

From: Bowman, Randal
To: [Kaiini Kaloi](#)
Subject: Fwd: Question on Tribal comments on monument review
Date: Monday, July 17, 2017 1:50:52 PM

FYI - 2 apparently Native Hawaiian comments sent to BIA on the monument review; middle comment is not on a marine monument

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Appel, Elizabeth <elizabeth.appel@bia.gov>
Date: Mon, Jul 17, 2017 at 1:34 PM
Subject: Re: Question on Tribal comments on monument review
To: "Begay, Amanda" <amanda.begay@bia.gov>
Cc: "Bowman, Randal" <randal_bowman@ios.doi.gov>, Anthony Rodman <anthony.rodman@bia.gov>

Hi Randy-

I was putting the finishing touches on our comment summary and noticed we had comments regarding 3 specific monuments that appear to be marine monuments. They are:

Gillespie, John Opposes the Monument status of the **Northwest Hawaiian Island Hoomalu Zone**. "My operations suffered the institution of monument status...I, one of 5 limited entry permit holders were displaced from valuable bottomfish in this region without compensation. This has had devastating effects on the fishing community and individuals..."

Jay Levy I support keeping **Kathadin Waters Memorial**, which is under review even though it's under a hundred thousand acres. We need to respect each other and each other's culture, especially with respect to the land.

Trask, Mililani Request for DOI to support the repeal of the **Northwest Hawaiian Island Papahānaumoku Monument**. "The Monument and its expansion diminished the boundaries of the State of Hawaii by hundreds of thousands of nautical miles....eradicated 2/3ds of our State EEZ and significantly imputed our State's economic income...our State Constitution provides that native Hawaiians have a right to access our State lands for cultural purposes, but the Monument regulations fail to provide a process for the exercise of cultural subsistence fishing or voyaging."

I will send you the full comment summary shortly.

Thanks!
Liz

On Mon, Jul 17, 2017 at 8:15 AM, Begay, Amanda <amanda.begay@bia.gov> wrote:
Hi Randy -

We haven't received any comments for any of the marine monuments. During the

Connecticut listening session, an individual expressed interest in submitting comments but did not provide any at that time. Please let me know if you have any questions!

Thank you!
Amanda

On Fri, Jul 14, 2017 at 8:56 AM, Appel, Elizabeth <elizabeth.appel@bia.gov> wrote:
Hi Randy-

I don't think so, but Amanda, on my team, who is finalizing the comment summaries will know for sure. She's out today, but should be able to get you an answer Monday.

Thanks!
Liz

On Fri, Jul 14, 2017 at 8:54 AM, Bowman, Randal <randal_bowman@ios.doi.gov> wrote:

Did any of the Tribal comments mention any of the marine monuments? If so, I would like to get a copy to provide to NOAA for use in their review process.

--

Elizabeth K. Appel
Office of Regulatory Affairs & Collaborative Action
Office of the Assistant Secretary - Indian Affairs
(202) 273-4680 - office
(202) 738-6065 - cell

--

Amanda Begay
Office of Regulatory Affairs & Collaborative Action
Office of the Assistant Secretary - Indian Affairs
U.S. Department of the Interior
Phone: (703) 390-6758

--

Elizabeth K. Appel
Office of Regulatory Affairs & Collaborative Action
Office of the Assistant Secretary - Indian Affairs
(202) 273-4680 - office
(202) 738-6065 - cell