

**Half Moon Ranch and Shaw (AKA Rockfellow) House
Douglas Ranger District, Coronado National Forest
Recreation Enhancement Act Fee Proposal**

The Forest Service is proposing to include the Half Moon Ranch and the Shaw House in the “Rooms with a View” Arizona Cabin Rental Program. The proposed new fee increase of \$150.00 would include 1 night’s rental at each house.

The Half Moon Ranch and the Shaw House are located in East Cochise Stronghold, on the eastern slope of the Dragoon Mountains, within 1½ hours of Tucson, Sierra Vista, and Douglas, Arizona, providing a local recreation base of well over a million people. Cochise Stronghold is one of southern Arizona’s most popular birding, hiking and climbing areas. Cochise Stronghold historically served as a refuge for the Apache chief, Cochise, and his band during the Apache campaigns of the 1860s.

The improvements to the Half Moon Ranch and the Shaw House will be completed this summer, in a manner that will allow both houses to function for a wide variety of overnight uses. Each house has indoor plumbing, electricity and/or propane, a fully stocked kitchen, furniture, beds and picnic table and grill.

History of the Area

The following paragraphs are adapted from Jonetta Holt’s excellent article on the history of Cochise Stronghold published in the Cochise County Historical Journal (Volume 36, No. 2 Fall/Winter 2006).

This narrow, high-walled defile on the eastern side of the Dragoon Mountains is a landmark well known as East Cochise Stronghold Canyon. Although the name may provoke thoughts that former inhabitants constructed a fortress there, no Apache-built fort stands today if there ever was one. Most of the time, the Chiricahua band of Apaches who frequently camped in the canyon built only what they needed to make their wickiup areas more comfortable. Few signs of their residence are visible.

Non-indigenous people, including Anglos, moving through or into the area quickly came to know that the canyon was one of Cochise’s favorite camping places. And it became widely known as “Cochise’s Stronghold” during the 12 years following the 1861 conflict between Cochise and the U.S. Army at Apache Pass. When Cochise and his followers finally negotiated the terms and boundaries of the Chiricahua Reservation in 1872 with Gen. O.O. Howard, they insisted that the Dragoons remain within its confines. Cochise was in camp with his followers in the Dragoons when he fell ill and died June 8, 1874. He was interred in a secret location in the Dragoons and the only white man to attend the interment, the chief’s friend Tom Jeffords, never revealed the location. The Chiricahua Reservation dissolved in 1876.

After the Apache were forced out of the Stronghold, numerous settlers (over a period of 100 years) moved into the area, including John A. Rockfellow, Red Warren, Alfonse and

Clemence Guitard, Robert and Charlotte Shaw, and James and E.L. Brophy. Much of the land that was in private ownership (through homesteading) passed back into Federal Government ownership during the 1950s and 1960s.

The Half Moon Ranch is located on a 40-acre parcel at the mouth of east Cochise Stronghold Canyon. The Ranch House was not constructed until the 1960s, however, an old adobe building dates to an earlier time period. When the building was built, and by whom, is unknown to date. There is no record of it being a homestead property and yet this parcel was occupied before Red Warren lived in the canyon. Some have suggested that it was built by the men of the Chiricahua Cattle Company (CCC) who pooled their assets in the spring of 1885 to form a competitive organization. The land passed through a series of owners until the 1960s.

Helen and Charlie Prude purchased the property in 1966 from John and Mary Magoffin and bought other land in a direction stretching out toward the Sulphur Spring Valley from their headquarters called "Half Moon Ranch." Helen said the ranch was composed of about 14 sections at one time, but when she and Charlie retired they sold the rest of it retaining only the 40-acre parcel where their house, and the CCC adobe, still sits.

The adobe building, although roofless and leaning when the Prudes obtained the property was made sturdy and useful again when the couple installed support beams at the top of the walls and re-roofed the building. They also reinstalled windows and doors, and used it as a bunkhouse for seasonal ranch workers. Charlie passed away Oct. 31, 1991. Helen remained on the ranch for several years after Charlie's death, and after her death in March 2008, bequeathed the ranch and the 40 acre parcel to the Forest Service.

The Shaw House, located further east, had its origins in the 1890s when John and Lucille Warren built a small adobe dwelling. Subsequent owners added rooms and changed the appearance of the house. The Shaw family occupied the house from 1920 until the 1960s and brought it to its current configuration. The Coronado National Forest acquired the property in 1969 and up until 3 years ago had been used to house employees since that time.

Description of Project

Half Moon Ranch is located in the east Cochise Stronghold in the Dragoon Mountains, approximately 1 ½ hours from Tucson. The site consists of the main ranch house, barn, and corrals. The Half Moon Ranch with its seven rooms can accommodate up to 10 people and 6 horses. The house contains two bedrooms (one with a queen size bed, the second with bunks and a twin bed), two full bathrooms, living room (with two futon couches), dining room, and a fully-equipped kitchen. The barn and corrals can accommodate up to six horses.

Ranch House

- 1700 sq ft of indoor space, 10 person capacity
- 1100 sq ft of barn and tack room
- 300 sq ft of covered corrals
- 4 large exterior corrals
- Beds for 6 people, and two double-size futons
- Electric stove, oven and heat
- Fully stocked kitchen
- Large dining table and 6 chairs, two futon double beds, two rocking chairs, one queen size bed, one bunk bed and a twin bed, end tables and lamps.
- Picnic table and chairs
- Propane BBQ grill

Parking and a turn-around for horse trailers is available on the site.

The **Shaw House**, located a mile southwest of the Half Moon Ranch, consists of a 10 room structure that can accommodate up to eight people. The house contains 3 bedrooms (one with a queen size bed, the remaining two each with a set of bunk beds), two bathrooms, living room (with two futon couches), dining room, and a fully-equipped kitchen. There is a corral and pasture that may accommodate several horses.

Shaw House

- 2000 sq ft of indoor space, 10 person capacity
- Equestrian accommodations for 6 horses
- Beds for 5 people, and two double-size futons
- Gas stove and propane heat
- Fully stocked kitchen
- Large dining table and 6 chairs, two futon double beds, two couches, one queen size bed, 2 sets of bunk beds, end tables and lamps.
- Picnic table and chairs
- Propane BBQ grill

Numerous attractions are also available at or near the Half Moon Ranch and the Shaw House. These include:

- Within 1 ½ hours of Tucson, Sierra Vista or Douglas
- Premier rock climbing area
- Attractions within 1 hour's drive include: the Amerind Foundation, Whitewater Draw Birding Area, Douglas and Naco International Ports of Entry, several wineries, Ft. Bowie and Camp John A. Rucker historic sites, Chiricahua National Monument, and the Willcox Playa
- Secluded, attractive location.

Financial Analysis

Proposed Fee Rates

Half Moon Ranch House and Shaw House - Collect \$150.00 per night for the use of the Half Moon Ranch or the Shaw House

All fees will be collected through the National Reservation System

Projected Revenues for the Half Moon Ranch = 180 days @ 150/day = 27,000
Less the 5% fund = 25,935

Projected Revenues for the Shaw House = 180 days @ 150/day = 27,000
Less the 5% fund = 25,935

The facilities will be open year round with seasonal variations in estimated occupancy. It is estimated that the year round occupancy will average about 50%. The occupancy numbers used are considered realistic occupancy numbers for the facilities. These numbers are based on past performance of facilities in the region and other similar facilities across the country. Furthermore, estimations of occupancy are based on demand factors affecting Forest Service recreation lodging facilities (Region 3 Cabin Feasibility Study).

Operations and maintenance of the Half Moon Ranch and the Shaw House are done in-house. Projected total costs for both houses are \$24,270 per year. This includes operations and maintenance, electricity; water testing, and cleaning. These figures were ascertained using the Forest Service corporate data system for infrastructure known as Infra (Region 3 Cabin Feasibility Study).

Looking at the overnight use of the Half Moon Ranch, the expected revenue is ~ \$27,600. The additional revenues generated will be allocated by the Arizona Cabin Rental Board to provide O&M for existing cabin rentals or to provide seed money to bring other historic buildings into the cabin rental program.

Business Plan

There is an existing “Rooms with a View” Arizona Cabin Rental Project Plan for Arizona Forests, last updated December 2003. The Executive Summary succinctly states on page 2 that “Fees are based on market demand, number of occupants, amenities, and management costs.” The proposed fee meets the objectives and goals stated throughout the Business Plan.

Analysis of Existing Private and Public Facilities or Services

Research shows that the Half Moon Ranch and the Shaw House will provide an experience unique within the state of Arizona. To our knowledge, only six other facilities

(Kendrick, Fernow, Caldwell, Spring Valley, Crescent Moon and Sycamore Cabins) offer overnight rentals with indoor plumbing; no other facilities can accommodate horses.

Relationship to Private or Concessionaire Developments

Two privately owned bed and breakfasts and a horse stable are located within 10 miles of the Half Moon Ranch.

The Cochise Stronghold Bed and Breakfast, offers full accommodations including breakfast served in the rooms, housekeeping, provisioning services (fully stocking your refrigerator upon request), massages, yoga and meditation services. The fees range from \$99.00 per night to \$259.00 per night for up to 4 people.

The Strawbale Bed and Breakfast, approximately 5 miles (by road) east of the Half Moon Ranch, offers accommodations for two people. They offer a full breakfast, two double rooms with a shared bath. The fee is \$75.00/night.

And the Horse You Rode In On, located approximately 10 miles north of the Half Moon Ranch and the Shaw House, offers boarding accommodations for horses and mules only. They offer no other accommodations.

Relationship to Other Public Developments (local)

The Prescott, Coconino, Kaibab and Apache-Sitgreaves National Forests offers overnight rentals for the cabins mentioned above. The cabins accommodate different size groups ranging from five to ten people. The fees range from \$125.00/ night to \$200.00 night and none of the facilities can accommodate horses.

Proximity to Urban Population

The Tucson area (population 1 million) is approximately 90 miles away from the Half Moon Ranch and the Shaw House and is about a 1 ½ hour drive. Phoenix (population 3 million) is approximately 200 miles away and is about a 3 ½ hour drive.

Justification for Fee

The Half Moon Ranch and Shaw House expanded amenity fee is in line with the value provided and in line with fees for similar facilities (Cochise Stronghold Bed and Breakfast, Crescent Moon, Kendrick, Fernow, Spring Valley, Caldwell and Sycamore Cabins).

These fees are the only source of funds for annual operation & maintenance. These include:

- Maintenance of the Half Moon Ranch House and Barn and restoration of the historic adobe.
- Maintenance of the historic Shaw House

- Maintaining the water system
- Covering the costs of electricity
- Rodent and pest control

Funds are desired for improvements that will enhance the rental use and continue to preserve the historic nature of the facilities. Surplus funds can be used to purchase materials for and to complete major improvements, such as:

- Replacement of the roofs, estimated cost \$10,000/building
- Preservation of the historic structures at the sites.
- Continued maintenance of roofs, walls and foundations, estimated cost: \$20,000

Description of How the Cabin Rental Board will inform the public about expenditures

The public will be kept informed of how their fees are at work in the area by placing individual signs in each of the facilities (i.e., “Your Fees at Work”).

Information will also be posted on the Coronado N.F. web site and will be forwarded to the Region for inclusion in the Regional Annual Fee Program Report.

Notification of Proposed Fee Increase to the Public

Date(s) of PI Activity	Type of Public Involvement	Audiences Reached	Feedback Received (Yes/No)	Synopsis of Feedback	Amount of Time & circulation
Oct. 19, 2007	Meg Magoffin (maiden name)	FS	Yes	In support of both cabins	
Nov. 7, 2007	Federal Register Notice	General Public	No	None	9 months
Dec. 5, 2007	John Ware – Amerind Foundation	Museum	Yes	In support of both cabins	
Dec. 2007	Notice to County Line Riders of Catalina	Equestrian Users of the CNF	Yes	2 comments in support of both houses	~ 8 months, 200 members
Jan. 8, 2008	Email to the local Congressional Delegation	Local Politician	No	No	12 Congressional Members
Jan. 18, 2008	Nancy Yates	Cochise Stronghold B & B Owner	Yes	Not in support of either houses	
Jan. 22, 2008	Arizona Media Release	General Public	Yes	See Below	7 months
Jan. 22, 2008	Molly Hunt –	Resident	Yes	In support of both cabins	
Jan. 23, 2007	Notice placed at Rocks and Ropes	Climbing Community	No	N/A	7 months
Jan. 23,	Email sent out by	Climbing	Yes	Jason Mullins	7 months

2007	Jason Mullins to climbing groups	community		in support of both cabins	~ 3,000 folks
Jan. 23, 2008	Media release posted at Summit Hut	Outdoor public	No	N/A	7 months
Jan. 23, 2008	Tucson Boy Scout Council		No	N/A	7 months
Jan. 23, 2008	Notice placed on Coronado NF web site	General public	No	1 comment in support of both houses	- 150,000 hits per month
Jan. 23, 2008	Notice published in the Tucson Citizen	General public	Yes	3 comments in support of both houses	7 months
Jan. 23, 2008	Notice Published on Cox.net	On-line public	Yes	2 emails in support of both houses	7 months
Jan. 24, 2008	Scott Ayers	Head of local climbing group	Yes	1 positive comment in support of both houses	7 months
Jan. 25, 2008	Sabino Canyon Visitor Center	Public	Yes	3 positive comments in support of both houses	
Jan. 26, 2008	“And the horse you rode in on”	Overnight boarding stable	Yes	No longer a B & B. They did not see a conflict.	
Jan. 28, 2008	Phone conversation with Marybeth Dawson asked me to contact Randy Redhawk	Resident	Yes	Questions regarding rentals	
Jan. 28, 2008	Phone conversation with Randy Redhawk	Caretaker on the Ft. Sill Apache property	No	Questions regarding rentals	
Jan. 28, 2008	Contacted Thelma & John. Strawbale Manor	B & B Owner	Yes	In support of both houses. They felt it would not impact their business.	
Jan. 29, 2008	John Heiman	Outfitter Guide	Yes	In support of both houses	
Feb. 3, 2008	Meeting with County Line Riders of Catalina	Equestrian group	Yes	See above	

Feb. 3, 2008	Meeting with Randy Redhawk and Dawson's	Residents	Yes	Addressed questions	
Feb. 10, 2008	Notice published in the Tucson Mountain Riders Newsletter	Equestrian Group	Yes	1 response in support of both houses	
Feb. 25, 2008	Meeting with Residents of Cochise Stronghold		Yes	Randy Redhawk in support of HMR, but not Shaw.	12 residents
Feb. 27, 2008	Email sent to all the attendees of the meeting in the Stronghold*	Residents	Yes	N/A	12 residents
Feb. 25, 2008	Nancy Edmiston	Chamber of Commerce	Yes	In support of both houses	
Feb. 27, 2008	Recap of resident meeting sent to all residents in the Stronghold	Residents	Yes	Randy Redhawk opposed to Shaw House. Marybeth and Roy Dawson also opposed	
Feb. 27, 2008	Eastern Arizona Courier published press release	General public	No	N/A	~ 10,000 subscribers
March 11, 2008	Reggie West	Public	Yes	In support of both cabins	
March 12, 2008	Michael Darrow – Ft. Sill Apache	Property owners	No	N/A	4 months
March 17, 2008	Notice posted at both sites	General Public	No	N/A	4 months
March 17 – 30, 2008	Jim and Billie DeRuiter	Volunteers	Yes	In support of both houses. Spent 2 weeks cleaning both houses	
March 29, 2008	Scott Eaton	Resident	Yes	In support of both houses, but drop the # of folks to 5-6 at the Shaw House	
March 30 – April 25	Robert Morris	Volunteer (Professor, SUNY –	Yes	In support of both houses. Spent 3	

		Electrical Contracting		weeks upgrading all electrical	
April 5-6, 2008	Eagle Scout Project	Volunteers	Yes	~ 25 HS boy scouts and families fixed the water tank, rebuilt a wall and repaired the storage shed	
April 5, 2008	Nancy Yates comments to Steve Hensel (Forest Service Employee)			Nancy Yates brought two folks by the HMR to show it as a proposed cabin rental. She was in favor of HMR	
April 7, 2008	Christine & Gary Auerbach	Resident	Yes	In support of both houses	
April 17-19, 2008	County Line Riders of Catalina	Equestrian Groups	Yes	Received letter with 22 signatures in support of both houses. Received 23 responses in support of HMR; 2 responses in support of both houses	
April 19, 2008	County Line Riders of Catalina & Cochise Co. Trails Assoc.	Hiking, Biking & Equestrian Groups	Yes	~ 20 people showed up for a work day to repair the corrals	
April 22, 2008	Cochise County Trails Association	Hiking, biking & Equestrian Organization	Yes	Sent emails to all members urging the FS to place both houses in rental program	3 months
April 24 - 30, 2008	Cochise County Trails Assoc. & County Line Riders	See Above	Yes	20 responses in support of both houses	

June 30, 2008	Jason Ground	KGUN9 News – Noticed media release on website	Yes	In support of both houses	
July 1-7, 2008	Patricia Spoerl	Passport in Time Volunteer	Yes	10 days caretaking & conducting maintenance at HMR & Shaw	

Summary of Public Input

In all thirty six contacts were made.

For the Half Moon Ranch, I received 97 comments in favor of the cabin rental and no negative comments. Nancy Yates has changed her position on the Half Moon Ranch and commented to a Forest Service employee that it could serve as overflow for her Bed and Breakfast.

For the Shaw House, I received 73 comments in favor of the cabin rental and three negative comments. The negative comment came from Nancy Yates, the owner of the Cochise Stronghold Bed and Breakfast. She was concerned that the cabin rental would directly compete with her business. However, our proposal offers a completely different experience. The B&B offers full accommodations, breakfast in bed, food provisioning (stock your refrigerator), yoga, meditation, massage, etc. The Forest Service is offering a house with some basic amenities. The price for the cabin falls within the middle of their price range and is not undercutting their prices above. The remaining two comments were from residents of the Canyon. Marybeth and Roy Dawson would like to see the Shaw House used for volunteers because they feel more Forest Service presence is needed in the Canyon. The other negative comment was from Randy Redhawk (a volunteer caretaker on the Ft. Sill Apache property) who was worried about noise, too many people in the canyon, potential drunken parties, etc. I did receive four positive comments from residents (Scott Eaton, Molly Hunt and Christine and Gary Auerbach). Ms. Hunt and the Auerbach’s were in favor of both houses and Mr. Eaton was in favor of both houses, but would like the number of occupants dropped from 8 to 5-6.

Possible mitigations for resolving these issues include dropping the number of occupants at the Shaw House.

Partnerships

Several partnerships were formed over the course of this project. Volunteers: Jim and Billie DeRuiter, Robert Morris and Pat Spoerl were all recruited through the Forest Service Passport in Time program. Robert Morris’s contribution saved the Forest Service thousands of dollars by upgrading the electrical systems in both houses. Numerous

members of the County Line Riders of Catalina and the Cochise County Trails Association spent several days at the Stronghold houses completing various tasks, including: shopping for lumber and parts, repairing the gates and the corrals, piling brush and removing limbs above the corrals. One Eagle Scout group (consisting of ~ 25 people) spent the weekend repairing the storage shed (which houses the water storage tank), repairing the concrete tank for wildlife purposes and constructing a rock and cement wall around the existing septic tank.

Personnel from the Coronado National Forest Supervisor's Office and the Douglas Ranger District personnel have participated in two work days. Approximately 100 Forest Service employees have painted, cleared brush, cut trees, repaired corrals and completed general maintenance.