group.

3 Of issue in looking for your help and,
4 also, the public's help with the monument plan
5 specifically are issues that cross these imaginary
6 lines on a map that we would like to think don't
7 exist when we are approaching land management on a
8 landscape scale.

9 So a lot of help that we can get from you
10 are issues that cross those borders. Like trails,
11 for instance. We don't need to be managing trails
12 one agency at a time when the trails continue on
13 past those lines.

14 And, also, how can shared funding help
15 out with a monument project? In addition to
16 planning, it's really hard from a planning
17 perspective to think about planning outside of the
18 box of what actually happens, and what actions the
19 different agencies are interested in, because
20 planning is integral to that.

21 So excuse me if I kind of go back and
22 forth between management and planning.

23 In the preplan that was provided to you,
24 as Jim stated, that was a BLM document and we were
25 required to prepare that in order to send that to

1 Washington, in order to secure funding, and really
2 just to kind of promote our interests in the
3 Monument. And we identified some objectives.
4 It's important that we explain the joint
5 management strategy in that plan. We will be
6 working to figure that out. We need to outline
7 the actions that are going to be necessary to
8 achieve the objectives of the plan, and really we
9 are looking to the public to identify through our
10 public scoping meetings and, also, through you
11 what those issues are that need to be addressed in
12 the plan.

13 The future conditions for the Monument.
14 What do we want it to look like in 10 years, 20
15 years, 50 years? That's something that we could
16 include in the plan that would help guide us long
17 term, listing the management goals and how we hope
18 to achieve those goals.

19 And, lastly -- I think most
20 importantly -- I am not -- I don't remember who
21 brought that up, but -- providing a schedule and a
22 cost estimate for plan implementation. It's easy
23 to make really big great plans, but if we don't
24 have an idea nor have a good handle on how we are
25 going to implement that and the different avenues

1 that we have, then really planning isn't going to
2 be that great.

3 Okay. So what we've done -- I'd like you
4 to take a look at a planning kind of outline that
5 I handed out. It's a flowchart. It looks like a
6 little flowchart with boxes and it's got stuff
7 labeled. Does everybody have that?

8 This is just a quick template. If we
9 take just some of the elements that need to be
10 done, public scoping meetings beginning, internal
11 review of our environmental impact statement
12 that's required, different protest periods, and
13 the number of days that are required in performing
14 those, and we shoot for October 2003 as our
15 deadline, this is a really aggressive planning
16 schedule and this is kind of an idea of the timing
17 that would be necessary to achieve that goal.

18 Obviously, the time is going to change
19 for some of these if there's different things
20 stopping us up, but the relationship between what
21 generally needs to happen for the plan and, for
22 example, Endangered Species Act protocol, Clean
23 Air Act, and State Historic Preservation, these
24 are some of those things Ed was asking. What are
25 requirements that must be in a plan? And because

1 we are a federal agency, these are requirements
2 that must be in the plan.

3 So throughout the planning process, we
4 hope to use this as kind of a guide. And this is
5 not inclusive. This is purely a beginning
6 template. And there's other things that we will
7 be adding to this. This is an idea of the
8 scheduling, the way that we look at the planning
9 for this plan.

10 So looking in the first box, up at the
11 top -- I guess we are in the second, November
12 through February. We are kind of in the beginning
13 stages still. We have been working to establish
14 the core staff, at least from the BLM and Forest
15 Service. And then on Monday, our last meeting,
16 who are the staffs that we should be bringing
17 together when addressing specific issues for
18 recreation, issues for cultural, fire? Who needs
19 to be coming to the table and talking?

20 We have had some meetings to get those
21 people all together at once, and then been
22 following up to see where they are meeting, their
23 kind of subcommittees to that big working group to
24 address different issues.

25 Equally as important is talking to those

1 individual resource's staff and seeing what they
2 do and do not have time for. And that's what we
3 can contract out the dollars for. For example, an
4 ethnographic survey for the entire Monument is
5 being contracted out underneath the Forest
6 Service. And they are going to include the entire
7 Monument as opposed to just covering the Forest
8 Service, which makes sense in an ethnographic
9 survey anyway, and it makes sense in a lot of our
10 surveys.

11 So we hope that that can serve as an
12 example of something. In this case, it's
13 contracted out and all the parties, Agua Caliente
14 and BLM and Forest Service at least -- agreed with
15 who will be doing that.

16 So that's an example of the kinds of
17 things we can work on together.

18 Internal meetings. Again, I mentioned
19 just trying to figure out the administrative
20 blocks and what things are different. We have
21 been working on that planningwise.

22 Our Federal Register notice -- and that's
23 a notice of intent to begin the planning process.
24 That has been drafted. It has been okayed through
25 the State level. It's now at the Washington

1 level. And we are waiting for that to roll out,
2 as they are calling it. Right now, it's kind of
3 lumped with these other monuments that were
4 mentioned earlier, the Presidential Proclamation
5 monuments.

6 And so we are working. We have had some
7 phone calls. And Danella made a phone call to see
8 when we can get that Federal Register notice
9 released. That's our official begin date for
10 beginning public scoping. We have attended some
11 meetings. The Pinyon Community invited us to come
12 speak. And at that stage it was kind of
13 informational; "This is where we are, where we
14 hope to be," that kind of a thing.

15 But until we get that Federal Register
16 notice published, we are not beginning our public
17 scoping meetings. But we hope that will happen
18 very quickly. And then we hope to have several
19 meetings in the valley, a meeting down in Anza,
20 and a meeting up in the mountains.

21 So, you know, we will speak with you
22 about when those will be. And they will be in the
23 evening or on Saturdays, again, so, obviously, for
24 the public --

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Question. Would it
142

1 be your hope that members of this Committee would
2 attend those?

3 MS. DUNNING: I think that would be
4 great. It's not our expectation, because it is
5 going to be six meetings in two weeks, five
6 meetings in two weeks. But certainly we are going
7 to pick a date and anyone can be there. I would
8 hope the more the merrier, because the more people
9 that are there to represent both the community
10 and, also, the BLM, Forest Service -- it's kind of
11 a mass information session. So, yes, we will
12 definitely coordinate with you.

13 One of the things that is required of us
14 in the planning process is that for the Monument
15 plan we have to address current land use. And
16 there are currently -- if you look at the line
17 around the map of the Monument, there's currently
18 already land use plans for the BLM lands and for
19 the Forest Service.

20 But both of those -- both the BLM and the
21 Forest Service right now are working on
22 revisions. The Forest Service is working on a
23 revision to their -- actually, all four of the
24 national forests in Southern California.

25 And they are right now -- their draft EIS

1 is due out September, this September. And they
2 have another handout that I gave you. "Forest
3 Plan Update" is the title of that handout. It's a
4 list of their estimated time line of their
5 planning process. And a lot of the issues that
6 you have or that you have noticed will exist in
7 the Monument and we are looking to you to
8 provide. The Forest Service is, hopefully,
9 covering a lot of those issues.

10 So an important step in the Monument plan
11 is identifying what is already going on, what
12 efforts have already been in place to help address
13 certain issues.

14 On the back of that page, there is a Web
15 address. There's also a list of current meetings,
16 and I invite -- the Forest Service speaking -- all
17 of you to attend any or each of these. Probably.
18 Not all of them. But there are some meetings
19 coming up. And those are going to be meetings
20 that the Forest Service has had in place for a
21 while to address some of the issues that they are
22 dealing with.

23 From the BLM side, the California Desert
24 Conservation Act covers quite a bit of the land --
25 that's the BLM land -- within the Monument. All

1 of it falls within the California Desert
2 Conservation Act. And we are currently under the
3 process of revising that plan. And we are working
4 with the Coachella Valley Multiple Species Habitat
5 Conservation Plan, as a lot of you know.

6 And so a lot of the issues that will come
7 up that we need subcommittees for, that we need to
8 address, a lot of those issues are being addressed
9 in that planning process as well. So it's of
10 great importance that each of you can get up to
11 speed on each of those plans, just to see what
12 issues are out there and how they are being
13 addressed. And hopefully you can use it --
14 yourselves, as an Advisory Committee -- to get up
15 to speed.

16 And, unfortunately, there's not a Forest
17 Service person here to represent the Forest
18 Service planning, but Elena and I can both answer
19 any questions you have about the BLM planning. We
20 thought it would be a little much to just dump
21 that entire plan on you at this meeting, but I can
22 see that it's definitely important that we address
23 that soon.

24 As an example of the goals of that
25 planning process, I went ahead and listed the

1 goals of our CDC plan amendment, what we are
2 calling it. And these are similar to the Forest
3 Serving planning. Species status and prevent
4 additional listings; accommodate increasing
5 urbanization needs in the Coachella Valley;
6 enhance cooperative relationships and
7 collaboration opportunities; ensures that our BLM
8 land management actions are consistent with the
9 Coachella Valley Multiple Habitat Conservation
10 Plan; and identify and protect Native American
11 resources.

12 So this is just kind of a bullet idea of
13 what our objectives are. And you can see that
14 there's overlapping issues on the Monument as
15 well. And I put this slide up here as an example
16 to show you the importance of addressing the
17 current land planning that's going on right now
18 and seeing, you know, how we are going to pull
19 those ideas forward.

20 So what I don't have up there, Agua
21 Caliente right now is working on a plan and how we
22 can pull those same ideas forward. And Mt. San
23 Jacinto State Park just completed a draft. And I
24 think they were receiving comments up until a
25 month ago. So those are two other planning

1 efforts that these issues are being addressed
2 right now. So it's not brand-new.

3 So we need to establish methods to bring
4 those planning actions into the Monument plan.
5 They are already being addressed. And there needs
6 to be a way that we can pull those forward. If
7 they are being covered sufficiently and in a
8 review process of whatever proposed actions are up
9 right now, then we can kind of use you guys -- let
10 those things kind of go as they are.

11 In terms of cultural resources, you might
12 be happy with the proposed actions as they are, as
13 they are being moved towards. You might not be as
14 happy with some of the other ideas. So it's our
15 role to get you up to speed with those planning
16 efforts as they are now and you can help identify
17 which issues you feel need to be addressed
18 further.

19 Again, we need to coordinate with the
20 different land managers and identifying actions
21 not covered by current planning efforts. If we
22 could just identify what needs to be done, that
23 are efforts that cross those imaginary borders,
24 for instance, you could all just right now think
25 of a lot of ideas that need -- you can't just look

1 at each plan independently. They are not going to
2 be covered unless we address them right now.

3 So the role that we see, as planners, how
4 you could help us the most is to get up to speed
5 with those current plans and the ideas that are
6 being proposed and give us guidance right now, and
7 focus on the goal. Not the decision itself.
8 Focus on the issue. "What are the important
9 issues?"

10 And the decision process takes a very
11 long time. So if we can focus on what are those
12 issues, what are the important issues that we need
13 to be addressing, that's what we need from each of
14 you. You know, "What are the important issues?
15 What do we need to be addressing?" Providing
16 guidance to those current planning efforts,
17 providing a public viewpoint that we might not get
18 at these public meetings. Especially since we
19 can't legally have those public meetings yet.

20 So any role you can play in the community
21 to represent the public would assist us.

22 So bringing up Ed's question at
23 lunchtime, what are the limitations? What are
24 your limitations as an Advisory Committee? What
25 can you not do?

1 Well, we do have requirements because we
2 are a federal agency. And I am speaking for the
3 BLM, but this also represents the Forest Service.
4 Anytime there's a new proposed action, we have to
5 go through a NEPA process, National Environment
6 Policy Act process. So that is not really a
7 limitation. It's just part of the way that we
8 have to get to an issue or a decision. So knowing
9 what -- I mean, that is a limitation in a way,
10 because it does take some time.

11 We also have to be in conformance with
12 current ideas. And that is something that all of
13 our land use planning processes have to do, is
14 identify what are the current uses out there. We
15 can't impact private property rights in any way.
16 None of our BLM and our federal land use planning
17 affects private lands. So it's something that you
18 can do as Advisory Committee members, is just be
19 cognizant of the federal regulations that exist
20 and look to us to provide that for you.

21 Were there any other questions
22 specifically about limitations and -- no?

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: How does the
24 Monument and its operation differ from a park and
25 its operation?

1 MS. DUNNING: The Monument -- we are
2 lucky in this case. The Monument was created with
3 its own legislation. And along with that, the
4 community members who were involved and each of
5 the different agencies involved in creating that
6 legislation, that's our backbone.

7 And National Parks and Fish & Wildlife
8 Service refuges and other natural areas,
9 wilderness management areas, there's lots of
10 different areas that have -- that were set aside
11 for different goals. Some monuments that were
12 created were created because of a cultural
13 resource to be protected. Some were established
14 specifically for wildlife purposes.

15 In this case, the legislation, you
16 know -- it clearly states what this Monument was
17 set aside to protect and to provide for. So we
18 can use that legislation to answer that question
19 and constantly refer to that.

20 Legislation. Paragraph 1. Here we go.
21 I will read the whole thing. "The Santa Rosa and
22 San Jacinto Mountains in Southern California
23 contain nationally significant biological,
24 cultural, recreational, geological, educational,
25 and scientific values."

1 And the purpose of this Monument is
2 stated in Section 2(b). "Establishment and
3 Purposes: In order to preserve the nationally
4 significant biological, cultural, recreational,
5 geological, educational, and scientific values
6 found in the Santa Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains
7 and to secure now and for future generations the
8 opportunity to experience and enjoy the
9 magnificent vistas, wildlife, land forms, and
10 natural and cultural resources in these mountains
11 and to recreate therein, there is hereby
12 designated the Santa Rosa and San Jacinto
13 Mountains National Monument."

14 So keep it close to you. Use it to
15 reference often. I do. Does that answer in some
16 way --

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: We are getting
18 there.

19 MR. HAVERT: Can I ask a question?

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Please.

21 MS. DUNNING: Oh, Elena has --

22 MS. MISQUEZ: I was just going to say
23 one thing that I think is unique about this
24 Monument, is it is not managed by one agency. It
25 is managed by multiple agencies, which makes it

1 very different from a park. And you are going to
2 have multiple perspectives of how to manage it.

3 And our challenge will be how to provide
4 seamless public service with all of these
5 different agencies working together.

6 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Bill?

7 MR. HAVERT: Yes. Connell, as I look
8 at the time line, obviously, a lot of that is
9 driven by the required end date of the plan. And
10 then backing up from that, given all of the
11 environmental documentation and Registry notices
12 and so on and so forth, it looks as though bottom
13 line here is that somewhere in the next month or
14 couple of months you need to have in effect a plan
15 that then is the project under the National
16 Environmental Policy Act, EIS.

17 And so if I am hearing that correctly,
18 our time line for really focusing on the planning
19 process itself, at least in terms of that which is
20 going to go out for environmental review, is
21 extremely short. And that seems to be something
22 that we really need to focus on this afternoon, is
23 what is that time frame.

24 And, you know, if it's in different
25 stages or phases, I think we need to be really

1 clear on what those are, what the time frames
2 associated with each one of those are, and then
3 what realistically we can hope to accomplish
4 within those time frames as a Committee.

5 MS. DUNNING: Again, this is an
6 extremely aggressive schedule. And it was written
7 with the goal of October 2003 as an end date.
8 Everything gets moved forward dependent upon our
9 public meetings and getting public scoping and
10 identifying what those issues are.

11 We can't begin -- we are beginning kind
12 of the nuts and bolts of working to make a plan
13 happen, getting all of our birds in place. Is
14 that the quote? Ducks. Thank you. I knew it was
15 some sort of avian thing.

16 So we are getting our ducks in place. We
17 are getting our resources, gearing up, and getting
18 ready to go. The issues are there. We can start
19 working on those issues now. But we do need to
20 have the public meetings as an official starting
21 point of getting the public's input. And we can
22 look to you to help give us kind of an entry to
23 that.

24 MR. HAVERT: Follow-up question: The
25 end of February 2002, the last item there, says

1 "Present Plan Strategy/Briefing to Advisory
2 Committee," and then under that, "March - May:
3 Continue working on administrative draft plan/EIS
4 and draft biological assessment."

5 So in effect, by the end of May, that
6 core planning process is completed.

7 Now, the follow-up question, then, is do
8 you have the guts of the plan or an outline of a
9 plan that staff has already been working on?

10 MS. DUNNING: Yes.

11 MR. HAVERT: Is that something that is
12 in here or --

13 MS. DUNNING: An important meeting for
14 us is in the next couple weeks. We are meeting
15 with regional planning staff from the Forest
16 Service. The BLM planning staff will be meeting
17 with that regional planning staff. And from
18 there, we hope to have kind of a go-ahead in terms
19 of how we are going to be working together and
20 getting this plan, this kind of a preplan that we
21 provided, and getting comments back from them.

22 Because the Forest Service and the BLM,
23 we are -- because we are required to present that
24 plan in October of 2003, that's really a very
25 crucial meeting for getting Forest Service

1 together with BLM. And that preplan will serve as
2 a backbone at that stage and any additional
3 regulations or things that we haven't addressed
4 thus far will be added to that.

5 So in that plan -- it's the
6 second-to-the-last packet in your packets -- we do
7 have listed kind of some preliminary issues,
8 anticipated issues, and management concerns. And
9 this has been reviewed by Forest Service planning
10 staff locally. We want to make sure the regional
11 staff kind of agree with these issues as they
12 exist. But we are looking to you to provide
13 additional issues that we should be addressing.

14 MR. IDEKER: Because it seems to do so
15 much to kind of shape some other discussion about
16 your work in the coming months, let's go back to
17 Bill's original question and make sure that we,
18 with great clarity, have understood the answers
19 that I heard to the question.

20 And that is, Is it correct that by the
21 end of February this Group will be given some form
22 of draft plan to review by the agency partners?
23 Is that how we are going to refer to it?

24 MS. DUNNING: No. At this point, we
25 have a draft preplan. And it's the same things

1 that we can get comments from. It's a --

2 MR. IDEKER: So the word "plan" here
3 should be "preplan." And, Danella, what --

4 MS. GEORGE: Without jumping in, but I
5 need to because -- what we did with these kinds of
6 sheets is we took the end date that was given to
7 us by the legislation. And I had asked Connell to
8 work out the different laws that were under the
9 regulatory laws. We actually did it first for
10 Coachella Valley Plan; right? So that I call it
11 an idiot sheet so that we can look at it and see
12 the time frames for the different regulatory
13 things that we have to do for ESA, Clean Air Act,
14 so staff will kind of know what they are up
15 against for time lines.

16 Reality is we are a year and -- how many
17 months behind? I mean, we are. We simply are --
18 from when the legislation was written. It took a
19 year or so to get a charter and to get a committee
20 and to be meeting here.

21 So this is built off of a day in
22 legislation that with all the other laws we are
23 under that we have to do, there's no way we could
24 do that.

25 And this plan is so closely linked to

1 what came out of Coachella Valley Multi Species
2 Plan, you know. I mean, many of the decision
3 points that we will go to come from Coachella
4 Valley Multi Species Plan as well as the Forest
5 Service plan. So everything is behind schedule.

6 MR. CRITES: So if I might --

7 MS. GEORGE: Is that okay, Connell?

8 MS. DUNNING: Oh, yes. This is an
9 idea of relationship.

10 MR. CRITES: If that's true, then all
11 of our discussions this morning about October the
12 24th, 2003, should really read October 24th,
13 2004?

14 MS. GEORGE: Well, not until somebody
15 says that.

16 MR. CRITES: You just said we are a
17 year behind.

18 MR. IDEKER: But the only one
19 acknowledging that is Danella.

20 MS. DUNNING: There's things that we
21 can accelerate.

22 MR. HAVERT: What are the consequences
23 of not having the plan adopted, in place, by
24 October 24th, 2003?

25 MS. GEORGE: Well, we run into things

1 like people don't get a goal, activities that
2 might be left and gone through a biological
3 opinion, and have been an accepted activity out in
4 the landscape of the Monument, that we be under
5 the same sort of regime we are currently under, at
6 least on the BLM landscape, where we are still
7 operating under a lawsuit. We are trying to free
8 ourselves from that by following the processes
9 that got us to that stage.

10 And then the other thing is, see, Bill,
11 for us, it's really important -- and I am putting
12 on my Forest Service hat too. It's Forest Service
13 and BLM. It's really important we have public
14 meetings. Those public meetings or scoping
15 meetings become what the issues are for driving
16 the plans, gathering what the public's input is
17 for the issues for the plan. And we couldn't have
18 that until the charter was done. Till the notice
19 of intent is in the Federal Register, we can't
20 have a public meeting.

21 So that's holding us back on this time
22 line.

23 MR. HAVERT: If I can pursue a couple
24 of things --

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Just a moment.

1 Paul, you've got control here, so -- please be
2 cognizant -- Bary has had his hand up a couple
3 times.

4 MR. IDEKER: I have noted Bary's hand,
5 and Bill as well. Bary, may I have Bill follow
6 up?

7 MR. FREET: Sure. Absolutely.

8 MR. IDEKER: And then definitely you
9 are next and --

10 MR. FREET: I am just curious who is
11 running the --

12 MR. IDEKER: The reason I think it's
13 useful to spend time on this is, one, I think you
14 want to leave here today knowing what we are going
15 to do, when do we have to do it by. And something
16 that someone asked earlier this morning now comes
17 very much into play. If, in fact, there is a need
18 to officially at least begin a process for moving
19 this date out one year, as Buford raised, what
20 role should this group play in moving that agenda
21 forward, in reaching out to the Congresswoman, and
22 in now their official capacity as appointed
23 Committee members and working with the agency
24 partners to do that?

25 So, Bill?

1 MR. HAVERT: Well, one, you know, I am
2 familiar with what the California Desert
3 Conservation Area Plan Amendment does, I mean,
4 what its function is and what the consequences of
5 not getting that completed are.

6 And I am familiar, obviously, with the
7 Multi Species HCP and what that does and what the
8 consequences are. It seems to me that those stand
9 apart separate from the Monument plan. And so I
10 am not quite sure I understand what the
11 consequences will be for not getting the Monument
12 plan done by a certain time line. I am not sure I
13 understand the full import of that plan as
14 separate from the CDCA Plan Amendment and the
15 Multi Species Plan Amendment.

16 So that's kind of Question A.

17 MS. DUNNING: Can we answer
18 Question A?

19 MR. HAVERT: Yes.

20 MS. DUNNING: I am afraid I won't
21 remember the question.

22 MS. MISQUEZ: I think other than as
23 written in the legislation, possibly funding
24 consequences, you know. I am not sure what
25 consequences --

1 MS. HENDERSON: Louder, please.

2 MS. MISQUEZ: Sorry.

3 Other than the fact that it's written
4 into law in the Monument Act, possible funding
5 consequences, I am not sure what consequences
6 there would be.

7 MS. DUNNING: And from a BLM planning
8 perspective, the current planning for -- that we
9 are amending, the current land use plan that we
10 are amending, if that process is completed and we
11 can then pull forward actions that were already
12 agreed upon through that process of consulting
13 with the Fish & Wildlife Service and getting the
14 cities to agree on actions in adjoining areas and
15 that kind of thing, if we can pull those forward,
16 it's much cleaner than amending an amendment,
17 which is what we would technically have to do with
18 those actions. If there were to be changes. We
19 are hoping that there wouldn't be.

20 MS. MISQUEZ: Let me speak on that.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Why don't you stand
22 up, please.

23 MS. DUNNING: Elena Misqueze.

24 MS. MISQUEZ: Certainly. Thank you,
25 Bill, for the presentation on the Coachella Valley

1 Multi Species Plan. And I want to emphasize that
2 is going to be very critical to the BLM as we move
3 through our CDCA Plan Amendment, of course. And
4 it has big implications for the Monument plan.

5 In our ideal strategy, we can deal with
6 the tough issues of the Monument, Bighorn Sheep,
7 through the CDCA Plan Amendment and the Coachella
8 Valley Multi Species Habitat Conservation Plan.
9 And then we can focus, hopefully, on other issues
10 within the Monument plan, bringing forward those
11 issues that were resolved through the CDCA Plan
12 Amendment into the Monument plan.

13 And then so that we can perhaps focus
14 more on, like I said, seamless public service, all
15 the agencies working together, interagency
16 coordination, things like that. So that in the
17 interim, it will be really important to get those
18 issues and concerns regarding, let's say, Bighorn
19 Sheep, Endangered Species Act issues that need to
20 be addressed through the Multi Species Plan, to
21 get that into that process now, be a part of the
22 policy action group which meets, I believe, every
23 fourth Thursday of the month at the Coachella
24 Valley Association of Governments Office in Palm
25 Desert. And I guess -- and, also, with the

1 National Forest Plans that they have ongoing.
2 Because things from there will be brought forward
3 into the Monument plan.

4 So we are in -- actually, we are in a
5 pretty good position. We are not starting totally
6 from scratch with this Monument plan; all right?
7 If, down the road, someone asks the question, "Do
8 we have an option to change things?" we always
9 can. You can go through your NEPA process, you go
10 through your environmental review process, you go
11 through another consultation process with the Fish
12 & Wildlife Service.

13 I know for BLM and many others, we want
14 to be very careful, though, if we stand to look at
15 changing things that are, let's say, already
16 agreed to through the Coachella Valley Multi
17 Species Plan and the CDCA Plan Amendment, we don't
18 want to compromise any commitments we have made
19 already, because the cities will have permits
20 issued to them from the Fish & Wildlife Service
21 for management of Bighorn Sheep activities on
22 private lands. And BLM is assisting in terms of
23 our management -- commitments we make for
24 management of our lands to help with that
25 process. And so we don't want to jeopardize

1 that.

2 That's the only thing we need to be
3 careful of -- it's a big thing to be careful of,
4 but --

5 MR. IDEKER: Are you getting
6 comfortable that you are seeing a clearer
7 picture? I am looking at Bill, but I guess I need
8 to look at everybody. Because you are all part of
9 this. And there's a no. There's a hand.

10 Allan? Jeffery? Comments on this piece
11 of it? Because -- Jim, do you want to add
12 something?

13 MR. KENNA: Well, I am just thinking I
14 can maybe help a little bit.

15 We have a legislative deadline. And we
16 talked about that. Danella, I think, was right on
17 target in saying that it will be very difficult to
18 meet that deadline. I think we have direction
19 from Congress, though, and as an agency we take a
20 deadline like that very seriously.

21 Whether we would end up at some point
22 reapproaching Congress for some leniency on that,
23 I think would be a question for the future, and
24 probably one which we might raise if and when we
25 have a better idea of what that schedule might

1 have to be if we can't make it.

2 But I think for the time being, we have
3 to approach this thing as though that is the
4 deadline. The internal schedule between now and
5 2003, there's room to move around in there. So if
6 there are pieces that we could accelerate or move
7 up or move back, I think those are open to
8 discussion.

9 Will you have a draft EIS by May? I will
10 be very surprised. I mean, I think that's the
11 essence of Bill's question. But we do need to
12 move as quickly as possible and move toward that
13 date as best as we can. And if we encounter
14 something that will prevent us from getting there,
15 I think we need to revisit that through the
16 congressional process, because we are responsible
17 for that date.

18 MS. DUNNING: And I would use this as
19 an example of the relationship of elements that
20 need to be completed rather than a hard, fast
21 deadline of what month each of those elements will
22 begin. The process is going to unfold. And as
23 speedily as we can create that process of the plan
24 being created, it will happen.

25 But this is a good -- something to refer

1 to, just all of the elements that go into the
2 plan. But look at it more as the relationship of
3 those in time to each other as opposed to, "On
4 this month, this action will start." If that
5 helps.

6 MR. IDEKER: Let's go to Bary. And
7 then we will come back here and then Jeffery.
8 Work our way back.

9 MR. FREET: Okay. My question: If I
10 am not mistaken, this body was chartered in
11 October; is that correct? So the year or the --
12 the term limits, if you will, started in October?
13 And we are already a quarter of the -- one quarter
14 of time past that. So some members on this panel
15 only have nine more months --

16 MS. GEORGE: Your letters were dated
17 November 16th, the letter itself. The charter was
18 October, but the letter to each individual was
19 November 16th.

20 MR. FREET: So we are not as far
21 behind -- is it going to be problematic to lose
22 one-third of this body November the 15th?

23 MS. GEORGE: Yes.

24 MR. FREET: I would think so.

25 MS. GEORGE: But the charter does say
166

1 that the people may be reappointed to a three-year
2 term when those charters are up. For those who
3 express interest and want to still be a part of
4 the group, I'm sure that opportunity exists out
5 there. We wouldn't want to lose the valuable --

6 MR. IDEKER: Well, that needs to go on
7 your agenda somewhere in terms of issues to be
8 dealt with soon, because that renomination
9 process, as we found out the first go-round, is
10 going to take some time.

11 So if there's not going to be a gap, if
12 you are going to avoid a gap there -- and avoiding
13 a gap seems to be an important thing -- then what
14 we want to do is make sure that early on those
15 people who have one-year terms are, first of all,
16 deciding whether they want to be reappointed;
17 secondarily, there's some internal agreement or
18 understanding about what you are going to do and
19 when you are going to do it about going back to
20 the people and making application for that
21 reappointment.

22 Or we are going to find ourselves next
23 October looking at people who are on the way out
24 and having that party. And that could be a
25 significant problem.

1 MR. FREET: And that process may need
2 to start in the next two months.

3 MR. IDEKER: Probably does. Probably
4 does need to start in the next two months.

5 MS. GEORGE: We know it does, yes.

6 MR. IDEKER: Yes.

7 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Just following
8 Bary's question. Barbara Lyons, Vice Chair, Agua
9 Caliente.

10 Wouldn't we really need to get a
11 guarantee from these people who have a one-year
12 term that they will be willing to sit again?
13 Because training new people at nine months down
14 the road, having a new person come in, they are
15 going to have to learn again all that we are
16 taking our time this whole nine months to learn.
17 And having them play catch-up, that's going to
18 pull our schedule back again.

19 MR. IDEKER: You are looking at me. I
20 would say it's advantageous to the Group to know
21 as early as possible who would like to continue
22 and who may not, for whatever the reason, be able
23 to continue.

24 I would also assume that since these will
25 become technically open positions, that there may

1 be competition for those positions in terms of the
2 appointment, and there's a prescribed process that
3 must be put in place where you solicit nominees
4 and do that whole thing again.

5 So I think you are going to have to move
6 along on some parallel track to avoid what Bary
7 gave us an early heads up about, and that's the
8 possibility -- and Jim said that -- you know, all
9 said that that would be a bad thing, to avoid that
10 gap. I think you are going to have to move on
11 some parallel track and hope it all converges
12 sometime in August. And with a good ending, might
13 I say.

14 Buford? Okay. Right next --

15 MR. GRAFTON: Larry Grafton, Indian
16 Wells.

17 Comments coming down from this table. I
18 can almost see me not being here. I mean, I am a
19 political -- or appointed by a city.

20 MS. HENDERSON: Can't hear you.

21 MR. GRAFTON: There is already
22 discussion about who is going to fill the slot, my
23 slot, since I am only appointed for one year. So
24 I think that's a big issue.

25 Secondly, getting back to Connell -- and
169

1 I am having some problems -- excuse me. I am kind
2 of an old-fashioned land use planner. Is it the
3 intent of core staff to take -- it sounds like we
4 have four bodies, four agencies doing their own
5 land use plan. Is it to take somebody on core
6 staff to go through, evaluate each of those plans,
7 identify problems, issues, and then pull that out
8 into a separate Monument Plan? Or to incorporate
9 those documents into one plan?

10 MS. DUNNING: We will have a separate
11 Monument Plan when we finish that, the process you
12 just described. And what elements will be pulled
13 forward and what elements are new and weren't
14 originally addressed will be in different places
15 in that plan. There will be plans that will be
16 referred to.

17 I think if we were to completely pull
18 forward everything, the document would be very
19 weighty. I think it's -- from talking with the
20 Forest Service, planning staff, and internally --
21 it's our idea that we have a working document
22 that's a bit more readable and addresses the main
23 issues, but may refer to other plans and other
24 planning amendments, the Forest Service plan
25 revision process.

1 So what that final document looks like, I
2 think, will be a mix.

3 MR. GRAFTON: Second question is, I
4 understand where you are going with that, but do
5 you see a possibility of inconsistencies arising
6 if you are referring back to other plans that, you
7 know, may change over time?

8 MS. DUNNING: Yes. We will be
9 referring to plans that ultimately will be
10 amended, but -- the final document, what we hope
11 to use as a starting point -- because the Monument
12 Plan itself may need to be amended in the future.
13 But those issues that are kind of above and beyond
14 -- it would be great if the final plan could
15 address only those issues that kind of are above
16 and beyond and we couldn't deal with in the other
17 plans and we could refer only to those other plans
18 by reference. But we are going to have to pull
19 forward some elements to make it readable.

20 So the amendment process at that point,
21 the Monument Plan will supersede -- Elena?

22 MS. MISQUEZ: Yes, it would.

23 MS. DUNNING: -- whichever plan
24 happens second. The Monument Plan -- and we are
25 assuming that that plan will be completed after

1 our CDCA Plan Amendment and after the Forest
2 Service Plan Revision. It's our intention that
3 that will then be the planning -- it's confusing
4 -- that will then be the document, draw a line
5 around the map, and then that will be the -- that
6 planning document that will then need to be
7 amended in the future.

8 MR. IDEKER: Sounded to me like when
9 Connell did it the first time, and now again --
10 and what Larry was saying -- is you've got four
11 plans, A, B, C, and D right now, that are big
12 chunks of planning work coming from different
13 agencies or organizations, but all of which have
14 some overlap potential for the Monument Plan.

15 The four of these are going to feed in in
16 some way to the ultimate Monument Plan. That's
17 where we get the part of we are not as far behind
18 as we may think, because these planning processes
19 are already in some state.

20 You can inform yourselves about where
21 they are, what state they are in, by going to the
22 various Websites or referring to the documents
23 that staff is sharing with you today and will
24 share with you in the future.

25 There's apt to be some gaps. Those are

1 the round X's here. Those are the gaps. Which
2 only relate to the final Monument Plan. Those are
3 things which definitely this Committee seems to me
4 is going to have to focus its attention on in the
5 coming months as directed and supported by staff
6 help here, because it's all about the Monument
7 Plan there.

8 Together, then, in the end, there's going
9 to be this great kind of mixing process of all the
10 best from the big four, all the holes, all the
11 circles, the individual plans, which involve your
12 own processes in terms of public hearings, site
13 surveys, a whole wealth of other things that have
14 to be done.

15 All of that, then, somebody puts
16 together. When you leave the pieces out at night,
17 the elves come and they make it into a Draft
18 Monument Plan. Right now, we are saying that the
19 final plan needs to be ready by 2003 with some
20 acknowledgment here today, on the 28th of January,
21 2002, that that's not likely to happen.

22 MS. GEORGE: Right. Because you are
23 going to be making -- exactly -- the land use plan
24 decisions, the plan of how the land
25 classifications -- we wouldn't want to be doing

1 that in the Monument Plan. We want to have that
2 from Forest Service first, from CDCA first, before
3 we went off making our plan, I think.

4 MR. IDEKER: You also want to have in
5 the end a plan that is not contradicting other
6 plans. I mean, that certainly doesn't make any
7 sense.

8 MS. MISQUEZ: Exactly. Such that I
9 would envision one of the focuses --

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Stand up when you
11 talk. You don't talk very loud.

12 MS. MISQUEZ: So that I would envision
13 one of the focuses of the Monument Plan is how to
14 tie all of these agencies together so that, again,
15 we work seamlessly to provide public service. So
16 that I think the focus will be on relationships.

17 MR. IDEKER: I am going to go to
18 Jeffery and then back to you, Barbara, and then
19 back up to Buford. And then anybody new.

20 MR. MORGAN: My question has been
21 partially answered by the previous discussions
22 over the last few minutes, but if we are going to
23 tie a lot of emphasis onto the Coachella Valley
24 Multi Species Plan, and that plan fails, where
25 people don't agree, the whole thing falls apart,

1 we need to be able to go beyond that and not put
2 too much weight on that thing actually happening.
3 Even though it may happen. It could well happen
4 very quickly. Also, may not.

5 So we need to have some ultimate method
6 of operation if that thing does fall apart.

7 MR. IDEKER: That could move from a
8 square to a letter with a circle with an X, is
9 what you are suggesting, and you need to have some
10 sense of a strategy for a Plan B where that big
11 box is concerned.

12 MR. MORGAN: Yes.

13 MR. IDEKER: Or you put those people
14 in a room and never let them out until they agree
15 that that will be that plan.

16 MS. GEORGE: Well, except we don't
17 have a chance with the -- the BLM part of it. I
18 mean, God help us if it failed the whole thing,
19 but we still have to move forward.

20 MS. MISQUEZ: We will finish our plan
21 amendment.

22 MS. GEORGE: Yes. We have no choice
23 because of the litigation.

24 MR. IDEKER: As God is their witness,
25 there will be that plan.

1 Barbara? Terry? Buford. Then Terry.

2 Buford?

3 MR. CRITES: Oh, two conclusionary
4 thoughts, at least. One, we need to direct the
5 Chair and our Supervising Officer, whatever the
6 fancy name is, to start the process next -- this
7 week for reappointments or new people coming on.
8 And it does need to be two months from now. I
9 doubt if they will have it done November if they
10 start tomorrow.

11 And Item 2, I think we ought to ask staff
12 to come back at the next meeting with a flowchart
13 that actually shows us something that might
14 happen, because, I mean, we are dead sure this
15 won't happen. It can't happen. And in two
16 months, you may have some better ideas as to
17 whether or not the Multiple Species Plan is going
18 to actually go forward or not and some of the
19 other things, and then put that all out and give
20 us something. Because we won't meet whatever
21 deadline we are supposed to meet anyhow. But it's
22 embarrassing to know that before we even start.

23 MS. DUNNING: So if it would help the
24 visual aid, I can pass out some black markers and
25 you can just mark out the dates, but -- the ideas

1 and the flow of events. So mentally do that if it
2 would help you as a visual aid.

3 And the next time we speak, we can
4 project with our current -- in the next couple
5 months, we will have a little better idea.

6 MR. IDEKER: It may also make sense to
7 do a column that assumes a 2004 due date to look
8 at least at what those interim dates might be as
9 well.

10 MS. DUNNING: Yes.

11 MR. IDEKER: Because at some point, it
12 sounds to me like something is going to have to be
13 done. What role this Committee plays in that --
14 to get that -- that due date realigned into
15 reality.

16 Yes, ma'am?

17 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: My other comments
18 before -- but first comment is we need Danella to
19 write larger. We can't read that from here.

20 MS. GEORGE: I am sorry. I am not a
21 facilitator. I just wanted to catch --

22 MR. IDEKER: But I am. And the reason
23 I am not worried about that is that's why we have
24 Diane.

25 MS. GEORGE: But I am just catching

1 what -- I guess, through notes or -- all I was
2 doing was catching what Buford had asked for, and
3 I will read it back to the Group for the next
4 meeting.

5 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: And you will give
6 those in writing, then, to us later?

7 MR. IDEKER: Well, you are going to
8 have access, I would assume, to the whole record
9 of the meeting.

10 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: The first
11 question I had was the Fish & Game, are they part
12 of this A, B, C, and D plan? You know, are they
13 part of that? And if not, when are they going to
14 be involved? Because we can't have them coming in
15 later and then slowing it down. We need them done
16 at the same time everybody else is coming
17 together.

18 MR. IDEKER: Do you want to address
19 that now?

20 Would you introduce yourself, please?

21 MR. KONNO: My name is Eddy Konno. I
22 am a wildlife biologist of the California Fish &
23 Game Department.

24 We would like to be involved in the plan
25 at the earliest possible date, because there are

1 issues involving the property that is managed by
2 us.

3 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: And then I would
4 suggest that we make sure that the other
5 departments, BLM and everything, work with them,
6 when you have your meetings together, that they
7 are part of that working group, so that we can
8 make sure that they are in there.

9 And the second thing is we know that date
10 is not achievable at this point of October 2003.
11 Would it be better for us, as a Committee, to have
12 an amendment on the date once we find out what a
13 good time line would be, when we come back later
14 on a time line, what that date should be so that
15 we don't look bad to the legislators and that our
16 funding will run the way we need it to run so that
17 it doesn't get cut off in October 2003; that we
18 make sure we have that resource?

19 So maybe that's something we need to look
20 at as a Committee and push for that amendment
21 through legislation.

22 MS. GEORGE: As a federal official, I
23 can't ask you to lobby Congress. So --

24 MR. IDEKER: Well, I think it's
25 totally appropriate in terms of what Barbara has

1 just said for the Committee at some point to draft
2 and adopt a resolution early on that would
3 probably end up at Linda's desk in Washington for
4 the Congresswoman to consider going back in and
5 revisiting this due date. Sooner rather than
6 later. I think that makes a great deal of sense.

7 And the other thing, Barbara, that was
8 very important what you said. And to underscore
9 it, with staff, you are probably only going to get
10 one shot at changing this date. So make sure you
11 get what you ask for in terms of knowing when you
12 are -- when it's reasonable to believe you will be
13 able to deliver the goods, because you probably
14 don't get a second shot at going, "No. Did we say
15 2004? We meant 2005."

16 So we want to make sure that that
17 information to the Committee is well informed by
18 reality. Linda had a --

19 MS. VALTER: Yes. Just to give a
20 little history about why three years was chosen.
21 There were some people that wanted it done in two
22 years, some people that said, "Oh, let's -- four
23 or five." Three was chosen because, quite
24 frankly, a lot of those folks who recreate in the
25 Monument wanted certainty that they would be able

1 to ride their horses, that they would be able to
2 hike, and that it wouldn't be in this nebulous
3 stage of, you know, what they could do, whenever.

4 So that's why, you know, we tried to
5 compromise -- four, two, and we went with three --
6 to give some certainty to individuals who have a
7 stake in the Monument. So it was kind of -- it
8 was a contentious point, but --

9 MS. GEORGE: I mean, three years,
10 people should be able to -- if we could have had
11 three years -- do a plan. I mean, we don't need
12 to spend our whole life planning. The goal is to
13 have a plan that's a framework so that we can get
14 into the place of implementation of doing
15 restoration rather than just having planning
16 meetings to go to, but that we are out in the
17 landscape. And that, I know, is very important to
18 the Forest Service and to Jim Kenna. We want to
19 get to a place of implementation.

20 But in order to do that, we have to
21 follow the law so we don't get litigated against.
22 And I guess what I am hearing -- make sure I
23 understand this -- what we need to bring to the
24 Committee next time to have a more realistic -- a
25 better feel of what it would take to get this plan

1 done is a time line based on failure of the
2 Coachella Valley Multi Species Plan and to move
3 forward at our own pace to start the consultation
4 process with Fish & Wildlife Service just for the
5 Monument.

6 Is that what we are looking for?

7 MS. MISQUEZ: We can provide two time
8 lines, assuming that Coachella Valley does not go
9 through, but we go ahead anyway. And then if the
10 Multiple Species Act does go through --

11 MR. IDEKER: For the purpose of this
12 meeting and this record, it might be useful to
13 show that staff is going to consider -- sit down
14 and look at various alternatives to the overall
15 timing and various scenarios that could be played
16 out and come back to the Committee to present
17 those as a series of scenarios that may or may not
18 happen but are at least realistic in terms of the
19 alternatives you see happening. That may turn out
20 to be three. It may turn out to be four. It may
21 only be two.

22 MS. GEORGE: We could do that and then
23 maybe the Committee can help determine the path we
24 go down.

25 MR. IDEKER: Mr. Chair, I know you

1 want to speak with Terry also.

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I just wanted to ask
3 Linda to follow up on that. Having said how you
4 arrived at 2003, is there in your mind any
5 difficulty with going to a realistic tool for
6 whatever the case may be, and if so, how much time
7 do you and your machinations need to make that
8 happen?

9 MS. VALTER: Gosh. That's hard for me
10 to say sitting here without actually talking to
11 the boss. So I don't necessarily want to speak
12 for her at this point in time.

13 But, you know, getting things through
14 Congress, even though it seems like a little deal,
15 is not the easiest thing in the world. And I
16 think the legislation does a lot for the Secretary
17 keeping the Advisory Committee together at his or
18 her discretion past the due date.

19 And also remember -- just kind of getting
20 a little bit off the point of what you asked --
21 that this is just for management on federal
22 lands. Obviously, we like for everything to tie
23 together, but, you know, I don't think in one fell
24 swoop we are asking everybody to determine the
25 entire management plan for the entire Coachella

1 Valley. This is how we are going to use BLM land
2 or Forest Service land particularly. Obviously,
3 we would like everything to weave together in a
4 perfect world.

5 And another point, plans can be amended
6 too. So it's not like what you guys decide to
7 suggest to Congress is going to be written in
8 stone forever. If the other plans are a little
9 late in arriving and this plan needs to be
10 amended, you can do that.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you.

12 MR. IDEKER: Terry?

13 MS. HENDERSON: A couple of issues.
14 One, I'd like to ask is there a reason why we got
15 started late? Because we are getting started
16 late.

17 MS. GEORGE: It's called the
18 election.

19 MS. HENDERSON: Okay. I am looking
20 for if we have an official reason why we are
21 starting late. If we have an official reason why
22 we were started late, then we have an official
23 reason why to ask for that -- at least that time
24 frame of an extension. The legislation, as it's
25 written, says, "The Advisory Committee shall cease

1 to exist on the date upon which the Management
2 Plan is officially adopted by the Secretaries or
3 later at the discretion of the Secretary," so it
4 would appear that we could deal with the
5 Secretaries on an extension.

6 As far as the reappointment process, what
7 it says on the Local Advisory Committee is a
8 member may be reappointed to serve on the Advisory
9 Committee upon the expiration of the member's
10 current term.

11 Now, under that, under "Vacancy," it
12 says, "Vacancy shall be filled in the same manner
13 as the original appointment," leaving me to
14 believe that the reappointment process can take
15 place without it being an open process. So I
16 would agree with everything I've heard down here
17 about starting that as soon as possible.

18 And let me see if I can find my third
19 item. I think I actually covered them all. Thank
20 you.

21 MR. IDEKER: Good.

22 MR. LYMAN: I think I am confused.

23 MR. IDEKER: And this is Bob Lyman.

24 MR. LYMAN: If this is all predicated
25 on the adoption or even the draft EIS of those

1 four plans, that we have something to work off and
2 everybody is saying that it's a self-education
3 process, that doesn't seem to be logical. I am
4 trying to figure out where I am going to pull
5 together four very distinct plans, get them, begin
6 to synthesize them and make sense and be able to
7 converse with the 15 people here. It sounds like
8 that's the issues we need to get our hands around
9 and to begin that process, to begin getting the
10 plans down the road.

11 MS. DUNNING: The Forest Service Plan
12 -- there's a Web page listed --

13 MR. IDEKER: Well, first of all,
14 before we go there, is what Bob has said really
15 kind of the homework assignment, if you will?

16 MR. LYMAN: But I think it's not just
17 intrinsic. It's not going out to a Web page.
18 There's got to be some understanding as you go
19 through this. Anybody can go out and read a Web
20 page, but you are going to have 15 opinions when
21 you come back from that.

22 I think we need to get secular instead of
23 ethereal and go from that point, it seems to be.

24 MR. IDEKER: When they go and they are
25 studying, what should they be looking for? What

1 is the precise homework assignment as they go to
2 the source?

3 MS. DUNNING: Well, in your discussion
4 to identify subcommittees, I am assuming that will
5 be based on identifying issues that you have
6 interest in. Just get back to what issues you are
7 interested in. What are they? Get them on paper,
8 agree on them. And then go looking for those
9 issues and see if they are addressed. I think
10 that's the first step.

11 Pipe in, anyone.

12 MS. GEORGE: Well, let me just ask.
13 If I heard what Bob asked -- does he have four
14 plans he can take home and read?

15 MR. LYMAN: Do I have something that's
16 not just out there?

17 MS. GEORGE: And, basically, we've got
18 a draft CDCA Plan; right? Is it draft yet?

19 MS. MISQUEZ: No.

20 MS. GEORGE: When will it be draft?

21 MS. MISQUEZ: Hopefully, by end of
22 February, March.

23 MS. GEORGE: Okay. So, no, we don't
24 have -- BLM doesn't have theirs.

25 Forest Service, your date on this sheet

1 is -- it says right here, "Forest Service
2 development of alternatives, January 15th, 2002."
3 Are you going to have your draft alternatives
4 written up that Bob could take home?

5 MS. DUNNING: There's a 162-page
6 document on this Web page that does outline things
7 that are being addressed. So that's a starting
8 point. And --

9 MS. ROSENTHAL: It's still in the baby
10 stages, but you can glean those issues out of it
11 for the Monument.

12 MS. GEORGE: So that's Forest
13 Service.

14 Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians is
15 not ready to release theirs to the public; right?

16 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: No. We are still
17 working with a few of the agencies.

18 MS. GEORGE: And you are looking about
19 April? About April for Agua Caliente.

20 And the fourth one is State Parks. And
21 that one is done; right?

22 MR. WATTS: That one is done. The
23 public comment period is over. It's scheduled to
24 be adopted by the State Park & Recreation
25 Commission in Palm Springs probably in April,

1 pending no litigation.

2 MS. GEORGE: Okay. So did that answer
3 the question?

4 MR. LYMAN: So two out of four, we can
5 touch.

6 MS. GEORGE: Two out of four you can
7 touch. We actually have -- but, see, the problem
8 is you can't get on the Internet for us right
9 now. But we had materials where the public
10 could -- did you have a planning Web site or
11 didn't you? Was that our office?

12 MS. DUNNING: The HCP has a
13 planning --

14 MS. MISQUEZ: We were working so
15 closely --

16 MS. GEORGE: It has our BLM stuff on
17 the HCP?

18 MS. MISQUEZ: I believe -- no, there's
19 not?

20 MR. IDEKER: Can we say, then, that
21 you will check that and get to the Committee
22 members what is accessible and how it's accessible
23 or that you will print out off the Website?

24 MS. GEORGE: Next meeting or before --
25 before we will get to Committee members available

1 -- right? -- available plan documents; is that
2 right?

3 MR. IDEKER: Right. Or address -- or
4 how to access.

5 MS. GEORGE: And that's why we did put
6 the prep plan in for us, was at least to have a
7 start point for you guys, for BLM, of some of the
8 stuff we know that was going to go into the
9 Monument Plan. We can also give them the prep
10 plan for the Coachella Valley Multi Species Plan;
11 right? Okay. So we can get that.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Question to the
13 Committee. Is everyone -- do you have the ability
14 to go on the Web and recover these materials and
15 print them out, which are quite lengthy? Is there
16 anyone here that does not have that ability?

17 Thank you.

18 MR. IDEKER: Good question.

19 Yes, sir, Allan?

20 MR. MUTH: You referenced four plans,
21 but there are, in fact, dozens of plans that
22 overlay the whole management area, Fish & Game,
23 Refuge Management Plans, Cooperative Strategy --
24 Management Strategies and all that.

25 None of that is available on the Web

1 because it's anywhere from 30 to 10 years old. It
2 wouldn't be put on the Web.

3 How do all those things fit into this?

4 MS. MISQUEZ: That would be, I think,
5 staff's job, through the planning process, is to
6 try to gather all the pertinent information that
7 will affect our decisions and to work those in,
8 take those into consideration.

9 MS. HENDERSON: Mr. Kibbey, will you
10 ask this young lady to come over here so we can
11 have some idea of what she's saying?

12 MR. IDEKER: You need to move over.
13 It's very hard even for me to hear.

14 MS. MISQUEZ: I am sorry. That would
15 be staff's responsibility to chase down any
16 information that would be pertinent to planning
17 and decisions that need to be made. It is our
18 responsibility to do that. And we certainly
19 appreciate any assistance. If you know something
20 that we need to be aware of and to take into
21 consideration, please let us know. But it's our
22 job to find those and to work them in.

23 MR. IDEKER: Bill?

24 MR. HAVERT: Okay. Just looking
25 briefly at your preplan document, it is maybe a

1 half-a-dozen issue areas in there that are
2 anticipated planning issues and management
3 concerns. You know, these many plans that we are
4 talking about, some are going to apply to one of
5 those issue areas, but not others and so on.

6 And maybe in conjunction with a, you
7 know, flowchart, if you will, at the next meeting
8 of how all these different things are supposed to
9 come together, you know, maybe some sort of
10 outline or matrix of the issues that are going to
11 be in the management plan and how some of these
12 other plans relate to individual issue areas
13 there, so we just get some sense of, you know,
14 what the planning context is.

15 You know, again, I think some of the
16 plans that Al was probably reminiscing about or
17 recollecting have to do with certain of those
18 issue areas and will not have a bearing on any
19 others. And just to get this all sorted out in
20 our mind, that will probably be helpful to see the
21 many arrows and circles and interrelationship
22 between these things.

23 But -- and maybe more to the point -- I
24 guess at least for me to get a handle on this
25 whole thing, in fact, within the time lines and

1 all of that, we really need to get a good
2 agreement on dot issue areas that this body is
3 charged with coming to grips with, and then we can
4 see maybe what -- some of these things maybe have
5 real high priority because they have to be
6 addressed in rather specific terms in the Monument
7 Plan and then, you know, whatever the time line
8 for that plan turns out to be, those things that
9 do have to go into the plan are things that we
10 really need to tend to.

11 There may be other issues that sort of
12 transcend what actually ends up in black and white
13 in the plan. And that may have more to do with
14 process or even plan implementation down the
15 road. And those may be things that we can
16 continue to hash over long after the draft plan is
17 out there for public review.

18 MR. IDEKER: Larry, you had a hand
19 up?

20 MR. GRAFTON: Yes. Larry Grafton.

21 I have got a little bit of concern and a
22 question. I am concerned that, from what I hear,
23 we are going to have 15 members going out looking
24 at several documents trying to figure out what's
25 going on.

1 I thought it was kind of the staff's
2 responsibility to go through these documents, do
3 an analysis, and come back to us. And if so, when
4 is that going to happen?

5 MS. DUNNING: We can do that at the
6 next meeting. What we need is the issues that you
7 have of interest for us to summarize, and we can
8 give you that summary of what the Forest Service
9 planning stage has at this point and what the
10 other plans have at that point. But we are
11 looking to you for those issues.

12 It's certainly not our intent or our
13 expectation that you go out there and -- each
14 individual -- do a lot of extra work that you
15 don't need to have done. But there are some of
16 you who have the time and would like to if you
17 have the time. I mean, this is what we are
18 actually going to be doing once we identify what
19 those issues are both from the public and from
20 you. What we need to do is go identify what the
21 current land use plans state for those, what the
22 current amendment and the revision processes are
23 doing to address those issues.

24 So we have to do that. That's our job.
25 And so if we can identify issues that you bring up

1 that we can come and summarize to you --

2 MR. GRAFTON: I would like to see what
3 each agency's issues are. I really don't know.
4 And I don't know if any -- you know, I know some
5 members here probably have specific trails issues
6 or whatever. But I'd like to know what each
7 agency's issues are and how they are dealing with
8 them.

9 MR. IDEKER: Maybe this could be
10 organized, the work organized in a way that once
11 you move in a short while to your subcommittees,
12 that be the first focus, the people who are
13 actually in this group going to work on particular
14 issues, then the larger picture once the work
15 actually begins. This is a process. And we are
16 as much designing that process and have waited to
17 design that so that it reflects what your needs
18 are rather than design it in the abstract. And
19 that's been a very tough thing to do.

20 I know how I approach wanting to inform
21 myself when I've got a task not even close to the
22 magnitude of yours, but similar. And we all have
23 a process. So part of what staff needs to hear
24 from you is exactly this stuff today, so that they
25 can prepare materials and circulate them.

1 Somewhat to that end, with Allan being
2 our leader, if before you leave today anybody --
3 anybody, the Committee members, or the audience --
4 you think there is a plan that you know of at some
5 point that we should try to find, please put it on
6 that list over there, give it to us by title, put
7 your name by it in case we need to contact you,
8 put it in parens so that we will know who made the
9 suggestion; if you know where a copy exists, how
10 it may be obtained. Let us know that so we can
11 begin.

12 I think one thing I am hearing that is
13 going to be useful is you need to begin to build
14 this library, this resource library. Whether it's
15 to copy material and send it out or where people
16 might come and look at some of this material.

17 Obviously, books of reports that are this
18 big are going to be pretty hard to get out to a
19 group this size. But we need to have access. You
20 need to have access, it sounds like, to more
21 information rather than less as we move forward.

22 MS. GEORGE: We have a library for BLM
23 folks that folks can come in and look at.

24 MR. IDEKER: Great.

25 Terry?

1 MS. HENDERSON: Mr. Kibbey, I would
2 like to suggest that not in total, but at least as
3 the beginning point, some of the issues that I am
4 concerned with -- and maybe we can take this to a
5 vote of the Committee -- are the issues that are
6 in the legislation under "Recreational Activity"
7 and they include recreational uses such as hiking,
8 camping, mountain biking, sightseeing, horseback
9 riding, and trail system. And there are motorized
10 vehicle issues, hunting, trapping, and fishing.
11 These are things that are in the legislation that
12 this Body is supposed to have concern about.
13 These are the issues that I am here for and what
14 I'm concerned with.

15 And if we want to make a list of them or
16 vote on them, I suggest we get started.

17 MR. IDEKER: Yes, sir? Then, I think
18 Gary, to you, and then back to Barbara.

19 MR. BROCKMAN: Bob Brockman.

20 As I understand it, this committee is
21 only supposed to meet two or three times a year.
22 And in listening to all of the concerns and
23 questions and requests for clarifications that I
24 am hearing, either we are going to have to do a
25 lot of decision-making or preliminary

1 decision-making at the subcommittee level or we
2 are going to have to be very careful about how we
3 take this flowchart, even with revised dates, and
4 how that interfaces with our meetings.

5 Because if you are looking for this
6 Committee to be giving interim feedback or
7 decisions along the way, this whole flowchart is
8 going to be affected by how often this Committee
9 meets. And so maybe at some point, there can be
10 key decision points marked on this chart so that
11 we all know where our decisions fit into this
12 process.

13 MR. IDEKER: For now, for the next
14 maybe 30 minutes at least, till we get there, it
15 seemed to me during lunch the sense of the Chair
16 and the Vice Chair and some of the staff that you
17 are going to be meeting more than twice in the
18 coming year.

19 MR. BROCKMAN: I am not surprised.

20 MR. IDEKER: I didn't think that, but
21 I wanted to let you know. I think your suggestion
22 is that once that meeting schedule is determined,
23 which will be today at some point, that that then
24 be superimposed over this entire planning process
25 to make sure that we are covered or that you are

1 covered in terms of decision points and keeping
2 things moving forward rather than having something
3 stalled and waiting 60 or 90 days for the next
4 meeting. That's very valuable as part of the
5 overall design of this process.

6 I hope you remembered who I said was
7 going to talk next, because I don't.

8 MR. WATTS: Me. Building on what Bill
9 said --

10 MR. IDEKER: Good, Gary.

11 MR. WATTS: I just glanced at the
12 preplan, also, and I like the way that you sort of
13 jumped out and sort of identified potential
14 planning areas and broad generic plans that need
15 to be addressed.

16 And certainly addressing Terry's
17 comments, they all fit under the recreation
18 classification that you put in there. If nothing
19 else, I can see that as a great starting-off point
20 for today to maybe talk about subcommittees in
21 those areas where we are interested in or where we
22 see additional needs to come back.

23 Now, you have got nine areas, I think,
24 identified in here already. So with 15 of us,
25 that spreads us pretty thin. Although I am

1 guessing the subcommittees are going to be
2 comprised -- a lot of staff, such as the group
3 that we met with the other day, Danella.

4 And I would hope -- in my perfect world,
5 I could see us maybe focusing on some of these as
6 potential subcommittee areas and then having a
7 presentation on each of these at our very next
8 meeting with all of that gleaning of information
9 that you get from the other documents pertaining
10 to those specific areas as opposed to a big, giant
11 plan that we get lost in.

12 So that would at least be a starting-off
13 point to go further. And if there's other areas
14 beyond these broad areas that are of interest to
15 the Committee, then we could certainly establish
16 subcommittees or something of that nature.

17 MR. IDEKER: You can take a real deep
18 breath right there. That sounded big for staff to
19 me.

20 I know Barbara is at the end, but was
21 there someone in between here that had another
22 comment? Then we will go right to you, Barbara.

23 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Yes. I think
24 that we have -- I want to make sure we look at,
25 besides the recreational issues --

1 MR. IDEKER: Terry was going so
2 fast --

3 MS. HENDERSON: They are all right
4 here.

5 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: There's more in
6 here in the beginning of the purpose of this act,
7 statute and purpose of the act, and that would be
8 -- and, also, the private land issues. And also
9 the reservation, its cultural significance. And
10 then, of course, the land exchange issues as part
11 of this act. And looking to the existing rights
12 already there.

13 MS. GEORGE: Can I just do an agenda
14 check?

15 MR. IDEKER: Sure.

16 MS. GEORGE: Part of the FACA and
17 focus -- and folks I had talked with in working
18 with teams and groups -- is some operating
19 guidelines and adopting Roberts Rules. Do we want
20 to do that before we go to subcommittee or do we
21 want to stay on the subcommittee?

22 MR. IDEKER: Well, we have been kind
23 of keying off the --

24 MS. GEORGE: Oh, the planning for why
25 to do subcommittees. I am with you. I am with

1 you. I am with you.

2 MR. IDEKER: If you think we are ready
3 to move back there, then we are ready to move back
4 there.

5 MS. GEORGE: No. I was just curious
6 with voting and things like that on motions.

7 MR. IDEKER: Well, there's no vote.
8 There could be no voting until you do that, but --
9 Barbara?

10 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Yes. You forgot
11 cultural. Because they are not always on the
12 reservation.

13 MR. IDEKER: All right. Okay.
14 Sorry. Didn't mean to.

15 Yes, Terry?

16 MS. HENDERSON: Now, aren't those the
17 items that we would begin to look at, how they
18 interplay with the other four or five plans that
19 are out there, get a report back from staff and
20 see where we need to go from there so that we can
21 kind of put these other plans to rest, either they
22 do for us what we need done or they don't?

23 MR. IDEKER: Either they are in the
24 square or they are one of those holes and you fill
25 it with your own work.

1 Laurie, you had your hand up?

2 MS. ROSENTHAL: I just also have an
3 agenda check here. Are we now focusing on
4 subcommittees --

5 MR. IDEKER: I think you came in --
6 Connell was already -- we jumped -- we changed the
7 agenda right after lunch. We started off with
8 Connell's presentation. It was expanded a bit
9 based on some questions the Chair had asked.

10 And we are now taking, I think, about all
11 of the questions we are going to take. Then we
12 are going to go into where they are actually going
13 to get down to Roberts Rules of Order. We are
14 going to talk about meeting dates and they are
15 going to identify subcommittees and, more than
16 likely, come up with a list of people who will
17 serve on those subcommittees.

18 MS. ROSENTHAL: So my question is, Are
19 we right now looking at subcommittees and going to
20 get consensus right now on this?

21 MR. IDEKER: No. We are going to do
22 that in moments from now.

23 MS. ROSENTHAL: Because I've got some
24 suggestions for all this -- --

25 MR. IDEKER: I am just capturing some
203

1 stuff that's coming in the conversation now --

2 MS. ROSENTHAL: Got it. Okay.

3 MR. IDEKER: -- that I know we are
4 going to need in five or ten minutes.

5 Allan. Then Jeffery. Then a couple more
6 questions. And then, Ed, I would recommend that
7 we move. Because I think we are going to come
8 back --

9 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I am going to cut
10 you off in another 12 minutes.

11 MR. MUTH: It strikes me as being a
12 bit premature to try to set up subcommittees.

13 MR. IDEKER: If it's a subcommittee
14 discussion, let's wait till we get to
15 subcommittee.

16 MR. MUTH: Well, we are still deciding
17 about issues. We don't really know what the
18 issues are in common between and among the other
19 plans that are out there, what are parochial
20 issues within other plans.

21 It strikes me that we need to have that
22 information in front of us before we can decide
23 what are the issues that we think needs additional
24 work, that needs subcommittee appointments, and
25 such.

1 So I think we are getting ahead of
2 ourselves here. And that's information that I
3 would like to see before we go much further down
4 this planning route.

5 MR. IDEKER: I think that has to be --
6 I agree that you are going to have to wrestle that
7 when we actually get to the subcommittee item,
8 whether it's premature, or what needs to be put in
9 place between now and the next time.

10 MR. MUTH: Okay.

11 MR. IDEKER: Was it Jeffery?

12 MR. MORGAN: On the issues, we also
13 need to be adding wildlife and natural history
14 resources.

15 MR. IDEKER: Now, understand, I am
16 just kind of keeping track of this. This is not
17 set in purple. Natural history was the --

18 MR. MORGAN: Yes.

19 MR. IDEKER: Yes. Okay. Barbara?

20 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Yes. That's kind
21 of like what's in the legislation, but it's not
22 the actual titles. I would rather us keep the
23 titles --

24 MR. IDEKER: When we get to
25 subcommittees and you actually decide what ones

1 you are going to set up --

2 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: But information
3 we need or gather, I think we need to keep it
4 what's actually in legislation.

5 MR. IDEKER: You want me to change it
6 now or --

7 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: I would rather it
8 be changed now.

9 MR. IDEKER: Okay. I am at your --

10 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: It's
11 biological --

12 MR. IDEKER: Biological what?

13 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: It just says
14 biological issues. Biological, educational, and
15 scientific values. And geological. I forgot
16 geological.

17 MR. IDEKER: Okay. Educational,
18 biological -- give me another one.

19 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Geological. And
20 scientific value.

21 MR. IDEKER: If I use this marker that
22 much more, that chemical is going to make the rest
23 of the afternoon really fun for me. Don't know
24 what that is, but we will be selling it.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Paul, I am going to
206

1 jump in here just a second. Have we finished
2 basically our discussion of the previous
3 presentation? If so, then we will move on.
4 Because I think we all have a pretty good feel of
5 where we are headed. We need to get down to the
6 administrative process, the rules under which we
7 are going to conduct ourselves, and so on.

8 And so if we have nothing else -- Paul,
9 do you have any closing comments on this section?

10 MR. IDEKER: No. I think -- Ruth has
11 a hand up now.

12 MS. GEORGE: Well, I just want to make
13 sure I am on the right page. And the page was we
14 have a summary for you guys of where we are with
15 our plan, our planning process for the Monument --
16 not the -- well, the Monument Plan, the prep plan,
17 and where we are with getting that Monument Plan
18 for you all.

19 We then talked about common issues.
20 These are the common issues with the plans. Some
21 of them.

22 And then we agreed to bring to the
23 committee some time lines by the time of the next
24 meeting that's more realistic. Is that right? At
25 least to summarize.

1 And the other one was what? There was
2 another thing we were going to do. I forgot.

3 Oh, the nomination process. And I needed
4 to get clarification. Some people are on the
5 one-year appointment, some people are on a
6 two-year appointment. I think that probably we
7 just do the one-year appointments to start the
8 process.

9 Okay. I just want to make sure. If I
10 don't ask now --

11 MR. MUTH: Was Connell finished?

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I believe she is.

13 MS. DUNNING: Are there any more
14 planning questions that -- yes?

15 MS. WATLING: I would just like to add
16 in on the topics access both to private land
17 within the Monument and public land. Even though
18 it can fit in under some of the other issues, I
19 think it should be its own --

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And I think this
21 list is very positive, not for -- because it's
22 giving to staff now an indication of those areas
23 that we feel are areas of concern.

24 That's what you asked for.

25 MS. DUNNING: That's what we needed.

1 I could have come here today and given you a
2 summary of where we are with our planning. You
3 know, that could have been all day long. And we
4 could have had Forest Service here also giving a
5 summary. And the other Forest people, also. But
6 from you, what we want are the issues that you
7 want done on the land.

8 And it's our job to make sure that
9 through whatever planning process -- the Monument
10 Plan, because that's what you are providing us
11 information on, but -- it's our job to make sure
12 that the actions that you want and are
13 representing as the public's interest can happen
14 on the land.

15 So keep thinking about it that way. What
16 do you want the Monument to look like in five
17 years? What would you like to have happen and be
18 in the Monument?

19 So think about it that way. And then you
20 can use us as, you know, the gophers to get you
21 the present information as it is now in the plans
22 that are out there.

23 Is that kind of what we have concluded?
24 Okay. I am done now.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Is everyone aware of
209

1 the length of your appointment? If not, in the
2 second section of what they gave us today, the
3 book, on the second page is a listing of each
4 member and their appointment time. I would ask
5 Jim, when it comes to the appointments, is this
6 basically a local decision that goes to Interior
7 stamped? Or do they actually make any decisions?

8 MR. KENNA: The answer to that is it's
9 the decision of the Secretary of Interior and the
10 Secretary of Agriculture, but that is the -- it --
11 we, in the case of the Monument, need the local
12 decision-making processes. Some of the cities,
13 Tribal Council action made recommendations. Those
14 carried a lot of weight in the process.

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: My question, then,
16 to be more definitive, if you sat back and listed
17 names, are they apt to say no?

18 MR. KENNA: All of the names that were
19 forwarded back -- we usually send back one or two
20 names, depending on what the Secretary has asked
21 for. And generally they will work off of that
22 list and, if they have an issue with a
23 recommendation, they will ask about it.

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you.

25 Then we will turn to administrative.

1 Danella, what do we need? Other than usual voting
2 and that sort of thing, is there anything
3 special?

4 MS. GEORGE: Well, Paul was going to
5 facilitate this portion with the Group; right?

6 MR. IDEKER: But Ed wanted to take
7 much of it. I think you need to decide on whether
8 you will use Roberts Rules of Order.

9 MR. MUTH: So moved.

10 MR. CRITES: Second.

11 MS. GEORGE: And the --

12 MR. CRITES: We actually have to vote
13 on it now.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes. I am waiting
15 here. She jumps in.

16 MR. MUTH: That was the discussion
17 part.

18 MS. GEORGE: Sorry. Sorry.

19 MR. HAVERT: Mr. Chairman, would you
20 keep the order, please.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So the motion has
22 been made and properly seconded to adopt Roberts
23 Rules of Order as the order in which we will
24 conduct our meetings. Is there any discussion?

25 Hearing none, is there anybody against

1 it?

2 So adopted.

3 The suggestion has been made that we
4 would conduct our meetings, the public portion of
5 it, in that a person would be allowed a maximum of
6 five minutes to make a presentation. Is there any
7 discussion on that?

8 MR. CRITES: Just a suggestion at our
9 next meeting that we also have a public comments
10 period at the beginning of the meeting.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. We will get
12 to that in a minute. The question on the floor at
13 the moment is the length of session.

14 MR. MUTH: Rather than adopt a set
15 time limit --

16 MS. HENDERSON: Can't hear you.

17 MR. IDEKER: Throw it back to Terry.
18 She's the one that's got to hear through those
19 35-year-old ears.

20 MR. MUTH: Well, these 36-year-old
21 vocal cords got to get it back to you. Rather
22 than adopt a set five-minute time limit, I think
23 we should allow some discretion of the Chair,
24 given what the issues are and how many people are
25 there to speak; give the Chair some discretion to
212

1 say five minutes if there's 150 people that want
2 to speak, ten minutes if there are fewer.

3 That's what I would recommend rather than
4 a set five minutes.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. Further
6 discussion?

7 Bary, did you have your hand up?

8 MR. FREET: I would be opposed to that
9 statement, and I would go back to the five
10 minutes.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. Anyone else?
12 Discussion on this point?

13 MS. HENDERSON: Just to add to that,
14 it's always possible for the Chair, with the
15 concurrence of the rest of the Body here, to
16 extend the amount of comment period time for
17 someone for some reason. But I think setting a
18 definitive number at the beginning is better, and
19 five is certainly long enough.

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: The Chair would
21 prefer an exact limit, because it's easier for
22 me. Someone can say, "Well, you are playing
23 favorites," or whatever the case may be. And,
24 again, if we had someone who is making a
25 presentation that the Committee feels needs more

1 time, a motion to that extent would extend that
2 time. So rules are always open to amendment
3 within the meaning.

4 Any other discussion on this? Do I hear
5 a motion?

6 MR. HAVERT: So moved.

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So moved for five
8 minutes. Do I have a second?

9 MS. HENDERSON: Second.

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: We have a motion and
11 a second. Any further discussion?

12 Anyone against it?

13 Now, it's been suggested by a member that
14 we have two public comment sessions, one at the
15 beginning and one at the end. Open for
16 discussion?

17 MR. CRITES: Well, the issue is simply
18 that if someone comes to make a public comment,
19 it's a long darn time to sit here from 8:30 in the
20 morning. Scintillating as it is, they may have
21 schedule problems or something, or common sense or
22 whatever comes over them.

23 So I would suggest at least a half hour
24 in the morning and a half hour in the afternoon or
25 some such time.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. For purposes
2 of discussion, two sessions, half hour each, one
3 at the beginning, one at the end.

4 Any further discussion on that? Yes,
5 Barbara?

6 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Just a question.
7 Will a person be able to talk at both morning and
8 afternoon? The same person? Talk about the same
9 issue again? I am just asking. Or are you going
10 to allow new people to talk?

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's open for
12 discussion. What do you think? Come on, guys.

13 MR. HAVERT: In the afternoon session,
14 give preference to those who did not speak in the
15 morning to ensure that they have an opportunity to
16 be heard. And if time permits, then people who
17 have stuck it out all day and it's that important
18 to them, let them speak again.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So half hour in the
20 morning, half hour in the afternoon. And if a
21 person wants to speak a second time in the
22 afternoon, they may speak within that half hour
23 after all other persons who have not spoken speak;
24 is that correct?

25 MR. BOGERT: Each person will make a
215

1 slip that they are going to make a speech so that
2 we don't have a volunteer coming up?

3 MR. HAVERT: Sign-up sheets in
4 advance.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Is that a
6 suggestion?

7 MR. BOGERT: That's a suggestion.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: We are putting it
9 together here. I am not making the rules. We are
10 putting it together.

11 MR. BROCKMAN: I think that's a good
12 suggestion.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So then a person
14 would submit a request to speak slip, which would
15 be available.

16 MS. GEORGE: Yes.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And those would
18 be --

19 MR. BOGERT: Then you can start out
20 with each slip and call them up. If you have them
21 just popping up out of the audience, it will take
22 you another hour.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. Any further
24 suggestions? Further discussion?

25 MR. WATTS: Are we talking about

1 public comments? Then I would suggest that we
2 also have a method to accept written comments as
3 well as oral testimony, since some people are
4 afraid to speak out loud.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Terry?

6 MS. HENDERSON: Yes. I have a
7 concern. I have not had time to digest everything
8 that we have received together, but what little I
9 have read has caused us to be very well aware of
10 the fact that the purpose of this is to receive as
11 much public input as possible. I certainly agree
12 with limiting in the morning to a half hour so we
13 can get on with our business, but I think I have a
14 problem with limiting to a half hour in the
15 afternoon if we should happen to have a room full
16 of people that stayed all day to speak.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Do you have an
18 alternative suggestion?

19 MS. HENDERSON: Until I can see a
20 reason why not, I would say that it remains open
21 until the last person has had an opportunity to
22 speak or until there's no longer a quorum in the
23 room.

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Now, we do have a
25 problem in that the portion which is specified in

1 the announcement -- in the -- I want to say public
2 record, but the --

3 MS. GEORGE: Federal Register.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: -- Federal Register
5 must be kept open for that period of time. So we
6 can't just say -- and correct me if I'm wrong --
7 until everyone has spoken. We must have a fixed
8 time and then we must stay here for that fixed
9 time, whether there's anyone to speak or not.

10 MS. HENDERSON: I was unaware that we
11 had a start and ending time.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: We do. And so I
13 would suggest for that reason that we would do a
14 specific length of time.

15 Robert?

16 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Couldn't we just
17 keep it at half hour and half hour, and if there
18 are a lot of people who want to speak -- since you
19 will have that list, can we automatically extend
20 the meeting to be longer because of the public
21 comments or because it's --

22 MS. GEORGE: Our expert here is
23 nodding yes. I trust Buford's opinion.

24 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: So I would say
25 keep it at the half hour/half hour. You have the

1 list of how many speakers. And then allow them to
2 speak. And if it goes an hour, then it goes an
3 hour.

4 MS. GEORGE: The only cautionary thing
5 on -- and help me with it, Buford -- is what Terry
6 is talking about. Terry is talking about the need
7 for these meetings to be a place where the public
8 comes and provides you input and provides you
9 information. There is a very high focus for
10 Advisory Committees to do that. That's why they
11 are there.

12 If a half hour at the end just isn't
13 enough and if they don't know if the general -- if
14 the general John Q. Public doesn't know that they
15 can put it in writing or that it could end in a
16 half hour, it could end in a half hour, they may
17 show up here not knowing. That's the only thing I
18 am struggling with. How do you deal with that,
19 Buford?

20 MR. CRITES: You are allowed to extend
21 by rule of the organization the amount of time
22 left in a meeting for such comments.

23 MS. GEORGE: Okay. So that's how
24 you'd handle it?

25 MR. CRITES: In the afternoon, you

1 have 35 people, so you just add the time.

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Buford is saying
3 that it could be extended by the Committee at any
4 such time. So my suggestion, then, would be a
5 motion to the extent that we would allow public
6 comment for a half hour in the morning or at the
7 beginning and a half hour at the ending with a
8 five-minute limitation, which has already been
9 adopted, and that comments could be submitted in
10 writing.

11 MR. IDEKER: Mr. Chairman, we need to
12 take a paper break.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Did I get a vote?
14 If there's no discussion. Is there any discussion
15 on that? Or could I have a motion?

16 MR. WATTS: So moved.

17 VICE CHAIRMAN PARKINS: Second.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. Moved by
19 Buford. Second by Rob Parkins. Any discussion?

20 Any against?

21 So adopted. Take a break.

22 (Brief recess was taken.)

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. We are back
24 on the record.

25 One of the things we need to do is

1 schedule our future meetings. We had talked at
2 lunch as to what we could do and what we couldn't
3 do, and we have to always announce our meetings
4 and schedule them and it's a real pain. So what
5 we thought we might do is not have another meeting
6 until the first week in April, which would be the
7 6th of April. It's a Saturday. We are not
8 required to meet on Saturday, but almost required
9 so that we are open to the public as much as
10 possible. And thereafter meet every two months on
11 a Saturday.

12 Buford has very nicely offered the City
13 Council Chambers at Palm Desert City Hall at no
14 cost, which will help us with our cost problems.
15 And it's a centralized location. I understand
16 Terry has also offered her City Council Chambers.

17 The one thing we have to do when we make
18 this schedule is make the entire schedule. So we
19 would have to -- if we are going to change places,
20 we would have to decide which time we are going to
21 change places, which might become somewhat
22 cumbersome.

23 My own preference -- thank you very much,
24 Terry, for your offer -- would be just one place
25 and then we are done with it. It would also, I

1 think, be better in the public's mind to know that
2 they are always going to meet at "X" position.

3 So having said all that, we are open for
4 discussion. Comments, anyone? Input?

5 MR. MUTH: Would that be like the
6 first Saturday of every other month?

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes. We would begin
8 on the 6th of April and then go on the first
9 Saturday of every other month after that.

10 Terry?

11 MS. HENDERSON: Ed, are they all going
12 to be 8:30 to 4:00?

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's up to us.

14 MS. HENDERSON: 9:00 sounds a heck of
15 a lot better.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's fine. 9:00
17 to 4:00.

18 Any other comments?

19 MR. CRITES: Once we choose a
20 schedule, I will step out and call and make sure
21 those dates are all free.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. That will be
23 fine.

24 Any other comments? Yes?

25 MS. WATLING: Do you want to skip

1 August?

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, if we skipped
3 August, that would be, then, three months dark.
4 Do we want to do that?

5 MS. WATLING: Unless we picked up
6 another one in September.

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: My own preference
8 would be regular schedule, no dark, no nothing.
9 As most of you know, I run an association. I run
10 a lot of meetings. And I found through much trial
11 and error that if you get it in somebody's mind
12 that they are going to be somewhere on a certain
13 time on a regular basis, they are there. So I
14 would suggest we not have any dark.

15 Oh. One point that was brought up to me
16 that I did not know. If any member of this group
17 cannot make a meeting, they may send a
18 representative who is there for all purposes
19 except voting. They can't vote. But they can be
20 there for discussion, to pick up materials, to do
21 all those things. So it's not live or die by the
22 schedule, although we'd like everyone to be
23 there.

24 Yes, Allan?

25 MR. MUTH: So how does that affect the
223

1 two meetings in a row? If you send a
2 representative two meetings in a row, you are not
3 present.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I would suggest that
5 you have not been there and so you are not
6 present, and that would affect the two meetings in
7 a row, in the way I read the legislation.

8 MR. MUTH: Okay.

9 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any other comments?

10 MS. GEORGE: As Designated Federal
11 Official, the month of August, the first Saturday,
12 I will not be present. But I can have Connell or
13 somebody sit in. Or Jim. Someone.

14 MS. DUNNING: In the FACA Guidelines,
15 it does say a Federal Official must be there.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I thought it said
17 Designated Official or her representative.

18 MS. GEORGE: Or designee.

19 MS. DUNNING: Oh, okay.

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I believe that's
21 what the law says.

22 MS. GEORGE: All the rest of the
23 Saturdays, I am here except August.

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: All right. Given
25 that, do we have a motion? Barbara?

1 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Yes. Clarify.

2 The schedule now, it will be the first Saturday of
3 every month? Every other month?

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes. The suggestion
5 was that we would meet the first Saturday in April
6 and every two months thereafter.

7 MS. GEORGE: It would be August the --
8 want me to go through the dates? August 6th, June
9 1st.

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: August 6? You mean
11 April 6th?

12 MS. GEORGE: I apologize. April 6th,
13 June 1st, August 3rd, October 5th. Then we go the
14 first Saturday, December 7th, January --

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: No. February.

16 MS. GEORGE: Oh, okay. February 1st.
17 February 1st. Is that right?

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And then April --

19 MR. IDEKER: March?

20 MS. GEORGE: Except we are only
21 sitting a year.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's right. We
23 only sit one year.

24 MS. GEORGE: So one more time. Just
25 check me on this; okay, Ed? April 6th, June 1st,

1 August 3rd, October the 5th. Then we went to
2 December the 7th. And then we jumped down to
3 February 1. Is that right?

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes. That's
5 correct.

6 MS. GEORGE: Okay.

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So that would be, if
8 it's acceptable, the motion?

9 MS. GEORGE: And in August, the DFO
10 will have to have a designee. Is that okay?

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes. That would be
12 fine. That wouldn't be part of the motion.

13 MR. IDEKER: Mr. Chairman, would you
14 like to include the times of the meeting?

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's what I was
16 just about to do before I was interrupted. And
17 then the times would be from -- suggestion -- the
18 suggested motion, from 9 a.m. to 4 p.m. The place
19 would be the Palm Desert City Council Chambers.

20 If that is acceptable, I would accept a
21 motion to that effect.

22 VICE CHAIRMAN PARKINS: So moved.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I have a motion --

24 MR. MUTH: Second.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: -- by Rob and a

1 second by Allan.

2 Any other discussion?

3 Anyone against it? So moved.

4 Okay. So any other organizational stuff
5 that we have to do?

6 MR. IDEKER: I think you are good.
7 Moving into subcommittees; is that where you plan
8 to go?

9 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's where I'm
10 going to go next. And then more organizational as
11 far as operations.

12 On subcommittees, we have had a lot of
13 discussion here. During the break, Jim and I had
14 a discussion and he said after listening to all of
15 what we had to say and everything like that,
16 probably the first thing that needs to happen is
17 for staff to take a look at the various plans and
18 so on and come up with a matrix.

19 Is that correct, Jim? Anything you want
20 to add to that?

21 No? Okay. Putting him on the spot,
22 which is only right. That's why he's paid the big
23 bucks.

24 So that would help us in regard to
25 information to work on. But we need to, I think,

1 decide what basic committees we might form to
2 process this information. One of the things that
3 I had thought about -- and I checked with my legal
4 expert -- was that one way we might be able to
5 move things along is to make one of our
6 subcommittees a -- called Planning Subcommittee or
7 whatever the case may be, and that subcommittee
8 would then receive input at their meetings, which
9 could happen in the next few weeks, from the
10 various Forestry, BLM, whatever the case may be,
11 as to their plan.

12 Anybody can attend a subcommittee. Just
13 can't be called a Committee meeting. It will be
14 called a subcommittee meeting.

15 So if we were to operate under that
16 process, then as many as were interested could
17 come to that subcommittee meeting and listen to
18 this input. And this would move us along. My
19 concern is the first week in April is a long ways
20 away for planning purposes. And I don't want to
21 just kind of sit around and do nothing. And at
22 the same time, I don't want to be going out and
23 holding a meeting on something we really don't
24 know what we are talking about. It's up to you.

25 So that's my thinking. Open for

1 discussion.

2 Terry? I am sorry. I just gave Terry
3 the high sign and I shouldn't have done that.

4 MS. HENDERSON: And I apologize. I am
5 wondering if I understand you correctly. You are
6 suggesting that between now and our next official
7 meeting in April, we only have one subcommittee
8 appointed that would be called, for lack of a
9 better term, Planning Committee, that would be
10 able to call at least one, maybe two meetings
11 where these other agencies that we have been
12 talking about would be making presentations on the
13 status of their plan, so that when we come back
14 the next time as the full Body we don't sit here
15 and say, "Well, we don't know what they are, what
16 they are doing, how they got there, and whether or
17 not we have any concerns with their plans"?

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Exactly.

19 Frank? Do you have a comment?

20 MR. BOGERT: I just have a comment.
21 How many will you have on the committee?

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's probably
23 seven -- three, four.

24 MR. BOGERT: Seven?

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: It doesn't make any
229

1 difference.

2 Bill?

3 MR. HAVERT: Well, I agree with your
4 observation that it's a long time to wait and do
5 nothing, especially with the kind of schedule that
6 we are at least perhaps going to attempt to adhere
7 to to meet the statutory deadline.

8 And I would say maybe we want to reserve
9 judgment, have some discussion now about potential
10 subcommittees, you know, based on issue areas, and
11 then consider whether there is something
12 productive that a subcommittee on each of those
13 areas could do between now and April, recognizing
14 that, you know, we could redefine subcommittees at
15 a subsequent meeting if, based on what we find
16 out, it warrants that.

17 So I would be inclined to suggest that we
18 go ahead, list potential subcommittees, see if we
19 can boil those down to a manageable number, and
20 see if we can assign them a useful task between
21 now and April. And if so, we form the
22 subcommittee and let them do the business and
23 reevaluate next time around.

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Very good. Any
25 comments?

1 I am sorry. Jeffery?

2 MR. MORGAN: No. That's okay. So you
3 are suggesting at this stage we have four months
4 of Committee devoted to receiving plans and defer
5 decisions on the other subcommittees till a later
6 date?

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: It was generally
8 thought by myself that that would be the most
9 productive. However, Bill says there probably are
10 certain areas that we do have definite
11 knowledgable persons on this Committee that could
12 go ahead and be working on that.

13 My concern with doing those other
14 subcommittees, Bill, was that they might be doing
15 something that's already there and so, therefore,
16 they were wasting their time. My biggest concern
17 here is that we are really operating blind, not
18 knowing what these various agencies have set
19 forth.

20 Bill?

21 MR. HAVERT: My response would be that
22 if we establish a subcommittee today, they could
23 take it upon themselves to consult with staff at
24 the earliest opportunity, find out whether, in
25 fact, there is something already out there that

1 they should be looking at. I don't think they
2 need to wait until April either to avail
3 themselves of that information.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's fine.

5 Buford?

6 MR. CRITES: Just a comment that if
7 all the subcommittees were established today, it
8 will take them a month to figure out how whatever
9 it is they are concerned with came to be where it
10 is right now. How did we end up with a trail
11 system that looks like this and access issues that
12 look like this? How did we decide to do or not do
13 land exchanges? How did we decide to do or not do
14 cooperative things with the tribes in terms of the
15 cultural things? What are the cultural issues?

16 I mean, there's a spell of time to just
17 sort of figure out where you stand in the
18 landscape of these issues before you start
19 planning. I think there's enough to do for
20 whatever that group of committees will be.

21 And by the way, all those dates are fine
22 for hosting those at the City.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you.

24 MR. IDEKER: Mr. Chairman --

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other comments?

1 MR. IDEKER: You have a staff comment
2 there in the audience from Laurie.

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes?

4 MS. ROSENTHAL: Way over here. I am a
5 newcomer on this, and I am going to ask Linda a
6 question.

7 Was the intent, in your opinion, of this
8 legislation not necessarily to be restrictive to
9 those things that were listed, geology or
10 whatever, but to look at what the needs of the
11 agency was, what the needs of the communities are,
12 and then go from there? Kind of a blank slate,
13 really looking at all the issues so we can manage
14 this in the best way possible? And if that's the
15 case, that maybe we need to just look at, you
16 know, what the issues are here. You know, kind of
17 be pure and naive on this.

18 MS. VALTER: Can you maybe expand on
19 your question a bit?

20 MS. ROSENTHAL: Okay. I know the
21 legislation is important, but there may be issues
22 that are not necessarily spelled out in the
23 legislation. But I am asking what the intent of
24 the legislation -- was it really to form a
25 Committee like this and get the community involved

1 in whatever issues are out there and set our own
2 priorities with the agencies, the land management
3 agencies, et cetera, and then go from there to try
4 to manage this plan that will be a stepping stone
5 to managing this in a way that will help alleviate
6 the conflicts and get us to the next level?

7 MS. VALTER: Let me see -- I will try
8 to answer. If I'm not, just come right back at
9 me.

10 MS. ROSENTHAL: The reason I am asking
11 is this has to do with the subcommittees.

12 MS. VALTER: Sure. The general intent
13 of Monument legislation is to figure out how best
14 to conserve the land. And realizing that there's
15 recreational opportunities available, how to
16 balance those two on federal lands.

17 We decided to mention specifically
18 hiking, horseback riding, because a lot of the
19 participants, in creating this legislation, wanted
20 to make sure that those rights were protected.

21 So the intent that we had in creating the
22 Local Advisory Committee and why we invited
23 everybody to join in was perhaps there's BLM land
24 that has cultural significance to the Tribe and
25 the Tribe really would prefer not to have hiking

1 or horseback trail riding through it.

2 That's why we decided we wanted to
3 collect everybody together to sort of balance
4 those two or, conversely, if we were going to
5 allow hiking at the toe of the slope, horseback
6 riding at the toe of the slope, but it doesn't
7 necessarily match up with the plan that the City
8 of Rancho Mirage has in effect -- in other words,
9 they have a no recreational area one mile to the
10 south and a recreational mile back to -- back down
11 north, if those two don't match up, you know,
12 recreation to recreational site, then that's kind
13 of like, "Well, what was the purpose of it?"

14 So I don't know if I am getting to your
15 question exactly.

16 MS. ROSENTHAL: I am just afraid that
17 we are going to have these plans kind of move
18 things to a point. There may be some issues out
19 there that we are not going to end up bringing
20 up. There might be other issues that maybe are a
21 lower priority, but because it's in the
22 legislation -- like geology, I don't know if that
23 is one of the high priorities, but it's in the
24 legislation, for example.

25 And I am just wondering if the intent of
235

1 the legislation was so we don't get bogged down
2 with all these other plans --

3 MS. VALTER: You are right.

4 MS. ROSENTHAL: And you are not even
5 to be writing the plan. You are more here as the
6 people who are going to elicit the public
7 involvement and get the issues on the table and --
8 so it's not the writing part of it. Is that
9 correct?

10 MS. VALTER: That's actually correct.

11 Yes.

12 MS. ROSENTHAL: Okay. So my
13 suggestion would be that with all the knowledge
14 that you have today, that -- and a few of you have
15 already suggested -- like, I think, Bill did, and
16 Buford -- was that maybe we could start with these
17 subcommittees going forth with the knowledge that
18 maybe we'd be changing them in two months or
19 whenever, but I think you pretty much know what
20 the issues are out there amongst the 15 of you and
21 the agencies.

22 So my suggestion would be to just move
23 ahead. And I agree with you that a Planning
24 Subcommittee would be a good thing to help keep
25 everybody together there.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you. One
2 point I have to make, it is now a couple minutes
3 after 3 o'clock. According to the advertised
4 agenda, the public hearing session is now open.

5 However, we will delay beginning it until
6 we are finished with this discussion.

7 Thomas? Larry? Do you have a comment?

8 MR. GRAFTON: Yes. After our previous
9 discussions, I still have a problem with us all
10 forming committees and going off on our merry
11 ways. Until I see what all these various agencies
12 have put together, I think we are flying blind and
13 we are just going to end up reinventing the
14 wheel.

15 I do like the idea of coming -- or
16 forming a Planning Subcommittee to get with the
17 staff to, you know, start reviewing some of this
18 information, refining it, and then bringing it to
19 this Body back at our next meeting so that we can
20 really get a handle on where we are going to go.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other discussion?

22 Yes? Bob?

23 MR. LYMAN: I would like to clarify on
24 that same point. I think that's appropriate. And
25 I think one of the things that we can do through

1 the planning group is get staff to bring us back
2 to setting up points from each plan, begin to
3 compare those. And, obviously, we are going to
4 bring it back to a public format, other comments
5 from the public where we have missed from the
6 group. And that way, again, you are not flying
7 blind or you are not doing duplicative work.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Bill?

9 MR. HAVERT: Again, I want to suggest
10 that there may well be issues that are of great
11 importance to the Monument that aren't well
12 addressed in any of those other plans which have a
13 much broader area to look at.

14 And maybe timingwise you want to go to
15 public comments and then come back to this, but by
16 listing the issues, let's see if we can just get a
17 concise list of issues. And then I think we can
18 look at those and say, "Is there anything
19 meaningful we can do on that between now and
20 April 1?" If the answer is yes, we do it. If the
21 answer is no, then that's the answer.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any further
23 discussion?

24 Yes, Jeffery?

25 MR. MORGAN: I agree with Bill. I

1 think we really should define the issues, the ones
2 in particular that we know about. We know that
3 there are a lot of issues out there and we know
4 the public are aware of these issues and they will
5 probably want to see us take some action on this
6 issue or at least start the process towards taking
7 the action.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any other comments?

9 MS. GEORGE: Going back to the prep
10 plan that Connell presented, on page 4, the
11 issues, the anticipated issues on the BLM portion
12 of the Monument Plan. Interagency Coordination.
13 That was what Elena talked about with the Monument
14 Plan needing a focus on seamless government
15 management, possible committee, how we can do
16 that.

17 Recreation. That's in the legislation.

18 Cultural resources to Native Americans.

19 In the legislation. Anticipated as an issue in
20 the plan.

21 Wildlife and habitat management. They
22 both -- one needs the other. We know that's an
23 issue.

24 Wilderness, fire management. Maybe that
25 fire goes in there with habitat and wildlife. I

1 don't know.

2 But, I mean, I would think that -- and
3 land acquisition exchanges, because Tom expressed
4 a desire today for a subcommittee on the land
5 acquisitions to be created.

6 So I'd just like to suggest if there's a
7 way to help the Monument folks writing the plan to
8 be able to take these issues that have been
9 identified in the prep plan and by coordination
10 with Forest Service and what was significantly
11 pointed out or called out in the legislation, that
12 would be good. That would be good. That's all.
13 It would be helpful.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other comments?

15 Then I would propose, as Chairman, for
16 approval by this Committee that we would form a
17 Planning Committee, a Land/Conservation/Endangered
18 Species Committee, and a --

19 MS. GEORGE: The cultural and Native
20 American.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: -- Cultural and
22 Native American Committee to begin with. Those, I
23 think, are three areas that we could get the talk
24 going and come back to the other meeting on April
25 6th with the idea, then, at that time those

1 committees would report to the -- the
2 subcommittees would report to the Committee and
3 then we can further refine and decide whether
4 there's subcommittees we might have involvement
5 with.

6 Does anybody have any problem with that?

7 MR. WATTS: Mr. Chair, could you
8 expand a little bit on that second lumping --

9 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, the lumping,
10 in my mind, all have connection; i.e., land, land
11 acquisition, endangered species. And -- I have
12 even lost my own thought here. What was the third
13 one on the --

14 MS. GEORGE: Cultural resources,
15 Native American.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: No. The lumping
17 one.

18 MS. GEORGE: Oh, land acquisition,
19 exchanges, and endangered species or habitat
20 conservation.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Right. Those are
22 all connected.

23 MS. GEORGE: Or do you want to split
24 that?

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, later on we

1 can split it, but I am just trying now -- playing
2 on Buford's comments that we are going to be doing
3 some historical perspective here during these
4 first subcommittee meetings.

5 Barbara?

6 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: I just want to
7 make sure that everybody understands, though, too,
8 that land acquisitions and native species are also
9 part of Native American and cultural resources and
10 preservation.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And none of them
12 would be completely divorced to the other. This
13 would, in my mind, be the prime discussion areas.
14 And they can go as far afield as they want. One
15 thing I would ask is that once we assign the
16 chairman of these three committees, that they
17 would appoint their committee members and that
18 they would make sure that the entire committee
19 knows of these meeting dates and places so any of
20 the committee members can attend.

21 So let's see. I think Jeffery?

22 MR. MORGAN: Yes. Another area
23 that -- or issue that is obviously very important
24 to many people is trails and access to trails.
25 That is probably one of the most -- I don't

1 know -- contentious issues with many, many people.

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: They have gone quite
3 a ways on that as far as BLM is concerned. So
4 maybe then we can have a fourth committee on
5 trails.

6 MR. MORGAN: Trails and access.

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I want to expand
8 trails a little bit and make it general.

9 MR. CRITES: Public access.

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Access. Thank you.
11 Make that trails and general public access. It
12 needs to be a little bit wider than that.

13 So did we get those, Paul?

14 MR. IDEKER: I think so.

15 MS. GEORGE: Can I ask you, for
16 clarification, the endangered species and habitat
17 conservation, those are with the land acquisition
18 and exchange --

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes. Those are all
20 one group, because they are all interconnected one
21 way or another.

22 And then I would suggest that we -- I am
23 sorry. Yes? Buford?

24 MR. CRITES: I suspect it's understood
25 by everyone, but on the Native American cultural

1 resources, I would hope that we are talking
2 historical resources as well. As an example,
3 there are the Martinez, the old rock cabin that's
4 on the National Historic Register, on Santa Rosa,
5 old cabins. Actually, even the Dunn Road has its
6 own historical presence, whether we like it or
7 don't like it, and so on and so forth.

8 Old cabins on the other side of Palm
9 Canyon, corrals and so on and so forth. So
10 somewhere in there, historic. Old mines. And
11 often we tend to think of cultural things as being
12 the domain of a particular group or so on, and you
13 need to make sure that's a very broad category.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And it is. I think
15 it's broad by lack of definition, that they can
16 just go anywhere in there that they would like.
17 The idea is to make these first committees very
18 broad and just a point to turn to, to target at,
19 if you will, but anywhere they want. And then
20 hopefully we will get enough expertise out of this
21 to go back.

22 Frank?

23 MR. BOGERT: How about a public use,
24 multiple use committee?

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, I think that

1 will go with public access.

2 MR. BOGERT: Included in something
3 else?

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I think that will
5 fit in the access, at least for the beginning,
6 Frank. I want to hold it down to three or four
7 committees at first.

8 MR. BOGERT: That should be part of
9 access. That's what I was going to bring up.

10 MS. ROSENTHAL: One suggestion, since
11 you are trying to make them broad. Maybe the last
12 one could be public use and education.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, that could
14 certainly be it. I don't want to make them too
15 definitive; okay? Just kind of general for this
16 period of time here. And then we will get back
17 to -- yes?

18 MS. ROSENTHAL: The reason I was
19 thinking about the educational aspect is we are in
20 a position right now up in Idyllwild where we have
21 some funding available to expand our district
22 offices. And one thing -- and this is going to
23 happen really fast because this is this year's
24 money -- one thing that we have been talking about
25 is making this a portal for the Monument and

1 making it multiagency.

2 And that's the reason I brought up the
3 education, because that's kind of an immediate
4 thing.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay.

6 MS. GEORGE: Visitor services? Would
7 that --

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Paul, go ahead and
9 add education at the bottom. Access and
10 education.

11 Anything else? If not, I will --

12 MS. HENDERSON: Yes, I do.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes, Terry?

14 MS. HENDERSON: Could you give me a
15 possible scenario of one of these committee
16 meetings?

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Call to order, ask
18 for any comments, and adjourn.

19 MS. HENDERSON: Are we bringing up the
20 issues as we know them, making a list, then going
21 back to the plans that are out there, seeing if
22 they have been addressed properly in the plans?

23 Or --

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: The way I heard the
25 comments of the various persons who wanted the

1 expanded subcommittees was that there is a history
2 in each one of these areas, a history that has
3 been undertaken, and that they would define this
4 history and define or outline where it could be
5 approved, where it's not been considered, whatever
6 the case may be, in broad, general terms, then
7 coming back to the Committee with their discussion
8 and suggestions, that dovetailing with our
9 Planning Committee and the plans that have come in
10 -- and I would hope that all of us would attend
11 those meetings -- and at that time, then, we'd
12 have a pretty good idea of what she's talking
13 about as to the suggestions that perhaps aren't in
14 the plan, the expansion of their plans, those sort
15 of things.

16 Again, my suggestion is that we keep it
17 very broad so that each committee chair would come
18 back and report the activities of their
19 subcommittee at the April 6th meeting and we would
20 then be a whole lot more informed than we are
21 today. Okay? Do you buy that?

22 Then, Buford, would you head up the
23 Planning Committee -- Subcommittee?

24 MR. CRITES: What do we plan?

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Don't give me a hard

1 time. And, of course, Barbara, would you head up
2 the --

3 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Land
4 acquisition?

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Would you head up
6 the Native American Subcommittee?

7 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Sure.

8 MR. CRITES: Ed, to be honest, I think
9 Bill Havert would be a better choice in terms of
10 the Planning Committee. That's the one that
11 really is to look at all of the existing planning
12 efforts and everything else. Of all people
13 looking down this row that knows something about
14 that --

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: He's also our expert
16 in land acquisition. That's where I was going to
17 put him, Land Acquisition, Multi Species, and
18 everything else. And I think he would be more
19 help there. I'm looking to your expertise on the
20 city council as to planning and organizing and
21 that sort of thing. But if you don't want to,
22 that's fine.

23 Allan, you had a comment?

24 MR. MUTH: Yes. Coachella Valley
25 Multiple Species Habitat Conservation Plan is at

1 the core of those first two proposed
2 subcommittees. And perhaps you would combine
3 those, call it whatever, and, again, Havert is the
4 one that's leading it and knows the most about
5 it. So maybe you want to -- Organization
6 Committee? I don't know what to call it, but the
7 two are intimately related there.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Looks like that, in
9 my estimation, is going to be the guts of this
10 thing and that's where we are actually receiving
11 input from the various organizations as to their
12 planning process.

13 MR. MUTH: Right. And they all have
14 input.

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes, Barbara?

16 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: That's why I say,
17 Native American, Cultural Resources, also, and
18 really combine into Land Acquisition, Multi
19 Species, because we are also having our multi
20 species plan that I believe is ahead of the other
21 plans at this point.

22 And, I mean, all those three areas are
23 just like all together, lumped together.

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Exactly.

25 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: It's not

1 individual. It's really one core --

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Are we getting back
3 to one subcommittee, then?

4 MS. GONZALES-LYONS: Yes.

5 MR. HAVERT: I think that's too much
6 to take on. Can I offer a suggestion?

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Bill?

8 MR. HAVERT: I would be happy to take
9 on land acquisition, the first line up there, and
10 that's definitely where I spend a lot of time.

11 Let me put someone else on the spot for a minute
12 and see if one of our planning folks, such as Bob
13 over there, would be interested in taking on
14 Planning.

15 I think you would certainly have an
16 appreciation of how multiple different kinds of
17 plans need to work together and if you have time
18 and would be willing to work with BLM and the
19 Forest Service and the others just to make sure
20 that all that information gets pulled together in
21 a format that is quickly comprehensible.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. So instead of
23 Buford, then we will get Bob. And then, Frank,
24 trails? General access? Can you chair that?

25 MR. BOGERT: Who? Me?

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: No. The other Frank
2 down there.

3 MR. BOGERT: The access?

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes.

5 MR. BOGERT: That's me.

6 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: You would be that
7 chair.

8 MR. BOGERT: Yes, sir.

9 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. So I would
10 ask each of you chairpersons to choose three
11 subcommittee members. Let me and staff know the
12 names of the subcommittee members. And then
13 advise Danella as to the meeting place and time of
14 your subcommittee so that she can then advise all
15 of the Committee members of those subcommittee
16 meetings. And --

17 MS. HENDERSON: Advise the whole
18 board.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's what I mean.
20 When I say committee and subcommittee, this is the
21 Committee.

22 MS. HENDERSON: Right. But then you
23 said that she could then advise all of those
24 members of the subcommittee.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Did I say

1 subcommittee? I meant to say Committee. Thank
2 you for the correction.

3 No. I want to make sure that all of us
4 are aware of all of the subcommittee meetings so
5 that we can attend. And I would suggest that you
6 attend as many as you can, because the idea is so
7 that all of us are informed.

8 MS. GEORGE: And may I ask, Mr. Chair,
9 until we get e-mail and Internet back, would it be
10 possible for one of the Committee members to
11 create a mail list and be able to send to your
12 brothers and sisters on the Committee these
13 meetings so that Connell and I aren't faxing and
14 calling?

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: If that's a problem,
16 just send them all to me and I will e-mail them
17 out. I mean, it's no big deal.

18 MS. GEORGE: Okay. That's what we
19 will do, then. That's what we are looking for.

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I will be the
21 coordinator. If you will, then, the subcommittee
22 chairs advise me, then -- I am just trying to keep
23 you in the loop -- advise me, then, of the
24 subcommittee meetings' time and place, and then I
25 will e-mail -- everyone has an e-mail address;

1 right?

2 MS. GEORGE: Till we get our Internet
3 back up.

4 MS. CADY: Yours is --

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: My e-mail is
6 EdKibbey -- E-d K-i-b-b-e-y -- at my.nahb.com.
7 It's here on the list, guys.

8 We have, I think, then achieved our
9 administrative details?

10 MR. IDEKER: Even if we haven't, I
11 think you want to open --

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I have already
13 opened the public hearing. We will then go to my
14 list here. This is a sign-up sheet. Is this
15 sign-up sheet for speaking or just a sign-up sheet
16 for attending?

17 MS. GEORGE: For speaking. For public
18 speaking.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. Our first
20 person --

21 Would you be our timekeeper, please?

22 MS. DUNNING: Sure. What is the
23 time --

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Five minutes.

25 MR. IDEKER: Do we want to start with
253

1 Ed Konno from Fish & Game?

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I don't know. I
3 will see if his name is on the list here.

4 MR. IDEKER: I don't know that his
5 name got on the list, but I know he's ready now.

6 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, I understand
7 he's ready. And we will go ahead and -- if
8 everybody else is okay -- because he is going to
9 give us information that might well perfect your
10 other comments.

11 MR. KONNO: My name is Eddy Konno. I
12 am a wildlife biologist with California Department
13 of Fish & Game.

14 MR. IDEKER: Ed, you might want to go
15 in the middle of the room.

16 MR. KONNO: We are represented on this
17 committee by Gary Watts. And I am not sure why we
18 don't actually have a seat there. I understand
19 that there's going to be some trade-off with
20 appointments or something like that. But I don't
21 know the details of that.

22 I think that we can participate and get
23 our issues across by working at a staff level.
24 But we'd like to be on the subcommittees, and then
25 I think that we need to coordinate with Gary prior

1 to the meetings a lot better. I think part of the
2 reason we are not there is that we didn't have our
3 senior and above staff -- they were not available
4 at this time.

5 So in that regard, I think there are
6 issues with lands that we do own, because they
7 were not purchased with multiple use in mind.
8 They had a specific -- their purchase was
9 specifically for the protection of Bighorn Sheep.
10 And there is legislation that covers our
11 ecological reserves out there that's under the
12 Fish & Game Commission Title XIV. And specific
13 closure dates are in that legislation. And so
14 that any management plan that comes out for the
15 Monument would need to incorporate those into
16 that.

17 There is also a management plan for the
18 Santa Rosa Mountains Wildlife Area. And I think
19 this is what Allan may have been referring to. It
20 is written under the Sykes Act, 1980. And some of
21 those issues are still relevant today even though
22 it was written 22 years ago.

23 And I think that our staff level
24 participation -- it's up to our regional manager
25 to assign that person, but I can be 99 percent

1 sure that it's going to be me that will be dealing
2 with it, so --

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Ed, if you would
4 give your business card, I will make sure that you
5 are on the notification list of all Committee
6 meetings, subcommittee meetings.

7 MR. KONNO: Okay.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And you can attend
9 any. And I would certainly hope, speaking, I
10 think, for the Group that you would be here at our
11 meetings to make presentations and be an integral
12 part of the operation.

13 MR. KONNO: Okay. I will do that.

14 MS. GEORGE: And, also, on March 19th,
15 the next contributing core -- that staff we talked
16 about, that staff to figure out projects from
17 different agencies -- is going to meet March 19th
18 at Idyllwild from 9:00 to probably 4:00, and we'd
19 love to have you there to look at the projects we
20 are working on, especially tamarisk.

21 MR. KONNO: Yes. We would like to
22 participate in that.

23 So -- that was less than five minutes.

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Very good. Nick
25 Steffanoff?

1 MR. STEFFANOFF: Good afternoon. I
2 really commend you for being here. You are not
3 being paid enough to do this, and so it's got to
4 be a labor of love. And I've kind of followed the
5 process and I was just thinking, as I heard the
6 comments about 35-year-old ears and things, "Gee,
7 I was attending grade school in Palm Springs
8 before the San Jacinto Park was even formed or
9 before there was even a BLM." So I feel like I
10 should be kind of shuffling up here kind of slow.
11 But I did make it.

12 And I've got some written comments. I
13 will just take a couple minutes to outline rather
14 than read everything within the five minutes. And
15 I wouldn't do that anyway to you.

16 I really appreciate what went on here
17 this morning. I think you are really headed in
18 the right direction. I am an advocate of the
19 historical -- or the National Monument and
20 particularly interested in some of the historical
21 things and cultural and some of those aspects of
22 what's going on up there.

23 I do live up there. I am in the
24 Monument. So I'm kind of acutely aware of those
25 things. And I hear all the grapevine and

1 the stuff that goes around those kind of
2 communities about what's good and what's bad about
3 what may or may not be happening with the National
4 Monument.

5 I really like the part I heard about
6 seamless. That makes a lot of sense to me.

7 Another thing that really caught my ear
8 was vision, because part of what I'm submitting is
9 what I suggest might be something to consider, to
10 form a vision statement for the Monument beyond
11 what the legislation already, you know, outlines
12 for you. So I thought, "Wow. We are thinking the
13 same way at least in that way."

14 I have two kind of issues, if you want to
15 think of them that way, that I would like to
16 address just briefly. One is process. And I
17 think you are headed right in process. And I am
18 thinking that since you are the Advisory
19 Committee, your role probably isn't the actual
20 hands-on planning part, but, rather, to review
21 what's being done and coordinate that with the
22 public input which you are getting right now.

23 So I still think, though, that you have
24 an opportunity to impact or affect that process,
25 and my major concern in that regard is that

1 there's inadequate inventory of what's up in that
2 Monument so that we -- well, how can we protect
3 what we don't know we have?

4 So it seems to me we need to be making an
5 inventory of certain things. I included a couple
6 of sheets of things myself about some trails and
7 some historical names, some mines, and some things
8 I heard mentioned before. So that's part of what
9 I am submitting here today.

10 My second concern -- and I don't need to
11 dwell on the first one that much, I suppose, but
12 my second concern is really what I read in the
13 legislation is an opportunity for a conflict. And
14 that's where the issues are going to come up and
15 you are going to be burdened with trying to
16 balance the Management Plan with property rights
17 and preservation and conservation and preserving
18 vistas and whatever else you interpret that you
19 can see in the legislation.

20 And so to that end, I selected an area
21 that became readily apparent and it was shown on
22 Mr. Havert's overlays today. I think he had some
23 of it. And I am not picking on Palm Springs. I
24 am just going to use this as a demonstration. But
25 Palm Springs has about, oh, 30 some sections of

1 land up there that were annexed years ago and they
2 come clear up to about the Pinyon Flats area. My
3 concern is that the legislation in one way says,
4 "Well, it's not going to affect lands within
5 corporate boundaries and won't affect private
6 property rights," and this and that, but I think
7 we all recognize that if we were to allow just
8 business as usual inside that corporate boundary
9 or include Cathedral City's, Rancho Mirage --
10 because they come up in there too -- and that was
11 to develop, given sewer and water and services, we
12 could just -- we wouldn't be showing Bighorn Sheep
13 as a logo around here much. They'd be gone,
14 because that goes almost to Highway 74. And it
15 really does go to Highway 74. Because Pinyon
16 Flats and Alpine Village and those areas develop
17 and finish the development -- they are already
18 developed with vacant lots -- if they all develop
19 out, you might as well connect Palm Springs via
20 the -- if you want to call it Dunn Road or Palm
21 Canyon Drive up to 74. And I don't think we want
22 that. So I prepared a little scenario in that.

23 And it's more obvious if you think about
24 this. Probably private lands up there that you
25 are going to find petroglyphs or petrographs on

1 rocks up there. And how do you do that? One
2 minute --

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: My timekeeper says
4 your five minutes are up.

5 MR. STEFFANOFF: So with that, I am
6 going to hand in my stuff. I think I hand it to
7 Danella, I suppose, for the record.

8 MS. GEORGE: Yes, sir.

9 MR. STEFFANOFF: And I appreciate your
10 time. And I commend you for your work and wish
11 you good luck.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you, sir.

13 Dave Mathews?

14 MR. MATHEWS: Good afternoon. I am
15 David Mathews. I am a resident of Cathedral
16 City. I would like to speak to you about a couple
17 of different issues. The first is your public
18 comment period. I would suggest that you place
19 your public comment period at the start of the
20 meeting, like many other public bodies do. That
21 would give you a chance to think about the public
22 comments during the meeting and, also, for the
23 public to be better able to address issues that
24 are going to be heard at your meeting.

25 I also suggest that to require people to
261

1 register three hours prior to making a public
2 comment is an onerous burden on people, for which
3 there's no apparent reason. I suggest that you
4 find some other way to register people for public
5 comments.

6 In fact, when I called BLM about this, I
7 was told I could register by phone, and I did, but
8 that was not made clear in the press release. And
9 that should be made clear to people.

10 You need a time limit and I suggest you
11 establish one. And apparently you have done so.
12 When I called on the phone, I was told that the
13 hour was going to be divided up by how many people
14 were interested in speaking. So theoretically, if
15 you had 60 people that wanted to speak, they'd
16 only get a minute, and 120 would get 30 seconds
17 apiece. That, to me, is a little ridiculous. So
18 I suggest you do have a limit.

19 Future meeting times. I would suggest
20 that you consider times that would be more
21 accommodating to the general public that may be
22 interested in participating in your meeting.
23 Trying to do the whole thing during the business
24 day on a Monday is a sure way to avoid getting
25 much public participation. I realize it's

1 difficult to find times when all you folks can
2 meet and get together, but there needs to be an
3 effort to be more inclusive of the public.

4 Thank you.

5 I'd also like to address the issue of
6 private landowner interest in the Monument. BLM
7 has historically and most recently with Dunn Road
8 done an outstanding job of alienating private
9 landowners in the area.

10 And to give you an idea of BLM's bias in
11 this regard, if you look at page 2 of your news
12 release, you will see the listing of the total
13 acreage of the Monument and the different acreage
14 for different agencies and private lands. BLM is
15 first with 32 percent. Second is the Forest
16 Service with 24 percent. And third is private
17 lands at 20 percent. Private lands were listed
18 last.

19 These things were not listed in
20 alphabetical order and they, as I just told you,
21 were not listed in order of amount of acreage. So
22 this is just some indication of the bias against
23 private landowners in the area. And I would like
24 you to be aware of that.

25 And, also, I would like to urge you, as a
263

1 Committee, to be aware that BLM in particular is
2 very good at bogging down things. And if there's
3 going to be any action taken to do positive
4 management on the ground in the Monument, it's
5 going to need to be some effort to move things
6 forward and not spend years and years studying the
7 different issues.

8 Regarding the Palm Springs corporate
9 limits, as the last speaker mentioned, I would
10 just like to mention that you might want to
11 consider trying to urge the City of Palm Springs
12 to deannex that area. There's no reason at all at
13 present for the City of Palm Springs to have that
14 land. It was done, as the previous speaker
15 mentioned, to support a proposed development
16 that's no longer on the drawing boards. And all
17 it serves to do is serves as an impediment to many
18 things that, hopefully, this Committee and the
19 Monument designation will be able to accomplish.

20 Thank you for your time.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Mr. Mathews, just
22 for your information, we did decide to hold our
23 meetings on Saturdays. We decided to hold the
24 meeting from 9:00 to 4:00. We decided that
25 sign-up would be at the meeting itself with a

1 beginning half hour and an ending half hour for
2 public comment.

3 MR. MATHEWS: Great. Thank you very
4 much, Mr. Kibbey.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you for
6 coming. Appreciate it.

7 MR. CRITES: Mr. Chairman, as a
8 procedural issue, if Connell would be kind enough
9 to let the speaker know when they have one minute
10 left. That way, they know when it's about time
11 for a summary-type thing.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Maybe you might --

13 MR. IDEKER: You might want to come up
14 here, Connell. And you can have -- just hold up a
15 finger.

16 MS. CADY: Get your club.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Joe Ingram?

18 No signs, Mr. Ingram, please. Just put
19 your sign down. Thank you very much.

20 MR. INGRAM: This is the point.

21 On June 25th, we had a meeting -- my name
22 is Joe Ingram. I live in Springcrest. I have
23 lived up there since the early seventies. I have
24 lived in the mountain since I dropped out of UCR
25 in '69. I was brought up in Palm Springs. Class

1 of '66. Raised in Palm Springs.

2 I have watched this area change through
3 the years. I have watched the mountain change
4 through the years. I think -- the Monument, to
5 me, could be a positive thing. What I see wrong
6 is -- is we have the same people that have been --
7 I call them the clique. That's my terminology.
8 And you all know who you are. We have a clique, a
9 group of people that have run the media and the
10 newspapers and the land acquisitions, most of -- I
11 know you personally. I think we need some fresh,
12 new blood in a fresh new Monument with some new
13 voices and with some old voices that we haven't
14 ever heard before.

15 In regards to the Bighorn Sheep, the
16 Bighorn Sheep were still plentiful when I moved
17 and worked and lived up on Dunn Road in the early
18 seventies through the late seventies. I worked
19 for Mike Dunn on the Dunn Road '73 to '78, till he
20 ran out of money. I lived out there. I lived at
21 the gate in Alpine. I lived in what we call the
22 modular. I lived there for a year and a half.
23 There were Bighorn Sheep in the road.

24 You are all aware of the Center for
25 Biological Diversity, the lawsuit. I got into it

1 for about ten minutes out front here with
2 somebody -- I have never met any of them before.
3 I met one out here today. His question, his focus
4 was totally on the Bighorn Sheep; the Dunn Road is
5 the primary one -- one of the primary reasons for
6 the decline in the Bighorn Sheep. I said,
7 "Baloney." I said, "I lived out there. I
8 watched them decline. It was drought." We are in
9 drought right now. There was drought starting
10 back then. It was drought, and then the secondary
11 diseases, deterioration, lack of feed, whatever.
12 Very little pressure from people on the Dunn Road
13 in the seventies.

14 And I said -- I asked him. I said,
15 "What's your opinion on it?" And he just -- he
16 had no opinion, because he -- he is too young. He
17 wasn't here. He is not from here.

18 So the BLM has been sued by this outfit
19 -- I just got 14 pages from Washington, D.C.,
20 three days ago for an extension till the end of
21 February. The BLM must go back and readdress that
22 lawsuit with the Center for Biological Diversity.
23 It's wrong. It is wrong and it needs to be
24 addressed and it's dooming this new Monument. I
25 don't know where those people came from, what

1 their background, if they are linked in with the
2 clique locally. Maybe. I question it. I don't
3 know. If I don't know, it's not -- it might not
4 be true. I hope it's not true. I hope they are
5 just freaks from Arizona or someplace that can be
6 dealt with by the BLM, by a consortium of people
7 getting together and addressing their issues and
8 exposing the lack -- I call it
9 pseudoenvironmentalism. It is
10 pseudoenvironmentalism, reading that lawsuit. I
11 have the entire lawsuit. I have read their
12 arguments.

13 That's one of my recommendations, is go
14 back, and for God's sake, before the quail die off
15 -- there are only a few quail left -- for God's
16 sakes, go back and talk to a man that has raised
17 animals out in these mountains in the Santa Rosa
18 before they die and try to get some insight into
19 managing the Bighorn Sheep. For God's sake. You
20 know, let's make it real. Let's make it real.
21 Let's make it good; okay? New ideas. Real.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you, sir.
23 Don't forget the sign. Don't forget the sign.

24 Gayle Cady, please?

25 MS. CADY: Hi. I also thank everyone
268

1 here for coming. My name is Gayle Cady. I am an
2 equestrian-type person. I am also an
3 environmentalist. I love the mountains. I am
4 from California. I have ridden in the mountains.
5 I have ridden in a lot of mountains, the Santa
6 Rosas, the San Jacintos, the San Diegos. I have
7 been in the Sierras. I love the mountains. I
8 love all the mountains there, including the
9 sheep.

10 I agree with the previous gentleman that
11 I don't believe that it's the trail riders that
12 are killing off our sheep. I believe there are
13 many other things that are happening in this
14 community. One of the things that I am in favor
15 of is the trail system that is accessible by
16 everyone who enjoys the mountains and the outdoors
17 as much as I do.

18 I am currently living in a community
19 newly formed in the county of Riverside called
20 Vista Santa Rosa. We are located in the East
21 Valley. We comprise about 23 square miles. We
22 are on the eastern border of La Quinta, the
23 southern border of Indio, the western border of
24 Coachella, and the northern border of Thermal.

25 We are trying to maintain and establish a

1 rural equestrian and agricultural community. We
2 have already managed to have trail access from the
3 largest polo facility in the country and the
4 largest conglomeration of horses and equestrian
5 activity west of the Mississippi. We have a trail
6 ride established from the trail head at Avenue 52
7 and Madison, which is going to be granted by
8 Alexander Hagen III, the sole owner of Empire Polo
9 Grounds, down Madison Street to Avenue 58 and then
10 west to Lake Cahuilla.

11 For all of you that don't know or aren't
12 aware, Lake Cahuilla has a magnificent equestrian
13 facility there. We have areas for approximately
14 40 or more campsites for riders that want to
15 come. At present, there is no electric or water
16 hookup at the individual campsites. However,
17 there is water and electric available at the
18 site.

19 In the process, as we speak, the county
20 is planning for a host full-time at the equestrian
21 camp at Lake Cahuilla as well as electrical and
22 water hookup at each campsite. You may know that
23 Lake Cahuilla also has camping facilities for
24 RVs. It has plenty of room for picnics,
25 children's activities, softball, baseball games.

1 There's even a swimming pool as well as fishing.
2 They do not allow motor vehicles on the lake, but
3 they will allow kayak or canoe. Obviously, the
4 Lake Cahuilla area is a magnificent community. It
5 also is located at the base of the Santa Rosas.

6 A trail head is located at Lake Cahuilla
7 community. Without access to these trails, we are
8 shooting ourselves in the foot if we do not allow
9 public access to these beautiful areas to ride and
10 enjoy the outdoors.

11 The good Lord gave us all of these
12 blessings. We need to be able to compromise and
13 live harmoniously.

14 One of the things that I do not
15 understand -- and perhaps some of you here in the
16 room can address this -- in the community, there
17 is discussion about a gentleman by the name of Tim
18 Blexis. And if I am saying his name wrong, I
19 apologize.

20 MS. DUNNING: One minute.

21 MS. CADY: This gentleman -- at least
22 it's my understanding -- has something to do with
23 the closure in or around the Dunn Road. This is
24 also a gentleman that has purchased an enormous
25 amount of land at the base or the end of Magnesia

1 Falls Road and is currently in the process of
2 building a monumental golf course. Yet another
3 golf course in our valley.

4 We should be very aware and very
5 concerned about our water issue and conservation.
6 We should be very concerned about the sheep who
7 die when they eat the oleanders and other noxious
8 and toxic plants that the public grows at the
9 country clubs. Keep in mind a nonpredatory,
10 four-legged herd animal, which is a sheep, Bighorn
11 Sheep, is not afraid of another four-legged,
12 nonpredatory herd animal, the horse.

13 I thank you for your time.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Glen Rasmussen?

15 MR. RASMUSSEN: Thank you. My name is
16 Glen Rasmussen. I am a member of the Andreas
17 Canyon Club. And I am here with Richard Segal and
18 Richard Skeie, who are also members of the Andreas
19 Canyon Club.

20 The Andreas Canyon Club is a fairly
21 good-sized landholder. We own about three and a
22 half square miles around Andreas Canyon and
23 Andreas Creek. Our nonprofit corporation has
24 owned that since 1923. We don't allow domestic
25 animals. Our primary purpose is preservation and

1 conservation of that property. Many of us have
2 gone up there since there were not nearly so many
3 lights down in the valley, and now the lights are
4 so strong that you can see your shadow from the
5 lights in town.

6 Having that historical connection, with
7 that property and with the development of Palm
8 Springs and now watching formation of this
9 committee, I just am here to say that we are very,
10 very interested and wish to participate actively
11 in the subcommittees. And the four were
12 identified, all of which we are very interested
13 in, Planning, Land Acquisition, Exchanges, Habitat
14 Conservation, et cetera.

15 We have worked very closely with Jim
16 Kenna. We have worked very closely with Tom Davis
17 and other members of the Agua Caliente Band of
18 Cahuilla Indians and would like to be on the list
19 of subcommittees so that we receive notification
20 so that we can actively participate. And we look
21 forward to doing so with such a qualified
22 Committee.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you, Glen.

24 Would you please address a letter to
25 our -- what are you? A CFO or --

1 MS. GEORGE: Designated Federal
2 Official. To Danella George. Just send me
3 something with how to --

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Send her a request
5 to be a member of the subcommittee, and we will
6 consider that. And, also, that you'd like to be
7 placed upon the e-mail list for meetings. Thank
8 you.

9 Dave Tunnicliff? How about Lita
10 Tunnicliff?

11 MS. TUNNICLIFF: I am just a resident
12 and I came to just check out the meeting.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Very good. Well, we
14 are pleased for you.

15 MS. TUNNICLIFF: And make sure my P.O.
16 box is in there so I can receive the information
17 and updates and --

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you.

19 Les Stanks? Starks? I am not too sure.

20 MR. STARKS: It's Les Starks,
21 S-t-a-r-k-s. I am from Snow Creek.

22 And although my suggestion might be a
23 little premature, I would like to suggest the
24 construction of a scenic turnout a quarter mile
25 east of Snow Creek Road on Highway 111 so drivers

1 entering the western end of the valley can stop
2 and enjoy the spectacular view of the north face
3 of Mt. San Jacinto and the waterfalls. This would
4 also be the perfect photo opportunity and signs
5 could be erected at the turnout with facts about
6 Mt. San Jacinto and the National Monument.

7 Although this is some of our most
8 dramatic scenery, drivers exiting Freeway 10 are
9 driving too fast to realize it's there, so a
10 scenic turnout would change that.

11 And I'd also like to suggest that
12 information be posted along Snow Creek Road, which
13 is now the western entrance to the Monument,
14 designating parking places and hiking trails.

15 And I'd also like to be on the
16 information list as a Snow Creek resident.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. Thank you
18 very much.

19 MR. STARKS: Thank you.

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That is the end of
21 my list of persons who have asked to speak. Are
22 there any other persons who wish to address the
23 Committee?

24 Yes, ma'am? I need you to come forward.
25 Come forward, please.

1 MS. HENNING: Could I just stay here?

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Give your full name,
3 spell your name, and give your mailing address.

4 MS. HENNING: My name is Eileen
5 Henning and I live at 59905 Avenida La Cambre,
6 Mountain Center, California, but I really don't
7 live there.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Is that where you
9 receive your mail?

10 MS. HENNING: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And the name Henning
12 is spelled?

13 MS. HENNING: H-e-n-n-i-n-g.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you.

15 MS. HENNING: Today, I have heard a
16 lot about public input, public trust, public
17 comments, public, public, public. And I am the
18 public. And I represent quite a few people.

19 Our main concern for all of you is to
20 protect the ownership of the land that we have
21 invested money, time, effort, whatever. I hear
22 horror stories from people, from the government,
23 coming in telling you that you can only use maybe
24 one-sixth of your property because of the French
25 Toed Lizard, you cannot build your barn, you

1 cannot build a riding ring, you cannot build
2 concrete walkways.

3 Now, to me, this is outrageous. It is
4 unacceptable. This was in The Desert Sun of
5 October 1, 2000. Excuse me.

6 I have a feeling even the private
7 developers have to pay -- if I'm wrong -- \$600 an
8 acre in order to make a deal with the
9 environmentalists so that the developer can build
10 his home or whatever it is in exchange for the
11 ability to build there, so the environmentalists
12 can use that \$600 per acre to buy land elsewhere
13 for the protected French Toed Lizard with the sand
14 that blows here, there, and everywhere. We live
15 in the mountains. We have more lizards now than
16 you can imagine, because there's water, there's
17 food, there's all kinds of shade. So we have, I'm
18 sure, more lizards now than there were there
19 before.

20 It really scares me to death when I hear
21 "land acquisition." You are purchasing so much
22 land. We have a little dot on that map up there.
23 It won't be long before the environmentalists say,
24 "Uh-huh. You can live in your home until you
25 decide to move or die, and then if you want to put

1 it on the market, we are going to buy it at,
2 quote, 'fair market value,'" which is not always
3 the case.

4 Also, it may come to pass -- and I say
5 "may" because I don't know, but you hear these
6 stories -- that you cannot deed your property to
7 your beneficiaries or your heirs.

8 So my main concern and bottom line is
9 don't touch our private property. You've got the
10 west already up in arms with their cattle and
11 grazing. Don't mess with our private property.
12 Once you start taking private property, you are in
13 big trouble.

14 And I respectfully thank you for your
15 time in listening, but I am very upset and I know
16 that a lot of other people are upset too. So I
17 hope you will bear that in mind. I'm sure you are
18 all property owners. You are probably down here.
19 You are not up in the wilderness where I'm sure
20 they're eyeballing that property in the time to
21 come.

22 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you very much
24 for your input. Yes, ma'am?

25 MS. BOGERT: Niki Bogert, 2787

1 Claiborne. I just have a comment --

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's what city?

3 MS. BOGERT: Palm Springs. Where
4 else?

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I know where you
6 live, but she doesn't.

7 MS. BOGERT: I just have a comment.
8 With all of these wonderful plans that you have
9 for the National Monument, I just want to have the
10 admission that they are going to be opened for
11 multiple access and for the public. I don't
12 want -- and what I see with -- if a few callers
13 that had happened lately, I don't want to have to
14 think that I have to join the Forest Service in
15 order to visit all these places. So I do hope
16 that we are able to have these beautiful mountains
17 open for anybody and everybody that wants to see
18 them.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you very
20 much. And I would hope you would attend every
21 subcommittee meeting that Mr. Bogert holds.

22 Yes, ma'am?

23 MS. NAVARRE: I am Rebecca Navarre --

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Spell the name,
25 please.

1 MS. NAVARRE: N-a-v-a-r-r-e -- 3836
2 Paradise Way, Cathedral City. I am not sure my
3 comment is appropriate, but I am commenting on
4 behalf of an old friend of mine who is deceased
5 and buried at Pechanga, but I know he would want
6 me to speak if I could about the possibility of
7 trying to pull in again one more time the people
8 of Santa Rosa, the Cahuilla people, and to
9 emphasize the Cahuilla nature, the original
10 environmental protection of the people who live
11 there. And I know that they are not on this
12 Committee and probably need a special sort of
13 invitation to draw them in. It's not my place to
14 speak, because the Agua Calientes, I know, are
15 represented, but the Mountain Cahuilla, that was
16 their land. And those ancestors are buried up
17 there. And I think we should extend an
18 invitation, a special effort to draw that energy
19 into this group and to use it as a centrifugal
20 force of that group along with the ethnobotany and
21 other modern interpretations of needing culture.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you very
23 much. And as you may or may not remember, each of
24 us represent a segment of the community. And so
25 the Native American, of course, is represented by

1 Barbara, and I would hope that you would have your
2 acquaintances, friends, whatever, get in touch
3 with her, make known their desires. Barbara,
4 would you raise your hand? And she will then be
5 their mouthpiece, as it were. And, of course,
6 they are always welcome here at any time, as you
7 are, to make comments to the Committee.

8 Did we have another hand over here? This
9 gentleman? Did you want to speak?

10 MR. QUINNEL: Yes. My name is Scott
11 Quinnel, 464 West Fourth Street in San
12 Bernardino.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you.

14 MR. QUINNEL: And I am a biologist
15 with Caltrans, and I would like to be involved
16 with biological issues, maybe the biological
17 subcommittee as it relates to Highway 74, because
18 we have some projects that we are working on along
19 the 74, and so just working on those issues as
20 they relate to the Monument Plan would be a
21 good --

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And, again, if you'd
23 please address a letter to Danella, as our boss
24 person here, give her your name, address, and your
25 interest in the committee you would like to be

1 informed about, and we'd love to have you at those
2 committee meetings. That would be great.

3 Are there any other comments of the
4 public?

5 Can't quite close the public input
6 session, because it's two more minutes, but any
7 comments from the Board -- or Committee members?
8 Yes?

9 MS. HENDERSON: Can we ask questions
10 of some comments that we heard?

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Certainly.

12 MS. HENDERSON: I would like to
13 address a question to that gentleman. I am
14 sorry. I didn't write your name down.

15 MR. RASMUSSEN: Glen Rasmussen.

16 MS. HENDERSON: Glen? I did not quite
17 understand what the -- I think he said that they
18 had three and a half square miles of property. Is
19 that a reserve property? Is it private ownership
20 and people are living there and not developing the
21 land? Or can you let me know a little more about
22 the three and a half square miles?

23 MR. RASMUSSEN: Sure. Andreas Canyon
24 Club is a nonprofit organization. We have owned
25 that property up there for several generations.

1 The memberships are passed down from father to son
2 or mother to daughter as the case may be.

3 My grandfather was an original member,
4 Chief Andreas. What were your other questions?

5 MS. HENDERSON: So you folks live on
6 the property and maintain it in its natural
7 state?

8 MR. RASMUSSEN: We have vacation
9 cabins. We don't have any electricity up there.
10 So we can't run air-conditioners or live up there
11 in the summertime. But we have cabins that are
12 rock-faced. They are designed to -- they are
13 actually designed after Cahuilla houses. The most
14 active use is in the springtime and in the fall.

15 MS. HENDERSON: Thank you.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Terry, it's one of
17 the most unique areas in our desert, and if you
18 are real nice to Glen, maybe he'd take you up
19 there and show you around, because it's really
20 something to see. They've got something to be
21 proud of up there. It's great.

22 Any other Committee comments?

23 MR. BOGERT: I'd like to ask this guy
24 from Stone Creek, do you actually want people
25 coming in that road? I thought you were trying to

1 keep people out of there.

2 MR. STARKS: Well, I mean, that is all
3 in the National Monument, and what I was
4 suggesting was a scenic turnout on Highway 111,
5 because people coming off of the Freeway 10 are
6 driving so fast, they drive right past one of the
7 most beautiful areas in the whole Monument without
8 ever being able to slow down and see it because
9 the cars behind them are going so fast.

10 So if there was a turnout, you know,
11 people could stop and look, take a picture of the
12 waterfall --

13 MR. BOGERT: But you don't want them
14 climbing on up?

15 MR. STARKS: Well, I think that will
16 be inevitable on Snow Creek Road, because that is
17 part of the Monument. Now, Snow Creek Village,
18 that's another -- that would be another story, you
19 know, because that is private property.

20 MR. BOGERT: I see people going in
21 there and they say, "Get the hell out of here. We
22 don't want you in there."

23 MR. STARKS: But it's perfectly legal
24 to park on Snow Creek Road and go hiking, because
25 that's a Pacific Crest Trail access.

1 MR. BOGERT: Thank you.

2 MR. CRITES: I was just going to add,
3 Frank, one of the issues that the Conservancy has
4 been looking at is how do we find a place in that
5 area for public parking, for access, for trail
6 head development so that folks aren't into the
7 village, wandering where they shouldn't be and all
8 the rest of that.

9 MR. STARKS: That's the problem now,
10 because people don't realize where they can
11 legally hike, because the property is so divided.
12 There's Bureau of Land Management. There's
13 private property. And so it's just kind of
14 confusing at this point.

15 MS. CADY: Signs should be posted.

16 MR. CRITES: All in the BLM time
17 frame.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: The public hearing
19 is now closed.

20 Any other comment from the Committee?
21 Has each Committee member handed in their
22 questionnaire? I see Buford hasn't yet. If you'd
23 hold them out, staff will come by and pick them
24 up, make sure that we have those.

25 Committee members, public, thank you very
285

1 much. We are just going to do some things like
2 filling out claims and so on. Thank you very
3 much. We appreciate it.

4 Committee members, we need to officially
5 adjourn this meeting.

6 MR. CRITES: So moved.

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's Buford
8 Crites.

9 Do we have a second?

10 MR. BROCKMAN: Second.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And Bob Brockman, a
12 second. The meeting is adjourned. Thank you,
13 Diane.

14 MR. IDEKER: Folks, as you are filling
15 out your forms and packing your bags, on behalf of
16 the various federal agencies, the State Parks
17 system, the state agencies that have been here
18 today, congratulations again, both on your
19 appointment but on surviving your first meeting.
20 May this be the beginning of a great adventure.

21 Looking at all of the various expertise
22 we have sitting on this Committee, I know that I,
23 as a resident of the Valley and a person who gets
24 to wake up every morning and look at the Monument,
25 feel pretty secure that this is going to be an

1 open process, a well informed process, and the
2 results are going to be great.

3 You know your staff contacts. In terms
4 of BLM, in terms of the Forest Service, the people
5 who are on the front lines of this effort, again,
6 I encourage you if you know some -- some reports
7 that we should try and look for, if we don't have
8 them, please put them on that sheet before you
9 leave. You can be assured of hearing from your
10 new BLM federal partners, the Monument Team on the
11 agency side soon with reams of paper and
12 information about your next opportunity to get
13 together.

14 For the public who came in late, but
15 especially for those who showed up at 8:30 and
16 have been here all day, it's good to have people
17 in the audience. Thank you on behalf of the
18 Committee.

19 It's time to go home. Diane's fingers
20 are sore. And we are done for today.

21 Thank you all very much.

22 (Meeting adjourned at 4:05 p.m.)

23 -o0o-

24 (All minutes and submitted written
25 comments available for review during office hours

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 07:45 - 16:30 Monday through Friday at BLM Palm
2 Springs/South Coast Field Office, P.O. Box 581260,
3 690 West Garnet Avenue, North Palm Springs, CA
4 92258; 760-251-4800)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25