

# Mojave-Southern Great Basin Resource Advisory Council Meeting Minutes

Thursday, September 22, 2016

Nye County Commission Chambers, 2100 E. Walt Williams Dr., Pahrump, Nevada

**RECEIVED** 

Ely, NV

# Resource Advisory Council members present and category represented:

•		
Susan Agee	Grazing/Ranching	Category 1
Douglas Baker	Transportation/Rights-of-Way	Category 1
Daryl Folks	Permitted Recreation	Category 1
Jason Higgins (RAC Chair)	Energy/Mineral Development	Category 1
John Hiatt	Environment	Category 2
Tara Kilpatrick	Wild Horse and Burro	Category 2
George Phillips	Archaeology/Historic	Category 2
Elise McAllister	Dispersed Recreation	Category 2
John Lee	Elected Official	Category 3
Stanley Smith	Academic/UNLV	Category 3

## Resource Advisory Council members absent and category represented:

John Zohlooki	F	<i>a</i>
John Zablocki	Environment/Wildlife	Category 2
Paul Mathews	Public at Large	Category 3
Annette George	Native American	Category 3
Stephanie Garcia-Vause (RAC vice-Chair)	Transportation/Rights-of-Way	Category 1

# Bureau of Land Management (BLM) representatives present:

Dareau of Land Management (DLM) representatives present.			
Tim Smith	BLM Southern Nevada District, District Manager		
Tim Coward	BLM Tonopah Field Manager		
Catrina Williams	BLM Red Rock/Sloan, Field Manager		
Chris Hanefeld	BLM Ely District Public Affairs Specialist		
Vivian Browning	BLM Las Vegas Field Office, Realty Specialist		
Deborah McNeil	BLM Pahrump Field Office, Field Manager		
Chris Carlton	BLM Caliente Field Office Field Manager		
Tabitha Ramero	BLM Pahrump Field Office, Wild Horse & Burro		
Shane Nalen	BLM Southern Nevada District Office, Supervisory		
	Ranger		

### **Public:**

Ed Goedhart, Private Citizen

Daria Bokolona, Pahrump Valley Times

Julie Von Tobel Gleason, American Mustang and Burro Association

Bill Lamb, QuadState

Tom Walters, Private Citizen, Pahrump

Mike Zaman, Pahrump Valley 4 Wheelers

Victor Queutes, Ministerio, Patch of Heaven Camp

Wade Hinden, Private Citizen

Dale Livingston, Private Citizen

Robert Adams, Private Citizen

Laura Cunningham, Private Citizen, Beatty

Eddie Jim, Private Citizen, Pahrump

David Kilpatrick, Private Citizen

A copy of each attachment is listed in the text of or at the end of these minutes and is also on file with the official copy of the minutes in the Ely District Office of the BLM. Persons desiring to review said minutes should contact Chris Hanefeld, public affairs specialist, at (775) 289-1842.

10:00 a.m. Jason Higgins, Mojave-Southern Great Basin Resource Advisory Council (RAC) chairperson, called the meeting to order and conducted introductions

Tim Smith announced Chris Hanefeld will be stepping down as the RAC coordinator and Kirsten Cannon, Public Affairs Officer, Southern Nevada District Office, will be filling the position.

- 10:05 a.m. Review and approve July/August meeting minutes. All members approved the minutes.
- 10:11 a.m. Recreational (target) shooting on public lands presentation by Shane Nalen, Supervisory Ranger. Handouts were provided (see Attachment 1). Presentation included issues related to target shooting on public lands,
  - ➤ Target shooting continues to be an issue as the population increases particularly in the Las Vegas area. There is a direct correlation with population size and the issues that come about from the amount of people that target shoot on public lands.
  - ➤ Have had more incidents regarding safety, in terms of people not being responsible and causing injury to others.
  - > Have had issues with wildland fires as a result of shooting.
    - Lovell Canyon fire is the most recent example. Over 500 acres affected by the fire.
    - Other fires have occurred down south of Gamebird Rd and in the Spring Mountain Range.
  - ➤ Within the Pahrump Valley, there are about a dozen established target shooting sites. The roads that go up the mountains (Wheeler Pass, Carpenter Canyon Rd, Trout Canyon Rd, and Roadrunner Rd) have had shooting areas established off of those roads. These are popular areas.
    - Within these shooting areas, there are environmental and wildlife issues due to dumping, driving and crushing vegetation.
  - ➤ Within the Pahrump area, the biggest issue area is off of Bell Vista. This is a really popular area and one of the most used areas for shooting. Some of the issues in this area were and are:
    - Stolen and abandon vehicles being dumped at this site
    - Lots of accidents as a result of target shooting
  - > Today the large refuse at the Bell Vista shooting area has been disposed of but there continues to be issues with trash and accidents.
  - > There are private citizens that do go out to the shooting range and clean up the area, which has been very helpful. Today, only about two private citizens clean up the area.
  - ➤ In the Las Vegas Valley are similar areas to the Bell Vista site, that get heavier use due to the size of the population.
  - ➤ One of the biggest things we can do to help with these issues, is to have the public get involved by picking up their targets and possibly other targets while they are at this shooting areas.
  - > Currently, Rangers are handing out bags that have the "Don't Trash Nevada" campaign on them and asking shooters to cleanup what they brought out and to

possibly clean up more trash in addition to what they brought out. This has been done in an effort to clean up the area.

### -Discussions-

John Hiatt-The Forest Service (FS) has indicated that there are problems with shooting within its jurisdiction. Part of their effort is to standardize targets, they are going to allow only things such a paper targets, because one of the biggest problems is the littering that is left as a result of using informal targets (televisions, computers). Is the Bureau of Land Management (BLM) aware of this new FS initiative within the Spring Mountains and if so is the BLM considering a similar policy?

Shane Nalen- We are not aware of the FS initiative, the BLM is not in the business of dictating the types of targets people use. The use of paper targets and only paper targets is what is set up for target shooters and probably about 99% of target shooters utilizes the paper targets. It does become an issue when things outside of the paper targets are utilized.

Daryl Folks- Why would FS have the ability to dictate what targets are used and BLM does not?

John Hiatt-FS has not said they would dictate what targets are used, they are trying to get people to agree to use certain targets, paper targets. It is more education.

Shane Nalen- Educating the public is what the BLM tries to do when we are out with the public. The BLM encourages the use of paper targets.

Daryl Folks- It is great that BLM is doing these initiatives. These areas are a mess and it unbelievable the things that are going on in these shooting areas. How often do Rangers go into these areas?

Shane Nalen-We go to these areas every day. There are so many target areas and the amount of land area that BLM Rangers have to cover is very large; so it makes it hard to get to all the target sites every day. There are other issues that come up that have to be addressed.

- Also if you want to catch the criminal activity you have to sit and wait, watch and see what is going on.
  - The primary mission as a Land Management Officer, Conservation Officer is to make sure the public is acting responsibly on public lands.
    - Each shooter needs to take personal responsibility in the recreational activity.
  - Cost the government over \$1,000 dollars to cleanup T.V. debris. This is a hazardous material site.

Jason Higgins- To my knowledge the Bell Vista is not an official shooting range and is more of just a long standing place where people go shooting, is that correct?

Shane Nalen-Yes, that is correct. The Bell Vista shooting range is a term that most residence use in the valley; it has not been sanctified by the BLM.

Jason Higgins- In these areas the public considers shooting ranges, is BLM putting any signage in these areas that would reflect the items that are listed on the back of the cards

you handed out (see Attachment 1) that would encourage the public to clean up after themselves?

Shane Nalen-BLM has put out two signs in these areas, they are:

- 1. No dumping
- 2. Clean up targets, bring out what you bring in

There are no signs stating it is a shooting range.

George Phillips- The growth of the area around Sloan is there some assistance that BLM needs, do you have any suggestions?

Shane Nalen- The BLM has a desert cleanup coordinator, that is part of the Great Basin Institute, and they work directly for the BLM.

- The Cleanup Coordinator's main source of help to cleanup these areas are volunteers.
- BLM encourages members of the public that would like to help cleanup these sights to contact the Desert Cleanup Coordinator.
- These areas are getting worse over time, they will be cleaned up and within months they look the same as they did prior to cleanup.
- Within the Pahrump valley, about 98% of the public is responsible and does cleanup. It is the other 2% that cause problems.

Elise McAllister- Do volunteers have to have any special training (i.e. lead, Hazardous Materials)?

Shane Nalen-BLM's Desert Cleanup does take those concerns into consideration. All volunteers have to sign a volunteer agreement when they go out to any site to volunteer. During cleanup, water is handed out, leather gloves and other safety materials to keep volunteers safe. If the site is deemed unsafe for juveniles then that would be taken into consideration.

John Lee- Clark County has non-traditional shooting ranges and a study was done that showed people only traveled 30 minutes away from their home to go shooting.

• A committee was formed and we were able to get Harry Reid to help with providing public lands and funds to build the shooting range in Las Vegas.

Shane Nalen- We encourage Commissioners from Nye County to engage the BLM to look at areas to have these shooting ranges.

• There is one area off of Carpenter Canyon Road that there are groups that go to shoot, but outside of that there are no shooting ranges. With the number of people in Pahrump that are engaged in the activity it would be appropriate to have a shooting range like the one in Las Vegas.

John Lee- We have a template to develop a shooting range and we can share our experiences with Nye County.

Shane Nalen- There are lots of gun ranges within the Las Vegas Valley that the population goes to and enjoys, but outside of that there is still parts of the population that:

- 1. Does not want to pay to shoot
- 2. Feels it is a family event and wants to just go out

Even with a designated shooting range, there is still a portion of the population, as evident with Las Vegas, will still go out and shoot in other places.

John Hiatt- Over 2 million dollars was spent building the shooting range to eliminate these problems and still the problem has gotten worse.

- The people that are going to the designated range are not the same people going out and shooting bottles.
- While it may be a worthwhile effort to get a designated shooting range that is regulated, the problem of random recreational shooting on public lands that are leaving a residue of lead, mercury, and other contaminants.
- Education is needed and more Law Enforcement presents.
- There is also a relatively new sign near Sloan and is a result of the no shooting boundary around Las Vegas that has moved those people further out of town, which created a new shooting area off of the old Las Vegas Blvd.
  - No one has addressed the safety issue
  - Vegetation has been shot off the low hills; some of the bullets go right out into the I15.

Shane Nalen- Have had multiple instances where the BLM has had to backup Metro off of state route 604, because there was a crime scene around a shooting area; Metro asked BLM to keep target shooters away because it is endangering the officers' lives.

John Hiatt- There is serious issues that need to be addressed such as:

- 1. Littering- antilittering campaign can be started to let people know what is acceptable and not acceptable.
- 2. Safety

Shane Nalen- As a Law Enforcement officer, education is a huge piece of fixing the problem.

John Hiatt- John Burpee, Superintendent of National Park Service for the Tule Springs National Monument, was talking about how he has been out at the fossil bed area with maps directing people on where to go on public lands under BLM jurisdiction to shoot.

Tara Kilpatrick- Starting in 2006, there has been an issue with people shooting at the Wilson Springs water tanks.

- The wells are having to be repaired regularly due to the public shooting holes in it.
- Water that is for wildlife is draining out the holes caused by shooting.

Shane Nalen-That element is going to be out there.

- Unless Law Enforcement is out there, it is going to happen.
- Law enforcement will help and working operations out there.
- Roads provide more access to these areas, which in turn bring people out to these
  areas.

Elise McAllister- Last October the Clark County Commissioner passed an ordinance that made it illegal to shoot within 20 ft. of any road. Getting the word out about this ordinance can help.

- In the rural communities there are people who do not want to drive to designated ranges since they have been shooting at non-designated ranges. These people are not being destructive; they just do not want to drive long distances.
- A couple of years ago, the communities looked into the possibility of getting it in the RMP for a shooting area; the problem is insurance and liability with shooting ranges.

Shane Nalen- Clark County ordinances in theory are good, but there is not enough law enforcement.

- BLM Law Enforcement can't enforce it as they are not deputized.
- Roads have to be recognized by the county- RS2477 roads can be enforced.

Elise McAllister- We could ask the County Commissioners to post signs in those areas where the roads are recognized.

Jason Higgins- In 1947 RS2477 roads were claimed by the county. Susan Agee- Has anyone done a cost benefit analysis of opening up a free range?

• If people are going to shoot it would be good to have a specific area for them to shoot.

Shane Nalen- That would be a Recreation Staff question, but that would not be something that the BLM would do; opening up a free range.

• That would have to come from the County or entity within the area.

Commissioner Dan Schinhofen- The Bell Vista shooting range did not make it on the last RMP. It is high on the list for disposal so that it can be made a shooting range.

 Would like to discuss the process with Mayor John Lee (how to get the land designated and money to build the range) on how to make it a legal area to shoot.

Jason Higgins- How many officers does BLM have and how much area do you have to cover on a daily basis?

Shane Nalen- The BLM is slated to have 17 officers, but currently there are only 9.

Jason Higgins- What can the RAC do to help?

Shane Nalen- Volunteerism, any avenues that you have to help with that, any groups that you know that would like to get engaged with volunteer work, and the BLM Desert Cleanup Coordinator, Ms. Pringle.

Tim Smith- With regards to the area covered, the BLM manages about 3.1 million acres with currently 9 Rangers.

• BLM Rangers are educators and enforcers in everything the BLM does.

Shane Nalen- A lot of the crimes we deal with, we find that we are dealing with the same people the Sheriff's office is dealing with.

 Rangers spend a lot of their time tracking down dumping suspects, which could lead to other crimes. Tim Smith- The BLM would be willing to have our Chief Ranger give a presentation on the historical piece of Law Enforcement and how it has evolved.

11:16 a.m.

### -Discussions-

Susan Agee- Each RAC develops its own standards and guidelines for grazing; the current standards are dated 2006. There is a request to revisit the standards, guidelines, and reporting forms for grazing.

- There is language that needs to be defined more clearly and it overall just needs to be cleaned-up along with the recording form.
  - The form only has grazing and non-grazing as options and does not specify whether it is horses, livestock, or what type of wildlife.

Elise McAllister- Does this need to be done in a subcommittee meeting?

Susan Agee- It could either be done by a subcommittee or the RAC.

Elise McAllister- The OHV guidelines should be done too, as they are from 2004.

Tim Smith- In other RACs, the grazing standards and guidelines have typically been done by subcommittee.

• Encourage the RAC look at forming a subcommittee to revise the standards, guidelines, and forms.

Stanley Smith- The original standards and guidelines were put together by the RAC in this region.

Susan Agee- Should there be a motion for a subcommittee for OHV and a subcommittee for grazing?

Jason Higgins- OHV could fall under the current Recreation Subcommittee.

Elise McAllister- The Recreation Subcommittee originally started out as OHV and then it was changed to recreation; so it could be done by Recreation.

Jason Higgins- For the grazing, could that fall under the Planning subcommittee or is it too lengthy for the Planning subcommittee to tackle?

Susan Agee- Not sure if it could fall under the Planning committee, Stephanie Garcia-Vause might be able to tell us for sure.

Jason Higgins- Stanley Smith, as you were involved in the original standards and guidelines what are your thoughts?

Stanley Smith- I was not involved in the 2006 updating of the standards and guidelines.

• Another option is a statewide grazing subcommittee.

Jason Higgins- It sounds like the grazing standards and guidelines might warrant its own subcommittee. Is there a motion to form a subcommittee?

Susan Agee- I motion to create a subcommittee for the purpose of updating and clarifying the standards and guidelines as well as the reporting forms.

Elise McAllister- I second the motion.

All members of the RAC favored the motion, there was no opposing, and the motion was carried.

Jason Higgins- The RAC will now appoint a Chair and Vice Chair and have meeting set up prior to next year's Tri-RAC.

• Call for nominations for Chair

Elise McAllister- I nominate Susan Agee.

No other nomination were made, Susan Agee accepted the nomination, and is now Chair of the Grazing Subcommittee that will update and clarify the standards, guidelines and reporting forms.

Jason Higgins- Call for nominations for Vice Chair.

John Hiatt- I nominate Stanley Smith for Vice Chair.

Daryl Folks-I second the nomination.

Jason Higgins- Stanley Smith do you accept the nomination for Vice Chair?

Stanley Smith- I would rather wait, I have a really time consuming job. I would be happy to participate, but I do not know what that entails.

Jason Higgins- You would act as the Chair when they are not available and set the agenda. I will take your response as a no.

• Nomination for John Hiatt as Vice Chair do I have a second motion.

Elise McAllister- I second the motion.

Jason Higgins- John Hiatt do you accept the nomination as Vice Chair?

John Hiatt accepted the nomination as Vice Chair of the Grazing Subcommittee that will update and clarify the standards, guidelines and reporting forms.

11:25 a.m.

# District Updates

BLM Southern Nevada District

Timothy Smith, Manager, BLM Southern Nevada District- (see attachment 2)

- National Public Lands Day (NPL) the Southern Nevada District will be holding three events this year.
  - September 17, 2016 at Sloan Canyon National Conservation Area a group of 30 volunteers helped to restore unauthorized routes.
  - September 24, 2016, at Red Rock Canyon National Conservation Area, volunteers will assist in the installation of hiking trail signs, hiking trail maintenance, and restoration along the 13 mile loop.

- On September 24, 2016, at Logandale Trails, volunteers will help with restoration of areas, restoration of the shade structures, installation of signs for trailhead, cleaning existing fire rings and protecting vegetation with natural items such as rocks.
- August 31, BLM awarded 30 million dollars for projects to reduce wildfires in Reno-Tahoe area; approved through SNPLMA.
- The eight projects are funded under the authority of SNPLMA and are to reduce hazardous fuels and prevent wildfires in the Lake Tahoe Basin and surrounding areas (Lincoln, White Pine, and Carson County)
- ➤ Gold Butte Re-engagement meetings have been attended by BLM since June of 2016. Met with Clark County, Moapa Band of Paiutes, Moapa Valley, City of Mesquite, Bunkerville Town Board and many others. All meetings have been high value and focused on ground work in the areas to include ROW, and land use authorizations.
  - During meetings there were discussions on whether the areas would be a national monument; those decisions are made at Washington.
  - Will have additional meetings regarding emergency services within the Gold Butte area and the next meeting will be in early October.
- National Test and Training Range (NTTR) withdrawal is currently being worked on in cooperation with the Air Force; this will extend the withdrawal for another 20 yrs. Most of the land under the NTTR is public lands that have been withdrawn to the Air Force.
  - The Air Force is looking to expand the withdrawal and that would include a large portion of the Desert National Wildlife Refuge.
  - There is also an area within the proposed expansion that would include a portion of an energy transmission corridor, the current Vegas to Reno Off-Highway race course, and proposed mountain bike and hiking trails in the Beatty area.
  - Public meetings will be held by the Air Force (see attachment 2)
- ➤ In November, the BLM is proposing to sell 16 parcels totaling 182.93 acres of public land. It will take place at the Clark County Commission Chambers.
- ➤ September 21, 2016, BLM met with Metro regarding search and rescue at Red Rock National Conservation Area (RRNCA). RRNCA accounts for about 80 % of Metro's search and rescue operations. Currently, BLM is working with Metro on a Memorandum of Understanding that pertains to Law Enforcement and Search and Rescue activities.
- ➤ Sloan Contact Station will be opening daily starting October 1, 2016.

## -Discussion-

Jason Higgins- What kinds of communication capabilities currently exist out there, are there cell phone towers or radio repeaters?

Tim Smith- There is one repeater and that is on Virgin Peak which is only used by fire and law enforcement. There are some places that cell phone coverage is spotty and other areas there is no cell coverage.

Stanley Smith-Would the withdrawal to the Air Force preclude public access to these areas?

Tim Smith-If the area is withdrawn to the Air Force then it would preclude public access.

John Hiatt- Is the \$30 million dollars from SNPLMA in addition to the \$300 million dollars that was provided to the Tahoe area, and is it only for that area?

Tim Smith- The \$30 million dollars is in addition to the \$300 million dollars and is only for that area and is the prescribed fire piece of SNPLMA (see attachment 2).

## 11:42 a.m. Public Comment

Herman Lewis- Thank you to the BLM for being here today, because the last time the BLM was scheduled to be out here at the Bob Rudd Center the BLM did not show up.

- It is very important that the BLM come out to the communities and hear what the communities have to say. There are a lot of members of the communities that are not ambulatory and therefore are unable to come to the meetings; but they do listen to those of use that do come to the meetings.
- When BLM uses so many acronyms and codes, it is very difficult for a lot of the
  public to know what the BLM is talking about; so we ask that before the BLM
  discusses something or uses any acronyms if they could explain what it is. This
  would help the public to understand.
- It is wonderful to have Shane Nalen from the BLM out here, because he is a community based person and we can build a relationship with him. I state this because as you know that the Pahrump and Nye County rural residence do not have a good relationship with BLM.
- BLM is, as public servants, here to help give back and are like the janitors and cleaning crew of the lands. With BLM's enormous budget, BLM should put money aside (Shane mentioned the money comes from the State, I do not think the money comes from the State of Nevada it comes from the Federal Government) for cleanup and work with members of the community.
- You also stated the government has to pay for things; I disagree, the government does not pay for anything, we the people pay for it. We fund you so that you can be the janitors of the public lands. This is not disrespect because we all do janitorial things at home and clean up.
- If you reach out more to the public, you will get more people to show up and we can work together.
- The biggest thing you will find moving forward is you have a lot of the rural communities, like Pahrump, distrusting the BLM and the Federal government, and one of the reasons is we feel tremendous arrogance from you. It is like you are our masters and we are your slaves and it is not that way at all, it is the other way around.
- If we could have a more open dialog and more respect and explain to us what those acronyms are, so we can go look them up and we know what they are and we can do a better job of turning out in bigger numbers.
- With regards to shooting- in every society that has not had the ability to own fire arms and be able to have self-defense, the government has turn totalitarian and over run the people. There is a person you might want to look up named John Lott he wrote a book called "More Guns Less Crime" and he did statistical research and a survey from 1950 to 2010 and he found there were no mass

shootings in places where guns are allowed. The only places that those types of instances happened were in gun free zones.

Jason Higgins- Thank you for your comments. Also, for clarification so you know and understand what where are as an organization, we are a Resource Advisory Council (RAC) appointed to our positions and serving in a volunteer capacity. All of us are private citizens too, and we work as volunteers to advise the BLM on issues. So as the community comes forward and brings issues to us, we can work as a group from all walks of life and uses of public lands. We are your partners in this too.

Herman Lewis- Thank you for that, that is what we need; but here is the thing I am very active, I come to the Commissioner meetings, the water board meeting and we need this interaction between us and I did not know who you were. If I do not know and I am very active in the community, think of all the other people that do not know who you are either.

- Maybe we can reach out to the media; we have the Pahrump Valley Times here today, and get a little bit more media exposure.
- Betsy Lilly also suggested getting social media going, get a Face Book page so we can reach out and work together because we have to work together, we are not enemies with each other.

Jason Higgins- The RAC is listed on the BLM website, as far as who our members are and what we do as a RAC. It is under the "Get Involved" tab on the left side of the BLM website.

Dwight Lilly- I came down from Spokane, Washington, two days ago in order to make the meeting because of the talk about destroying, what is labeled as Wild Horses and Wild Burros. The words wild horse and wild burro is a misnomer in itself.

- All wildlife including human beings are just life sharing the planet.
- The thought of destroying animals because of the management criteria that somebody in Washington D.C. comes up does not sit right with me or with a lot of the people I talked with.
- The animals are part of nature and nature itself increases populations and decreases populations dependent upon the conditions. Years ago I would travel across Wyoming and Montana in the rural areas and I would notice that when there were a few mild winters the wildlife would increase and when it was a hard one you would see nothing but dead wild animals along the roads. That is the way nature is.
- With regards to resource management, I would like an emphasis to be on allowing nature to be what it is.
- Words have meaning-
  - When I hear someone mention that that it is BLM's land, that is not the BLM's land, it is my land and your land and public land that we all have a right to go to.
  - When I hear words such as lead and mercury tossed out, that is a code word for someone wanting to control guns. We have had a lot of lead and mercury thrown around during the Civil War and Revolutionary War; nobody has gone out and picked up any musket balls or mercury associated with that or anything that was associated with making the

- ammunition. This is just the way it is; it is part of the interaction with each other and the planet itself.
- We used to have a public shooting range in Pahrump that the Wolfenstein Company provided, until there were individuals that messed it up by shooting at a gravel pit. I would think that if you wanted to save resource money and properly manage that resource, you would take and put some berms in the public shooting areas and have it managed that way rather than have people shooting over the top of other people's heads. That is a safety issue.
- I would like to see my fellow citizens come together and maybe form a subcommittee where we could take some resource money from the BLM, they say they want to manage our land then give use some money to manage it, to put in berms and an actual focused effort to have fire arms. This money would also increase the budget for the local county if people new that we had managed areas in the county, where people could go and it was safe.
  - The BLM already does this with Dumont Dunes, another recreation area that they have agreed to spend money and devote resources to.
- I would like to have you look at managing the lands for the public and not the BLM. The BLM is just an agency.

Jason Higgins- The RAC traditionally tries to move the meetings around Southern Nevada, as this is the area that we represent. It runs from Tonopah to Ely and everything south. Meetings have been done in Caliente, Ely, Beatty, and Las Vegas. If you can't make a meeting and would like to get your comments in for the record you can always send an email in and they will be read into the meeting for the record.

Diane Johnson- My main concern is with the BLM management of the mustangs, they use the term euthanasia.

- Euthanasia, depending on whom you are talking to, could be anything from humanly administered by a veterinarian, a bullet to the head, or the misconception that slaughter is euthanasia.
- Anyone who thinks that slaughter is a form of euthanasia should go to any public
  auction; any livestock place, and go behind the shoots to see what happens. I
  have seen the horrors that go on back there. I have seen the abuse. I have seen
  horses ripped open and left to die. Is this how we want our mustangs treated in
  the name of being humanly euthanized? It is not how I want it.
- If the BLM is going to use the term euthanasia, I want to know in what definition.
- With regards to the shooting range, I agree with what Mr. Lilly was saying except if there is a properly set up and maintain shooting range, I really think it would be in our best interest to have a place where people can go to learn how to shoot a gun properly than having a person just out popping shots because they want to play with a gun and do not have a place to do it.

Edwin Goedheart-I have lived in Armargosa Valley since 1986, and have gone through the BLM disposal process and was part of the group that was the only one in almost a half of a century that was able to get a piece of ground rustled from the BLM at fair market value.

- I had to go through a lot of hoops and hurdles even though there is currently in the Resource Management Plan (RMP) about 20 thousand acres slated for disposal in Armargosa valley.
- It took the BLM Archeological study, Minerals study, Vegetation study, a Desert Tortoise study, Artifact study and all the rest in order to get the land, but in Las Vegas if there is a piece of land that goes up for disposal all you have to do is a letter of concurrence and the biggest check and you can by that ground subject to the terms and conditions of the local planning process and local jurisdictions.
- In Armargosa valley they have not done any basin wide studies so any parcel of ground that you want to buy you have to go ahead and reach out and get all the people to go ahead and pay for all those studies.
  - Then it goes to a BLM selected appraisers and you still have to pay fair market value.
  - Many times one is going to be paying 3 to 4 times the value of the land by the time you figure in all the different fees for all the studies.
- Currently, I have a piece of land that is L-shaped and has wheel line sprinklers, with wheel line sprinklers as they start to chatter through the air a lot of the water gets lost to the low humidity and high winds and moister.
  - The best most efficient method is the low drop sprinkler method. So I made an application that falls on both sides of the BLM parcel that was slated for disposal.
  - I put a pivot on and I would not put any more acres under production, I would keep the acreage the same and lose the acres in the corners, but the land I would farm, I would be putting the water to a lot better more efficient use.
  - Went through the process with the BLM and they said it is probably going to take \$50-\$60 thousand dollars to do all the studies to see whether or not it is eligible for disposal, even though it is slated for disposal, they wanted to make sure it is still suitable for disposal.
  - I asked if I would have a modified competitive bid and the BLM said no, it would go to the highest person.
  - I asked if I lose it by \$1 dollar does that person that bought it reimburse me for the cost of the studies and BLM said no.
  - I asked what if it is found not suitable for disposal do I get my money back and the BLM said no.
  - I decided to go through with the process and the BLM said they did not have the money to process the application, I asked if I could pay the BLM extra staff time and they said they would have to have over time because they do not have enough staff. I then asked if I could pay the BLM staff time-and-a-half overtime so they could do the studies and the BLM said no they could not do it at this point in time.
- When things are in the RMP and are shown as eligible for disposal in the real world it does not happen in places like Armargosa Valley.
- The cumulative impacts of those types of actions are no economic activity in these areas. There is a very disadvantaged socioeconomic population. I am trying to generate big business to come in on good size projects with good paying jobs, the over preponderance of BLM controlled land is a real detriment to current and future economic viability of the community.
- Over the last 20 years the community is worse off today than it was 20 years ago. Today, in Armargosa valley there is less ground that is owned by private

individuals then there was 20 years ago, because the BLM has taken the Southern Nevada Public Land Management Act (SNPLMA) money and used it to buy environmentally sensitive land and have not opened up any compensatory ground to be put back on the tax roles to be owned by private individuals.

- There are a lot of hard working people in Armargosa whose dreams have been crushed because the bureaucracy that they have fought and lost.
- There was a lady who bought a piece of ground for her horses, in Armargosa because she could not afford it in Las Vegas, and the water rights and the movement of the water rights for a 1.5 acre portion of pasture was fought by the federal government and she died before her horse had the opportunity to be on the pasture.
- It is my wish and hope, the RMP process would allow for a few more opportunities for public input and maybe even take the time to drive around the valley. We would take the time to show the BLM what would benefit both parties.

Victor Quentes- I came to the valley in 2004, and through the help and donation of many beautiful people in Pahrump, I was able to a buy 40 acre parcel in Ash Meadows for half a million dollars.

- I hear the name BLM and since I came to the valley, I have never heard anything good about the BLM, everything is bad. They crush businesses; they stop people from buying land and being able to develop it.
- If you go to the website, you will see how many lawsuits BLM has against them. In every case, they have 12 attorneys against 1 attorney from the private person.
- Where does the money come from for these attorneys?
- In my church when we have an issue, we identify the problem; we do not just treat the symptom.
- In BLM's case, the problem is BLM itself. I think the agency needs to be eliminated, together with Forest Service (FS) and Fish and Wildlife Service (FWS).
- I have a lawsuit against FWS for 6 years now, because they stole my water. They have flooded me 3 times. Even when the State Engineer signed the order for our vested water rights. FWS has 7 attorneys against our 1 attorney.
- Where is the money coming from for the attorneys? We keep talking about resources.
- We need to pass a referendum in Nye County for the people of Nye County to vote to take BLM out of Nye County. The people will win if we do a referendum. The cancer is BLM, FWS, FS themselves.
- Just recently the FS destroyed the Trail of Tears in the Appalachian Mountains.
   The manager of the FS in that area retired after she did it, just like the manager of FWS retired after they took our water.
- We can deal with you guys; we do not need the BLM.
- The BLM sells our land down here and all the money goes to Washington D.C. They give us \$50 dollars and take \$1,000 dollars.
- We can do amazing things down here but the cancer; BLM, FS, FWS, needs to be eliminated.

Priscila Lane- I am glad to see they are cutting back on the helicopter gathers with the wild horses.

- The fatalities they have shown from the Calico Basin, one of the worst roundups the BLM ever did.
- BLM does have a bad reputation. BLM's people have been caught abusing, kicking, feeding, and torturing the horses and burros. We have pictures and audio of all your lies and your trust has gone out the window with the citizens.
- The BLM is leasing and selling our land and what are we getting in return?
- We are supposed to be in a drought and you are rounding up the horses due to the drought, but the grazing for cattle continues (which is probably about 4% that stays in the country) then why is that going?
- We don't have the water for you to be drilling, fracking and mining and all these things. Because when they use billions of gallons of water they cannot be used again.
- BLM has 45 thousand horses that you call euthanizing. What are you going to do now; you have been caught sneaking them out the back door to auctions and to slaughter.
  - Tom Davis up in Colorado was caught taking 1,800 horses for a year to slaughter under Secretary Salazar.
  - This in inhumane.
  - Now there are people out there cloning the mustangs...for what reason?
  - The BLM is killing something that is so historical to our country.
- I am glad that you guys are acting like you are listening. I went to one BLM meeting and they were up there sleeping, tossing their pencils, on their phones and just doing whatever; which was the rudest and inconsiderate thing they could have done.
- BLM needs to be held accountable for some of the things you have done and the roundups in the past.
- The BLM has so much control and it is ruining a lot of people who respect a lot of the things we do have. This is a great county and it has gone to hell-in-a-handbasket and if we do not get a handle on it, to include you guys, we are going to lose it all. All for a stupid cow or the money that you keep in your pocket. You have good jobs and you got all this going on but what about the people that are on a fixed income, what about the seniors that are sitting here and are trying to make ends meet... and you are out selling our land and we don't get jack back from it.
- You need to stop taking our horses off the land and our burros too; you have been caught red handed in every capacity.

Robert Adams- I agree with Pastor Quentes, he has a beautiful dream that would benefit many that has been suppressed by bureaucracy.

- There is bad policy that comes from too many people being involved, that are someplace else that should not be involved in Nevada issues. People in large urban areas that have lost touch with nature are telling people, who have kept relationships with nature, what that relationship should be by passing laws. Examples of this are:
  - Wolves at Yellowstone
  - Recent national comment over Nevada OHV event up in Great Basin
  - Planning 2.0, it negates the input of those most knowledgeable and most affected by policy because they are too close to the objective.
  - I am not talking about those areas of Nevada that are truly special places that due belong to all Americans and those that are set aside that should

- be set aside. What we are talking about are those areas that just a few decades ago were referred to as waste lands.
- All of the west to the Midwest was once federal land though the Louisiana Purchase or treaty of Guadalupe. That land that was worth owning became private land, the rest public land, stayed public land because it was not worth owning. It has only been in recent years that there has been an interest by people that have not seen it, and protecting the land in Nevada as if it were the Grand Tetons. It is not. We respect those truly unique places that need to be reserved, but let the rest of Nevada be managed for Nevada.

BLM should be led in the direction of state management of public land within their borders, or at least forming regional authorities similar to TVA, that would manage public land for the people that are most effected.

Laura Cunningham- I am a resident of Beatty and wanted to let the BLM know of some of the uses for the land that is covered on the National Test and Training Range NTTR military expansion map for Nellis.

- The area contained within the expansion is a really used area by the public in Beatty.
- David Spicer and his ranch is a mountain bike person and part of his mountain bike system is within the enclosure map.
- Since 2002 I have watched the town's economics go down, we do not have the
  gold mine any more, they are still transitioning to try to be a Park Service
  gateway community and the mountain bike trail system is attracting a lot of
  mountain bike tourists into Beatty, which Beatty needs it.
- I see the tourists as I going hiking in that area; I ride my horse in that area that is in the proposed closure area.
- Beatty residence also like to take their 4-wheelers on the roads, Cat Canyon is one that is actually in the closure area.
- The wildflowers in the area were amazing and lots of residence went out to enjoy them
- In the map of the enclosure area, in the upper section of the Armargosa River is apparently going to be in the enclosure area as well.
- The ACEC is within the proposed lands.

Julie Gleason- It is important that the RAC shares information with RACs in other territories.

- There are a lot of things that have been on Facebook recently regarding the spay and neuter program. The program has been stopped. There was a lot of misinformation that was put out on Facebook regarding the program. There are 3 different methods being studied and BLM was trying to find the safe and most effective method.
- I have brought a power point that was done by Lisa Barnes, Wild Horse.
- and Burro Specialist, in Oregon and it talks about the 3 different methods. There is also an article in horse magazine that was written in 2004 that talks about some of the newer and safer methods.
- I do agree with the prior comments regarding euthanasia, it does need to be defined
- Would like to see the adoption program expanded more back east.
- Would like to see more fertility control methods used across the board.

- The permanent sterilization is a good tool to have in our tool box.
- The copy of the information is going to be left with Tara Kilpatrick.
- We need to disseminate a lot of the information out there on Facebook.
- We asked the National BLM in a letter, what is your 10 year plan, when do you
  expect us to be at carrying capacity. We asked for specific answers from
  Secretary Jewell.
- We talked at our Tri-RAC about going out and educating the public, the whole
  cow vs. horses thing is so wrong. Cows and horses are on the same side, as we
  all want healthy range lands. Within our RAC, we are coming up with a study
  and showing how many AUMs have been reduced and has that been any help
  when horse numbers have not been reduced.
- The advisory board has asked BLM National, if cows were eliminated what would happen. Our smaller picture with that is to provide that information in our own areas and letting them know what that study shows.

Eddie Gim, Chairman of the Pahrump Paiute Tribe- The horse issue is dear to our hearts.

- The wild horses have been very popular. In 2006 the state quarter came out and they put the wild horse on there so that shows you how popular they are.
- We want the horses treated well and humanly, more needs to be done, although I do not know what.
- I hope the horses are not being removed just because someone wants the grazing land.
- We need an established gun range out here. There are so many gun ranges out here and they constantly get moved.
- Once you establish a range, you need to close the area off to building.
- No one publicized gun ranges in this town and so they get closed.
- With regards to the off road race, that is supposed to start in Pahrump and go to Beatty, I do not want the off road race in this town. They are disrespectful to the private land owners. Miners up in Johnny have a problem with them. Now we have problems with helicopters.
- BLM was also disrespectful to the private land owner that had a road through public lands that lead to their private property. The roads were torn-up along with the vegetation and we confronted BLM and they said it was the private land owner's problem.

## 12:28 p.m. Lunch

1:54 p.m. Wild Horses and Burros presentation by Tara Kilpartrick, Wild Horse and Burro Representative, Mojave Southern Great Basin Resource Advisor Council (MSGBRAC)

Presentation included an overview of the of wild horses and burros within the area as well as wild horse and burro goals for the future (see attachment 3).

- > Tara Kilpatrick was appointed the MSGBRAC as the Wild Horse and Burro Representative in February 2016, and considers herself a wild horse advocate.
- ➤ In April of 2007, she became a volunteer for the Wild Horse and Burro program in the Las Vegas Field Office.
  - In 1995 she and her husband moved to Sandy Valley. It is surrounded by public lands. She and her husband would go out and explore the public lands; its history such as mining, cultural resources.

- In 1999 while driving to an outcropping to look petroglyphs she and her husband saw their first band of horses.
- In 2002 while she and her husband were out exploring an old mill site they saw a young mare that look really bad, during that year there was a really bad drought. At this point is when she became concerned about the horses.
- In 2002 there was an emergency gather; the BLM left the health horses out on the range, the others went to Oliver Ranch. Horses were kept there for about 6 months and then they went somewhere else as they were not but back on the range.
- In spring 2003 there was a lot of rain; Nate Tanenbaum stated that 2003 fell in the top 10 years for rain fall.
- In 2004 was another good spring for rain fall, horses on the range looked healthy.
- In 2005 was another good spring for rain fall, horses on the range looked healthy.
- On June 22, 2005, lighting struck in Good Springs, Nevada; horses stayed to the south end of the valley. 33 thousand acres were burned and most of that area was in the Herd Management Area (HMA). Red Brome started growing.
- In December 2005, there was still nothing for the horses to eat.
- On February 16, 2006, another emergency gather was done in the fire area. The BLM gathered a total of 37 animals, 15 were released. The BLM reported that there were 17 animals remaining in the Red Rock Herd. This area is a joint management area between the BLM and the FS.
- The area is 187,639 total areas and the AMLs for the Red Rock Herd area are south of 160 should be 16 to 27 and the burros north of 160 should be 29 to 49.
- On June 11, 2006, the BLM released a 2 year old Palomino, colt from another area, into the valley.
- On June 24, 2006, she saw one of the horses, Willow, had had a foal that was dead by the 4<sup>th</sup> of July due to residence in Good Springs feeding the horses. The residence in Good Springs felt that because of the fire they needed to feed the horses, this caused the horse to chase cars and it got hit and died. Feeding of the horses is an issue.
- In 2006, she met Jerry, Wild Horse and Burro Specialist, Las Vegas Field Office, and shared her concerns regarding the wild horses and burros.
- In April of 2006, fields of Desert Marigold were growing along with the Red Bram.
- In 2006 the BLM started a Wild Horse and Burro Volunteer Program and this is when she and her husband became volunteers.
- October 2006 she attended her first adoption, all 38 animals were adopted.
- The BLM receives \$125 dollars for each adoption.
- Visited Ridgecrest, CA WH&B holding facility it is really nice.
- One of the things that are preformed is foal counts (see attachment 3 for more detail).
  - ✓ Mama had Feather in 2006

- ✓ Feather has had 8 foals, 7 of which have survived (numbers do not including 2016)
- ✓ Twin Star has had 7 foals, 3 of which have survived
- ✓ Dancer has had 4 foals, 1 of which has survived
- ✓ Cinnamon has had 2, 1 of which has survived
- It is not unusual to go months without seeing a certain horse, it is very normal
- 2 year old colts usually leave the earth band at around 2 to 3 years.
- 2 year old fillies have babies; this is where the overpopulation problem really starts.
- One of the horses named Lorado, attacks the young foals.
- She has been a part of the Jackson The Red Rock Burro Program since it started in 2013; the event averages about 275 visitors each event. The event runs September through May from 10 am to 1pm everyone is invited.
- She and David have helped out with hauling water, feeding and watering the burros that are rounded up, and assisting with shots.
- Bird Springs is checked once a month- 330 gallons of water had to be hauled out there earlier this summer, but overall it is usually a pretty healthy area.
- In 2014 there was a water issue in the Bird Springs area; David made a cover for the water. When the horses were breaking the ice, there were issues.
- Wilson Springs is checked bi-weekly. This is the area that has an issue with members of the public going out and shooting the tanks. When they do that the water drains out of the holes and the water meant for wildlife is lost. October of 2007 is when the first bullet hole was repaired, since then it has continued to be an issue.
- Currently, there is about 133 horses and burros that live in the Good Springs Valley.
- Tara and her husband David work together, without his support she would not be able to do this.
- > The goals as a volunteer are as follows:
  - Help assist with the startup of the PZP program
  - Continue with the monitoring of the animals
  - Participate in outreach events, education, and assist where needed
  - In the future when a gather is done- would like to be a liaison between the BLM and the property owner to get things set up between them for any bait traps
  - Propose during an adoption to be able to provide a DVD of the adopted animal's life on the range. This could help with marketing
  - Would like to come back and discuss the patterns of the animals, that were found during observation
  - Discuss the Jenny (female burro) that lives in the area with the horses and what her life has been like.
  - Discuss the pros and cons of water on private property
  - Discuss OHV use and recreational shooting around horses
- The horses' lives right now are out of balance, there a so many of them.
- People say that the gathers break up horse families, the horses do so much of that themselves; gathers have nothing on what they do to themselves.

### -Discussions-

Jason Higgins- Can you talk a little bit more about the Volunteer Program and How many volunteers are in it.

Tara Kilpatrick- I do not know of any other volunteers within the Las Vegas Field Office that help with the water like my husband and I.

Tabitha Remaro- There is no other volunteers for the Red Rock Herd Management Area that do what Tara and Dave do. They are life savers. Before I was hired by the BLM, I was a volunteer for 2.5 years, it was only myself, David and Tara that were active volunteers. Now it is just two people volunteering, Dave and Tara.

Jason Higgins- It sounds like you could use more volunteers throughout the District.

Tabitha Remaro-Yes, we really could use more volunteers.

Tara Kilpatrick- It is really important to get recreation folks as volunteers, because horse people are not out there. It is the people who are out there enjoying public lands that are out there more.

• If you get the OHV people out there, you can get a whole club and they can take turns. This is where you could get a good volunteer base is through systems like that.

Jason Higgins- At the springs you mentioned, was that a guzzler?

Tara Kilpatrick- That was a spring that is piped from the ground through the tunnel and to the drinker. The original ones melted in the 2005 fire.

Elise McAllister- The idea about tapping into recreational folks for volunteer for the WH&B program is great. We have seen them get involved with the cultural site steward program because they were out there anyway.

John Hiatt- One of the interesting things I heard was the rate of increase and what that holds for the future. When you have large animals with no predators their numbers will increase until either run out of water, food, or both. Because they are big strong animals when there is water available, but no forage they will destroy the range before they die. We need to address how we deal with these numbers in the face of opposition from wild horse advocates against any sort of removal or round-up.

Tim Smith- I would like to introduce Tabitha Remaro, she is the Districts WH&B Specialist. She has been with the BLM about a month. Krystal Johnson was the previous WH&B Specialist.

Tabitha Remaro- David and Tara Kilpatrick do so much for the program and we are really appreciative of that.

Have been volunteering with the WH&B program for about 2.5 years, I would go
out with Krystal Johnson on a weekly basis to haul water, do range monitoring,
and help with public outreach.

- The BLM as a whole is very focused on the future as it is a hot button topic and very multifaceted issue.
- One of the main focuses is on fertility treatment, whether that be PZP or permanent sterilization, there has to be done something to control the population.
- Another focus is on using bait and trap rather than helicopters; helicopters are needed on large scale gathers. Bait and trap method was used on the Cold Creek gather as the animals would not have been able to handle the stress of helicopters.
- BLM is focused on using public help and outreach to monitor animal and range conditions and promote adoptions. Adoptions have been cut to a third of what they use to be, we use to do 10 annually and now we do 2. A lot of it is economics; it is cheap to buy a horse, but not to maintain.
- Within the Southern Nevada District, we are hauling a lot of water with the drought. 110,000 gallons of water have been hauled to three different heard management areas this year alone. The largest concern is the test site; we are hauling 20-40 thousand gallons each time.
- BLM is working with the FS on the Spring Mountain Herd Management Area Plan- this will allow us to have a joint effort in maintaining herd numbers and allow us to use fertility treatments across very large area that we would not have been able to do alone.
- If animals are becoming an issue please contact the WH&B Specialist, she will happy to come out and document and take pictures to work together to get the animals off the highways, and private property.
- Wild horses and burros are part of the wildlife landscape and they need to be managed in conjunction with that. It is not a cow issue, sheep issue, or horse issue; it is a wildlife issue. My goal is to create a balanced approach and look at all the multi-faceted issues.

John Hiatt- Is there an inspection practice for the fencing along 159 and Red Rock?

Tabitha Remaro- Yes, currently we are working on determining whose liability that is.

- Recently there was an issue along Johnny Mine Road where a cattle guard had
  filled in and the burros were coming out, and it was determined to be NDOT's
  responsibility and so NDOT came out and cleaned up the cattle guards.
- Once we determine whose liability the fence is, we will get together a crew and ride along the fence to find the issues in the fence.
- 2:39 p.m. Red Rock NCA/ Possible Fee Increase presentation by Catrina Williams, Red Rock/Sloan Field Manager. Presentation included an overview of the standard and amenity fees currently, visitation increase and possibility of a fee increase at the Red Rock Conservation Area (see attachment 4).
  - ➤ Looking at the potential to increase the standard and amenity fees at Red Rock.
  - ➤ Looking at updating the Red Rock Business Plan as it was last done in 2010.
  - ➤ In 2010 the visitation numbers were 873 thousand; in 2015 the visitation numbers have increase to 2.4 million. That is almost triple since the last time there was a fee increase.
  - Youth numbers have also increase, we have implemented a lot of educational and interpretive programs. The Every Kid in a Park initiative was kicked off at Red Rock by Secretary Jewell.

- > We have had a lot of transportation grants that have been achieved in an effort to bring children out from the local school.
- At the end of 2015 a Defense Act was passed that added additional 1,200 acres of lands to the Red Rock Canyon National Conservation Area (RRCNCA). A survey was just finished and we should be getting an updated map to reflect that.
- The last business plan done in 2015 focuses on the following goals:
  - Provide for public enjoyment and visitor experience
  - Enhance recreational opportunities
  - Preserve Red Rock resources
- ➤ The LEED Gold Certified Visitor Center is one of our accomplishments. It features classrooms, gift shop, exhibit area, and amphitheater. We do a lot of events at the visitor's center.
- Recently, the BLM received funding from the Federal Highway Administration, which was used to construct and install two bridges and a flood warning system. The areas where they were installed were prone to continuous flooding; people would get trapped during heavy rain seasons.
- Have installed 2 out of 6 portal signs that have been installed around RRCNCA.
- > Big Jim from Cowboy Trails, partner, helps with trail restoration.
- RRCNCA has a graffiti removal team that has been successful and we are committed to working hard to remove all graffiti.
- > RRCNCA also has plant salvaging and restoration and also involved with the Fire for fuels reduction and weed control.
- > This next fiscal year there are a lot of projects coming such as:
  - Phase Two, this is a continuation of the bridge project, and it will repair and repave the 13 mile scenic route and will expand the parking lot and restrooms around the scenic route. It will add 300 more parking spaces. It will start in fall 2016.
  - Working on the MOU with Metro Search and Rescue
  - Have added more positions to include 2 Ranges (1 for interpretative and education and 1 climbing ranger)
  - Will be putting out more signs and changing out old signs to include sign around the trail, and kiosk signs.
- Next steps will include:
  - Will be working on another business plan and developing the proposal, public involvement, State Director and Washington Office would review, and then the fee proposal would be presented to the RAC for recommendations.

Stanley Smith- What is the fuels reduction program, the main fuel out there is Red Brome and I assume that is not what is being reduced.

Catrina Williams- It is not Red Brome, it is other weeds out there and we are working with our Fire Division and they are working on a plan right now.

Stanley Smith- Is it a controlled burn?

Catrina Williams- No.

George Phillips- The Howard Hughes Development is moving up and the school is open now and it is really difficult to get into the Brown Stone area. This area has the highest concentration of

petroglyphs and cultural sites in the Red Rock Canyon National Conservation Area. Are there any plans for preserving this area?

Catrina Williams-We work closely with Summerlin and they do have a lot of residential property that skirts RRNCA. They are very cautious, and do work with the BLM Archeologist when they are considering how the development is going to go and put in their own buffer zone.

John Hiatt- This problem is that there is road access through their land to get up to the entrance of Brown Stone Canyon. People are driving around the barrier that BLM has put in. The folks that are doing that are most likely the ones that are damaging the petroglyphs.

- The issue is youth coming up to this area and partying.
- The only way to deal with this issue is law enforcement.

When asking for a fee increase you should show a balance sheet showing what your income is, what the money is being spend on, and what you intend to do with the increase.

Catrina Williams- As far as our labor, training, travel, supplies come to about \$1.7 million. Law Enforcement is about \$277 thousand. We will have a range, as far as increasing the fee, not sure where that will start at. Currently, we are at \$7 dollars a vehicle to get in. We could start off at \$10 dollars and gradually go up from there depending on research.

John Hiatt- Keep in mind that the Department of Interior is really working on increasing the diversity, and youth on public lands. If you look at the demographics of people living in Las Vegas, there are an awful lot of poor individuals, if you look at the amount of people in the school system that get free or reduce lunches it is about half. Those are the people you would like to be able to have come out to the public lands. To them, \$7 dollars or whatever can present a big barrier to them.

Catrina Williams- We are making great strides to get grants that our partners get to transport kids to RRCNCA. Also, the pass that 4<sup>th</sup> graders get with the Every Kid in a Park initiative, which includes the whole family.

John Hiatt- Do you have any idea the response you have gotten due to the initiative?

Catrina Williams- I do not have those numbers yet, but we are looking at that.

Jason Higgins- When I see numbers where you are going from 800 thousand to 2.4 million visitors, you are getting a significant increase in money already in just the foot and car traffic that is coming. You said you added 2 Rangers; I assume you have added other staff as well.

Catrina Williams- Yes, we have added an Assistant Field Manager, 2 Outdoor Recreation Planners, and another outdoor Ranger.

Jason Higgins- With the new visitors' center would it be an issue of up-keep and additional monies to maintain that. When the request comes in we are going to analyze not only the fee you are requesting but how that is also off-set by the increase visitor traffic.

Tim Smith- In Federal Land Recreation Enhancement Act (FLREA) it does talk about a Recreation RAC that is required to review and hopefully concur with the Bureau or FS on any fee increases. Some states only have one Recreation RAC for the whole state. Nevada decided that the RAC would do it for both the BLM and FS. The reason I asked Catrina to make the presentation today is this is going to be the Recreation RAC that will review or fee proposal when the time comes. As part of this process we will have to:

- Do a Business Plan
- Public engagement at several points along the way
- Discussions with the BLM Washington Office and State Office
- Coming back the to MSGBRAC for input as well

We do ask for the Recreation subcommittee to be 100% engaged with Catrina as she begins to work through this process.

John Hiatt- How do you actually come up with the number of visitors; do you count the number in each car?

Catrina Williams-We take the number of vehicles and 1.2%, it is an equation. We are looking at doing a visitor capacity study as well, so through we might be able to find a better way to count, and find out where visitors are coming from.

John Lee- There are seasons where you could probably get support for this. Do these parks need to run at a profit; is that the basis for what you are doing? In North Las Vegas our parks are just not profit centers. Is the parks budget built upon living within your prosperity or do they augment your budget because of growth?

Catrina Williams- This area is a National Conservation Area which is different from a park. There are significant resources we are protecting out there.

Tim Smith- It is not the Bureau's desire to have a revenue generating place. Our goal is to provide services for the public; it is the public's place. We have to look at the resource needs in the area.

- In the FLREA, to charge a fee you have to have X number services you provide. That is what we are providing for, as our visitation increases, the impact on those facilities and resources becomes greater.
- Our ability to manage that will come at where the fee sets.
- There is an appropriation issue and the dollars that Catrina gets to manage the area falls well below where we are to manage the visitation.
- The Business Plan is going to be based on the visitation, amenities provided, services we need to provide, where the dollar figure will be.
- We will go out and look at other areas that charge fees like Lake Mead to see and see where we are.

John Lee- When you do the SNPLMA sales, a portion goes to water district, education, administration. Is there a way that through the sales you could call it administration and use those funds?

Catrina Williams-No. The SNPLMA is strictly for the valley.

Tim Smith- SNPLMA money has to be project oriented. I can't use the money to cover staffing out there, that would be an inappropriate use. The visitor's center was built under capital improvements.

John Hiatt- It is not only inappropriate to use SNPLMA money for maintenance and things, it is illegal. The money can only be used for capital improvements.

Susan Agee- When you are earmarking a certain amount of money for capital improvements, it seems to me that you may be making improvements that you do not need. Is there a way to cut down on the cost of capital improvements or does BLM have to spend X amount of dollars on capital improvements?

Tim Smith- If you look at most National Conservation Areas and National Monuments that BLM manages you will find very few capital improvements. Red Rock has been a very popular place, back in 1983 we had a visitor center that we out grew because of the visitation. When you get that much visitation you have to look at having the infrastructure that will support that much visitation. BLM wants to have as few capital improvements as possible.

3:15 p.m.

## District Updates (continued)

**BLM Elv District** 

Chris Carlton, Field Manager BLM Caliente Field Office- (see attachment 5)

- The Ely is reviewing comments received during public scoping period for the Basin and Range National Monument Resource Management Plan. Moving forward on the Management Plan.
- There is an emergency gather going on in the Sands Spring Valley. Up to 300 horses and the gather is in the process of beginning due to drought conditions.
- Not completely through fire season, had few large fires given the amount of vegetation in the area. The biggest fire was Strawberry Fire which burned 4,657 acres. Also, had the Overland Fire.
- ➤ Vegas to Reno race occurred and went really well. There was as last minute change in plans due to an incident in the monument and there was a last minute route change.
- ➤ Continue to move forward and expect to sign a decision in late October on round three land sale, which include parcels in Caliente, Alamo, Pioche, and Panaca. The sale would happen 6 months from the date of the signed decision.
- Rapping up big recreation season. Did have 2 successful motor-cross races.
- ➤ Construction for the non-motorized bike trails to start construction late winter/early spring. Working on the Environmental Assessment and will be coming up for scoping on things like equestrian use, bike trails, and potentially motorized trails.

## -Discussions-

John Hiatt-One of the most common elements of water shed projects is thinning of Juniper, partly for Sage Grouse. If you only thin trees rather than removing them, you are not helping Sage Grouse, they do not like trees. You need to have large areas with no trees.

Chris Carlton- I will check with Kyle and Cody who are the planners behind the projects. I will also make sure that the next RAC I will have an update.

George Phillips- With regards to the desert race, when you had to transport the vehicles, did that go pretty smoothly?

Chris Carlton- Yes, it went smoothly, partly because we already analyzed that alternative in the first EA.

George Phillips- There was as survey done up in Utah up near 9 mile, does this affect Nevada as well?

Chris Carlton- It could be that as part of their planning, in Utah, there had to be a class 3 inventory completed as part of their travel activity planning. That is different from a specific event. That is not something that is required in general for an event like this. As part of our cultural it was within existing disturbance, existing roads, and we made sure we stayed within the bounds of this.

## BLM Battle Mountain District

Tim Coward, Manager, BLM Tonopah Field Office- (see attachment 6)

- ➤ Gemfield Resources project- We are awaiting the proponent to turn in an updated plan. The NEPA process will proceed once all updates have been received and accepted.
- ➤ Manhattan Road- The project has been issued to Nye County and is under construction.
- Silverpeak Road- The project is also under construction.
- > Stone Cabin HMA- Currently gathering horses in the Stone Cabin Complex.
  - It is a bait and water trap gather, gathered over 300 horses, going to ship 100 and the goal is to try and adopt 15 this Saturday.
  - We have completed the gather in the north and are working on gathering in the south.
  - We will administer PZP on the horses north as well as the ones in the south.
  - Ones in the north were originally PZP in 2012 and of the one we captured in the north portion 25 of those were ones that were previously administered PZP.
  - We will be going out in 6 months and administering a booster.
  - Gather will continue until we get the numbers.
- ➤ There is an APD, Permit to Drill, was out for public comment until September 16, 2016, issues were addressed and the final EA will be out this week with the Finding of No Significant Impact (FONSI) and Decision Record.
- ➤ We are working in conjunction with Nye County for our NPL day event. Today is the NPL day event in Tonopah; we are fixing all the stuff that is left within in area that was used for different purposes at one time and contouring the area.

### -Discussions-

John Hiatt- What is the cost of administering PZP both initially and a follow-up booster?

Tim Coward- From my perspective with regards to the follow-up PZP I do not think we have done a good job because I don't think anyone thought of how to do the PZP after it has been done initially.

- We have been working with non-governmental entities and permittees that have experience with administering PZP to develop the future plan.
- Theoretically about 6 months after the initial application you have to go back out to administer a booster. Then 8 to 10 months later you have to go back out and administer another dose. Then a year later you have to go out again and then you have a couple years break before it has to be done again.
- Hopefully by that time you will start to see some sort of maintaining of numbers.

John Hiatt- I was under the impression that you administer the PZP and then go back out in 2 years to administer it again. But you just said you do it initially, 6 months, then 8-10 months, then another year after that.

Tim Coward- That is correct. What we found out is PZP 22 that the very last pellet in the 22 is not functioning as accurately as it should which is why we have to go back out and administer the booster. The booster then runs us to the 8 month to year mark and then we go out and give then the first year shot.

Jason Higgins- What is your success of finding the horse again to administer the follow-up, are you finding every horse or hitting at 80%?

Tim Coward- There has not been a lot of in the field operations like this.

- We have gone out and photographed every horse, trying to find any markings that would identify the horses. When we give them PZP, we also mark them. We have multiply ways of looking for them.
- The likelihood of getting 100% of these horses for their follow-up is about 89%, that is a guess, because I have not been able to do the program for a 4 year or more period of time.
- What we have done in Tonopah is we have worked on one area that we know is more of a controlled area and have been able to identify those horses. We know all the horses in that area.
- We went from an area that had 100 horses and are now in an area with well over 500.
- It is different in every area, because of all the different variables (food, water)

# 3:39 p.m. Subcommittee Updates

- -Basin and Range National Monument Susan Agee, Chairperson-
  - ➤ Overall within the county the overall opinion was that things should not change from the existing Ely RMP, which up until know the area has been run under.
  - ➤ Outside pressure groups should not be able to come in and tell the people of Lincoln County how to live their lives.
  - There should be no change to Fire Management, soils, air quality, and wild horses from existing the RMP.
  - > We noted that the proclamation allows for grazing to continue and we would encourage but not mandate reestablishment of grasses and vegetation.
  - The level of visitors' services should be commensurate with the level of visitors.
  - ➤ We recognize City but do not believe it will have a positive economic effect on the county; it will actually have the reverse.
  - The three economic drivers in the county are OHV, ranching, and mining.
  - There was a motioned entered, in terms of Lands and Realty and water resources, that specifically addressed it should be managed within the laws of the state of Nevada, Ely RMP, and the State Engineers Office. The monument would not interfere with the state of Nevada water rights permitting process or the BLM's current land use permitting process for water development.
  - There is an area called Water Gap and there is an unwritten rule in that area that cowboys have first right on that water. Should we make that a written rule given the uncertainty in that area?

➤ Should not interfere with any laws in the state of Nevada; recommend that land that has been submitted for withdrawals, reservations, or appropriations through the Lincoln County Conservation and Development Act be honored.

### -Discussions-

Jason Higgins- Would the Antiquities Act trump the prior application?

Susan Agee- It appears that it would.

Jason Higgins- If we are going to make this a recommendation should we caveat it with as long as it does not interfere with federal law or anything in the Antiquities Act.

Chris Carlton- How many acres of overlap is there, because the disposal lands are Primarily concentrated around the communities.

Susan Agee- I would have to check on that.

John Hiatt- The proclamation states clearly that the lands within the monument are withdrawn from various forms of land entry, mineral entry, and so on. That statement supersedes the laws that provide for land entry.

Elise McAllister- At the meeting, the gentleman that brought this up wanted it to be part of the record, not necessarily resolved.

Jason Higgins- Do we want to make a motion to adopt the recommendations formal to the RAC as written?

Elise McAllister- I make a motion to adopt the recommendations for the monument with the caveat that it does not conflict with federal law or the Antiquities Act.

Susan Agee- I would like to make the suggestion that we formalize the unwritten rule that the cowboys get first water rights.

John Hiatt- The water in Nevada is regulated by the State Water Engineer, so it is a moot point.

Jason Higgins- BLM does not control the water rights, so we could do a second recommendation that the cowboys go about that their own way, but we can't recommend that to the BLM because they do not jurisdiction over that.

John Lee- Where do these recommendations go, do they go in a file in BLM's folder. Jason Higgins- This would be a recommendation to the monument manager that is developing the RMP. The Proclamation states that an RMP be adopted within 3 years of the Proclamation, which was July of 2014.

Chris Carlton- Public scoping period has completed right now, they are going through the comments received and the next step will be starting the alternative process. Alternatives have not been developed so this is a good time for recommendations to be submitted to BLM.

Jason Higgins- My recommendation would be, with regards to the water, the folks that use that water to file an application with the State Engineers office. That would be the proper route for

those issues. With that being removed, because it is not under the jurisdiction of the BLM, do we have a motion to adopt this less the water issue and with the caveat of subject to the Antiquities Act as written.

Elise McAllister- I want to modify my motion with the above.

John Hiatt- I second the motion.

Jason Higgins- Motion carries.

## -Planning

Stephanie Gracia-Vause, Chairperson (Not available; an email was sent and read into the record by Jason Higgins) –

- ➤ Meeting was held September 21, 2016, received an update from BLM staff regarding current realty actions.
- ➤ Nicollee Gaddis shared an update of the Las Vegas in-valley EA taking place. A 30 day public comment period will likely open next week. Once approved it will improve efficiency and timing of the review of ROW requests within the Las Vegas Valley. She referenced an Eplanning and offered to come back to give us a demonstration.
- Received an update regarding the status of Planning 2.0.
- ➤ Lee Kirk, BLM, is waiting for the State Director to give direction on how to proceed with the Las Vegas RMP.
- ➤ Pinch Points-the group desired more information to get a better understanding of the issue before making any recommendations.
- ➤ Discussions about getting information about the up and coming West Wide Energy Corridor public meeting taking place September 27, 2016.
- > Stan Harder shared his experience from California and is currently working on trying to improve trail signs in Lincoln County and promoting more responsible use of public lands.
- ➤ Potential subcommittee meetings- the group would like to continue meeting between now and the Tri-RAC.
- ➤ Recommend items for 2017- Discussion regarding the approach to public meetings and public engagement from notices to meeting format, there was a desire to have discussion at the Tri-RAC level. Would like an update on Planning 2.0 depending on where it is in the process, if the meeting is scheduled when there is time to provide comments, the group would like to spend time understanding the proposal and providing comments.

### -Recreation

Elise McAllister, Chairperson-

- ➤ We have 2 recommendations to the RAC and we had a discussion regarding Get Outdoors Nevada and having RAC members go to these events.
  - We would like to recommend to the RAC, to recommend to the BLM, that when they are spreading the message to come and enjoy the public lands, they are also spread the message of responsible use and of proper land ethic.
  - As the RAC is the link between the public and the BLM, we ask that the RAC support that when possible, the RAC members attend outreach events and help educate the public as to the RAC, letting them know that

our interests reflect all that the BLM does. Also, RAC members can get the word out on meetings and agendas for the meetings.

➤ We would also like to continue meeting and talking about how we can educate and engage the meet-up groups. We would also work on educating folks on the permitting process.

#### -Discussions-

Jason Higgins- Please read the first recommendation.

Elise McAllister- Recommend that the RAC recommend to the BLM to include the message of responsible use and good land ethics with the message of come out and enjoy public lands.

Jason Higgins- Do I have a motion?

Elise McAllister- I motion to adopt.

John Hiatt- I second the motion.

Jason Higgins- The recommendation one carries. What is recommendation two?

Elise McAllister- Recommend that the RAC recommend to the BLM, that RAC when possible, attend outreach events to help the BLM and educate the public about the RAC and the interest that we represent on the RAC.

Jason Higgins- I do not know that that needs to be a recommendation to BLM. That is more the RAC internally, to encourage each other to go out. What is BLM going to do with the recommendation?

Elise McAllister- That is true.

Jason Higgins- Unless we are asking for the BLM's support in helping set-up a booth or that sort of thing. That is where I can see BLM being a support for the RAC. The recommendation would be to include the RAC in public events that the BLM participates in so that we can carry the message.

Elise McAllister- That is what we want in a round-about way, yes.

Tim Smith-We encourage that with the RAC and I also think that we would encourage you at events to talk about your role as a RAC member.

Jason Higgins- We could also ask the BLM to keep us informed of activities we could go to when they come up that could benefit both the BLM and the RAC.

Elise McAllister- We would like to ask the BLM to provide the RAC with information about upcoming events and activities where we could be a part of the education process on getting the word out about the RAC.

Jason Higgins- We have a recommendation and a motion, do we have a second?

John Hiatt- I second the motion.

Jason Higgins- The recommendation carries.

4:00 p.m. Jason Higgins adjourned the meeting.

APPROVED BY:

Date: 28 FEB 2017

Jason Higgins, Chairperson Mojave Southern Great Basin R

- Minutes provided by Vivian Browning, BLM Realty Specialist

# Attachments:

- 1 Target Shooting Handout
- 2 Southern Nevada District Office Report
- 3 Wild Horse and Burro Presentation
- 4 Red Rock NCA/ Possible Fee Increase Presentation
- 5 Ely District Office Report
- 6 Battle Mountain District Report